



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Certificate of Appropriateness

To: Shannon Burns
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Anthony Schneider, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: June 21, 2018

Case No: 18COA1118
Classification: Staff Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 166 N Keats Ave.

Applicant: Shannon Burns
166 N Keats Ave.
Louisville, KY 40206
502-759-4323
henryasleep@gmail.com

Owner: Same as Applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$1000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant is requesting an after-the-fact approval of a wood, front porch rail of approximately 36 inches with copper caps on the posts.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on May 30, 2018 and was considered complete and requiring committee review on June 13, 2018. Staff spoke with the applicant letting them know of the need for committee review prior to June 15, 2018. On June 18, 2018 the applicant came into the office to discuss the committee process and mail notice to adjoining property owners. Staff performed a site visit on June 20, 2018 to take photos and post notice.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Porch**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R-5 zoned property within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the east side of N Keats Avenue and located mid-block and north of Sycamore Avenue. This is a frame construction, single-story, late Victorian home constructed in a bungalow style. The porch is indicative of the street's overall architectural style with a majority of homes of similar style, period, and ornamentation. This porch and many of the single family porches on the street feature classical columns with varying heights off the ground. Few porches on the street feature porch rails.

Conclusions

The project generally does not meet the Clifton design guideline **PO5** for **Porch**. The proposed addition of a front porch rail is not indicative of the architectural style and detracts from the home's historic architectural features. There are few single-family structures on this street with front porch rails and those that do exist are of a different architectural style or feature a structural knee wall. The rail, as installed, does not meet the guideline **PO5** for porch rails and is not required by building code.

As this is an after the fact request, staff would not have recommended a rail on this porch in its entirety had the applicant submitted a COA prior to installation. However, staff recommends that the applicant either remove the rail as it exists and replace with a less bulky, slim black metal rail that is installed behind the columns in lieu of in front of the columns as currently installed; or for the applicant to paint the rails to match the columns, lower the posts to be flush with the rail as it exists, and replace the balusters with a lower profile of either wood or metal.

DECISION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness is **approved with the following conditions:**

1. The applicant shall remove and replace the rail with a rail that is more discreet with a narrow profile as to not obstruct the architecture of the home.
2. The applicant shall remove the copper caps and lower the posts to be flush, or near flush with the rail as exists currently.
3. The applicant shall replace the 2"x2" balusters with a more artistic design that is either wood or metal by working with staff.
4. All new wood shall be painted white to coordinate with existing columns and trim within 6 months.
5. If the design changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

Anthony Schneider
Historic Preservation Specialist

Date

Porch

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- NA Not Applicable
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- NSI Not Sufficient Information
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
PO1	Reconstructed entrance or porch features should be replaced with in-kind materials. If not economically or technically feasible, a compatible substitute material may be used including composite or other synthetic materials, columns, or trim designed to reflect the appropriate style of the house. Design elements should match the proportion, detailing, and size of the original style.	NA	
PO2	Architectural features that are proposed for reconstruction or replacement must be photographically documented by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks for approval of any exterior modification. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained.	NA	
PO3	Replacement porch railings and balusters should match the		A precedent for porch railings

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	originals as closely as possible. If it is technically or economically unfeasible to accomplish this, then pre-fab wood or synthetic materials may be purchased that are similar to the originals. Wood railings should be finished with paint or an opaque stain.	-	does not appear to exist with this structure or other structures on the block of a similar architectural style.
PO4	Cast or wrought iron columns, railings, or balusters should not be used as a replacement for brick or wood porch elements.	NA	
PO5	When installing a new code-required handrail or railing to porch steps or from the street where not originally installed, select a design that is simple and stylistically appropriate or artistic.	-	New railing appears bulky and is less stylistically appropriate than a narrow-profile, metal rail.
PO6	Conjectural porch ornament should not be added; often its style conflicts with the style of the house. For example, do not add gingerbread spindles or Corinthian columns to a Craftsman-style house.	NA	
PO7	Over-sized boards (2" thick) should not be used for porch floors. 3/4" to 1" tongue-and-groove boards are generally appropriate. Deck boards are not appropriate for street façade porch floors.	NA	
PO8	Replacement porch flooring should be installed that closely matches the original tongue-and groove flooring dimensions. The proper installation of tongue and groove for outdoor flooring provides for a maximum gap of 1/16" between boards to allow for expansion. Wood edging should be applied to the exposed ends of floorboards to prevent moisture infiltration into the grain.	NA	
PO9	Porch or cornice elements or any architectural-defining feature on the street façade should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum siding.	NA	
PO10	Porch ceilings should not be installed, nor exposed eaves enclosed, where no such covering existed previously. Exposed rafters and roof decks are character-defining features for certain architectural styles, such as the Craftsman style.	NA	
PO11	Deteriorated porch steps should be replaced with in-kind materials. Replacement steps should be of the same scale and dimensions as the original. 5/4" deck boards should not be used for stair treads. Stone steps may be patched with concrete that is tinted a visually compatible color.	NA	
PO12	Historic stone steps should not be replaced unless the stone itself is unsafe or no longer useable. Resetting stones on a firm foundation and re-pointing or applying appropriate sealant can address most problems (contact Landmarks for advice on sealant product choices).	NA	
PO13	Front porches can be enclosed with screen panels (not glass panels) provided the construction is reversible and no alterations are made to the original façade. Screen panels that can be removed seasonally when they are set behind porch elements are preferred. The porch enclosure shall not be made into a conditioned living space.	NA	
PO14	When undertaking a non-street front-facing or rear porch enclosure project, do not obscure the design or detailing of original porch elements. The enclosure shall not become a room addition. See the Addition guidelines if a room addition is desired.	NA	
PO15	A porch may be added to a structure's primary façade only if the porch design is appropriate to the style of the house.	NA	