



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Tami Conti
Thru: Bob Keesaer, AIA, NCARB, Planning and Design Supervisor
From: Bob Keesaer
Date: January 25, 2017

Case No: 17COA1013
Classification: Staff Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 124, 126, and 128 Vernon Avenue

Applicant: Tami Conti
Brown Conti Company LLC.
3936 Dutchmans Lane
Louisville, KY 40207
Ph. 502-548-3339
tambam3369@aol.com

Owner: Same as Applicant

Architect: Scott Kremer
Studio Kremer Architects
3258 Ruckriegel Parkway
Louisville, KY 40299
Ph. 502-499-1100
Scott@studiokremer.com

Attorney: Clifford H. Ashburner
Dinsmore & Shohl, LLP
101 S. Fifth Street, Suite 2500
Louisville, KY 40202
Ph. 502-540-2300
Clifford.Ashburner@Dinsmore.com

Contractor: TBD

Estimated Project Cost: \$450,000.00 +/-

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicants request approval of two items. **Item #1** approval to demolish the existing two story contributing residential duplex structure located at 124 Vernon Avenue. The structure built in the early 1800's was assessed by Steve Leonard, P.E. with the following: soil bearing problems associated with lateral foundation movement, inadequate support beams and steel post requiring replacement, failing 1st floor joists, possible inadequately sized and reinforced footings, undersized 2nd floor joist system, lack of fire blocking throughout the entire structure, and the 2nd floor ceiling joists need to be reattached to rafters to prevent shear failure and possible roof collapse. **Item #2** approval to construct a new 2 story apartment building with a 3 story fall-away located towards the rear of the structure. The 7 unit apartment building features a modern design aesthetic that relates to the surrounding structures in mass and scale as viewed from a public viewpoint along Vernon Ave. The structure is approximately 22'-0" in width by 136'-0" in length, by 25'-0" at the front façade, and approximately 32'-0' +/- in height at the rear of the structure where fall away lot allows for a third floor. The **Front (East) Elevation** sits back 30'-0" from the property line and in line with a majority of the surrounding structures. The 2 story elevation features a single entry door with balcony and door above, double casement windows with transoms located on the first and second floors. The design includes a fiber cement Hardi-Panel veneer and wood siding for the balcony guard wall. The **Right Side (North-Driveway) Elevation** shows the fiber cement Hardi-Panel veneer with wood sided balconies, seven double casement windows and seven single casement windows on all floors above grade. The elevation features an open first floor access area to the stairwell, and shows the side of the asphalt shingled pitch roof, and the side of the rear egress stairs located on the back of the structure. The **Rear (West) Elevation** shows three floors above grade and includes the exterior egress stairs, and decks. The elevation also shows the fiber cement Hardi-Panels system. The **Left Side (South) Elevation** shows the fiber cement Hardi-Panel veneer with wood sided balconies, and 14 double casement window for all three floors above grade. The elevation also includes an open first floor access entry area with access to the stairwell, and shows the side of the asphalt shingled pitch roof, and side of the rear egress stairs located on the back of the structure. The project also includes a "California Drive" with bordering grass pavers that will function as a drive lane running from Vernon Ave. along the north side of the proposed new building and leading to a 14 space surface parking lot behind the building. The parking lot will feature an underground detention basin to capture water run-off and will have a minimal visual impact as viewed from Vernon Avenue. The existing concrete slab locate on the north side of the site is proposed to remain.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on January 20, 2017, and was considered complete and requiring Committee Review on January 25, 2017. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee on February 8, 2017 at 4:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 302.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Demolition, New Construction-Residential, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The existing two story structure is zoned R5B and located on the west side of Vernon Ave. mid-block between Frankfort Ave. and Emerald Ave. and across the street from the Northeast Clifton Campus Church. The property is located within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District and surrounded by one and two story masonry homes, and one story sided shotgun style homes with camel back additions.

The structure was originally built as a two room school house in the 1880's by Clifton's first residents, and closed in 1938. The structure was converted to housing during WWII. According to a Courier-Journal article contractor **Alph C. Kaufman** intended to convert the structure into apartments for war workers in 1944. The structure was approved to be moved 25' from the street in order for it to conform to the city's code and front yard setback requirement.

Conclusions

The project generally meets the design guidelines for **Demolition, New Construction-Residential, and Site**. The existing structure proposed for demolition has lost its historic design integrity through the loss of construction details related to the original structure including: window and door placement locations. The modern design of the proposed apartment structure relates with the scale and massing of the surrounding residential structures along Vernon Ave. The project's design presents a record of current design and materials and methods of construction, and is consistent with the recommendations from the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for modern construction located within an historic context. The proposed design substantially meets the following Design Guidelines for **New-Construction-Residential**: NCR3, NCR4, NCR5, NCR6, NCR7, and NCR10.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. The concrete used for the "California Drive" shall utilize the Historic Concrete mix.
2. A final landscape plan shall be submitted to staff for review and approval before installation.
3. All exposed wood sided balconies shall be painted or have an opaque stain.
4. Details of the trash container installation and screen wall shall be submitted to staff for review and approval.
5. Should the design change, the applicant shall contact staff.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.



Bob Keesaer, AIA, NCARB
Planning and Design Supervisor

1/25/2017

Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist
2. Application

Demolition

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines NA
- Does Not Meet Guidelines NSI Not Sufficient
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	<p>The Metro Landmarks Standard Design Guidelines for Economic Hardship Exemption and Guidelines for Demolition also apply to an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition within the Clifton Preservation District, and associated application for an economic hardship exemption, with the following exception:</p> <p>The Standard Design Guidelines for Demolition DE1-DE6 are replaced in their entirety with the following:</p>		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Any structure in part or in whole 50 years old or older within the Clifton boundary should be preserved. The Landmarks staff will evaluate the demolition request. All demolition proposals must include photographic documentation by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained.	+/-	After Staff evaluation the structure was considered to have lost most of its historic integrity.
DE2	With approval, when demolishing a non-historic structure or addition, the existing non-historic building or addition should not be demolished in a manner that will threaten the structural integrity of any existing historic structure.	NA	
DE3	With approval, when demolishing an addition to an historic structure, be mindful that a wall of the existing structure will be left exposed visually, and to the deteriorating effects of weather. Take steps to insure the structural integrity of this newly exposed wall.	NA	
DE4	With approval, when demolishing an addition to an historic structure, a wall that was once an interior wall may be exposed. Remove the interior finishes and make the wall suitable to be an exterior wall that matches the historic exterior of the structure.	NA	
DE5	With approval, when demolishing an addition to an historic structure, interior openings (such as door openings) will be revealed to the exterior. Retain evidence of exterior door, window openings, or architectural features not incorporated into the interior of the addition. Leave the window or door frame intact. Compatible exterior construction materials should be used.	NA	
DE6	The approved removal of a non-historic structure or an addition to an historic structure will create a new land area as a result of their demolition. Take steps to grade and landscape according to the existing topography and landscaping of the historic property and to be consistent with the slope and grade of adjacent properties.	NA	
DE7	The approved removal of an addition to an historic structure may change the look of the street-facing façade of the existing historic structure. Take measures to re-establish the street-facing wall through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	NA	
DE8	<p>Where demolition of an historic structure has been approved, or in the event of an emergency Metro-ordered demolition, documentation of the structure to be demolished will be required. The staff or ARC may set the degree of documentation required according to several factors: primary vs. secondary structure, historic value, and historic contribution to the Clifton neighborhood. Documentation may be subject to the following requirements:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Measured floor plans for the first and each additional story, and drawings of exterior elevations showing views of the front and one side. These drawings shall be drawn at the standard architectural scale of 1/4 or 1/8 inch per foot. Measurements should be accurate to the nearest 1/4 inch and should indicate rough openings. Representative examples of original trim and other finish details shall also be measured. Drawing shall be on acid-free paper and indicated original vs. added construction. Additions 50 years old or older shall be shown by dashed lines for exterior walls only. If a primary structure has been approved for demolition, the ARC may require the above. If this is the case, the applicant is advised to hire a professional to fulfill these requirements. If a secondary structure is approved for demolition, the ARC may amend these requirements to 	+/-	The structure has lost most of its historic integrity and details. Providing measured "as-built" documentation would not provide an accurate historic record of the original structure. Photographs of all 4 elevations would be sufficient to record and document the building as-is.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	<p>require less-stringent documentation (examples: property-owner supplied drawings, drawn by hand).</p> <p>2. Digital photographs showing: the physical relationship to surrounding resources (streetscape); each façade; typical exterior details (e.g., moldings, brackets, rafter ends, brick patterns); typical interior details (e.g., door/window surrounds, staircases, mantels); typical construction details where visible; exterior landscape features; and outbuildings. A contact sheet shall be printed from the digital files on archival paper and submitted (along with the digital files on acceptable electronic media) to the Metro Landmarks Staff. If a primary structure has been approved for demolition, the committee may require the above. If this is the case, the applicant is advised to hire a professional to fulfill these requirements. If a secondary structure is approved for demolition, the ARC may amend these requirements to require less-stringent documentation (examples: property-owner generated digital photographs in an acceptable electronic media).</p>		

New Construction - Residential

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines NA
 Not Applicable
 - Does Not Meet Guidelines NSI Not Sufficient
 Information
 +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NCR1	New construction designs should conform to all applicable regulations including the Land Development Code, Zoning District Regulations, Building, and Fire and Safety codes, MSD, and any other regulatory agency. All new construction architectural designs will be reviewed by the Clifton ARC.	+	Proposed new construction will be reviewed by the Clifton ARC.
NCR2	No structure should be demolished to make way for new or large-scale construction. All structures in the district will be identified as either contributing or non-contributing at time of application. The Landmarks staff and ARC will evaluate and review all demolition permit requests. See the Demolition guidelines for more details.	+/-	After Staff evaluation the listed contributing structure was considered to have lost most of its historic integrity.
NCR3	Building height, scale, massing, volume, directional emphasis, and setback should reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	The proposed new apartment building provides a massing, volume, and setback along the street wall that relates with the surrounding structures.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NCR4	The scale of new construction should not conflict with the historic character of the district.	+	
NCR5	Building materials and design elements in new construction design should be sympathetic with surrounding historic buildings in the district. Materials should be of a complementary color, size, texture, scale, and level of craftsmanship.	+	The proposed new structure features Hardi-board fiber cement panels which relate well with the scale and texture of the surrounding masonry building. The proposed modern design reflects a current record of construction that follows the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for new construction.
NCR6	Creative design is encouraged. Examples of materials to avoid include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unfinished wood, and asphalt siding. Chain-link fences should not be installed where visually incompatible.	+	
NCR7	New construction design should reflect and reinforce the human scale of the neighborhood, which is a character-defining feature of the preservation district.	+	The proposed design reflects and reinforces the human scale of the neighborhood.
NCR8	Important public views and vistas should not be disrupted by new construction design. See the Cultural Landscape guidelines for more details.	+	
NCR9	Existing spatial patterns created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, should be reinforced in new construction design.	+	
NCR10	The spatial organization established by surrounding buildings should be reinforced in infill construction design. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly designed façades.	+	The new design will mimic the scale of the existing building.
NCR11	The façade's organization should closely relate to surrounding buildings in infill construction design. Cornice lines and columns are other important character-defining façade elements. Imitating an historic style or period of architecture in new construction is not recommended.	+/-	The modern architectural design of the proposed building does not match but complements the surrounding structures.
NCR12	A new building's mass should have a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solid surfaces (walls) to voids (window and door openings).	+	
NCR13	Window patterns should be sympathetic with those of surrounding buildings. Compatible frame dimensions, proportion, panel and light, and muntin configurations are encouraged. Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one half (height) by one (width).	+	
NCR14	Front door design should be sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings in new construction design. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+	
NCR15	The orientation of the main entrance should be the same as the majority of other buildings on the street in new construction design.	+	
NCR16	Paved walks should be installed between public sidewalks and front entrances where this is a character-defining feature on the street.	NA	
NCR17	Handicapped access ramps should be located on secondary elevations (side or rear) wherever possible. If the only option is to install the ramp on the street address façade, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible. Removable or portable ramps may also be used.	NA	
NCR18	Infill construction design should be compatible with the	+	The proposed new two story

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	average height and width of surrounding buildings.		building is compatible with the average height and width of the surrounding buildings.
NCR19	Horizontal elements such as band boards, brick coursing, window sills or lintels in new construction design should be within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the similar height of the horizontal elements is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	
NCR20	The historic rhythm of the streetscape should be maintained.	+	
NCR21	Historic building setback patterns should be maintained. To maintain the continuity of the streetscape, front setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	
NCR22	Roofs of new buildings should relate to neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+/-	The majority of roofs are front gable or hipped. The gable is only visible from the side and not the front elevation.
NCR23	Rooflines for infill construction design should follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+/-	A pitched shingle roof with end parapet walls is proposed.
NCR24	The orientation of the main roof form in new construction design should be parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	
NCR25	The existing cornice line on each block should be emphasized in new construction design where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NCR26	Rooftops should remain uncluttered and mechanical systems should be obscured from public view in new construction design.	+	
NCR27	Trash receptacles should be screened from public view with a four-sided enclosure.	NSI	
NCR28	Exterior sheathing should be compatible with surrounding historic buildings. Painted wood siding or fiber cement board is preferred. Vinyl siding may be used for new construction on streets where the predominant historic construction material is wood. See Siding and Trim guidelines for additional details.	+/-	Fiber cement board panels are proposed.
NCR29	Masonry types and mortars should be compatible with surrounding buildings. Red brick is the most common masonry material found in the district. See Masonry guidelines for additional details.	NA	
NCR30	Stone or cast-stone sills and lintels should be incorporated into new construction design on streets where these elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NCR31	Raised masonry foundations which are compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings should be used. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	NA	
NCR32	New front porches should be built on streets where they are a predominant character-defining feature, and are allowed on other streets, and should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. New columns should consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	+/-	No porch but similar to house located to the north.
NCR33	Porches on newly constructed buildings should be designed so the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below	+/-	No porch but similar to house located to the north.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the façade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.		
NCR34	Storm-water management systems in new construction design and water runoff should not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	An underground detention basin is proposed for the parking lot located behind the new structure.

Site

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Paving materials (concrete, brick, paver stones, cobblestones, asphalt, gravel, stone, permeable or pervious materials) that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character should be used for private sidewalks, drives, and roadways.	+	Grass pavers surrounding the "California Drive" are proposed.
ST2	Historic paving materials for streets, alleys, sidewalks, and curbing (brick, hexagonal pavers, cobblestones, limestone, granite, or natural stone) should be protected, maintained, restored, and reused. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Replacement with historic materials is encouraged. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original. See Masonry M13 guideline for cement mortar mix recipe.	NA	
ST3	Steps on private property made of brick, stone, or poured concrete should be maintained wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST4	Paving companies and utility contractors shall not harm historic resources during road or underground utility repair projects.	NA	
ST5	Driveways, parking areas, and loading docks should be constructed or located to the side and rear of properties. Alley access is preferred.	+	The proposed "California Drive" is located to the north side of the new building.
ST6	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not re-contour front yard berms into stepped terraces. Do not use railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	
ST7	Excavations, trenching or re-grading adjacent to a building or site should be performed cautiously so as not to cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources. Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve architectural resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project.	+	

ST8	Masonry walls in street-visible locations should not be installed unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless an historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST9	Retaining wall and curbing should match the existing character of the original materials when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST10	Fencing should match existing sections of fencing in material, height, design, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST11	Iron fencing should be installed, historically compatible, and of a similar height where there is a demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST12	Front yard fencing should not be installed where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST13	Rear yard or side yard privacy fencing should be installed with the finished side out and a side wall setback from the front of the house of at least two feet. Privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Refer to the Land Development Code or contact the Department of Codes and Regulations regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST14	Chain-link fencing painted black or dark color may be installed in residential front yards or along commercial corridors at the street where there is an historic precedent. Split-rail, woven-wood fencing, opaque fencing, painted or stained pressure-treated wood fencing, or recycled or reclaimed materials may be permitted with appropriate design. Synthetic or composite fencing that is durable may be considered.	NA	
ST15	Exterior lighting fixtures should not be falsely historical. The fixture should be attached to the exterior in a way as to not damage historic fabric.	NA	
ST16	Exterior lighting for parking areas, architectural features, or other site areas should be directed down and away from neighboring properties. Energy-efficient lights should be used to create a soft illumination and to minimize the impact to adjacent properties. Reference the Land Development Code for illumination restrictions.	NSI	
ST17	Parking lot design requires a portion of the parking area to be landscaped or buffered from adjoining properties. Reference the Land Development Code for specifics on parking lot design, maneuvering, landscaping, and buffering requirements.	NSI	
ST18	Auxiliary fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, rain barrels, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, should be located on secondary elevations (side or rear) so they do not detract from the street-address façade and the character of the site.	NA	
ST19	Trees in front yards should be preserved. Established street tree patterns should be enhanced by planting additional trees along the public rights-of-way in the grass area between the street and sidewalk. Consult the city arborist or Frankfort Avenue Street Tree Master Plan to determine tree species that are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review by Landmarks staff unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety concerns.	NA	
ST20	Cellular towers and associated fixtures should be strategically located to minimize the impact on historic view shed(s), screened from public view, and should not damage historic elements when attached to structures.	NA	

ST21	Utility lines should be installed underground whenever possible.	NA	
ST22	The concrete mixture should match the existing or historic concrete mixture when repairing or replacing sidewalks or installing new sidewalks in the public right-of-way. Contact the Landmarks staff for the appropriate mixture and specifications.	NSI	