



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: July 27, 2022 *SD*

Case No: 22-COA-0149
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1728 Payne St.

Applicant: Scott Huff
Eldridge Company
931 E. Main St.
Louisville, KY 40206
(502) 656-4971
scott@eldridgecompany.com

Owner: James Duffy
Duffy Properties Franck, LLC
1728 Payne St.
Louisville, KY 40206
(502) 432-9355
james@beargrassdevelopment.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$ 400,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant proposes the construction of two two-story, four-unit, multi-family apartment buildings approximately 26' W x 93'-10.5" D x 30'-10" H in the rear and 28'-4" H in the front to allow for grade changes. The buildings will have a staggered placement on the site to allow for a continuous 15' setback, similar to the neighboring historic properties. The buildings are mirror images of one another with front facing doors onto private patios emulating the same front door, front porch relationship historically seen on the street. The exterior of each building is proposed to be clad with masonry, that will be painted differing colors to distinguish the buildings from one another. Front facing gable roofs with expansive windows, along with the use of smooth vertical fiber cement siding and cedar tongue-and-groove siding as accents, give the buildings a contemporary design that speaks to the historic setting. The primary entrances to the units are located along the central

corridor created between the two buildings, that leads from Payne St., between the two buildings, and on to the alley at the rear of the property. There will be windows located on all facades to further break the massing. The existing one-story CMU building is to remain onsite and continue to function as a rental unit

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on June 23, 2022 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on June 27, 2022. Staff met with the applicant several times prior to the application being submitted. The applicant was aware that this would be a committee case prior to the application being submitted.

The case has been scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee on August 3, 2022 at 5:30 pm, in the Metro Development building located at 444 S. 5th St., Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **New Construction - Residential** and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site is located on the southeast side of Payne St., four lots west of the intersection with Stoll Ave. The property is zoned R5 within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. There is one building currently on the site, which is an approximately 600 sq. ft., one-story, painted cement block dwelling, with a hipped roof clad with asphalt shingles. The building was constructed circa 1944 based on city directories and PVA records. It is surrounded by an eclectic mix of historic residential buildings, and contemporary commercial buildings of various styles, materials, and massing.

The existing building is currently marked non-contributing on the Clifton Preservation District map and is outside the Clifton National Register Historic District boundary as well. In the evaluation of the property for this case, staff recommends to the Clifton ARC that building be considered contributing to the Clifton Preservation District as it relates to residential development of the Clifton Preservation district in the post-World War II period/mid-Twentieth century. The building was constructed for Arthur P. Duggins, a retired switchman for L&N Railroad, widower, father of two. He lived there alone until circa 1960. The building's location at the rear of the property reads as an accessory structure even though it served as a residence. It is a modest structure with limited architectural detailing.

The property owner previously brought the case before the Clifton ARC on February 24, 2021 under case number **21-COA-0005**. The committee continued the case to allow the applicant time to explore preserving and incorporating the existing building into the design, rather than to demolishing it.

Conclusions

The proposed changes generally meet the Clifton Preservation District for **New Construction - Residential**, and **Site**. The extant building aligns more with the setbacks of the neighboring auxiliary structures and not the primary structures on the adjacent lots. This is a modest structure characteristic of the construction of accessory structures during the time period. Thus, the new buildings are proposed to be constructed in front of this building to fill in the gap between the street and the building, which is where a primary structure would normally be located. The buildings will be sited in line with other primary structures on the street and will be staggered to match this pattern as well. The proposed new buildings have been designed to match one another, while still reading as individual buildings. The construction of two buildings versus one large building helps keep the massing in scale with the neighboring properties.

The project will require a zoning change if approved by the committee and will be required to adhere to all applicable regulations per **NCR1**. Though the scale of the proposed buildings is larger than the buildings that are directly adjacent (generally contradicting **NCR18**), they do reflect the architectural context. Payne Street has a mix of larger scale buildings along with residential scale houses. Some of the houses appear larger as they sit on higher elevations than this property. The form and placement of the proposed new buildings also helps reinforce the human scale of the neighborhood per **NCR7**. The design attempts to mitigate **NCR3** by staggering the façades to maintain the existing site line, as well as the historic setback per **NCR10** and **NCR21**. The placement of the proposed new buildings also adds to the eclectic historic character of the district per **NCR4**. The staggered heights also generally meet **NCR8** and **NCR9** which encourages new construction to not disrupt important public views, and to reinforce circulation routes.

The proposal is creative in design as **NCR6** encourages. The proposed materials are generally sympathetic to the size, texture, scale and level of craftsmanship of the surrounding buildings. They generally meet **NCR12**, as they help to break up the visual weight of the building and attempt to meet **NCR5** with use of traditional and contemporary materials in a color palette compatible with the district. **NCR11** is generally met since the proposed design does not imitate a historic style or period of architecture. **NCR14**, **NCR15** and **NCR16** are generally met with the orientation of the front façade, the walk leading from the sidewalk to the front door, and the proposed design of the front door on the front facades.

Per **Site** Design Guideline **ST1** applicant shall use historic mix concrete for any sidewalks, curbing, or apron installed in public view. The applicant proposes three parking spaces to be located at the rear of the property which meets **ST5**.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. Staff shall be notified of an excavation schedule for the site and if archaeological discoveries such as artifacts, features, and other archaeological deposits are found during new construction.
2. Manufacturer's information on all materials shall be submitted to staff prior to construction.
3. Any visible poured concrete shall be of historic mix.
4. Storm-water management systems in new construction design and water runoff shall not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
5. Applicant shall design storage for waste receptacles to be hidden from view.
6. All other required permits and approvals shall be obtained prior to the start of both the demolition and new construction.
7. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Planning & Design Coordinator

07-27-22

Date

New Construction - Residential

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+ Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

NA Not Applicable
NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NCR1	New construction designs should conform to all applicable regulations including the Land Development Code, Zoning District Regulations, Building, and Fire and Safety codes, MSD, and any other regulatory agency. All new construction architectural designs will be reviewed by the Clifton ARC.	+	Zoning approval shall be obtained prior to moving forward. Applicant shall conform to all applicable regulations.
NCR2	No structure should be demolished to make way for new or large-scale construction. All structures in the district will be identified as either contributing or non-contributing at time of application. The Landmarks staff and ARC will evaluate and review all demolition permit requests. See the Demolition guidelines for more details.	NA	Existing historic structure to remain and continue to function as a rental unit.
NCR3	Building height, scale, massing, volume, directional emphasis, and setback should reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	The building is taller in height to adjacent buildings but does reflect the architectural context. Payne Street does have a mix of larger scale buildings along with residential scale houses.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NCR4	The scale of new construction should not conflict with the historic character of the district.	+	The scale is larger than the adjacent buildings but keeping with the character of the district in terms of design.
NCR5	Building materials and design elements in new construction design should be sympathetic with surrounding historic buildings in the district. Materials should be of a complementary color, size, texture, scale, and level of craftsmanship.	+	Material choices are sympathetic with surrounding historic buildings.
NCR6	Creative design is encouraged. Examples of materials to avoid include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unfinished wood, and asphalt siding. Chain-link fences should not be installed where visually incompatible.	+	Design is creative and uses appropriate materials.
NCR7	New construction design should reflect and reinforce the human scale of the neighborhood, which is a character-defining feature of the preservation district.	+	Two separate buildings help to break the massing up and keep the human scale seen in the neighborhood.
NCR8	Important public views and vistas should not be disrupted by new construction design. See the Cultural Landscape guidelines for more details.	+	
NCR9	Existing spatial patterns created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, should be reinforced in new construction design.	NA	
NCR10	The spatial organization established by surrounding buildings should be reinforced in infill construction design. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly designed façades.	+	The scale is larger than the historic buildings adjacent to it. The way it is staggered and set back helps to mitigate this.
NCR11	The façade's organization should closely relate to surrounding buildings in infill construction design. Cornice lines and columns are other important character-defining façade elements. Imitating an historic style or period of architecture in new construction is not recommended.	+	See conclusions
NCR12	A new building's mass should have a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solid surfaces (walls) to voids (window and door openings).	+	See conclusions
NCR13	Window patterns should be sympathetic with those of surrounding buildings. Compatible frame dimensions, proportion, panel and light, and muntin configurations are encouraged. Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one half (height) by one (width).	+	Window placement is balanced and sympathetic to surrounding buildings.
NCR14	Front door design should be sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings in new construction design. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+	Proposed door design is sympathetic to surrounding buildings.
NCR15	The orientation of the main entrance should be the same as the majority of other buildings on the street in new construction design.	+	Orientation is the same as the surrounding buildings
NCR16	Paved walks should be installed between public sidewalks and front entrances where this is a character-defining feature on the street.	+	Paved walk leads from sidewalk to a central corridor for the two buildings.
NCR17	Handicapped access ramps should be located on secondary elevations (side or rear) wherever possible. If the only option is to install the ramp on the street address façade, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible. Removable or portable ramps may also be used.	+	ADA access is located at the rear of the building.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NCR18	Infill construction design should be compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+/-	Compatible but appears to be taller than those next to it.
NCR19	Horizontal elements such as band boards, brick coursing, window sills or lintels in new construction design should be within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the similar height of the horizontal elements is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	NA	
NCR20	The historic rhythm of the streetscape should be maintained.	+	Rhythm of material, design, and placement
NCR21	Historic building setback patterns should be maintained. To maintain the continuity of the streetscape, front setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	Follows the historic setback pattern on the street
NCR22	Roofs of new buildings should relate to neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	The roof design though different does relate to the surrounding buildings.
NCR23	Rooflines for infill construction design should follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	The roof design though different does relate to the surrounding buildings.
NCR24	The orientation of the main roof form in new construction design should be parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	Roof form is generally parallel to adjacent properties.
NCR25	The existing cornice line on each block should be emphasized in new construction design where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NCR26	Rooftops should remain uncluttered and mechanical systems should be obscured from public view in new construction design.	+	Applicant shall keep mechanical systems concealed.
NCR27	Trash receptacles should be screened from public view with a four-sided enclosure.	+/-	Enclosure not proposed, but can not be seen from front façade.
NCR28	Exterior sheathing should be compatible with surrounding historic buildings. Painted wood siding or fiber cement board is preferred. Vinyl siding may be used for new construction on streets where the predominant historic construction material is wood. See Siding and Trim guidelines for additional details.	+	Compatible materials
NCR29	Masonry types and mortars should be compatible with surrounding buildings. Red brick is the most common masonry material found in the district. See Masonry guidelines for additional details.	+	Proposed use of painted masonry is in keeping with other painted masonry in the district.
NCR30	Stone or cast-stone sills and lintels should be incorporated into new construction design on streets where these elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NCR31	Raised masonry foundations which are compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings should be used. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	NA	Elevations show brick going all the way to grade level
NCR32	New front porches should be built on streets where they are a predominant character-defining feature, and are allowed on other streets, and should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. New columns should consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	+	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NCR33	Porches on newly constructed buildings should be designed so the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the façade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	+	
NCR34	Storm-water management systems in new construction design and water runoff should not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NSI	

Site

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Paving materials (concrete, brick, paver stones, cobblestones, asphalt, gravel, stone, permeable or pervious materials) that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character should be used for private sidewalks, drives, and roadways.	+	Existing alley will be utilized for access. Applicant shall use historic mix concrete for any proposed concrete.
ST2	Historic paving materials for streets, alleys, sidewalks, and curbing (brick, hexagonal pavers, cobblestones, limestone, granite, or natural stone) should be protected, maintained, restored, and reused. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Replacement with historic materials is encouraged. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original. See Masonry M13 guideline for cement mortar mix recipe.	+	Applicant shall retain any historic limestone curbing.
ST3	Steps on private property made of brick, stone, or poured concrete should be maintained wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST4	Paving companies and utility contractors shall not harm historic resources during road or underground utility repair projects.	NA	
ST5	Driveways, parking areas, and loading docks should be constructed or located to the side and rear of properties. Alley access is preferred.	+	Rear yard; already exists onsite
ST6	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not re-contour front yard berms into stepped terraces. Do not use railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST7	Excavations, trenching or re-grading adjacent to a building or site should be performed cautiously so as not to cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources. Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	and preserve architectural resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project.		
ST8	Masonry walls in street-visible locations should not be installed unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless an historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST9	Retaining wall and curbing should match the existing character of the original materials when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST10	Fencing should match existing sections of fencing in material, height, design, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST11	Iron fencing should be installed, historically compatible, and of a similar height where there is a demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST12	Front yard fencing should not be installed where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST13	Rear yard or side yard privacy fencing should be installed with the finished side out and a side wall setback from the front of the house of at least two feet. Privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Refer to the Land Development Code or contact the Department of Codes and Regulations regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST14	Chain-link fencing painted black or dark color may be installed in residential front yards or along commercial corridors at the street where there is an historic precedent. Split-rail, woven-wood fencing, opaque fencing, painted or stained pressure-treated wood fencing, or recycled or reclaimed materials may be permitted with appropriate design. Synthetic or composite fencing that is durable may be considered.	NA	
ST15	Exterior lighting fixtures should not be falsely historical. The fixture should be attached to the exterior in a way as to not damage historic fabric.	+	
ST16	Exterior lighting for parking areas, architectural features, or other site areas should be directed down and away from neighboring properties. Energy-efficient lights should be used to create a soft illumination and to minimize the impact to adjacent properties. Reference the Land Development Code for illumination restrictions.	+	
ST17	Parking lot design requires a portion of the parking area to be landscaped or buffered from adjoining properties. Reference the Land Development Code for specifics on parking lot design, maneuvering, landscaping, and buffering requirements.	NA	
ST18	Auxiliary fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, rain barrels, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, should be located on secondary elevations (side or rear) so they do not detract from the street-address façade and the character of the site.	+	
ST19	Trees in front yards should be preserved. Established street tree patterns should be enhanced by planting additional trees along the public rights-of-way in the grass area between the street and sidewalk. Consult the city arborist or Frankfort Avenue Street Tree Master Plan to determine tree species that are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review by Landmarks staff unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety concerns.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST20	Cellular towers and associated fixtures should be strategically located to minimize the impact on historic view shed(s), screened from public view, and should not damage historic elements when attached to structures.	NA	
ST21	Utility lines should be installed underground whenever possible.	NA	
ST22	The concrete mixture should match the existing or historic concrete mixture when repairing or replacing sidewalks or installing new sidewalks in the public right-of-way. Contact the Landmarks staff for the appropriate mixture and specifications.	+	All poured concrete shall be historic mix