



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: West Main Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Joe Haberman- Planning Manager
From: Becky Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: August 18, 2017

Case No: 17COA1189
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 707 West Main Street

Applicant: Tim Fries
CBRE
6060 Dutchmans Lane
Louisville, KY 40205
Ph. 502-412-7655
Tim.fries@cbre.com

Owner: Cynthia Knapek
Leadership Louisville Foundation
732 West Main Street
Louisville, KY 4020
Ph. 502-561-5232
cknapek@leadershiplouisville.org

Architect: Steve Eggers
K.Norman Berry Architects
815 West Market Street
Louisville, KY 40202
Ph. 502-582-2500
seggers@knbarch.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$30,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to replace the existing wood storefront elements on the 1st floor front elevation with milled aluminum storefront material and replace all glazing. The profile is proposed to match the existing with the exception of the horizontal window mullion (previously approved in 17COA1142 based on historic photo documentation). New milled aluminum door units with insulated glass are also proposed.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on August 10, 2017. The application was considered complete and requiring committee level review on August 14, 2017. Staff met with the applicant on site on August 10, 2017.

FINDINGS**Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the West Main Street Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Storefront.** The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

This block of West Main Street, between 7th and 8th Streets, is primarily comprised of 3 and 5 story cast-iron storefront buildings built between 1860's and 1890's and storefronts are identified as character-defining features. The subject structure is a 5 story masonry building with a cast iron first story with a translucent storefront consisting of transoms and large glass windows with wood window trim and wood bulkheads. The upper stories are brick that have been stuccoed and incised to appear like stone. The 2nd and 3rd story windows have straight classical lintels. The 4th and 5th story windows are capped with segmental arched lintels. The cornice features bold brackets and stretches across 711 W. Main unifying the structures as do the matching quoins that are topped with a fleur-de-lis motif. The building is zoned C3, within the Downtown Form District, and is located on the north side of West Main Street adjacent to Fort Nelson Park at the corner of West Main Street and North 7th Street.

Previous cases include work associated with the 1985 complete renovation of the building for the adaptive reuse of living units on the upper floors and retail/commercial on the first floor through the use of Historic Rehabilitation Tax Credits that met the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. In 2006 the restored wood bulkheads were replaced in-kind with wood bulkheads. Most recently, Case #17COA1142 approved the replacement of the existing wood trim on the front elevation of the building with new wood material; installation of new insulated storefront windows with a profile to match the current façade with the exception of deleting the horizontal window mullion, which was identified through historic photo documentation; new entry doors with insulated glass; replacement of the

damaged aluminum storefront material and glass located on the rear elevation of the building with like material; installation of one new exit storefront glass door on the rear façade within the existing window bay as required by code; construction of a canopy for the mechanical unit above the exit door on the east elevation of the building, and a new metal rack to house condensing units located on the rear elevation of the building.

Conclusions

The wood storefront system was restored in 1985 using the Federal Rehabilitation Tax Credits. In 2006, the wood bulkheads were replaced. While the wood of the bulkhead is not historic in age, the material used historically for the bulkheads and storefront systems during circa 1860s construction was wood. The Storefront guidelines SF1, SF2, SF27, and SF28 require that historically accurate materials be used for restoration in order to preserve the historic appearance of historic storefronts. Removal of historic fabric compromises the original character of a building. While the proposed milled aluminum storefront is proposed to closely match the original storefront in form and detailing staff cannot confirm that in implementation. Moreover, staff's interpretation of "historic materials" is the use of in-kind material type not that the existing material is the original material. Milled aluminum would not have been an available material when the building was constructed circa 1860s. The proposed replacement of wood with aluminum does not meet Storefront design guidelines SF1, SF2, SF27, and SF28.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted be denied. However, wood could be used particularly for the bulkheads as based on the previous approval 17COA1142.



Becky Gorman
Historic Preservation Specialist

8/18/2017
Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Design guideline checklists

STOREFRONT

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SF1	Do not remove historic materials from storefronts. Such materials as wood, cast iron, terra cotta, carrara glass, ceramic tile, and brick contribute significantly to a storefront's architectural character.	-	Milled aluminum is proposed to replace wood, which was the original material used during circa 1860s construction. The wood bulkhead contributes significantly to the storefront's architectural character.
SF2	Use historic materials where historic storefronts must be replaced in part or in whole. Cast iron, limestone, or wood are appropriate materials for storefront replacement.	-	Milled aluminum is not a historic material in this context.
SF3	Retain all historic storefront elements, including later alterations that are historic in their own right. An example is a late nineteenth-century storefront with Art Deco features added during the 1930s.	+/-	Only cast iron elements are proposed to remain.
SF4	Respect façade alterations that have attained historic or architectural significance in their own right. Work to incorporate such elements into any new storefront design or renovation. Do not attempt to recreate a conjectural historic design if there is insufficient physical or documentary evidence.	+	Proposed design is based on the current storefront configuration with the exception of the horizontal muntin as previously approved based on historic photo documentation.
SF5	Do not remove later historically-significant material to restore a building to an earlier period. For example, a 1910 storefront should not be taken back to a conjectural 1850s appearance.	NA	
SF6	Maintain the original scale, proportion, and organization of architectural elements (bulkheads, display windows, transoms, door, piers, and cornices) when renovating historic storefronts.	+	The proposed replacement storefront will closely match the existing design and the cast iron columns will remain.
SF7	Use the original form and detailing of a storefront as a model, if extensive deterioration requires complete reconstruction. The reconstruction should convey the same visual appearance and use the same material as the original. Under no circumstances should a historic storefront be removed and not replaced.	+/- NSI	The milled aluminum storefront is proposed to match the original storefront form and detailing. The proposed material is aluminum which is not the same as the original material of wood. Staff cannot confirm accuracy of the form or detailing of milled aluminum storefront.
SF8	Use historic, pictorial, and physical documentation to construct a historic storefront when the original is missing. The design may be an accurate restoration, if sufficient evidence exists, or a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, material, and color of the historic building and district.	+	New window muntins will replicate known photo documents of the structure.
SF9	Keep storefront designs within their original openings. Transitions from one façade to another should be clean and clearly defined.	+	The existing design of the storefront would not be altered.

SF10	Emphasize the transparent character of storefronts when implementing new designs or renovations. Generally, 60 percent of the wall surface at the sidewalk level should be transparent. Historically, merchandise seen in storefront displays was emphasized to a much greater extent than any ornament on the storefront itself.	NA	
SF11	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	
SF12	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	
SF13	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	+	
SF14	Select replacement doors that reflect the storefront's original character. Doors should have large glass panels and be made of wood or painted steel or aluminum. They should not be overly-decorated or possess inappropriate historic features.	+	New replacement storefront doors will reflect the storefront's original character.
SF15	Do not change or reorient the location of the main entrance of a storefront.	+	The main entrance would remain in its current location.
SF16	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
SF17	Install awnings made out of matte-finish weather-proofed fabric or a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
SF18	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
SF19	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
SF20	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present.	NA	
SF21	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7'-6" above the sidewalk.	NA	
SF22	Maintain the commercial character of storefronts, even if they have changed use. Blinds or insulating curtains may be added for privacy and thermal performance.	+	The existing commercial character of the storefront would be maintained.
SF23	Design replacement storefronts that are compatible with and complementary to their historic neighbors, but are recognizable as being of their own era.	+	The proposed storefront would maintain compatibility by visually mimicking the historic look.
SF24	Do not add elements to storefronts that have no historic precedent. Common examples of inappropriate alterations include the installation of coach lanterns, false mansard designs, small-paned windows, and inoperable shutters.	NA	None proposed
SF25	Do not add false fronts, false stories, or pent eaves to the roofs of commercial buildings.	NA	None proposed
SF26	Do not use storefront design elements that are historically inappropriate, such as small-pane windows or colonial doors on late-nineteenth and twentieth-century buildings.	+	The existing design of the storefront would not be altered with the exception of the removal of the horizontal muntin that was previously approved based on historic photo documentation.
SF27	Do not use materials in storefront renovations that were not available at the time of original construction, such as vinyl or aluminum siding, stainless steel, uncoated anodized aluminum, tinted glass, or artificial stone.	-	Milled aluminum would not have been an available material circa 1860s when the building was constructed.
SF28	Use historic materials when replacement of bulkheads is required in part or in whole. Wood or stone panels are most appropriate.	-	Milled aluminum would not have been an available material circa 1860s when the building was constructed.

SF29	Do not use rough-textured wood siding or simulated masonry, such as permastone, on storefronts.	+	
SF30	Use historic materials when cornice replacement is required in part of in whole. Cast iron, wood, or sheet metal area appropriate materials.	NA	
SF31	Do not install inappropriately-scaled signs that obscure or damage surviving storefront features that convey a building's architectural character.	NSI	No signage is proposed at this time.
SF32	Include the following storefront elements when redesigning or renovating a historic storefront: large display windows and doors, transoms, relatively thin framing elements, a cornice element separating the storefront from the upper façade, low bulkheads, and tile entry flooring.	NA	
SF33	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	