

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Certificate of Appropriateness Report of the Committee

To: David Coyte

Thru: Clifton Architectural Review Committee

From: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Specialist

Date: February 14, 2018

Case No: 18COA1004

Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 107 N. Jane Street

Applicant: David Coyte

2223 Sycamore Avenue

Louisville, KY 40206 502-632-2545

dvdct2@gmail.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$175,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to demolish the rear camelback addition on the shotgun house. Then the applicant proposes to dig out a 36' x 16' basement in order to repair existing foundation problems caused when a cellar was excavated. The applicant proposes to rebuild a camelback addition on the shotgun house with a 16' x 20' footprint. The addition will have a shed roof clad in classic rib metal roofing, fiber cement lap siding, and synthetic clad wood windows. A second story deck and fire stair will be constructed on the rear elevation of the proposed camelback for egress. The applicant proposes to construct an 18' x 10' screened porch on the south elevation of the shotgun.

The applicant seeks approval to replace the existing vinyl siding on the shotgun with new fiber cement lap siding; replace the existing vinyl windows with new windows; and replace the standing seam metal roof with either new standing seam metal or a classic rib metal roofing. Lastly, the applicant seeks approval to add solar panels to the south facing roof of the shotgun and on the south facing side of the proposed camelback addition.

Case #: 18COA1004-CL Page 1 of 12

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on January 17, 2018 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on January 22, 2018. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on February 14, 2018 at 5:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 101.

The Clifton ARC met on February 14, 2018at 5:52pm in Conference Room 101 at 444 South Fifth Street to discuss the case. Members present were Dave Marchal, Jessica Murphy, Jay Stottman (Chair), and Pam Vetter. Savannah Darr, Landmarks staff, and David Coyte, the applicant, were also present. Ms. Darr presented the case and recommended approval of the project with six conditions listed in the staff report. Mr. Coyte explained the foundation issues with the house and his plan to remedy them. He also further explained the addition construction and his overall plans for the property.

Mr. Stottman opened the meeting to public testimony. Phil Samuel, 3 Angora Court, asked about the front window sizes and their relation to the window brackets. Mr. Coyte said that he would find the historic window opening in the wall and go back to that size and retain the brackets. Mr. Samuel also expressed concern over the solar panels proposed on the south wall of the new addition. He did not feel they were appropriate. With no further comment, Mr. Stottman closed the public testimony.

Ms. Vetter made a motion to approve the demolition of the rear chimney, rear camelback addition, and rear one-story addition so that they can be replaced with new construction. Mr. Marchal seconded the motion and suggested adding a condition that the shotgun portion of the house remain and be protected from demolition and construction activities (see condition 1 under **DECISION**). Ms. Vetter accepted the amendment to her motion. With no further comment, Mr. Stottman asked for a vote. The motion carried unanimously with four ayes (Marchal, Murphy, Stottman, and Vetter).

Ms. Murphy expressed concerns that the submitted drawings were not detailed enough and she would like future review, either by staff or the ARC, to ensure that the work meets the design guidelines. The ARC members discussed the proposed solar panels at length. Mr. Coyte explained that the south roof of the shotgun would have panels after the front 7' to the camelback addition. He would also have panels on the proposed side screened porch and the roof of the camelback addition. He explained that the proposed panels on the south wall of the new addition were actually for solar water heaters. The ARC members commended Mr. Coyte's use of solar panels but did not feel that the panels on the side wall were appropriate at this time. They recommended that if Mr. Coyte required those three panels that he come back with clearer information and drawings.

Ms. Vetter made a motion to approve the staff report with the exception of the solar panels proposed on the south wall of the new addition and with one new condition (see condition 2 under **DECISION**). Ms. Vetter stated that the ARC members did not believe that the solar panels proposed on the south wall of the

new addition were appropriate at this time. Ms. Murphy seconded the motion. With no further comment, Mr. Stottman asked for a vote. The motion carried unanimously with four ayes (Marchal, Murphy, Stottman, and Vetter). The meeting was adjourned at 6:35pm.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Demolition, Addition, Roofing, Windows, Siding & Trim, and Archaeology**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the east side of N. Jane Street three lots north of the train tracks. It is zoned R5 within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site contains the one-story shotgun house with a camelback addition, and is bound by an alley to the east, similar houses to the north and south, and N. Jane Street to the west.

Conclusions

The proposed addition demolition and new construction generally meets the Clifton design guidelines for **Demolition** and **Addition**. The existing addition and other repairs are causing foundation issues in the house. The demolition and basement excavation will remedy these issues. The new camelback addition is appropriate for the historic shotgun house. The proposed screed porch is also an appropriate addition to the house and will be set back from the street.

The proposed siding, window, and roofing replacement on the historic shotgun generally meet the Clifton design guidelines for **Roofing**, **Windows**, and **Siding** & **Trim**. The shotgun house currently has vinyl siding and replacement vinyl windows that do not appear to be historically accurate in size. The new windows can fit those newer openings or be more accurate in size as it is a preexisting condition. The house currently has a standing seam metal roof that is not in great condition. The new roofing will either be standing seam metal or a classic rib metal. Both of these options replicate the appearance of the historic roofing and are appropriate for the house. Furthermore, the proposed solar panels will be on the side, south facing elevation and not visible from the primary façade. They will be visible from street if standing at an angle, but this is still appropriate for the house.

DECISION

Considering the information furnished, the Committee **approved** the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

Case #: 18COA1004-CL Page 3 of 12 1. The shotgun portion of the house shall remain and be protected during the demolition and construction of the rear addition.

2. The applicant and/or his representative shall submit details to staff for review and approval for the following items: windows, rear deck/stairs, screened porch, front façade, and fence.

3. The proportion and spacing of the metal roofing seams/ribs and trim should match the original.

4. The new windows shall fit the existing window openings or fit new openings that are more historically accurate.

5. The new fiber cement lap siding shall be smooth faced and have a

3"-4" exposure.

6. The applicant and/or their representative shall inform Landmarks staff of the basement excavation schedule.

- 7. Archaeological discoveries such as artifacts, features, and other archaeological deposits should be reported to the Landmarks Commission.
- 8. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

Demolition

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

Meets Guidelines

Does Not Meet Guidelines

+/-Meets Guidelines with Conditions NA Not Applicable

NSI Not Sufficient Information

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----|--|---------|---|
| | The Metro Landmarks Standard Design Guidelines for Economic Hardship Exemption and Guidelines for Demolition also apply to an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition within the Clifton Preservation District, and associated application for an economic hardship exemption, with the following exception: | 3 | Johnnone |
| | The Standard Design Guidelines for Demolition DE1-DE6 are replaced in their entirety with the following: | | |
| DE1 | Any structure in part or in whole 50 years old or older within the Clifton boundary should be preserved. The Landmarks staff will evaluate the demolition request. All demolition proposals must include photographic documentation by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained. | + | Demolition of an addition proposed—not the main structure |
| DE2 | With approval, when demolishing a non-historic structure or addition, the existing non-historic building or addition should not | + | |

Case #: 18GOA1004-CL Page 4 of 12

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----|---|---------|--------------------------|
| | be demolished in a manner that will threaten the structural | | |
| DE3 | integrity of any existing historic structure. With approval, when demolishing an addition to an historic | | |
| | structure, be mindful that a wall of the existing structure will be left | + | |
| | exposed visually, and to the deteriorating effects of weather. Take | | |
| | steps to insure the structural integrity of this newly exposed wall. | | |
| DE4 | With approval, when demolishing an addition to an historic | + | |
| | structure, a wall that was once an interior wall may be exposed | - | |
| | Remove the interior finishes and make the wall suitable to be an |] | |
| | exterior wall that matches the historic exterior of the structure | | |
| DE5 | With approval, when demolishing an addition to an historic | NA | New addition will be |
| | structure, interior openings (such as door openings) will be | | constructed in its place |
| | revealed to the exterior. Retain evidence of exterior door, window | | conditacted in its place |
| | openings, or architectural features not incorporated into the | | |
| | interior of the addition. Leave the window or door frame intact. | | |
| E6 | Compatible exterior construction materials should be used. | | |
| | The approved removal of a non-historic structure or an addition to an historic structure will create a new land area as a result of their | NA | New addition will be |
| | demolition. Take steps to grade and landscape according to the | | constructed in its place |
| | existing topography and landscaping of the historic property and | | • |
| _ | to be consistent with the slope and grade of adjacent properties. | İ | |
| E7 | The approved removal of an addition to an historic structure may | NA | May addition with |
| | change the look of the street-facing facade of the existing historic | INA | New addition will be |
| | structure. Take measures to re-establish the street-facing wall | | constructed in its place |
| | through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation | | |
| E8 | Where demolition of an historic structure has been approved or in | NA | Demolition of an |
| | the event of an emergency Metro-ordered demolition |] | addition proposed—not |
| | documentation of the structure to be demolished will be required. | Î | the main structure |
| | The staff or ARC may set the degree of documentation required | ł | the main structure |
| | according to several factors: primary vs. secondary structure, historic value, and historic contribution to the Clifton | | |
| | neighborhood. Documentation may be subject to the following | | |
| | requirements: | | |
| | Measured floor plans for the first and each additional story, | | |
| | and drawings of exterior elevations showing views of the front | | |
| | and one side. These drawings shall be drawn at the standard | | |
| | architectural scale of 1/4 or 1/8 inch per foot. Measurements | | |
| | should be accurate to the nearest 1/4 inch and should | J | |
| | indicate rough openings. Representative examples of original | | |
| | trim and other finish details shall also be measured. Drawing | | |
| l | shall be on acid-free paper and indicated original vs. added |] | |
| | construction. Additions 50 years old or older shall be shown | [| |
| | by dashed lines for exterior walls only. If a primary structure has been approved for demolition, the ARC may require the | 1 | |
| | above. If this is the case, the applicant is advised to hire a | | |
| | professional to fulfill these requirements. If a secondary | | |
| | structure is approved for demolition, the ARC may amend | | |
| ľ | these requirements to require less-stringent documentation | | |
| | (examples: property-owner supplied drawings, drawn by | | |
| | hand). | | |
| Ì | 2. Digital photographs showing: the physical relationship to | | |
| | surrounding resources (streetscape); each facade: typical | [| |
| | exterior details (e.g., moldings, brackets, rafter ends, brick | | |
| ı | patterns); typical interior details (e.g., door/window | | |
| | surrounds, staircases, mantels); typical construction details | ĺ | |
| ı | where visible; exterior landscape features; and outbuildings. | } | |
| | A contact sheet shall be printed from the digital files on archival paper and submitted (along with the digital files on | | |
| 1 | archival paper and submitted (along with the digital files on acceptable electronic media) to the Metro Landmarks Staff. | [- | |
| | If a primary structure has been approved for demolition, the | | |
| | committee may require the above. If this is the case, the | | |
| | applicant is advised to hire a professional to fulfill these | | |
| | requirements. If a secondary structure is approved for | | |
| | demolition, the ARC may amend these requirements to | | |
| - 1 | require less-stringent documentation (examples: property- | | |

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|---------|--|---------|---------|
| | owner generated digital photographs in an acceptable | | |
| <u></u> | electronic media). | | |

Addition

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

Meets Guidelines

Does Not Meet Guidelines

NA

NSI

Not Applicable Not Sufficient Information

| +/- | Meets | Guidelines | with | Conditions |
|-----|-------|------------|------|------------|
|-----|-------|------------|------|------------|

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----|--|--------------|-----------------------------------|
| A1 | The design of any new addition or expansion should be | + | New addition will resemble the |
| | compatible and in proportion with the mass and scale of | | addition proposed for demolition. |
| | the historic building, adjacent structures, and the district. | | addition proposed for demolition. |
| A2 | New additions should be designed in a manner that makes | + | The new addition has a different |
| | clear what is historic and what is new. Do not design | | roof form and configuration from |
| | additions to appear older than the original building. | | the historic sheets up |
| A3 | Additions should be designed so there are subtle | + | the historic shotgun. |
| | distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion | + | The new addition has a different |
| | and the new alteration. This may include simplifying | | roof form and configuration from |
| | details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion. | | the historic shotgun. |
| | Do not duplicate the exact form, material, style, and | | |
| | detailing of the historic building in the new addition. | | |
| A4 | Additions should be attached to side or rear elevations | <u> </u> | |
| | (façades) and should be set back from the street front | + | Attached to the rear elevation |
| | façade, and should not damage or obscure character- | | |
| | defining features. | | |
| A5 | The design of the new addition should be subordinate to | | |
| 7.0 | the original building. Rear and side additions should not | + | Camelback addition proposed to |
| | exceed half of the original building's total floor area or | | resemble the addition proposed |
| | building footprint. | | for demolition. |
| A6 | The original street front orientation of a building should not | | |
| | be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition | + | |
| | should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade. | | |
| | (The side or the rear of the house should not become the | | |
| | front of the house.) | Ì | |
| A7 | The new addition should be designed so the first-floor | + | |
| | height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. | T | |
| | The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 | | |
| | percent less than the original building. In no case should | | |
| | the floor heights exceed those of the original building. | | |
| A8 | The new addition should be designed with the intent to | + | |
| | maintain the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to | | |
| | voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion. | | |
| | The size and placement of doors and windows should be | | |
| | proportional to the number, size, and shape of the new wall | | |
| | elevation as compared to the mass and scale of the | | |
| | historic building. See Door and Entrance and Window | | |
| | guidelines for more details. | | |
| A9 | Full-floor additions on contributing residential structures | NA | |
| | (adding an additional full floor on top of a house) are not | ' ' ' | |
| | recommended unless the full-floor addition will be | | |
| | compatible with the existing streetscape and adjacent | | |
| | homes and structures and the impact on the character of | | |
| | the historic home is not totally transformed. | | |
| A10 | Materials should be used that are the same as or | + | Same materials |
| | subordinate to the primary material of the original building. | • | Jame materials |
| | Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are | | |
| | subordinate to stone. | | |
| A11 | The original roof pitch, style, shape, and volume should be | + | The compliant of the many |
| | respected when designing an addition. The roof on the | T | The camelback addition will |
| | | | have a shed roof |

Case #: 18COA1004-CL Page 6 of 12

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----|--|---------|--|
| | addition should complement the existing roof forms, not overwhelm them. | | |
| A12 | On commercial or institutional structures, the construction of new additions or additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street and should not damage or destroy character-defining features. New additions or additional stories should be set back from the historic wall plane. | NA | |
| A13 | New additions to structures may incorporate contemporary, energy efficient, and sustainable design and materials. However, do not imitate an historic style or period of architecture in new additions, especially for contemporary uses such as drive-in windows or garages. | + | Solar panels are proposed for the south facing side of the rear addition. |
| A14 | Sunrooms or screened porches that are compatible with the home may be constructed as a rear or side addition and built with a similar level of quality construction and design. | + | Screened porch is proposed for the south elevation of the shotgun |
| A15 | Decks may be constructed on the rear or an inconspicuous side of the building. Do not construct a deck on the front façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or stained. | + | Rear second story deck and fire stairs are proposed for the rear of the camelback addition |
| A16 | The rear deck design should not extend beyond the side walls of the house and should not be visible from the front façade or street. | + | |
| A17 | When adding new exterior steps, stairways, fire escapes, or elevator shafts, do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features. The new addition's construction scale and materials should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure. | + | |
| A18 | Exterior fire escape steps should be installed only on the side or rear façade of the building. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. The fire escape should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street. | + | Fire stairs are proposed for the rear of the camelback addition |
| A19 | Exterior fire escape steps constructed of wood should be painted or stained, oriented to the yard, and kept to a minimum functional size. | + | |

Roofing
Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

Meets Guidelines

Does Not Meet Guidelines

+/-Meets Guidelines with Conditions NA

Not Applicable Not Sufficient Information NSI

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|----|--|---------|--|
| R1 | Replacement roofing materials should closely match the original roofing material in texture and profile. Some substitute materials including asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles may be considered. Contact the Landmarks staff for any new emerging roof technologies. | +/- | The shotgun portion of the house has standing seam metal roofing. The replacement will be either new standing seam metal roofing or classic rib metal roofing. |
| R2 | Metal roofing materials like lead-coated copper, terne-coated steel, and aluminum/zinc-coated steel can successfully replace tin, terne plate, zinc, or lead. Copper-coated steel is a less expensive (and less durable) substitute for sheet copper. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted a traditional roof color. Repair and replacement with in-kind materials is recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original. Contact | + | |

Case #: 18COA1004-CL Page 7 of 12

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----|--|---------|---------|
| | the Landmarks staff for any new emerging metal roof technologies. | | |
| R3 | When replacing metal roofing on residential roofs, the proportion and spacing of the seams and trim should match the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture because the scale is inappropriate. | + | |
| R4 | On historic terra cotta clay tile roofs, ridge and hip tiles should be retained. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible. | NA | |
| R5 | On slate roofs, historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps, should be replaced with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible. | NA | |
| R6 | The reconstruction of any missing roof feature should be based on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If the evidence is insufficient, the roof feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely historical or conjectural reconstruction. | NA | |
| R7 | On additions or new construction, new roof designs should be similar or compatible with the shape, size, scale, and materials of the historic building and other buildings within the district. | NA | |
| R8 | For major decaying or deteriorated roof features – like cupolas, dormers, or chimneys – the form and detailing of the features should be used to create appropriate replicas. Smaller irreparable historic roof details – such as decorative cresting, finials, or metal roof caps for slate roofs – should be replaced with in-kind or visually compatible materials. | NA | |
| R9 | Extensive areas of flashing should not be visible and should be avoided. Portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco. | NA | |
| R10 | When installing replacement gutters, do not destroy the historic roof detail. | NA | 1991 |
| R11 | When replacing gutters, use half-round replacement gutters or ogee profile gutters that have a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim. When it is not possible to repair or replace the original box gutters, the box gutters should be roofed over and the replacement gutters attached. | NA | |
| R12 | Unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts are not preferred as they will rust and stain adjacent materials. Galvanized gutters should be appropriately primed and painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy. | NA | |
| R13 | Historically exposed rafter ends and eaves should remain and be preserved. | NA | |
| R14 | New roof-top additions should not compromise the structural integrity of the building. | NA | |
| R15 | Any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment should be installed in a manner as to not damage the historic elements or fabric; examples include: cupola, weathervane, and chimney. | NA | |
| R16 | Mechanical equipment or systems (examples: HVAC or water) should not be installed on roofs where they may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system. Additional support systems may need | NA | |

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----|--|---------|--|
| | to be constructed to support the additional weight load. | | |
| R17 | Antennae, satellite dishes, skylights, vents, roof-top mechanical units, decks, terraces, dormers, or high-profile solar panels should not be installed where they can be seen from a building's street address façade or primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible. | + | The proposed solar panels will be on the south facing roof of the shotgun, which will not be visible from the primary elevation. Solar panels are also proposed for the south facing wall of the rear camelback addition, which is set back from the street and not highly visible from the primary elevation. |

Windows

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

Meets Guidelines

Does Not Meet Guidelines

+/-Meets Guidelines with Conditions NA

Not Applicable Not Sufficient Information NSI

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|----|---|---------|--|
| W1 | The maintenance and repair of historic windows are essential to preserving the historic character and fabric of Clifton structures and the overall Clifton historic district. For that reason, historic windows on street-address façades and street-facing façades shall not be replaced with new windows unless the Clifton ARC determines that the condition of existing windows, safety or energy efficiency considerations, or other relevant factors support window replacement. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows. | NA | Already has replacement vinyl windows |
| W2 | If historic windows on façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades are replaced, or the owner is authorized to replace windows on street-address façade or street-facing façade pursuant to W1, the new windows shall convey the same visual appearance as the historic windows. The visual appearance of a window is based on details such as sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and other decorative features. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of wood, metal, or synthetic window systems for authorized window replacement is permissible. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows. | NA | Already has replacement vinyl windows |
| W3 | Replacement sash should not be used that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows. | +/- | The existing windows are clearly not a historically accurate size. The new windows can be the same or they can be more |

Case #: 18COA1004-CL Page 9 of 12

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-------|--|--------------|--|
| | | | appropriate. |
| W4 | Replacement windows proposed for façades other than | + | Double hung windows being |
| | street-address façades or street-facing façades, and those | | replaced with double hung |
| | authorized pursuant to W1 for street-address façades and | | windows |
| | street-facing façades, shall operate in the same way as the | | |
| | original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with | | |
| | double hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements. | | |
| W5 | Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance | NA | N |
| | with W2 shall have such muntins permanently applied and | INA | No muntins |
| | may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass | | |
| | panes. | | |
| W6 | Reflective or insulating film shall not be applied to window | + | 3.7 |
| | glass on street-address façades or street-facing façades. | | |
| W7 | Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass shall not be used on | + | |
| | windows on street-address façades or street-facing façades. | | |
| W8 | Transoms or sidelights shall not be blocked-in or back- | NA | |
| | painted. | | |
| W9 | The number, size, location, or shape of original windows | NA | |
| | shall not be altered on street-address façades or street- | | |
| | facing façades by making new window openings or | | |
| | permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no | | |
| | longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters | | |
| | exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact. | | |
| W10 | Any new window openings for a new use shall not be | NA | |
| | located on street-address façades or street-facing façades. | NA | |
| W11 | The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered | | 13.64 |
| | with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side | | |
| | of historic window trim. | | |
| W12 | New floors or dropped ceilings shall not be installed that | NA | |
| | block the glazed area of windows. If such an approach is | | |
| | required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow | | |
| | the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed. | | |
| W13 | If exterior storm windows are installed they should duplicate | NA | |
| 1877 | the shape of the original window. | | |
| W14 | When installing exterior storm windows or screens do not | NA | |
| W15 | damage or obscure historic windows or frames. | . | |
| W 15 | Window sashes shall not be altered to accommodate | NA | |
| W16 | window air-conditioning units. When installing security bars do not obscure the | NIA | |
| ** | architectural character of original windows or damage | NA | |
| | historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out | | |
| | of sight during business hours. | | |
| W17 | Awnings shall be designed to complement existing | NA | William Control of the Control of th |
| | architectural features. They should not overwhelm the | ''' | |
| | façade. | | |
| W18 | Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the | NA | |
| | building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be | | |
| | considered if compatible with the design and character of | | |
| 14/46 | the building. | | |
| W19 | Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the | NA | |
| | building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required | | |
| | for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar | | |
| W20 | joints, not masonry units. On commercial buildings attach awnings between the | L | |
| **** | window display area and the signboard or second-floor | NA | |
| | window display area and the signboard or second-noor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom | | |
| | line where historic prism glass is present and building scale | | |
| | allows. | | |
| W21 | Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower | NA | |
| • | than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works). | 11/4 | |
| W22 | Replacement shutters should match the visual appearance, | NA | 191. 191 |
| | size, and location of the originals and may be constructed of | | |

Case #: 18COA1004-CL Page 10 of 12

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----|---|---------|---------|
| | wood, metal, or synthetic material. | | |
| W23 | Shutters shall be installed only where there is historic evidence for them. | NA | |

Siding and Trim Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

Meets Guidelines

NA

Does Not Meet Guidelines

Not Applicable Not Sufficient Information NSI

+/-Meets Guidelines with Conditions

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----|---|---------|---|
| SD1 | Missing wood features should not be replaced with conjectural or falsely historic reconstructions or with newly designed elements that are incompatible with the building's size, scale, or materials. | NA | |
| SD2 | Architectural features that are proposed for reconstruction or replacement must be photographically documented by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks for approval of any exterior modification. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained. | + | |
| SD3 | Contemporary wood siding or fiber cement board, which conveys the visual appearance of historic siding, should be used when replacing sections of deteriorated wood. Other materials which expand and contract like wood may be used when approved by staff or ARC review. | + | New fiber cement siding proposed to replace existing vinyl siding |
| SD4 | Structurally inappropriate materials such as textured plywood (e.g., T-111) or similar soft wood products that shed water poorly should not be used on primary structures. Architecturally and historically inappropriate materials should not repair, replace, or be placed over historic wood siding. | NA | |
| SD5 | Exterior veneers shall not be installed over wood siding or as a replacement for exterior siding. Some examples of historically inappropriate exterior veneers not to be used are artificial stone or other masonry, EIFS (synthetic stucco), asbestos shingles, or asphalt shingles. | NA | |
| SD6 | Replace or repair damaged or deteriorated wood siding with wood or wood-like materials. Undamaged, intact historic wood siding should be preserved and not removed and/or replaced. | NA | |
| SD7 | Replacement siding should be installed horizontally unless there is valid historic documentation for a different original orientation. | + | |
| SD8 | Retaining and preserving the original wood siding and trim with paint is encouraged, especially on the street-address façade. The application of fiber cement board matching the original existing exposure is preferred over vinyl or aluminum siding and may be approved by staff without ARC review. Vinyl or aluminum siding may be applied to street address façades, side, and rear elevations with ARC approval. The installation of any type of siding should not obscure or damage historic ornamental details such as fish-scale shingles, moldings, window casings, sills, hoods, brackets, and corner boards. Do not install siding of any type over rotten wood. Do not wrap windows and trim with metal. If applied, remove insul-brick material and apply house wrap before applying siding. | NA | There is already vinyl siding on the house |
| SD9 | Fiber cement, vinyl or aluminum siding should match the profile and dimensions of the original wood siding. A smooth-faced, narrow profile siding (3" or 4" reveal) is acceptable for installation. Historic fabric, trim, or corner boards should | + | See conditions of approval |

Case #: 18COA1004-CL Page 11 of 12

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|------|---|---------|---------|
| | project slightly beyond the vinyl siding, wherever possible without causing damage. | , | Comment |
| SD10 | Paints and coatings manufactured before 1978 contained lead. Historic structures often contain hazardous substances, such as lead paint and asbestos. Since June, 2010, the EPA regulations require contractors to be certified and follow specific work practices to prevent lead contamination. For additional lead paint information, contact the Metro Health Department. For asbestos removal and disposal methods, contact Metro Air Pollution Control. | + | |
| SD11 | Installation of insulation with a proper vapor barrier should be done from the interior. Do not remove exterior siding to install insulation within the exterior walls of historic wood frame construction. This can result in damage to historic fabric by locking in mold and moisture and will rot wood from within. Houses need to be breathable. | + | |

Archaeology Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

Meets Guidelines

Does Not Meet Guidelines

+/-Meets Guidelines with Conditions NA

Not Applicable Not Sufficient Information NSI

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----|---|---------|----------------------------|
| AR1 | For projects subject to Landmarks review, associated excavations or soil disturbances shall be considered for their effect on archaeological resources. Efforts should be made to either limit disturbances to archaeological resources, or to properly document them. | + | See conditions of approval |
| AR2 | Archaeological discoveries such as artifacts, features, and other archaeological deposits should be reported to the Landmarks Commission. Examples include Native American spear points and tools, historic objects, historic trash pits/dumps, privies (outhouse pits), cisterns, wells, and foundations. | + | See conditions of approval |
| AR3 | Prior to excavating to replace or repair underground utilities, notify the Landmarks Commission as to when the work will be scheduled. | + | See conditions of approval |
| AR4 | A property owner must not willingly destroy or disturb archaeological resources, nor allow artifact collectors, amateur archaeologists, or others to do so. | + | |
| AR5 | In the event that the collection of artifacts through excavation or an archaeological investigation is conducted, the work shall be conducted by a professional archaeologist as defined by the Kentucky Heritage Council. | NSI | |
| AR6 | All archaeological investigations must have a research design and proposal that are reviewed and approved by Landmarks Commission staff. When qualified personnel are available, the Landmarks Commission may design research and conduct archaeological investigations. | NSI | |
| AR7 | All archaeological investigations shall be conducted in accordance with the standards for archaeological fieldwork and the Commonwealth of Kentucky's Antiquities Act. | NSI | |
| AR8 | Property owners who wish to retain ownership of artifacts shall provide sufficient time for the Landmarks Commission to properly document the materials. Artifacts recovered through excavation with the intent to collect artifacts or archaeological investigations should not be sold. It is recommended that artifacts be curated (stored) at an acceptable curation facility (museum). | NSI | |

Case #: 18COA1004-CL Page 12 of 12