



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

MEMORANDUM

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
From: Priscilla Bowman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
Date: September 22, 2023 *S.Darr*

Case No: 23-COA-0004
Property Address: 1319 S. Floyd Street

Case History

May 24, 2023: Case 23-COA-0004 was reviewed by the Old Louisville ARC, members present were Doug Wilson, Mary Martin (Chair), Howard Rosenberg, and Robert Kirchdorfer. Priscilla Bowman, Brad Fister, and Iná Nakao, Landmarks staff; Aaron Paull Bell and Chase Brauner, the applicants; and Stan Dzhishkaryani, the previous property owner, were also present. The case was deferred date certain to July 26, 2023 at 4:30pm to allow the current property owners to work with the former owner, and building inspection to see if the after-the-fact changes to the property would meet code, and pass inspection.

July 26, 2023: Old Louisville ARC continued hearing—members present were Mary Martin (Chair), Howard Rosenberg, Jonathan Klunk and Robert Kirchdorfer. Priscilla Bowman, and Brad Fister Landmarks staff; Aaron Paull Bell and Chase Brauner, the applicants; and Jacob Mercier, the owner's broker, were also present. A motion was made to approve the application and to change Staff's recommended conditions of approval to the following:

1. The first-floor front facing replacement windows shall be altered to look like a picture window with a transom above it within 12 months of approval.
2. The applicant shall remove and reside the front facade with a cementitious or wood siding with a 3-4" reveal depth within 12 months of approval.
3. The applicant shall reconstruct the eave to mimic the proportions of the box gutters there previously, extend the roofline over them, and attach the new gutters to them. This shall be done within 12 months of approval.
4. The applicant shall stain or paint all exposed wood on the deck and privacy fencing within 6 months of approval.

5. The CMU garage foundation shall be covered with a parge coat within 6 months of approval.
6. The applicant shall stain the concrete apron within 6 months of approval.
7. The applicant shall obtain after-the-fact building permits for the alterations to the house, deck, and garage.
8. The applicant shall make provisions for screening and storage of trash receptacles.
9. If the design, materials, or scope of the project should change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.
10. The applicant shall contact staff in the future prior to any exterior changes to the property.

August 8, 2023: The applicant emailed staff expressing their difficulties in meeting the COA conditions of approval (specifically related to the cost of box gutter/soffit and siding). Staff explained that any changes to the conditions of approval could not be approved by staff, and that the applicant would need to return to the Old Louisville ARC. The applicant is requesting relief from conditions number 2 and 3 and an amended Certificate of Appropriateness.

Staff Conclusions—Updated

Staff finds the applicants' request for relief from the Old Louisville ARC decision for the soffit/box gutter to be reinstalled on the front facade and the cementitious lap siding on the front façade be reinstalled with a 3-4" reveal depth does not meet the **Roofing** or **Siding & Trim** design guidelines. While the current owners/applicants did not complete this work, they did inherit the violation with their purchase. The alterations that have been made to this house have negatively impacted its historic integrity, and the integrity of the district as a whole. When comparing the current building to the designation photograph, the building is almost unrecognizable. This influenced how the Old Louisville ARC made their decision to grant approval of the majority of the after-the-fact changes made to this property. Staff finds any further deviation from the design guidelines by the ARC in regard to the after-the-fact changes made to the property would only further the loss of integrity to the property and the district as a whole.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the applicants' request for an amended Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

SIDING & TRIM

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SD1	Do not replace missing wood features with conjectural or falsely-historic reconstructions or with newly-designed elements that are incompatible with the building's size, scale, material, or color.	-	The historic reveal depth on the front façade was 3-4". The siding is too wide and incompatible with the building's architecture. The ARC previously approved the Dutch lap siding on the sides and rear of the building.
SD2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	-	This is an after-the-fact application. It was not documented, but images of the property prior to the recent changes exist
SD3	Consider using contemporary wood siding, which conveys the visual appearance of historic siding, when replacement of such materials is required.	-	The applicant replaced the historic wood siding with cementitious siding on the front façade, and Dutch lap vinyl siding on the sides and rear. The wood siding was not evaluated for deterioration. None of the siding replacement conveys the visual appearance of the historic siding.
SD4	Do not use textured plywood (T-111) vertical siding. It is not an appropriate substitute material.	NA	
SD5	Do not install artificial stone, asbestos shingles, or asphalt shingles over or as a replacement for exterior siding.	NA	
SD6	Orient all replacement siding horizontally, unless there is sound, historic documentation for a different original orientation.	+	Siding orientation is horizontal
SD7	Do not install vinyl or aluminum siding on primary elevations on historic buildings. Retention of exposed original wood siding is always preferred; however, if a decision is made to apply siding to side and rear elevations, it should be done in a way that does not obscure or damage historic ornament, such as fishscale shingles, window casings, sills, hoods, brackets, and cornerboards.	-	Staff was unable to evaluate the historic wood siding, as it was removed prior to the application being submitted. While vinyl was not applied to the front, the cementitious siding was not installed properly.

SD8	Use only vinyl or aluminum siding that matches the dimensions of the original siding. Generally, smooth-faced, narrow-profile siding (3" or 4" depending on the character of the existing siding) is acceptable for installation on secondary elevations. Wherever possible without causing damage to historic fabric, trim, such as cornerboards, should project slightly beyond the vinyl siding.	+/-	Vinyl siding on the sides and rear is generally the same reveal as the historic wood siding. However, the sides and rear have been replaced with Dutch lap siding, and there is no historic evidence to support this change.
SD9	Make sure that removal, handling, and disposal of lead-containing paint complies with all local, state, and federal standards.	NSI	
SD10	Do not remove exterior siding to install insulation within the exterior walls of historic wood frame construction. This can result in damage to historic fabric. Installation of insulation with a proper vapor barrier should be done from the interior.	NSI	

ROOFING

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R1	Use only replacement materials that closely match the original roofing material in color, texture, and profile. Possible substitute materials include asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles.	+	The new asphalt shingles generally match what was there previously in terms of material.
R2	Use copper, lead-coated copper, terne-coated stainless steel, or terne metal when replacing a historic metal roof with in-kind materials. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted either muted red or green, traditional roof colors. Replacement with in-kind materials is recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original.	NA	The original metal roof appears to have been replaced sometime post designation with asphalt shingles as seen in PVA photos
R3	Make sure that the proportion of the seams and trim on replacement metal roofing matches that of the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture, because the scale is inappropriate.	NA	

R4	Retain ridge and hip tiles on historic tile roofs. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles, however, should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible.	NA	
R5	Remove existing roofing material when replacing non-repairable or non-historic roofing. Removing these underlying layers will prolong the life of the roof and help restore the original profile of the roof edge.	NSI	
R6	Do not apply asphalt shingles over wood shingles. This will trap moisture and cause deterioration of the roof structure.	NA	
R7	Base the reconstruction of any missing roof feature on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If such evidence is insufficient, the feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely-historical or conjectural reconstruction.	+	There are historic photos on which the box gutter/ soffit on the front façade could be replicated to look like.
R8	New roof designs for additions or new construction should be compatible in size, scale, material, and color with the historic building and district.	NA	
R9	Use the form and detailing of severely deteriorated roof features, such as cupolas and dormers, or chimneys, to create appropriate replicas.	+/-	Applicant removed side and rear gabled dormers. However, these were near the rear of the property and not particularly character defining.
R10	Avoid having extensive areas of flashing visible. In some cases, portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco.	NA	
R11	Do not destroy historic detail when installing replacement gutters. If synthetic materials are used, they should be painted to match the trim color.	-	Applicant completely removed the box gutters leaving a void between the cornice and the roofline where the new gutters are attached. The ARC conditioned approval, on the applicant reconstructing the eave to mimic the proportions of the box gutters there previously, extend the roofline over them, and attach the new gutters to them.
R12	Half-round replacement gutters that are of a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim, or in limited cases ogee profile gutters, are preferred. Synthetic materials painted to match the trim color are acceptable.	-	In lieu of an eave and box gutters, there are ogee gutters. They are painting to match.
R13	Do not use unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts, which rust and stain adjacent materials. These gutters should be painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy.	NA	Gutters are painted
R14	Leave historically-exposed rafter ends and eaves open and uncovered.	NA	
R15	Make sure that any new roof-top additions do not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	NA	
R16	Install any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment in such a way that historic fabric is not damaged.	NA	

R17	Do not attach antennae, satellite transmitters, skylights, vents, air conditioning units, decks, terraces, dormers, or solar panels that can be seen from a building's primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	NA	
R18	Do not introduce mechanical equipment or systems that may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system.	NA	
R19	Paint all roof vent assemblies to match the color of the roofing material.	+	Generally appear to blend
R20	Do not install ridge vents on historic structures. They are non-historic approaches to attic ventilation.	NA	
R21	Replace historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps on slate roofs with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible.	+/-	Eaves, box gutters, and dormers were all removed. This changes the design of the roof and the house. The ARC conditioned approval, on the applicant reconstructing the proportions of the box gutters there previously, extending the roofline over them, and attaching the new gutters to them