



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Priscilla Bowman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: August 23, 2022 *SDarr*

Case No: 22-COA-0156
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2312 Glenmary Ave

Owner: Nathan and Jennifer Romero
2312 Glenmary Ave
Louisville, KY 40204

Applicant: Rachel Harmon
Concept Architects, LLC
1621 Windsor Place
Louisville, KY 40204
(270) 823-4647
rachel@conceptarcs.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$80,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to construct a 1,426 SF two-story carriage house. The building will be 24' W x 32' D x 23'-10" H and have a two-car garage on the first level with an accessory apartment on the second level. The second floor living space will be 658 SF and have one bedroom, one bathroom, and a deck facing the alley. The hip roof will be clad with asphalt shingles to match the adjacent roofs. JamesHardie™ vertical fiber cement board and batten siding will be used around the second story exterior and around the façade of the exterior staircase to match the rear addition of the main home. 206F Wirecut Flashed Lee brick will be used on the first story/garage level to also blend with the main home. There will be two carriage style garage doors, one facing the alley and the other facing the rear yard. Woodgrain fiberglass facing doors and Brickmould vinyl double-pane windows with pre-finished metal cladding will be placed on both levels of the addition. A new paved parking area will be placed between the garage and the alley.

The side yard elevation (southwest elevation) will have two, horizontal 1/1, casement vinyl windows with transoms on the second level, and a 4' x 17'-10.5" landing and stairs to the yard. Two wood

fiberglass doors will be added, one accessing the second-story apartment from the exterior side-entry landing stairs, and the other providing ground-level pedestrian access to the garage.

The alley side elevation (southeast elevation) will have an exterior balcony with two woodgrain fiberglass doors and will be accessed from both the living room and bedroom. An 18' wide Clopay® Coachman® insulated steel and composite roll up garage door will be located directly below the balcony, and a 20' x 33' concrete slab will be placed behind the garage for additional parking.

The rear yard elevation (northwest elevation) will have one, horizontal 1/1, casement vinyl window and a Clopay® Coachman® insulated steel and composite roll up garage door on the first level, along with two, single casement windows on the second level.

On the south side of the property, across the existing driveway, a matching wood fence will be added to the existing fence to remove 12 feet of access into the rear yard. A second wood fence will be added to the south side of the parking pad, at the edge of the landing stairs and will connect to the existing fence along the rear property line. A wood deck will be constructed, which will replace the existing wood deck on the rear, southeast side of the main home.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on June 27, 2022 and considered requiring committee level review on June 27, 2022 Staff contacted the applicant on July 27, 2022 requesting cut sheets for the proposed materials. The applicant submitted those to staff on August 7, 2022. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on August 31, 2022 at 4:30 pm, in-person at 444 S. 5th Street, Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **New Construction Residential, Garage, Addition, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is zoned R-6 and is within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The property is located on the south side of Glenmary Avenue on the fourth lot east of Willow Avenue. The main home is a one-and-a-half-story, 3,557 SF masonry Craftsman style home. The surrounding buildings are predominately two and three-story multi-family residential masonry homes.

In 1991, staff approved a COA (S-91-19-C) to construct a wood fire escape system from the second floor at the rear of the house, and to reconstruct an existing dormer window into a new ½-lite exit door. In 2005, a COA (S-05-160-CT) was approved with conditions at staff level for the replacement of multiple doors and windows of the home and the removal of the rear wood second-story fire escape.

Conclusions

The proposed carriage house generally meets the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District design guidelines for **New Construction Residential** and **Garage**. The proposed design of the building is subordinate in size of the main home as it is roughly 4 feet lower in overall height and is approximately 2,131 smaller in square feet. The proposed structure also complies with applicable Land Development Code zoning and setback requirements. The new carriage house will be set back from the existing alley, surrounded by a variety of existing garages and structures. The proposed board and batten siding and brick are appropriate materials and will be used in a way that blends with the original house and nearby structures. The proposed alley side double garage door, however, does not meet the design guidelines, which call for single-car openings. Most of the nearby alley-facing garage doors appear to be single-car opening garage doors. The subject alley also measures 15 feet wide, which allows enough space for single garage door parking. Therefore, staff recommends the proposed alley side garage door be changed to two single garage doors with single-car openings.

The proposed wood deck generally meets the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District design guidelines for **Addition**. The new deck will be located on the rear, yard-facing façade of the main home. The rear wood deck shall replace an existing wood deck of similar size. All historic trees shall remain.

The proposed wood fence generally meets the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, design guidelines for **Site**. The new fence is intended to fill gaps in an existing fence, and it will match the existing wood fence.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. All wood shall be painted or opaque stained within 12 months of construction.
2. The garage doors facing the alley shall be single garage doors with a single-car opening rather than one double garage door.
3. All grade level concrete shall be of historic concrete mix.
4. The applicant shall use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment shall be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Light should be directed down and away from neighbors.
5. Half-round or Ogee gutters shall be installed.
6. Trash receptacles shall be screened and stored off the alley.
7. Storm-water management provisions shall be incorporated into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
8. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.



Priscilla Bowman

Historic Preservation Specialist

8/23/2022

Date

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	NA	
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	Reflects the Craftsman style of main home and neighborhood; Vertical board and batten siding used around majority and most visible areas of structure, and brick walls at garage level; asphalt shingle roof to match existing home and surrounding structures.
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	NA	
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	NA	

NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	NA	
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+	
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	NA	
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	The ground floor heights are roughly the same; the second-floor height is shorter than the main home by approximately 4'
NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	NA	
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	NA	
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	+	

NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	See conditions of approval.
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	+	Red brick (206F Wirecut Flashed Lee Brick) will be used on first level.
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	+	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+	
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+	
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	Garage will be located and facing rear alley.
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+/-	Single garage door facing main home on the rear yard side; Double garage door is proposed on alley side
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	NA	
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	NA	
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	Parking pad to be located behind carriage house, between the carriage house and alley.
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	See conditions of approval.

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The size will match the existing wood deck.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	The deck is attached to the rear façade of the main home.
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	New wood deck replacing existing wood deck.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	NA	
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	NA	
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	NA	
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+	
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	NA	
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	NA	
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	

A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	+	New wood deck to replace existing wood deck on rear yard facing façade
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	+	
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	+	See conditions of approval

GARAGE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	
		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	
		+	Minimize paving	
Materials	Walls	NA	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		+	Board and batten siding	Vertical (Hardie Board) fiber cement board + batten siding
		+	Brick	
		NA	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		NA	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	+	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	Asphalt shingles
		NA	Metal roofing	
		NSI	Half-round or Ogee gutters	See conditions of approval
		NA	Approved Gable-end element	
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	

Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		NA	No overly elaborate volumes	
	Roof	NA	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	
		+	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		+	Overhanging eaves	
		NA	Half-round gutters	
		NA	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	
		NA	No flush eaves	
		NA	No roofs without gutters	
Openings	Garage	+/-	Single-car openings	Two-car opening on alley side, Single-car opening on rear yard side.
	Doors	+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	
		+/-	No double and triple doors	Double garage door on alley-facing side. Single garage door on side facing rear yard.
		NA	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	
	Windows	+	Use window openings to break up wall surface	
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any re-platting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+/-	See conditions of approval
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+/-	See conditions of approval
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	+	

ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NSI	See conditions of approval
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NSI	See conditions of approval
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	+	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	