



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Certificate of Appropriateness

To: Annie E. Jewell, Jr.
Thru: Joe Haberman, Planning Manager
From: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: October 2, 2017

Case No: 17COA1211
Classification: Staff Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 613 W. Kentucky Street

Applicant: Annie E. Jewell, Jr.
613 W. Kentucky Street
Louisville, KY 40203
502-302-9358
jacjewell@outlook.com

Owner: Annie E. Jewell, Sr.
613 W. Kentucky Street
Louisville, KY 40203
502-408-2671

Estimated Project Cost: \$25,000 +/-

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to the existing side and rear wood windows with new Renewal by Andersen Fibrex windows. Some of the windows are 2/2, 1/1, and 6/6 double hung wood windows. The applicant proposes all windows to be 1/1 double hung Fibrex windows. The applicant also seek approval to replace all entry doors with new ¼ lite fiberglass doors that mimic the appearance of the historic front entry door.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on September 14, 2017 and considered incomplete on September 18, 2017, as there were no photographs. The applicant submitted photographs to staff on September 25, 2017. The five windows on the front façade were removed from the application and added to a new COA application (17COA1224) requiring committee level review on September 29, 2017. Thus, this application was considered complete and requiring staff level review.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Limerick Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Door** and **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the north side of W. Kentucky Street, east of Crystal Alley. It is zoned TNZD within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site contains the two-story frame Folk Victorian style house and is bound by alleys to the north and west, three-story masonry houses that face S. 6th Street on the east, and a parking lot to the south.

There are no previous COAs for this property.

Conclusions

The proposed door replacement generally meets the Limerick design guidelines for **Door**. There are three entry doors on the house: ¼ lite (with 6 lites) historic wood door on the front façade, ¼ crescent lite fiberglass door on the east elevation, and ½ lite (with 9 lites) wood door on the rear elevation. The two wood doors are in a state of severe deterioration. The proposed ¼ lite (with 6 lites) fiberglass replacement door mimics the appearance of the front door and is appropriate for all elevations of the house. The proposed window replacement generally meets the Limerick design guidelines for **Windows** with the exception of design guideline W2. The side and rear windows consist of a mix of 1/1, 2/2, and 6/6 double hung windows. **Where the windows are 1/1 or 2/2, the applicant shall replace them with a 1/1 double hung window. Where the windows are 6/6, the applicant shall replace them with a 6/6 double hung window.**

DECISION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness is **approved with the following conditions:**

1. **Where the windows are 1/1 or 2/2, the applicant shall replace them with a 1/1 double hung window.**
2. **Where the windows are 6/6, the applicant shall replace them with a 6/6 double hung window.**
3. **The replacement window shall fit the historic window openings.**
4. **The new wood trim and window sills shall match the historic trim and sills.**
5. **If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.


Savannah Darr
Historic Preservation Specialist

10/2/17
Date

DOOR

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|----|---|---------|--|
| D1 | Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent. | NA | |
| D2 | Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric | + | |
| D3 | Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate. | NA | |
| D4 | Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original. | + | The new door will mimic the appearance of the historic front entry door. |
| D5 | Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door. | NA | |
| D6 | Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors. | + | |
| D7 | Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door. | NA | |
| D8 | Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended. | NA | |

| | | | |
|------------|--|-----|--|
| D9 | Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame. | NA | |
| D10 | Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade. | NA | |
| D11 | Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way. | NA | |
| D12 | Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended. | +/- | The ¼ crescent lite fiberglass door on the east elevation is inappropriate. The new door is appropriate. |

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----------|--|---------|--|
| W1 | Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original. | + | The existing windows are in a state of severe deterioration. The side and rear windows will be replaced with Fibrex windows. |
| W2 | Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible. | - | The applicant proposed 1/1 double hung windows on all elevations. However, the side and rear windows shall be 6/6 to match the historic windows. |
| W3 | Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair. | NSI | |
| W4 | Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows | + | New windows will match historic windows |
| W5 | Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or lousie windows in exterior window openings. | NA | |
| W6 | Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades. | + | New Fibrex windows on the side and rear elevations |
| W7 | Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements. | + | |

| | | | |
|------------|---|----|--|
| W8 | Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations. | NA | |
| W9 | Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass. | + | |
| W10 | Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way. | + | |
| W11 | Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required. | NA | |
| W12 | Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights. | NA | |
| W13 | Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible. | + | Much of the sills and trim is rotted and will need to be replaced. |
| W14 | Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact. | NA | |
| W15 | Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building. | NA | |
| W16 | Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material. | NA | |
| W17 | Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed. | NA | |
| W18 | Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame. | NA | |
| W19 | Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim. | NA | |
| W20 | Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit. | NA | |
| W21 | Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours. | NA | |
| W22 | Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade. | NA | |

| | | | |
|------------|--|----|--|
| W23 | Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive. | NA | |
| W24 | Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns. | NA | |
| W25 | Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry. | NA | |
| W26 | Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows. | NA | |
| W27 | Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk. | NA | |
| W28 | Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals. | NA | |
| W29 | Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors. | NA | |
| W30 | Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window. | NA | |
| W31 | Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters. | NA | |
| W32 | Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric. | + | |