



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Butchertown Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Joe Haberman, Planning Manager *JH*
From: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: August 17, 2017

Case No: 17COA1173
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1051 E. Main Street

Applicant: Chris Steele
Stock Yards Bank & Trust
P.O. Box 32890
Louisville, KY 40232
502-625-9993
chris.steele@syb.com

Owner: Nancy B. Davis
Bourbon Properties, LLC
P.O. Box 32890
Louisville, KY 40232
502-625-9993
nancy.davis@syb.com

Attorney: Timothy W. Martin
Frost Brown Todd, LLC
400 W. Market Street, Ste. 3200
Louisville, KY 40202
502-568-0274
tmartin@fbtlaw.com

Plan Prepared By: Scott W. Hannah
Heritage Engineering, LLC
101 N. 7th Street
Louisville, KY 40202
502-561-3404
shannah@heritageeng.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$300,000 +/-

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval construct a parking lot on the site of the former Kentuckiana Veterinary Supply Co. building (see **Site Context/ Background**). The new parking area will be accessed from an existing parking lot to the east and will contain 24 spaces. The existing concrete curbing and stairs, which are located north of the public sidewalk along E. Main Street, will remain and be used for a planting area and pedestrian entry to the parking lot. In the planting area, a 3'-0" tall masonry wall will be constructed to screen the parking area per Land Development Code requirements, and two Chinese Elm trees (*Ulmus parviflora*) will be planted. In addition, three proposed Interior Landscape Areas (ILA) will contain American Hornbeam trees (*Carpinus caroliniana*) and other vegetation. Additional landscaping areas will be located along the rear alley with more Chinese Elm trees.

The applicant also seeks approval to construct a one-story, two-car garage off the rear alley. The hip roofed garage will be clad in metal with a metal roof. The two-car garage door will face west. There are no other windows or doors proposed.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on July 21, 2017 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on July 24, 2017. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Butchertown Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on August 23, 2017 at 5:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Butchertown Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Industrial Character and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the north side of E. Main Street, east of the intersection with S. Johnson Street, and is zoned M2 within the Traditional Marketplace Corridor Form District. The site contains the circa 1948 Kentuckiana Veterinary Supply Co. building, which was an Art Deco style block building. According to the Butchertown Preservation District map, the building is considered non-contributing to the Industrial Character area of the District. Per the Design Guidelines, demolition of non-contributing buildings in the Industrial Character area does not require any review by staff or the ARC. Thus, the building will be demolished for the proposed parking lot.

There are no previous COAs for this property.

Conclusions

The proposed parking area and landscaping generally meets the Butchertown design guidelines for **Industrial Character and Site**. The **Industrial Character** design guidelines focus more on new infill building construction rather than the construction of a surface parking lot. Thus, the proposed parking lot does not necessarily meet design guidelines IN5, IN12, IN18, and IN19. Furthermore, the parking lot does not necessarily meet **Site** design guideline ST7. However, most of those guidelines pertain to parking being placed behind buildings out of public sight. Since there will be no building on the site, rear parking requirements are moot. **Industrial Character** design guideline IN12 states, "Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape where it exists." The proposed parking lot does not maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. However, the proposed project still meets the design guidelines overall.

The proposed two-car garage generally meets the Butchertown design guidelines for **Industrial Character**. The building is a simple design that is in keeping with the industrial buildings in the District.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. The existing curbing and stairs shall be kept and utilized. If they have to be repaired, historic concrete mix shall be used.
2. The proposed garage building shall be a medium and/or darker earth tone color to meet Industrial Character design guideline IN6.
3. Outdoor lighting shall adhere to Site design guidelines ST17, ST18, and ST 20.
4. Any trash receptacles in the parking area or near the rear garage shall be screened to meet Industrial Character design guideline IN17.
5. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

8/17/17

Date



Savannah Darr
Historic Preservation Specialist

Industrial Character Area

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
IN1	Structures identified as contributing shall follow the design guidelines adopted for the Residential Character Area.	NA	According to the Butchertown Preservation District Map, the building is non-contributing.
IN2	Make sure that new designs conform to all other applicable regulations including the Jefferson County Land Development Code.	+	This proposed plan will require a Category 2B review for compliance with the Land Development Code.
IN3	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual local landmark designations or National Register nominations.	+	According to the Butchertown Preservation District Map, the building is non-contributing.
IN4	Design construction so that the building height, scale, massing, volume, directional emphasis, and setback reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures and do not conflict with the historic character of the district.	NA	A parking lot is proposed for construction, not an infill building
IN5	Select materials and design elements for construction that are sympathetic with surrounding historic buildings in the district. Materials should be of a complementary color, size, texture, scale and level of craftsmanship. For new construction, use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. When there is no adjacent context, masonry is preferred for facades that are visible from the public right-of-way. Metal and stucco in dark warm tones may also be appropriate alternatives.	+/-	The brick masonry wall is sympathetic with the historic gas station building to the west and the Stock Yards Bank buildings to the south. The metal garage building does not correlate specifically with buildings on that block but is in keeping with the industrial character of the District.
IN6	Medium and darker earth tone colors should be used instead of bright and/or very light colors.	+	The proposed masonry wall will be brick colored. According to the submitted plans, the proposed garage will also be a darker color (see conditions of approval).
IN7	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	

IN8	New industrial buildings should be aligned with the prevailing setbacks of existing buildings in a block.	NA	A parking lot is proposed for construction, not an infill building. The rear garage will be set back from Main Street on the rear alley.
IN9	Plant canopy trees in front of any large-scale new construction to provide a visual sense of consistency along a streetscape.	+	Trees are proposed for landscaping along the public sidewalk and inside the parking area ILAs.
IN10	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings. The rhythm of the façade should also reflect the characteristic rhythm of existing buildings on the street.	NA	A parking lot is proposed for construction, not an infill building. The rear garage will be set back from Main Street on the rear alley.
IN11	Design infill construction so that the organization of the street-facing façade closely relates to any surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, pilasters, and parapets are important character-defining elements.	NA	A parking lot is proposed for construction, not an infill building. The rear garage will be set back from Main Street on the rear alley.
IN12	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape where it exists.	-	The proposed parking lot does not maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The existing building is built to the property line like the adjacent buildings.
IN13	Various roof forms that are found in historic industrial architecture and are compatible for new construction include gables, stepped parapets, low-sloped hipped, and shed forms. Mansard roofs are not compatible.	NA	A parking lot is proposed for construction, not an infill building. The rear garage will be set back from Main Street on the rear alley.
IN14	Freestanding and drive-through canopies should be designed with piers that are proportional to the roof mass.	NA	
IN15	Incorporate mechanical systems into new construction in an organized, planned manner.	NA	
IN16	Shed-roofed canopies at loading docks help reduce the visual impact of overhead doors.	NA	
IN17	Make provisions for screening and storage of trash receptacles when designing new construction.	NSI	Need more information (see conditions of approval)
IN18	Design construction so that access to off-street parking and storage yards is off alleys or secondary streets whenever possible.	+/-	As there will be no main building on site, the parking area cannot be place behind it. The proposed garage will be located off the rear alley.
IN19	Generally speaking, parking and storage lots should be located in the rear. Parking areas shared among groups of business is encouraged. Design required new parking and storage lots in a way that it is as unobtrusive as possible and	+/-	As there will be no main building on site, the parking area cannot be place behind it. Perimeter landscaping and a 3' masonry wall will screen the parking area.

	minimizes the impact on the historic setting. Perimeter landscaping, fencing, colonnades, or other construction shall visually continue the building line along open sidewalks.		
IN20	Galvanized chain link fencing may not be used in the front or street-side yard. Wrought iron, aluminum tube fencing, and masonry walls are preferred. Vinyl-coated chain-link combined with landscaping may be acceptable.	+	The proposed 3' masonry wall will screen the parking area per Land Development Code requirements

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	Asphalt is in use in adjoining lot to the east.
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+	The historic curbing and stairs will be kept and utilized for the new design.
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	+	The historic curbing and stairs will be kept and utilized for the new design.
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+/-	As there will be no main building on site, the parking area cannot be placed behind it. The proposed garage will be located off the rear alley.

ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	The historic curbing that wraps a higher front yard elevation will be kept and utilized.
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	+	The proposed 3' masonry wall will screen the parking area per Land Development Code requirements
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	Screening wall along Main Street is proposed but not any fencing.
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NSI	Need more information (see conditions of approval)
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NSI	Need more information (see conditions of approval)
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	+	This proposed plan will require a Category 2B review for compliance with the Land Development Code.
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NSI	Need more information (see conditions of approval)
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	

ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	+	Additional trees will be planted along E. Main Street near the proposed masonry wall.
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	