



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: June 8, 2022

Case No: 21-COA-0084
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1105 S. First St.

Applicant: Katherine Renfro
The Renfro Group
6403 Deep Creek Dr.
Prospect KY, 40059
(502) 345-3667
katierenfro5@gmail.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks after-the-fact approval for the replacement of four front facing side windows that were two-over-two, double-hung, historic wood windows with one-over-one, single-hung, vinyl windows. The applicant also seeks after-the-fact approval for the replacement of 28 side and rear windows that were two-over-two, double-hung, historic wood windows toward the front and four-over-four, double-hung, historic wood windows toward the rear. These were replaced with one-over-one, single-hung, vinyl windows.

The applicant originally also applied for an after-the-fact fence and gate, both of which are approvable at staff level and have been removed from this application.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:

The applicant first contacted the Urban Design team on November 6, 2020 to ask about the materials required for window replacement, as well as security bars. Staff confirmed that if the front facing windows met W1, then they would need to be replaced with wood or clad wood windows per the design guidelines, while the sides and rear could possibly be replaced with other materials. Staff also let the applicant know a COA would be required. The applicant then contacted the Urban Design team again on April 26, 2021 to see if they would need a COA to make interior changes to the property. Staff informed the applicant if the interior changes caused changes to the exterior then a COA would be required. Staff also reminded the applicant that a COA is required for anything on the site such as fencing etc. On April 28, 2021, the applicant contacted the Urban Design team to let them know they had been working at the property, and were issued a stop work order. The applicant applied for the COA on April 28, 2021 and it was accepted on April 29, 2021. The ARC case is scheduled to be heard on June 15, 2022 at 5:30 PM in the Metro Development Center located at 444 S. 5th St. Suite 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The two-story masonry building at 1105 S. First St. was constructed circa 1890, and has character defining decorative lentils over the front facing windows as well as rusticated stone string courses on the front façade. The multi-residential apartment building is located 3 lots south of the intersection of S. First St. and E. Saint Catherine St. The property is zoned TNZD and located within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District.

Conclusions

The proposed changes do not to meet the **Window** Design Guidelines for the Old Louisville Preservation District. Staff cannot comment on the condition of the previous historic windows since they were removed without any documentation. Thus, it is unclear if they met the threshold for replacement in **W1**. Furthermore, the replacement windows do not replicate the configuration of the previous historic windows, which had a two-over-two muntin pattern. This does not meet **W2**. Furthermore, the vinyl replacement windows do not have a 1:1 ratio of upper sash to lower sash like typical windows. The replacements have a larger upper sash and smaller lower sash, which also does not meet **W2**. Thus, staff recommends that the applicant replace the 28 vinyl windows with new replacement windows that closely replicate the previous historic windows, including equal sash heights and two-over-two muntin configuration.

Lastly, **W6**, does not permit synthetic replacement windows on front facades. Four of the replaced windows are on bays that face the street. As these bay windows are front facing and not deeply setback, staff recommends that the applicant replace them with a wood or clad wood window that fits the historic window openings and matches the original window configuration of two-over-two.

Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied** as the vinyl replacement windows do not meet the design guidelines.

However, if the ARC determines that the proposed vinyl is an appropriate material, or if the applicant changes replacement window material, then staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. The front facing replacement windows shall be replaced with a wood or clad wood window that fits the historic window openings and matches the original window configuration of two-over-two.
2. The 28 side and rear replacement windows shall be replaced with new vinyl windows that match the original window configuration of two-over-two.
3. The glass shall not be smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective. Clear low-E glass is permissible.
4. The applicant shall not wrap the window trim or sills with vinyl or aluminum.
5. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

6-8-2022

Date

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	-	Staff cannot comment on the condition of the previous historic windows since they were removed without any documentation, but the replacement windows are not the same two-over-two configuration as the originals and are not wood or clad wood.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	-	Replacement windows do not match the historic windows.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NSI	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+	Replacement windows do fit the historic window openings.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	-	The front facing windows were previously wood and now vinyl.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+/-	Replacement windows are single-hung, which is somewhat common when replacing a historic double-hung window.
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	The current replacement windows do not have this.
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	The current replacement windows do not have this.
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	

W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	

W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Applicant shall document changes