



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to The Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: July 25, 2022 *S.Darr*

Case No: 22-COA-0159
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2353 Sycamore Ave.

Applicant: John Waits
SFR3
2353 Sycamore Ave.
Louisville KY, 40206
502-395-2520
john.waits@sfr3.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$20,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks after-the-fact approval for the following items:

1. The applicant proposes to replace three windows on the front façade with committee approvable windows. They have been replaced with windows that do not meet the design guidelines.
2. Installation of new 36" tall wood deck railing to enclose the front porch, as well as wood hand rails on either side of the stairs leading to the porch.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The property was inspected by Zoning Enforcement after a complaint of work being completed without a COA. The application was received on July 1, 2022. The application was considered complete on July 5, 2022. Staff contacted the applicant with questions about the windows. The applicant's representative contacted staff on July 18, 2022, and staff recommended dividing the application into two so that some items could be reviewed at staff level as others had to go before the Clifton Architectural Review Committee. A new application was filed July 19, 2022 (22-COA-0168) and approved on July 20, 2022.

The case will be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee on August 3, 2022 at 5:30 PM, in the Metro Development Center located at 444 S. 5th St. Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Windows** and **Porch**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the southeast side of Sycamore Avenue, two lots west of its intersection with N Ewing Ave. It is zoned R5 within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site contains a circa 1910, wood frame, lap siding clad, two-story, American Foursquare residence. The complex hip roof with a hipped dormer, limestone foundation, and full front porch are character defining elements to this property.

No previous COAs were on file for this address. The applicant received a stop work order from Zoning Enforcement in late-June for work without a COA. The side and rear window replacement, reconstruction of covered rear porch, and garage doors were removed from this application and placed in a new one as they can be a staff level review. See Case # 22-COA-0168 for more information.

Conclusions

The applicant previously removed the three historic 1/1 double-hung wood windows on the front façade and replaced them with six 1/1 single-hung windows, which does not meet **W1**, **W2**, **W3**, **W5**, **W9**, and **W10** of the Clifton Design Guidelines for **Window**. However, the applicant proposes to replace these six new replacement windows with three new windows that meet the design guidelines. Thus, staff recommends a 1/1 double-hung clad wood window that fits the historic window openings. The window configuration should go back to three total windows instead of the current six total windows.

The after-the-fact hand rail, and balusters, on the existing front porch generally do not meet the Clifton Design Guidelines for **Porch**. This porch never had a full railing historically, and this railing installation does alter the appearance of the structure. However, the porch is 36" or higher and the owner's insurance is requiring this change. The hand rails though simple in design, are designed for decking projects not historic front porches. Thus, staff conditions their approval on the height being lowered a minimum of 6" and a 1" x 4" board being added at the top and bottom of the outward facing balusters, and that the entire railing system be painted the color of the columns, or house to blend in. The railings are not attached to the columns or siding of the house, they are supported with posts that have been attached to the porch floor, do not harm the historic fabric, and are not a permanent feature.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. The applicant shall replace all 6 front facing windows with 3 windows that are either wood, or clad-wood windows that fit the historic openings and have the same 1/1 configuration as the respective historic windows did.
2. The applicant shall provide staff with cut sheets prior to installation for approval, replacement windows shall match the provided cut sheets, fit the historic openings, match the historic operation, and be clear glass.
3. The applicant shall lower the height of the existing porch rail a minimum of 6", install a 1" x 4" board on the top and bottom of the outward facing balusters, and paint the entire railing system the color of the columns or the siding.
4. The applicant shall apply for a COA for any other exterior work to the property prior to work taking place.
5. If the design or materials change, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval.

07-25-22

Date

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister

Planning & Design Coordinator

Windows

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	The maintenance and repair of historic windows are essential to preserving the historic character and fabric of Clifton structures and the overall Clifton historic district. For that reason, historic windows on street-address façades and street-facing façades shall not be replaced with new windows unless the Clifton ARC determines that the condition of existing windows, safety or energy efficiency considerations, or other relevant factors support window replacement. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	-	3 front facing historic wood windows were replaced with 6 vinyl windows.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W2	If historic windows on façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades are replaced, or the owner is authorized to replace windows on street-address façade or street-facing façade pursuant to W1, the new windows shall convey the same visual appearance as the historic windows. The visual appearance of a window is based on details such as sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and other decorative features. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of wood, metal, or synthetic window systems for authorized window replacement is permissible. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	-	The three windows on the front, facade were 1/1 double-hung wood windows that fit the openings. There are now 2 vinyl windows in each of the 3 openings. This does not match the historic window configuration and does not emulate the look of historic wood windows.
W3	Replacement sash should not be used that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows.	-	The three windows on the front, facade were 1/1 double-hung wood windows that fit the openings. They are now 6 vinyl windows. Thus, these windows do not fit the historic window opening.
W4	Replacement windows proposed for façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades, and those authorized pursuant to W1 for street-address façades and street-facing façades, shall operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	All new replacement windows operate similarly to the historic windows.
W5	Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance with W2 shall have such muntins permanently applied and may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass panes.	-	The three windows on the front facade were 1/1 double-hung wood windows. They are now 6 1/1 single-hung vinyl windows.
W6	Reflective or insulating film shall not be applied to window glass on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+	See conditions of approval
W7	Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass shall not be used on windows on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+	See conditions of approval
W8	Transoms or sidelights shall not be blocked-in or back-painted.	NA	
W9	The number, size, location, or shape of original windows shall not be altered on street-address façades or street-facing façades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	-	The applicant previously removed 3 1/1 double-hung wood windows on the front façade with six 1/1 single-hung vinyl windows.
W10	Any new window openings for a new use shall not be located on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	-	Three new openings were added on the front façade.
W11	The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side of historic window trim.	+	Historic trim appears to be in tact and uncovered.
W12	New floors or dropped ceilings shall not be installed that block the glazed area of windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W13	If exterior storm windows are installed they should duplicate the shape of the original window.	NA	
W14	When installing exterior storm windows or screens do not damage or obscure historic windows or frames.	NA	
W15	Window sashes shall not be altered to accommodate window air-conditioning units.	NA	
W16	When installing security bars do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W17	Awnings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W18	Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building.	NA	
W19	Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units.	NA	
W20	On commercial buildings attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W21	Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works).	NA	
W22	Replacement shutters should match the visual appearance, size, and location of the originals and may be constructed of wood, metal, or synthetic material.	NA	
W23	Shutters shall be installed only where there is historic evidence for them.	NA	

Porch

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
PO1	Reconstructed entrance or porch features should be replaced with in-kind materials. If not economically or technically feasible, a compatible substitute material may be used including composite or other synthetic materials, columns, or trim designed to reflect the appropriate style of the house. Design elements should match the proportion, detailing, and size of the original style.	NA	Porch railing and balusters did not originally exist on this porch.
PO2	Architectural features that are proposed for reconstruction or replacement must be photographically documented by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks for approval of any exterior modification. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained.	NA	
PO3	Replacement porch railings and balusters should match the originals as closely as possible. If it is technically or economically unfeasible to accomplish this, then pre-fab wood or synthetic materials may be purchased that are	NA	Porch railing and balusters did not originally exist on this porch.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	similar to the originals. Wood railings should be finished with paint or an opaque stain.		
P04	Cast or wrought iron columns, railings, or balusters should not be used as a replacement for brick or wood porch elements.	NA	
P05	When installing a new code-required handrail or railing to porch steps or from the street where not originally installed, select a design that is simple and stylistically appropriate or artistic.	+	Hand railing on either side of stairs is simple in design
P06	Conjectural porch ornament should not be added; often its style conflicts with the style of the house. For example, do not add gingerbread spindles or Corinthian columns to a Craftsman-style house.	-	The after-the-fact porch railing is in contradiction to the style of the home, and is designed for decking installation, not historic front porches.
P07	Over-sized boards (2" thick) should not be used for porch floors. 3/4" to 1" tongue-and-groove boards are generally appropriate. Deck boards are not appropriate for street façade porch floors.	NA	
P08	Replacement porch flooring should be installed that closely matches the original tongue-and groove flooring dimensions. The proper installation of tongue and groove for outdoor flooring provides for a maximum gap of 1/16" between boards to allow for expansion. Wood edging should be applied to the exposed ends of floorboards to prevent moisture infiltration into the grain.	NA	
P09	Porch or cornice elements or any architectural-defining feature on the street façade should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum siding.	NA	
P010	Porch ceilings should not be installed, nor exposed eaves enclosed, where no such covering existed previously. Exposed rafters and roof decks are character-defining features for certain architectural styles, such as the Craftsman style.	NA	
P011	Deteriorated porch steps should be replaced with in-kind materials. Replacement steps should be of the same scale and dimensions as the original. 5/4" deck boards should not be used for stair treads. Stone steps may be patched with concrete that is tinted a visually compatible color.	NA	
P012	Historic stone steps should not be replaced unless the stone itself is unsafe or no longer useable. Resetting stones on a firm foundation and re-pointing or applying appropriate sealant can address most problems (contact Landmarks for advice on sealant product choices).	NA	
P013	Front porches can be enclosed with screen panels (not glass panels) provided the construction is reversible and no alterations are made to the original façade. Screen panels that can be removed seasonally when they are set behind porch elements are preferred. The porch enclosure shall not be made into a conditioned living space.	NA	
P014	When undertaking a non-street front-facing or rear porch enclosure project, do not obscure the design or detailing of original porch elements. The enclosure shall not become a room addition. See the Addition guidelines if a room addition is desired.	NA	
P015	A porch may be added to a structure's primary façade only if the porch design is appropriate to the style of the house.	NA	