



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*
From: Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: April 6, 2018

Case No: 18COA1032
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1882 Frankfort Avenue

Applicant: Michael Doyle
1882 Frankfort Avenue
Louisville, KY 40206
502-602-1407
mdoyle2@humana.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$41,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to extend the existing second story addition 15'-0" north on to the one-story roof of the house. The new addition will have a 6/12 pitch front gabled roof rather than a hipped roof and the eaves and gutters of the new roofline will match the existing. The entire rear addition will be altered to match the proposed front gabled roof. The proposed addition will be clad in 4" vinyl lap siding to match the existing. The front elevation of the addition will reuse the two 1/1 double hung vinyl windows on the current addition. The side elevations of the addition will each contain one 1/1 double hung vinyl window to match the others.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on February 26, 2018 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on March 5, 2018. The applicant submitted new elevation drawings on March 27, 2018. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on April 11, 2018 at 5:30 pm, at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 302.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Addition**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the south side of Frankfort Avenue at the southwest corner of Frankfort and Haldeman Avenues. It is zoned R6 within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site contains the one-story masonry house with a camelback addition, and is bound by Frankfort Avenue and Kentucky School for the Blind to the north, Haldeman Avenue and a liquor store to the east, a residential structure to the south, and a camelback shotgun house to the west.

In 2006, staff approved a COA (S-06-72-CL) for the construction of a rear deck and stairs. In 2004, the Clifton ARC approved a COA (C-04-80-CL) for the construction of the rear camelback addition after the house sustained fire damage. The addition was proposed with a side gabled roof but the Clifton ARC conditioned the roof to be hipped to complement the house and be more contemporary in design.

Conclusions

The proposed addition generally meets the Clifton design guidelines for **Addition**. While technically not a full-floor addition, the proposed addition will be located 15'-0" on top of the one-story roofline. A good portion of the original roofline at the front of the house will remain giving a visual break from the addition. The existing addition roof is hipped to complement the house, but the proposed roof is front gable. This will be a slightly steeper roofline than the existing. However, it will still complement the hipped roof of the main structure.

The proposed addition does not meet Addition Design Guidelines A4 or A5. Guideline A4 states, "Additions should be attached to side or rear elevations (façades) and should be set back from the street front façade, and should not damage or obscure character-defining features." The proposed addition will be located on the front of the existing addition and will extend closer toward the front façade of the house. However, no character-defining features will be obscured. Guideline A5 states, "The design of the new addition should be subordinate to the original building. Rear and side additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint." The existing addition is not subordinate to the main building and this extension addition is adding to that.

Despite not meeting Addition Design Guidelines A4 or A5, staff recommends approval of the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness. The house has already been altered by the large rear addition constructed in 2004 when a portion of the original house was removed. Furthermore, the fire damage led to

replacement of all of the windows and doors. The house is a circa 1964 infill construction with little to no remaining character-defining features, so there is little historic integrity to impact with this proposed addition.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following condition:**

1. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

4/6/18
Date


Savannah Darr
Planning & Design Coordinator

Addition

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	The design of any new addition or expansion should be compatible and in proportion with the mass and scale of the historic building, adjacent structures, and the district.	+/-	See conclusions
A2	New additions should be designed in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	
A3	Additions should be designed so there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion. Do not duplicate the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition.	+	
A4	Additions should be attached to side or rear elevations (façades) and should be set back from the street front façade, and should not damage or obscure character-defining features.	-	The proposed addition will be located on the front of the existing addition and will extend closer toward the front façade of the house. However, not character-defining features will be obscured.
A5	The design of the new addition should be subordinate to the original building. Rear and	-	The existing addition is not subordinate to the main building

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	side additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.		and this extension addition is adding to that.
A6	The original street front orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade. (The side or the rear of the house should not become the front of the house.)	NA	
A7	The new addition should be designed so the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	NA	
A8	The new addition should be designed with the intent to maintain the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion. The size and placement of doors and windows should be proportional to the number, size, and shape of the new wall elevation as compared to the mass and scale of the historic building. See Door and Entrance and Window guidelines for more details.	+	The new addition will have the same solids and voids as the existing addition.
A9	Full-floor additions on contributing residential structures (adding an additional full floor on top of a house) are not recommended unless the full-floor addition will be compatible with the existing streetscape and adjacent homes and structures and the impact on the character of the historic home is not totally transformed.	+/-	While technically not a full-floor addition, the proposed addition does come close to the front of the house (see conclusions).
A10	Materials should be used that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	Proposed vinyl siding is subordinate to the brick
A11	The original roof pitch, style, shape, and volume should be respected when designing an addition. The roof on the addition should complement the existing roof forms, not overwhelm them.	+/-	The existing addition roof is hipped to complement the house, but the proposed roof is front gable. This will be a slightly steeper roofline than the existing. However, it will still complement the hipped roof of the main structure.
A12	On commercial or institutional structures, the construction of new additions or additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street and should not damage or destroy character-defining features. New additions or additional stories should be set back from the historic wall plane.	NA	
A13	New additions to structures may incorporate contemporary, energy efficient, and sustainable design and materials. However, do not imitate an historic style or period of architecture in new additions, especially for contemporary uses such as drive-in windows or garages.	+	Vinyl siding and vinyl windows are proposed
A14	Sunrooms or screened porches that are compatible with the home may be constructed as a rear or side addition and built with a similar level of quality construction and design.	NA	
A15	Decks may be constructed on the rear or an inconspicuous side of the building. Do not	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	construct a deck on the front façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or stained.		
A16	The rear deck design should not extend beyond the side walls of the house and should not be visible from the front façade or street.	NA	
A17	When adding new exterior steps, stairways, fire escapes, or elevator shafts, do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features. The new addition's construction scale and materials should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A18	Exterior fire escape steps should be installed only on the side or rear façade of the building. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. The fire escape should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street.	NA	
A19	Exterior fire escape steps constructed of wood should be painted or stained, oriented to the yard, and kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

