



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Staff Report to the Architectural Review Committee

To: Butchertown Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Bob Keesaer, AIA, NCARB, Planning and Design Supervisor *PK*
From: Becky Proctor Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: June 3, 2016

Case No: 16COA1109
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1607 Frankfort Avenue

Applicant: Isaiah Hoagland
HRE, LLC
9103 Kingdom Way
Louisville, KY 40291
502-939-0889
Isaiahhoagland@gmail.com

Owner: Same as above

Designer: Charlie Williams Design
1626 Windsor Place
Louisville, KY 40204

Contractor: TBD

Estimated Project Cost: \$60,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to create a new patio area to the east of the house for entertaining space for the B & B. The patio space will include a wood pergola, a brick paver surface and retaining walls. The new retaining walls are proposed to be historic concrete mix and screened with landscaping, plantings and a trellis wall system to create a green wall. The proposed vines would be Virginia Creeper. The existing railroad tie retaining wall is proposed to be replaced with historic concrete mix and also screened with a trellis wall system covered in vines. The existing stairs next to the parking area and between the proposed new patio will be widened and will also be historic concrete

mix. The applicant also proposes new iron fencing around the perimeter, as well as, the existing car parking area.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on May 13, 2016. The application was considered complete and requiring Committee Review on May 16, 2016.

The case is scheduled for a hearing at the regular meeting of the Butchertown Architectural Review Committee on June 8, 2016, at 6:30 pm, at 444 South 5th Street, Conference Room 302; notice mailed not less than seven days before the meeting to the abutting property owners.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Butchertown Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site zoned R7 is located on the northeast side of Frankfort Avenue in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. It is located on the lot northwest of Blue Horse Avenue. This site is unusual for the general residential area but characteristic of early riverside development. The building is a 2-and-a-half-story residence converted to a bed and breakfast surrounded by other 2-story commercial buildings and 1- to 2-story residences. The house is sited upon a steep hill.

Conclusions

The project generally meets the design guidelines for **Site**. The house sits on top of a steep hill. The hill doesn't allow for comfortable use of the expansive yard. The proposed patio will provide usable flat space for guests. The site changes will have some impact from the front street views but the front yard topography is not being changed. Trees and plantings will have a visual blending effect. The plans do not provide the proposed height of the retaining walls. Staff would like the minimal height for the walls without sacrificing safety. Historic concrete mix is an acceptable material for the retaining walls and the added green wall trellis system will screen the concrete material. Staff has concern that during the winter season the retaining wall will be more visible and suggested a stone veneer for the wall system. There is a demonstrated precedent for front-yard fencing along the main street frontage. The new fencing will complement the existing fencing by extending the fencing along the perimeter to the retaining wall. The new fence by the parking area should meet protective height restrictions. No lighting was proposed with the application. Staff recommends approval with conditions. Trees are noted to be removed. Staff recommends protecting and maintaining existing trees if at all possible.

Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, the Staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. Wrought-iron fencing material is preferred over steel.
2. Fence shall match existing fence height and be painted black.
3. Any proposed lighting shall be reviewed and approved by staff prior to installation.
4. Trees should be protected and maintained where possible. Staff should be notified of tree removal.
5. Any archeological resources shall be reported to Landmarks staff.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

4/3/14

Date



Becky Proctor Gorman
Historic Preservation Specialist

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist
2. Application

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----|---|---------|---|
| ST1 | Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship. | +/- | The site changes will have some impact from the front street views but the front yard topography is not being changed. Trees and plantings will have a blending effect. |
| ST2 | Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns. | NA | |
| ST3 | Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character. | + | Brick paving materials will be used. |

| | | | |
|-------------|--|-----|--|
| ST4 | Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original. | NA | |
| ST5 | Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature. | + | Historic concrete mix will be used. |
| ST6 | Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair. | NA | |
| ST7 | Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred. | NA | |
| ST8 | Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls. | +/- | The proposed new retaining walls are not in the front yard topography, however, they are in the side yard which is visible from the street. |
| ST9 | Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources. | +/- | Any archeological resources shall be reported to Landmarks staff. |
| ST10 | Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists. | +/- | These walls will be used to retain earth and make a usable space by patrons of the B and B. There are existing retaining walls that will be replaced and incorporated into the new design. |
| ST11 | Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate. | +/- | A matching fence is acceptable. |
| ST12 | use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate. | + | Historic concrete mix is proposed with plantings and trellis "green" wall system. |
| ST13 | Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent. | + | There is fencing on the front of the property facing Frankfort Ave. |
| ST14 | Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent. | | |
| ST15 | Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties. | NA | |
| ST16 | Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design. | NA | |
| ST17 | Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point. | NSI | Any proposed exterior lighting shall be approved by staff prior to installation. |
| ST18 | Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties. | NA | |

| | | | |
|-------------|---|-----|--|
| ST19 | Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements. | NA | |
| ST20 | Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired. | NA | |
| ST21 | Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties. | NA | |
| ST22 | Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons. | NSI | |
| ST23 | Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view. | NA | |
| ST24 | Install utility lines underground whenever possible. | NA | |