



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Joe Haberman, Planning Manager *JH*
From: Becky Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: October 19, 2017

Case No: 17COA1198
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1200 S. 1st Street

Applicant: Amine Karaoud
SRK Properties LLC
1200 S. 1st Street
Louisville, KY 40203
502.345.4059
srkpropertiesllc@gmail.com

Owner: same as applicant

Contractor: NSI

Estimated Project Cost: \$1200

Description of proposed exterior alteration

The applicant requests approval for the replacement of a chain-link fence with a recently installed horizontal shadowbox style wooden fence with posts and caps.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on August 28, 2017. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Staff Review on September 5, 2017. Staff met with the applicant on October 12, 2017 to discuss the fence and design guidelines. The applicant requested the case be heard by the committee.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee on October 25, 2016 at 5:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, conference room 302.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/Background

This property is located at the southwest corner of S. 1st Street and W. Oak Street. It is located in a Traditional Neighborhood Zoning District and Form District. The surrounding neighborhood is comprised mostly of late-nineteenth century buildings.

This three-story masonry building is a mixed-use corner commercial building with Queen Anne style architectural features. The storefront has a corner entrance and display and transom windows that face both S. First Street and W. Oak Street. A decorative turret with a conical roof completes the corner on the upper two-stories. Limestone belt courses define the lintels of the second and third story windows that face S. First Street. One-over-one double hung windows are located on the S. First Street elevation and turret, while two-over-two double-hung windows are on the W. Oak Street façade. Architectural ornamentation including a finial, balustrade and concave parapet along with three chimney stacks help to define the roofline.

Previous COAs include case # 10088 in 2007 to replace deteriorated asphalt shingle siding on the third floor with Hardiplank siding. A new commercial range hood was approved in 2004.

The applicant removed an existing chain-link fence and replaced it with a horizontal shadowbox style wooden fence with posts and caps without a Certificate of Appropriateness. The front yard between 1200 S. 1st Street, a corner commercial structure, and 1202 S. 1st Street, a residential structure, has had iron fencing, vertical wood privacy fencing, and chain link fencing.

CONCLUSIONS

The fence that has been installed does not strictly adhere to Site design guidelines ST13, ST14, or ST16. However, there is precedent for fencing in this location including a wrought iron fence, a wood privacy fence and most recently a chain link fence. It is assumed that all of these were installed prior to the designation of the preservation district. Staff is not aware of any approved front yard fencing of this particular style in the Old Louisville Historic Preservation District. Therefore, the Architectural Review Committee should determine if this particular style of fence in this location meets the intent of the guidelines and is considered "appropriate design" as stated in ST16.

Staff recommends a wrought iron fence or aluminum fence of a simple design matching the height of the newly installed fence which would be more appropriate for this location and generally meet the Site design guidelines.

RECOMMENDATIONS

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted be denied.



Becky Gorman
Historic Preservation Specialist

10/20/17

Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Applicant submittal documents

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	NA	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NA	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	

ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	-	New fencing is over 2'-5" in height and is wood not iron fencing. It is replacing a chain link fence that was approximately 7' in height.
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	+/-	There appears to be iron fencing in the circa 1970s photo submitted by the applicant, which would have been typical for the district, as well as a wood privacy fence and chain link fence.
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	-	This fence is visible from the public way. Staff is not aware of any approved front yard fencing of this style in the Old Louisville Historic Preservation District.
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	

