



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report of the Committee Certificate of Appropriateness

To: Aaron Paul Bell | Jordan White
From: Old Louisville ARC
Thru: Priscilla Bowman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: July 26, 2023

Case No: 23-COA-0004
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1319 S. Floyd St.

Applicant: Aaron Paul Bell | Jordan White
1319 S. Floyd St.
Louisville KY 40208
502- 229-4091 | 502-562-7346
abfc8403@yahoo.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks after-the-fact approval for the following:

- Windows
 - Front façade: The first floor single-hung window and trim was removed. The window had a leaded glass upper sash and a larger, clear glass, 3-lite lower sash. The window had a simple hood above and trim around. It was all replaced with one large, vinyl picture window with no trim.
 - Front façade: Two side-by-side, 1/1 double-hung, historic wood windows on the north side of the second story were replaced with two 1/1 single-hung vinyl windows. The historic wood trim was wrapped.
 - Front façade: One window opening, which had been infilled with wood, was located on the south side of the second story. This opening was shortened, and one 1/1 single -hung vinyl window was installed. The historic wood trim was wrapped.

- Front façade: The previously replaced, dormer windows were replaced with vinyl picture windows. The northern dormer window was a casement window while the southern dormer window was already a picture window. The historic wood trim was wrapped.
- Side and rear elevations: Five windows and openings on these elevations were completely removed and were sided over.
- Side and rear elevations: Nine 2/2 double-hung, historic wood windows were replaced with 1/1 single -hung vinyl windows. The historic wood trim was wrapped.
- Rear elevation: One 1/1 double-hung wood window on the second story was replaced with a 1/1 single -hung vinyl window. The historic wood trim was wrapped.
- Front Porch:
 - The character defining, hipped porch roof with dentil molding was removed. Two pilasters located on either side of the front door were also removed.
 - A new shed porch roof clad in metal roof was installed. Cementitious lap siding was installed on either side of the roof.
- Siding:
 - Front façade: The historic wood siding was removed from the front façade and replaced with cementitious siding with a larger reveal (6-7").
 - Side and rear elevations: The historic wood siding was removed from the sides and rear elevation and replaced with Dutch lap vinyl siding.
- Roofing:
 - The box gutters and eave were removed creating a void between the cornice and the roof line. Siding material was added to the front façade to fill this void.
 - Aluminum, ogee gutter system was installed in lieu of an eave and box gutters.
 - Two gable dormers were removed. One from the north side and one from the rear.
- Paint:
 - The previously painted limestone foundation was painted black.
 - The previously unpainted concrete front porch floor and stairs and limestone foundation were painted black.
- Rear deck:
 - A one-story, shed style rear porch roof and a wood egress stair were removed from the rear elevation.
 - A one-story rear deck with stairs leading to rear yard was constructed on the rear elevation. A wood guardrail surrounds the deck and a wood handrail lines the stairs.
 - The ½ lite rear entry door was replaced with a ¼ lite rear entry door.
- Garage:
 - A one-story, shed roof outbuilding was demolished. It had a poured concrete foundation and exterior walls clad in asphalt shingle. A set of wood double entry doors faced the north alley.
 - A one-story, front gable garage was constructed in the similar location as the shed. The garage has a CMU foundation, Dutch lap vinyl siding, and an asphalt shingled roof. The north elevation has a two-car, overhead garage door. The west elevation has a pedestrian entry door.

- Fencing:
 - Construction of a new 7' horizontally oriented wooden privacy fence with gates to the front and rear of the property.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:

An application (22-COA-0162) was first received on July 8, 2022 following a zoning enforcement case opened on December 27, 2021 (ENF-ZON-21-001340) in response to a complaint of work being done without a COA. The application was considered to be incomplete, and staff attempted to contact the former owner multiple times via phone and email for more information. The former owner reached out to staff on October 25, 2022 to schedule a site visit, and staff met with them on site the same day. Staff informed the applicant at the site visit the case would require committee review, and staff emailed the applicant on November 2, 2022, letting them know that quorum had been established for an Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) meeting on December 7, 2022. However, this meeting did not occur as staff discovered that the property had sold. The new owners would need to be consulted. The application known as 22-COA-0162 was voided.

The new property owners/applicants submitted a new application, which was received on January 10, 2023. Staff spoke with the new applicants multiple times to discuss the case moving forward. Staff recommended pulling out items from this application that could be approved at staff level. However, the applicants desired to keep the case as-is. The case is now scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville ARC on Wednesday, May 24, 2023 at 4:30PM in Room 101 of the Metro Development Center (444 South 5th Street).

The Old Louisville ARC met on May 24, 2023 at 4:30pm in Room 101 of the Metro Development Building, at 444 S. 5th Street. Members present were Doug Wilson, Mary Martin (Chair), Howard Rosenberg, and Robert Kirchdorfer. Priscilla Bowman, Savannah Darr, Brad Fister, and Iná Nakao, Landmarks staff; Aaron Paull Bell and Chase Brauner, the applicants, and Stan Dzhishkaryani, the previous property owner, were also present.

This was the second case on the agenda, and its review began at 5:17pm. Ms. Bowman presented the staff report, which recommended denial of the after-the-fact exterior renovations as they caused a loss in historic integrity of the home. Ms. Martin opened the hearing for committee questions for the applicant and staff. The Committee discussed the complexity of the case and the great loss of character of the home as a result of the after-the-fact alterations.

Mr. Dzhishkaryani explained that the previous windows and trim were not original or historic. Drew Martin, the applicant's selling agent, stated that Mr. Dzhishkaryani had claimed on the seller's disclosure that all required government permits and approvals were obtained for the alterations made on the home. Mr. Dzhishkaryani stated that electrical permits had been issued.

There were two other members of the public present who requested to speak. Neighbors, Melissa Oldham and Phillip Garrett both expressed their appreciation of the improvements made to the home. Mr. Garrett implored that the current property owners

are not to blame and should not be punished or enforced because of someone else's actions.

Mr. Rosenberg proposed deferring the meeting to allow time to have the building to be inspected. Mr. Kirchdorfer moved to defer the meeting for building inspection to a date certain, on Wednesday July 26, 2023 at 4:30pm. Mr. Rosenberg seconded. Ms. Martin called for a vote, and the motion passed unanimously (4 yes, 0 no).

The Old Louisville ARC reconvened on July 26, 2023 at 4:30pm in Room 101 of the Metro Development Building, at 444 S. 5th Street. Members present were Mary Martin (Chair), Howard Rosenberg, Jonathan Klunk and Robert Kirchdorfer. Priscilla Bowman, and Brad Fister Landmarks staff; Aaron Paull Bell and Chase Brauner, the applicants, and Jacob Mercier, the owner's broker, were also present. This case was the first of two cases on the agenda.

Ms. Martin opened the meeting and asked for Ms. Bowman to deliver her staff report. Ms. Bowman began with a timeline as to the events that happened since the continuation of the meeting on May 24, 2023. Staff documented prior communication with the previous owner/contractor and selling agent of the home. Staff detailed the unique complications surrounding the building inspection and permitting process for the home.

Ms. Martin opened the hearing for committee questions for the applicant and staff. The applicants reiterated that they did not make the alterations in question and should not be held responsible. The applicants explained the confliction with the building inspection and permit process, since they are unable to obtain the information required in order to be issued their building permits.

Mr. Rosenberg made a motion to approve the application, and to change Staff's recommended conditions of approval. Mr. Rosenberg based his motion on the fact that he believed the historic integrity of the property to be lost due to the inexcusable and crude alterations that had been made to the property by the previous owner/contractor. Mr. Rosenberg added that he believed the replacement windows do meet W2 in terms of the 1/1 windows were replaced with 1/1 windows that from a pedestrian level generally replicating the previous windows with the exception of the 1st floor picture window, and the second-floor window over the porch roof that was shortened. He believes that replicating the historic window hood over the first-floor picture window after so much has been altered, would be faux historic conjecture at best, but recommends the window be altered to look like a transom is above it to make the window as a whole more proportional to the house. Mr. Rosenberg read through each of the 13 staff recommended conditions of approval and made changes to them (see 10 conditions of approval below). He stated that his motion to approve the project was in no way condoning the inexcusable changes that were made to the property by the previous owner/contractor. He further emphasized that this is a site and situational specific approval and should not be looked at as a precedent for future after-the-fact work done in the district that may come before the committee.

Mr. Kirchdorfer seconded Mr. Rosenberg's motion. Ms. Martin asked if there was any discussion on the motion. Committee members discussed that they wished the expense of the changes they were recommending were to be the responsibility of the previous owner; however, it is not in their purview. Ms. Martin called for a vote, and the motion passed unanimously (4 yes, 0 no). The case ended at 5:50 pm.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window, Porch, Siding & Trim, Roofing, Paint, Addition, Door, Demolition, Garage, New Construction Residential, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is zoned TNZD within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. It is located on the north east side of S. Floyd Street, nine lots south of its intersection with E Ormsby Ave. On the property stands a circa 1900, two-and-one-half-story, wood-frame, transitional Victorian style, single family residence. The home is a, set a raised rusticated limestone foundation, is clad with lap siding, has a character defining wide cornice, with swag and bow motif, capped with dental molding, that matched that of the cornice above the front facing first floor window, as well as the cornice below the hipped style front porch roof, both of which are now gone.

There are no other COAs on file for the property; however, the property is in violation with an open Zoning Enforcement Case (ENF-ZON-21-001340) and an open Building Permit Enforcement Case (ENF-BLD-22-06083).

Conclusions

The Old Louisville ARC finds that the window replacement generally does meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Window**. The replacement windows generally replicate the dimensions or muntin configuration of the previous historic windows, which meets **W2**. Furthermore, **W6** does not permit synthetic replacement windows on front facades, and six of the replaced windows are on the front. It was decided that so many changes had taken place that the historic integrity of the property was lost. Furthermore, the recreation of elements such as a window hood could be seen as faux historic and conjectural. The committee does want for the applicant to work with staff to make changes to the picture window so it reads as a picture window with a transom to help the proportions of the window in comparison to the house.

The Old Louisville ARC found that removal of the hip porch roof, dentil molding, and pilasters generally do not meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Porch**. However, it was the finding of the committee so many changes had taken place that the building had lost its historic integrity, and to change the porch back now would not help.

The Old Louisville ARC found that the siding replacement does not meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Siding & Trim**. They approve leaving the Dutch lap vinyl siding on the sides, rear, and garage. They find that the cementitious siding on the front needs to be removed and reinstalled with a 3-4" reveal to match the reveal of the siding on the rest of the property.

The Old Louisville ARC found the alterations to the roof generally do not to meet the Design Guidelines for **Roofing**. The removal of the side and rear dormers do not typically meet **R9**, but these were near the rear of the property and not particularly character defining. The removal of the box gutters and eave does not meet **R11**, **R12**, and **R21**. The form, size, and design of roof eaves and box gutters are character defining to this building. The removal of these features has diminished the historic integrity of the building. The addition of the siding to fill the void left by the removal of the box gutters is not appropriate. The committee decides that eaves be installed that mimic the size and dimensions of the box gutters that were removed, and to extending the roofline over them, and attaching the new gutters to them. This will reestablish the character defining details along the cornice and prevent future water infiltration to the walls.

The Old Louisville ARC found painting of previously unpainted masonry generally does not meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Paint**, which states in **P1** not to paint previously unpainted masonry. Though most of the limestone foundation was previously painted, the concrete porch floor and stairs were not. However, its use in this specific project works to ground the overall building visually.

The Old Louisville ARC finds the rear deck generally meets the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Addition** in terms of scale, placement, and materials as stated in **A1-A4**. It generally does not change the orientation of the building per **A7**. The elements that were demolished for the new deck were not character defining to the building. The ARC gives the applicant 1 year for the wood to be painted or stained per **A16**.

The Old Louisville ARC finds the replacement of the rear door generally meets the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Door**. The previous door did not appear to be original to the building. The overall design of the new door is in keeping with the character of the building and district as a whole, so it generally meets **D3**. Additionally, the door reads as a rear entry which meets **D7**.

The Old Louisville ARC finds the demolition of the previous shed and construction of a two-car garage generally meets the applicable Old Louisville Design guidelines for **Site**, **Demolition**, **Garage**, and **New Construction Residential**. While the shed was demolished without a site visit or documentation, based on photographic evidence it did not appear to be contributing to the District. The location scale and massing of the new garage is generally appropriate, and its construction helps to reestablish the street wall per **DE6**. As this is new construction, the use of vinyl siding and Dutch lap is permissible. While the guidelines discourage the use of a double-car garage door (**NC14**), this location on the alley has a tight turning radius. In these circumstances, doors like this have been allowed. The bare CMU foundation does not meet **NC34** as concurrently constructed. The

ARC requires a parge coat be added to the foundation to bring it into compliance. Additionally, the committee finds that if the applicant wishes to store their trash cans outside of the garage they work with staff to create a place for the trash receptacles to be screened per **NC29**. The apron to the garage, however, does not appear to be historic concrete mix and may be covering historic limestone curbing which put it in conflict with **ST3** and **ST4**. The ARC requires the apron to be stained.

The Old Louisville ARC finds the placement and design of the privacy fencing generally appears to meet the **Site** Design Guidelines for Old Louisville. The fence is below the 7' height restriction, and the finished side faces out per **ST17**. Along the alley the fence sits back approximately 1' from the stone retaining wall. Fence heights are measured from grade. With the 1' setback on the retaining wall, the fence remains only 7' in height. The applicant will need to stain or paint the fencing within one year of approval to meet **ST16**.

While the current owners/applicants did not complete this work, they did inherit the violation with their purchase. The alterations that have been made to this house have negatively impacted its historic integrity. When comparing the current building to the designation photograph, the building is almost unrecognizable, which means it has a lack of integrity. This influenced how the Old Louisville ARC made their decision for this case.

DECISION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, the Committee approves the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

1. **The first-floor front facing replacement windows shall be altered to look like a picture window with a transom above it within 12 months of approval.**
2. **The applicant shall remove and reside the front facade with a cementitious or wood siding with a 3-4" reveal depth within 12 months of approval.**
3. **The applicant shall reconstruct the eave to mimic the proportions of the box gutters there previously, extend the roofline over them, and attach the new gutters to them. This shall be done within 12 months of approval.**
4. **The applicant shall stain or paint all exposed wood on the deck and privacy fencing within 6 months of approval.**
5. **The CMU garage foundation shall be covered with a parge coat within 6 months of approval.**
6. **The applicant shall stain the concrete apron within 6 months of approval.**
7. **The applicant shall obtain after-the-fact building permits for the alterations to the house, deck, and garage.**
8. **The applicant shall make provisions for screening and storage of trash receptacles.**
9. **If the design, materials, or scope of the project should change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**
10. **The applicant shall contact staff in the future prior to any exterior changes to the property.**

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	-	Staff cannot comment on the condition of the previous historic windows since they were removed without any documentation, but the majority of the replacement windows are generally not the same configuration as the originals and are not wood or clad wood.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	-	Vinyl windows do not replicant the dimensions of historic wood windows. Additionally, 2/2 windows were replaced with 1/1 windows.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NSI	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+/-	With the exception of one on the front façade, the replacement windows generally fit the historic window openings.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	-	The front facing windows were previously wood and are now vinyl.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+/-	Replacement windows appear to be single-hung, which is somewhat common when replacing a historic double-hung window.

W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	The current replacement windows do not have this.
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	The current replacement windows do not have this.
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	+	The applicant shall use documentation to reconstruct the 1 st -floor front-facing window to resemble a picture window with a transom above it similar to the previous historic window.
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	-	5 windows were removed from the side and rear, and the openings were sided over, which are visible from the alley.
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	-	The window hood over the front facing 1 st floor window was removed, and all window trim appears to have been wrapped with aluminum.
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	

W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	-	This is an after-the-fact application. It was not documented, but images of the property prior to the recent changes exist

PORCH

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
--	-----------	---------	---------

PO1	Replace reconstructed entrance or porch features with in-kind materials. If that is not economically or technically feasible, a compatible substitute material may be considered. Composition and plastic moldings, however, should not be used due to their unproven longevity.	-	Hip roof was removed and replaced with a metal shed style roof. The rear pilasters that supported the front porch were removed completely, along with the dentil molding. It was not replaced with in-kind materials or design.
PO2	Photographically document architectural porch features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	-	This is an after-the-fact application. It was not documented, but images of the property prior to the recent changes exist
PO3	Design replacement porch railings and balusters to match the originals as closely as possible. If it is technically or economically unfeasible to accomplish this, a simplified porch rail and baluster design may be used of 2" x 4" rails and 2" x 2" pickets, set between top and bottom rails, and nailed to the inside face of the rail. Railings should be finished with paint or an opaque stain. Plans are available from the Landmarks Commission.	NA	
PO4	Do not use cast- or wrought-iron columns, railings, or balusters as a replacement for brick or wood porch elements. Columns should match the proportion, detailing, and size of the original.	NA	
PO5	When installing a new code-required handrail or railing, select a design that is simple and stylistically appropriate. Generally, metal is appropriate for masonry buildings and wood for frame buildings.	NA	
PO6	Do not add conjectural porch ornament; often its style conflicts with the style of the house.	+/-	The shed style roof and metal roofing material conflict with the style of the house. However, because of the extensive number of alterations made to the home, the home has lost its historic integrity. The neighboring home has an existing metal roof, Therefore, the new metal porch roof may be considered appropriate in this context.
PO7	Do not use over-sized boards (2" thick) for porch floors. 3/4" to 1" tongue-and-groove boards are generally appropriate.	NA	
PO8	Install replacement porch flooring that closely matches the original tongue-and-groove flooring dimensions. A maximum gap of 1/16" should be left between boards to allow for expansion. Wood edging should be applied to the exposed ends of floorboards to prevent moisture infiltration into the grain.	NA	
PO9	Do not cover porch or cornice elements with vinyl or aluminum siding.	NA	
PO10	Do not install porch ceilings or close in exposed eaves where none existed previously. Exposed rafters and roof decks are character-defining features for certain architectural styles.	NA	

PO11	Replace deteriorated porch steps with in-kind materials. Replacement steps should be of the same scale and dimensions as the original. Stone steps may be patched with concrete that is tinted a visually-compatible color.	NA	
PO12	Do not replace historic stone steps unless the stone itself is no longer useable. Resetting stones on a firm foundation and repointing or applying sealant can address most problems.	NA	
PO13	Do not enclose front porches. Screen panels that can be removed seasonally, are set behind porch elements, and do not damage historic fabric may be permitted.	NA	
PO14	Do not obscure the design or detailing of original porch elements when undertaking a side or rear porch enclosure project. Large sheets of glass recessed behind original porch features should be used rather than solid materials such as wood, stucco, or masonry.	NA	
PO15	Do not add porches to the primary façades of structures that never had porches.	NA	

SIDING & TRIM

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SD1	Do not replace missing wood features with conjectural or falsely-historic reconstructions or with newly-designed elements that are incompatible with the building's size, scale, material, or color.	+/-	The historic reveal depth on the front façade was 3-4". The siding is too wide and incompatible with the building's architecture (see conditions of approval). There is no historic Dutch lap on the building, so the addition of Dutch lap vinyl is conjectural.
SD2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	-	This is an after-the-fact application. It was not documented, but images of the property prior to the recent changes exist
SD3	Consider using contemporary wood siding, which conveys the visual appearance of historic siding, when replacement of such materials is required.	-	The applicant replaced the historic wood siding with cementitious siding on the front façade, and Dutch lap

			vinyl siding on the sides and rear. The wood siding was not evaluated for deterioration. None of the siding replacement conveys the visual appearance of the historic siding.
SD4	Do not use textured plywood (T-111) vertical siding. It is not an appropriate substitute material.	NA	
SD5	Do not install artificial stone, asbestos shingles, or asphalt shingles over or as a replacement for exterior siding.	NA	
SD6	Orient all replacement siding horizontally, unless there is sound, historic documentation for a different original orientation.	+	Siding orientation is horizontal
SD7	Do not install vinyl or aluminum siding on primary elevations on historic buildings. Retention of exposed original wood siding is always preferred; however, if a decision is made to apply siding to side and rear elevations, it should be done in a way that does not obscure or damage historic ornament, such as fishscale shingles, window casings, sills, hoods, brackets, and cornerboards.	-	Staff was unable to evaluate the historic wood siding, as it was removed prior to the application being submitted. While vinyl was not applied to the front, the cementitious siding was not installed properly.
SD8	Use only vinyl or aluminum siding that matches the dimensions of the original siding. Generally, smooth-faced, narrow-profile siding (3" or 4" depending on the character of the existing siding) is acceptable for installation on secondary elevations. Wherever possible without causing damage to historic fabric, trim, such as cornerboards, should project slightly beyond the vinyl siding.	+/-	Vinyl siding on the sides and rear is generally the same reveal as the historic wood siding. However, the sides and rear have been replaced with Dutch lap siding, and there is no historic evidence to support this change.
SD9	Make sure that removal, handling, and disposal of lead-containing paint complies with all local, state, and federal standards.	NSI	
SD10	Do not remove exterior siding to install insulation within the exterior walls of historic wood frame construction. This can result in damage to historic fabric. Installation of insulation with a proper vapor barrier should be done from the interior.	NSI	

ROOFING

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
--	-----------	---------	---------

R1	Use only replacement materials that closely match the original roofing material in color, texture, and profile. Possible substitute materials include asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles.	+	The new asphalt shingles generally match what was there previously in terms of material.
R2	Use copper, lead-coated copper, terne-coated stainless steel, or terne metal when replacing a historic metal roof with in-kind materials. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted either muted red or green, traditional roof colors. Replacement with in-kind materials is recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original.	NA	The original metal roof appears to have been replaced sometime post designation with asphalt shingles as seen in PVA photos
R3	Make sure that the proportion of the seams and trim on replacement metal roofing matches that of the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture, because the scale is inappropriate.	NA	
R4	Retain ridge and hip tiles on historic tile roofs. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles, however, should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible.	NA	
R5	Remove existing roofing material when replacing non-repairable or non-historic roofing. Removing these underlying layers will prolong the life of the roof and help restore the original profile of the roof edge.	NSI	
R6	Do not apply asphalt shingles over wood shingles. This will trap moisture and cause deterioration of the roof structure.	NA	
R7	Base the reconstruction of any missing roof feature on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If such evidence is insufficient, the feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely-historical or conjectural reconstruction.	NA	
R8	New roof designs for additions or new construction should be compatible in size, scale, material, and color with the historic building and district.	NA	
R9	Use the form and detailing of severely deteriorated roof features, such as cupolas and dormers, or chimneys, to create appropriate replicas.	+/-	Applicant removed side and rear gabled dormers. However, these were near the rear of the property and not particularly character defining.
R10	Avoid having extensive areas of flashing visible. In some cases, portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco.	NA	

R11	Do not destroy historic detail when installing replacement gutters. If synthetic materials are used, they should be painted to match the trim color.	+/-	Applicant completely removed the box gutters leaving a void between the cornice and the roofline where the new gutters are attached. However, the applicant shall reconstruct the eave to mimic the proportions of the box gutters there previously, extend the roofline over them, and attach the new gutters to them (see conditions of approval).
R12	Half-round replacement gutters that are of a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim, or in limited cases ogee profile gutters, are preferred. Synthetic materials painted to match the trim color are acceptable.	-	In lieu of an eave and box gutters, there are ogee gutters. They are painting to match.
R13	Do not use unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts, which rust and stain adjacent materials. These gutters should be painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy.	NA	Gutters are painted
R14	Leave historically-exposed rafter ends and eaves open and uncovered.	NA	
R15	Make sure that any new roof-top additions do not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	NA	
R16	Install any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment in such a way that historic fabric is not damaged.	NA	
R17	Do not attach antennae, satellite transmitters, skylights, vents, air conditioning units, decks, terraces, dormers, or solar panels that can be seen from a building's primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	NA	
R18	Do not introduce mechanical equipment or systems that may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system.	NA	
R19	Paint all roof vent assemblies to match the color of the roofing material.	+	Generally appear to blend
R20	Do not install ridge vents on historic structures. They are non-historic approaches to attic ventilation.	NA	
R21	Replace historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps on slate roofs with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible.	+/-	Eaves, box gutters, and dormers were all removed. This changes the design of the roof and the house. However, the applicant shall reconstruct the eave to mimic the proportions of the box gutters there previously, extend the roofline over them, and attach the new gutters to them (see conditions of approval).

PAINT

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
P1	Painting masonry or stucco that has never been painted is not recommended. Paint is difficult to remove, accumulated layers will obscure decorative detail, and paint coatings (even "breathable" paints) will affect the wall's vapor transmission performance. The presence of a lead oxide wash does not constitute a precedent for painting a building.	-	Applicant has painted the porch floor and stairs that were previously unpainted.
P2	When removing paint from previously-painted masonry, use gentle treatments that have been previously tested in an inconspicuous location. Do not sandblast or use acid-based cleaners.	NA	
P3	Use a "breathable" masonry paint that is compatible with and can create a strong bond with existing paint, only on previously-painted masonry.	NSI	
P4	If painting previously-painted masonry, select a color that matches the existing color, approximates a natural masonry color as approved, or is recommended by the staff. Staff is available to consult with you on appropriate colors.	+/-	Black is generally not considered to be a masonry color; however, its use in this specific project works to ground the overall building visually.
P5	Have paint samples analyzed when possible. Paint seriation studies can determine historic pigments and appropriate colors for repainting, by analyzing a paint sample under special lighting conditions to ascertain specific color, hue, and value of paint layers.	NA	
P6	Do not expose metal types that require protection from the elements or apply paint or other coatings to metals that were historically meant to be exposed, such as copper, bronze, or stainless steel.	NA	
P7	Paint replacement gutters, downspouts, metal frame screen and storm windows, roof-vent assemblies, and fire escapes to match wall, trim, cornice, or roof color of the house, whichever is most effective in reducing the visibility of these elements.	NA	
P8	Be aware that historic structures often contain hazardous substances, such as lead paint and asbestos. Contact the Board of Health regarding proper methods of removal and disposal.	+	Applicant shall take appropriate precautions.

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	Rear deck is generally in proportion and appropriately scaled.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	Rear deck is generally subordinate in size, and design to the original building.
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	Deck is located on the rear facade
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	The use of wood is generally a subordinate material
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	NA	
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	Orientation of the building is unchanged.
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	NA	
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	NA	
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	

A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	NA	
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	+/-	Deck is located at the rear of the building. See conditions of approval.
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	+	Deck does not extend past the rear corner of the building.
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

DOOR

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	+	Rear door replacement generally is complementary
D2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric	-	This is an after-the-fact application. It was not documented, but images of the property prior to the recent changes exist
D3	Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is	+	Door design is generally compatible.

	compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate.		
D4	Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.	+/-	Previous door appeared to be a replacement door. The original door is unknown.
D5	Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.	NA	
D6	Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.	+	
D7	Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.	NA	
D8	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.	NA	
D9	Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.	+	Rear replacement door generally reads as a rear door based on the design.
D10	Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	
D11	Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	Entrance existed historically
D12	Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended.	+	Generally is complementary

DEMOLITION

Design Guideline Checklist From Economic Hardship Exemption

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Introduction

Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

Demolition by Neglect

The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.	+/-	The rear shed was removed without a COA or site visit. However, based on previous images, it did not appear to be contributing.
DE2	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	NA	
DE3	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	NA	
DE4	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	NA	
DE5	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent with those features on adjacent properties.	NA	
DE6	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	+	Street wall was reestablished with the construction of a new garage in the same location as the previous shed that was removed.

GARAGE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	Located in the rear side yard where a previous shed stood
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	Aligns with the previous location of the shed that was removed and is in line with the privacy fence.
		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	Does enclose side/rear yard
		+	Minimize paving	A small apron was poured without historic concrete mix
Materials	Walls	NA	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	Board and batten siding	
		NA	Brick	
		NA	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		+	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	Vinyl siding is within the 3-4" exposure Dutch lap
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	+	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	Asphalt shingle roof that matches that of the primary structure
		NA	Metal roofing	
		+	Half-round or Ogee gutters	Gutter system is installed
		NA	Approved Gable-end element	
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	Simple rectilinear form
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		+	No overly-elaborate volumes	Simple design
	Roof	+	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	Gable roof
		NA	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		+	Overhanging eaves	Eaves overhang appropriately
		+	Half-round gutters	Aluminum gutters have been installed
		NA	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	
		NA	No flush eaves	Eaves exist
		+	No roofs without gutters	Gutters exist
Openings	Garage	+/-	Single-car openings	Double car garage door used
	Doors	+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	Articulated panels help to break the mass of the double door
		-	No double and triple doors	Double door is used

		+	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	Articulated panels break up the mass of the door
	Windows	+/-	Use window openings to break up wall surface	No windows exist, however this is similar to other garages in the alley
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	NSI	A building permit was not received for this work so it is unknown if it meets applicable regulations
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	+/-	The rear shed was removed without a COA or site visit. However, based on previous images, it did not appear to be contributing.
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	New garage design is in keeping with others along the alley
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	Scale of garage is in keeping with others along the alley
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	The materials and design in general are in keeping with those seen on adjacent garages and the primary structure.
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	The materials in general are in keeping with those seen on adjacent garages and primary structures.
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	The scale of the garage generally reinforces the human scale.

NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	Generally does not disrupt public views as it is located toward the rear side of the property that backs up to the interstate.
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	Generally reinforces existing patterns of open space and enclosure
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	Generally reinforces existing spatial organization patterns
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+	Façade design is similar to others along the alley way
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	Has similar mass in comparison to other garages in the alley way
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+/-	Windows were not used, which is typical along this particular alley way
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+/-	Alley facing garage door is an articulated panel double-car door without windows, similar to others on neighboring structures.
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+/-	The opening generally aligns with where the previous shed opening existed.
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+	Size of garage is typical of other nearby garages
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	NA	

NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	+	Historic streetscape is maintained
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	Historic setback patterns are generally maintained
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+/-	Gabled roof is different than the hipped roof of the primary structure but similar to other garages along the alleyway
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	Generally follows others along the alley
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	NA	
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+/-	Applicant shall make provisions for trash receptacles. See conditions of approval
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+/-	Dutch lap vinyl siding
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	NA	
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+/-	Bare CMU was used. It needs a parge coat. See conditions of approval.

NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+	Generally is complementary
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	Adjacent to alley
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	Alley exists
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+/-	A double door was used, however it is a tight alley, and this is seen on the other neighboring garages
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	+	Roofline is generally in accordance
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	+/-	Roof pitch is appropriate, however its form does not mimic that of the primary structure.
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	Access is off an alley
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NSI	Unknown, constructed without COA and building permits

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable

NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	Privacy fence is generally complementary
		+	Placement of new garage is in the rear side where a previous shed once stood
		+	Rear deck addition generally creates a cohesive connection for the rear of the building and the rear yard.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+/-	Concrete apron at garage door does not appear to be historic concrete mix. See conditions of approval.
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NSI	The apron for the garage is poured concrete that may or may not cover historic limestone curbing.
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	Access to the garage is from the side alley
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	

ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	+	Rear privacy fence is set back a minimum of 2' from the front façade, less than 7' in height, and the finished side faces outward
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	+	The horizontal wood privacy fence is generally appropriate and sets in from retaining wall approximately 1'. The fence needs to be stained or painted.
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	+	Exterior lighting fixtures are simple and generally appropriate, and additional lighting shall be submitted to staff for review.
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	