

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:

Clifton Architectural Review Committee

Thru:

Robert Keesaer, AIA, NCARB- Landmarks Supervisor

From:

Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Specialist

Date:

May 19, 2016

Case No:

16COA1079

Classification:

Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 172 William Street

Applicant:

Jacqueline Longmire

172 William Street Louisville, KY 40206

502-387-8419

iackiesue247@bellsouth.net

Owner:

same as applicant

Architect/Design: N/A

Contractor:

David McGill

502-249-3478

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval the after-the-fact demolition of a rear yard shed. The wooden shed roof structure had no foundation and a dirt floor. The walls were board and batten and the roof was covered with asphalt shingles. The shed was in a severe state of deterioration due to neglect by the previous property owner.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on April 13, 2016 and was originally part of 16COA1078. This portion of the application was separated for committee level review. Staff met with the applicant on April 12, 2016 and helped her through the COA process for a staff level fence case and explained the shed demolition

Case #: 16COA1079-CL

Page 1 of 4

would need committee level review. At the meeting, the applicant was very concerned about her and her pet's safety due to the severe deterioration of the shed, so staff and building inspector David Arnett conducted a site visit on April 25, 2016. Staff then discovered the demolition of the shed. Upon further conversations, it was clear the applicant misunderstood and thought she had approval. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee on May 25, 2016 at 5:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Demolition**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R5A zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the west side of William Street on the third lot north of Embry Avenue. The home is a one-story frame shotgun style home. The surrounding buildings are predominately one to two-story shotgun style homes.

Conclusions

When the application was submitted, the applicant assumed that the project was approved. Due to the communication error, the shed was demolished prior to a review by Landmarks staff and the Clifton ARC. From the photographs submitted by the applicant, the shed was built with no foundation and placed directly on the ground surface, which led to the severe deterioration. The lack of foundation would have made structural repairs extremely difficult. Staff conducted a site visit and saw remnants of the shed structure as well as the exposed ground surface and retaining wall at the alley. It appeared that the shed was bolted to the retaining wall at some point, but the wall was falling toward the alley. This likely affected the structural integrity of the shed as well. At district designation, this building was considered to be contributing; however, this specific shed does not appear on any of the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps. There were a couple previous sheds on the maps, but they were different shapes and in different locations. It is possible that this shed was built a little later to replace an earlier version.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility

Case #: 16COA1079-CL Page 2 of 4 for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

5/19/16	Sovariallas
Date '	Savannah Darr
	Historic Preservation Specialist

Attached Documents / Information

- 1. Staff Guideline Checklist
- 2. Applicant Submitted Information Packet

Demolition

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+ Meets Guidelines

NA

Not Applicable

Does Not Meet Guidelines

NSI

Not Sufficient Information

+/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	The Metro Landmarks Standard Design Guidelines for Economic Hardship Exemption and Guidelines for Demolition also apply to an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition within the Clifton Preservation District, and associated application for an economic hardship exemption, with the following exception: The Standard Design Guidelines for Demolition DE1-DE6		
	are replaced in their entirety with the following:		
DE1	Any structure in part or in whole 50 years old or older within the Clifton boundary should be preserved. The Landmarks staff will evaluate the demolition request. All demolition proposals must include photographic documentation by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained.	+/-	Staff would have recommended demolition but it was gone before determination
DE2	With approval, when demolishing a non-historic structure or addition, the existing non-historic building or addition should not be demolished in a manner that will threaten the structural integrity of any existing historic structure.	NA	
DE3	With approval, when demolishing an addition to an historic structure, be mindful that a wall of the existing structure will be left exposed visually, and to the deteriorating effects of weather. Take steps to insure the structural integrity of this newly exposed wall.	NA	
DE4	With approval, when demolishing an addition to an historic structure, a wall that was once an interior wall may be exposed. Remove the interior finishes and make the wall suitable to be an exterior wall that matches the historic exterior of the structure.	NA	
DE5	With approval, when demolishing an addition to an historic structure, interior openings (such as door openings) will be revealed to the exterior. Retain evidence of exterior door, window openings, or architectural features not incorporated into the interior of the addition. Leave the window or door frame intact. Compatible exterior construction materials should be used.	NA ·	
DE6	The approved removal of a non-historic structure or an addition to an historic structure will create a new land area as a result of their demolition. Take steps to grade and landscape according to the existing topography and	NA	

Case #: 16COA1079-CL

Page 3 of 4

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	landscaping of the historic property and to be consistent with		
	the slope and grade of adjacent properties.		
DE7	The approved removal of an addition to an historic structure	NA	
	may change the look of the street-facing façade of the		
	existing historic structure. Take measures to re-establish the		
	street-facing wall through the use of low fences, walls,		
	and/or vegetation.		
DE8	Where demolition of an historic structure has been	_	Shed already demolished.
	approved, or in the event of an emergency Metro-ordered		
	demolition, documentation of the structure to be demolished]	
	will be required. The staff or ARC may set the degree of		
	documentation required according to several factors:		
	primary vs. secondary structure, historic value, and historic		
	contribution to the Clifton neighborhood. Documentation		
	may be subject to the following requirements:		
	Measured floor plans for the first and each additional		
	story, and drawings of exterior elevations showing		
	views of the front and one side. These drawings shall		
	be drawn at the standard architectural scale of 1/4 or		
	1/8 inch per foot. Measurements should be accurate to		
	the nearest 1/4 inch and should indicate rough		
	openings. Representative examples of original trim and		
	other finish details shall also be measured. Drawing		
	shall be on acid-free paper and indicated original vs.		
	added construction. Additions 50 years old or older		
	shall be shown by dashed lines for exterior walls only. If		
	a primary structure has been approved for demolition,		
	the ARC may require the above. If this is the case, the		
	applicant is advised to hire a professional to fulfill these		
	requirements. If a secondary structure is approved for		
	demolition, the ARC may amend these requirements to		
	require less-stringent documentation (examples:		
	property-owner supplied drawings, drawn by hand). 2. Digital photographs showing: the physical relationship		
	to surrounding resources (streetscape); each façade;		
	typical exterior details (e.g., moldings, brackets, rafter		
	ends, brick patterns); typical interior details (e.g.,		
	door/window surrounds, staircases, mantels); typical		
	construction details where visible; exterior landscape		
	features; and outbuildings. A contact sheet shall be		
	printed from the digital files on archival paper and		
	submitted (along with the digital files on acceptable		1
	electronic media) to the Metro Landmarks Staff. If a		,
	primary structure has been approved for demolition, the		
l	committee may require the above. If this is the case, the		
	applicant is advised to hire a professional to fulfill these		
	requirements. If a secondary structure is approved for		
1	demolition, the ARC may amend these requirements to		.
l	require less-stringent documentation (examples:		
	property-owner generated digital photographs in an		
	acceptable electronic media).		

Case #: 16COA1079-CL Page 4 of 4