



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Staff Report to the Architectural Review Committee

To: Jean Russell
Thru: Bob Keesaer, AIA, NCARB- Supervisor
From: Burcum Keeton, Architectural Projects Coordinator
Date: August 12, 2015

Case No: 15COA1146
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 237 Haldeman Avenue

Applicant: Jean Russell
237 Haldeman Avenue
Louisville, KY 40206
502-608-0407
Jeanrussell5792@yahoo.com

Owner: Same as above

Architect: NA

Estimated Project Cost: \$14,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to build 480SF garage. This garage will be constructed as a post frame building with a metal exterior consisting of vertically oriented corrugated material. The project will include replacement of existing concrete apron. Garage roof to be metal. New structure to measure 20' x 24' and to be located with alley access at the rear of the property.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on July 29, 2015. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee Review on August 10, 2015 with notice mailed not less than seven days before the meeting to the applicant and abutting property owners. Staff Keeton contacted the applicant on August 10th requesting additional information describing the person door, the garage door, and the window(s) to be used.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Garage, New Construction, Site, and Archeology**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R5 zoned house is located on the east side of Haldeman Ave mid-block between Brownsboro Road and Frankfort Avenue. The site is in a Traditional Neighborhood Zoning District and is surrounded by residences of an eclectic mix of architectural styles.

The one and half-story stucco structure features craftsman style characteristics and was recently renovated per 14COA1188 and 14COA1255. A single car garage at the rear of the property was damaged and demolished in 2015.

The applicant was previously approved requests (14COA1188 and 14COA1255) in 2014 to construct a 728 square foot addition that extends from the back of the house and new windows to be added into existing openings.

Conclusions

The project as proposed meets the applicable Clifton Preservation District guidelines **with conditions**.


RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, the Staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed design of the new garage be **approved with following conditions**:


1. New garage walls should be constructed with any of these materials:
 - (1) Horizontal siding to match existing exposure of the primary structure (normally 3" or 4" exposure)
 - (2) board and batten siding
 - (3) brick
 - (4) stucco over frame or concrete block
 - (5) painted concrete block with parged or flush joint finish; T-111, exposed uncoated concrete block, or painted concrete block to not be used unless parged or skim coated first
 - (6) cast stone or molded concrete block
 - (7) Wood, aluminum or vinyl siding, or fiber cement siding or board to match existing exposure of the primary structure.

2. Exterior lighting of garage at alley to be considered.
3. Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.
4. Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
5. Window specifications to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to installation
6. Person door specifications to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to installation
7. Garage door specifications to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to installation
8. Historic concrete mix to be used at apron

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.



Burcum Keeton
Architectural Projects Coordinator



Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist
2. Applicant Submitted Information

Garage

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
G1	Contributing secondary structures should be preserved. However, when demolition is being requested to make way for a new secondary building, then Landmarks staff and/or the ARC will evaluate and review the demolition permit request based on the structure's integrity, historical character and materials, functionality, and security concerns. All structures in the district will be identified as either contributing or non-contributing at the time of application. See the Demolition guidelines for more details.	+/-	Existing garage was damaged and demolished by owner with building inspector's permission in 2015. (email attached)
G2	New garages or other secondary structures should be designed so they complement the scale, mass, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures. They should also be subordinate to the primary structure.	+	
G3	New garages should be sited adjacent to an alley where present. Review the garage prototype illustration that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	
G4	When no alley exists, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Landscape screening is encouraged along the driveway.	NA	
G5	Single garage doors should be used rather than expansive double or triple doors.	+	
G6	The roofline of a new garage should be oriented so it is parallel with the main house or follows the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures when a pattern exists.	+	Gable roof form
G7	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. The roof form of the garage should match the roof form of the main house when it is a character-defining feature.	+	
G8	New garages should be designed so access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	
G9	New garages should be located at the rear of the property, should define and enclose the rear yard, and should be aligned with adjacent secondary structures.	+	
G10	The garage design should be simple and rectangular in shape. Ell-shaped floor plans, slightly-projecting bays, and cantilevered second floors are also permitted.	+	
G11	New garage walls should be constructed with any of these materials (1) Horizontal siding to match existing exposure of the primary structure (normally 3" or 4" exposure), (2) corner boards and trim around openings, (3) board and batten siding, (4) brick, (5) stucco over frame or concrete block, (6) painted concrete block with parged or flush joint finish, (7) cast stone, molded concrete block, or (8) wood, aluminum or vinyl siding, or fiber cement siding or board to match existing exposure of the primary structure. Do not use these materials: T-111, exposed uncoated concrete block, or painted concrete block unless parged or skim coated first.	+/-	There is precedence along this alley of garages with similar metal material.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
G12	Approvable roof designs include simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope), hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets, intersecting gables, overhanging eaves, and gable end-vents. Not approvable are low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope), flush eaves, and roofs without gutters.	+	
G13	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, tile, metal, slate or synthetic shingles are recommended roof materials. Half-round or ogee gutters, gable-end elements, and solar collectors are approvable. Do not use membrane or roll roofing on sloped roofs with 3-in-12 pitch or greater. See Roofing guidelines for additional details.	+	
G14	Single-car garage doors or openings are preferred. Double- or triple-wide doors which convey the appearance of 2 or 3 single doors may be approved. Flush garage doors which accentuate the large size of the opening are prohibited.	+	
G15	Garage window openings should be used that visually break up the wall's surface and may be placed at higher elevations for security. Security grills may be installed on the inside face of the windows.	+	

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	+/-	
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	

NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and alleys of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	NA	
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements. In the Clifton Preservation District, NC11 is subordinate to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, items 3 and 9 (see footnote 1).	NA	
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width). In the Clifton Preservation District, NC12 is subordinate to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, items 3 and 9 (see footnote 1).	+	
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged. In the Clifton Preservation District, NC13 is subordinate to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, items 3 and 9 (see footnote 1).	NSI	
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged. In the Clifton Preservation District, NC14 is subordinate to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, items 3 and 9 (see footnote 1).	NSI	
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street.	NA	
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	NA	
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	

NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	+	
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	NA	
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	-	
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+/-	
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	NA	
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	-	
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	

NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+	
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	+	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+	
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	+	
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	+	
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NSI	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	No new paving proposed
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	+	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	+	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	+	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	No new fencing is proposed
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	

ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design. [Note: The prohibition against chain-link fencing does not apply in the Clifton Preservation District.]	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NSI	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NSI	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NSI	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	

Archaeology

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
 - Does Not Meet Guidelines
 +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

NA Not Applicable
 NSI Not Sufficient

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
AR1	For projects subject to Landmarks review, associated excavations or soil disturbances shall be considered for their effect on archaeological resources. Efforts should be made to either limit disturbances to archaeological resources, or to properly document them.	+	
AR2	Archaeological discoveries such as artifacts, features, and other archaeological deposits should be reported to the Landmarks Commission. Examples include Native American spear points and tools, historic objects, historic trash pits/dumps, privies (outhouse pits), cisterns, wells, and foundations.	+	
AR3	Prior to excavating to replace or repair underground utilities, notify the Landmarks Commission as to when the work will be scheduled.	+	
AR4	A property owner must not willingly destroy or disturb archaeological resources, nor allow artifact collectors, amateur archaeologists, or others to do so.	+	
AR5	In the event that the collection of artifacts through excavation or an archaeological investigation is conducted, the work shall be conducted by a professional archaeologist as defined by the Kentucky Heritage Council.	+	
AR6	All archaeological investigations must have a research design and proposal that are reviewed and approved by Landmarks Commission staff. When qualified personnel are available, the Landmarks Commission may design research and conduct archaeological investigations.	+	
AR7	All archaeological investigations shall be conducted in accordance with the standards for archaeological fieldwork and the Commonwealth of Kentucky's Antiquities Act.	+	
AR8	Property owners who wish to retain ownership of artifacts shall provide sufficient time for the Landmarks Commission to properly document the materials. Artifacts recovered through excavation with the intent to collect artifacts or archaeological investigations should not be sold. It is recommended that artifacts be curated (stored) at an acceptable curation facility (museum).	+	