




Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer 
From: Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: July 6, 2018

Case No: 18COA1127
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 126 Pope Street

Applicant: Deondrea Robinson
Jump Start Realty and Development, LLC
5505 Mock Court
Louisville, KY 40258
502-298-5456
jumpstartranddev@gmail.com

Owner: Courtney and Darius Pettway
Pettway Estates, LLC
435 Camp Street
Louisville, KY 40203
502-414-3885
Courtney@pettwayestates.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$28,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to replace all existing wood windows on the front elevation which are 1/1 double hung wood windows. The new windows will be 1/1 double hung vinyl windows. The applicant requests approval to replace the upper half story arched window with a solid piece of wood and repair the trim.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on June 6, 2018 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on June 11, 2018. The case was scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee on July 11, 2018 at 5:30 pm, at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Windows**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R5A zoned property within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located midblock on the west side of Pope Street. The frame, two-and-a-half-story Queen Anne house is surrounded by a mix of one- and two-story homes of similar style.

The only previous Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for this property was approved by staff on June 13, 2018 (18COA1126) for replacement of the side and rear windows; closing off one of the rear entry doors; constructing a rear deck; and replacing existing vinyl siding with new vinyl siding. According to the designation photograph, the property has been in its current condition since before Clifton became a Preservation District in 2003.

Conclusions

The proposed window replacement generally meets the Clifton design guidelines for **Windows**. The 3 first story windows are in good condition with the exception of missing ropes and being painted shut. The wood has been protected by the existing wooden storm windows and the front porch. With some repair, these windows could be operational. However, the 4 second story windows are in poor condition. The aluminum storm windows are either missing or broken leaving the windows exposed to the elements. There are signs of rotted wood in all 4 of the windows. Due to the deterioration, staff believes these windows could be replaced with an appropriate replacement window. However, the proposed 1/1 double hung vinyl windows are not ideal for the front façade. The vinyl windows will not have the same dimensions and profiles as the historic windows, which guideline W2 requires. Staff recommends that the 4 second story windows be replaced with new 1/1 double hung wood, wood clad, or Fibrex windows that fit the historic window openings.

According to the designation photograph, the upper half story arched window was falling out in 2003. All that remains is the window trim and the lower sash, which is falling out. The applicant proposes to replace the small window with a piece of wood and keeping the trim. This window opening is a stylistic detail of the front façade so keeping the opening is important. However, there are options to modify what fills the opening to suit the needs of the owners. Staff recommends the opening be filled with wood, a wood vent, or a new wood, wood clad, or Fibrex window that fit the historic window opening.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. The 3 first story, front windows shall be repaired and maintained.
2. The 4 second story, front windows shall be replaced with new 1/1 double hung wood, wood clad, or Fibrex windows that fit the historic window openings. The openings shall not be altered or built-up to fit a window.
3. All window trim shall be repaired and maintained.
4. The upper half story arched window trim shall be repaired and maintained. The opening can be filled with wood, a wood vent, or a new wood, wood clad, or Fibrex window that fit the historic window opening.
5. Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass or film shall not be used on windows on street-address façades or street-facing façades.
6. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

7/6/2018
Date


Savannah Darr
Planning & Design Coordinator

Windows

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	The maintenance and repair of historic windows are essential to preserving the historic character and fabric of Clifton structures and the overall Clifton historic district. For that reason, historic windows on street-address façades and street-facing façades shall not be replaced with new windows unless the Clifton ARC determines that the condition of existing windows, safety or energy efficiency considerations, or other relevant factors support window replacement. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	+	The applicant is aware of the Clifton design guidelines and procedures.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W2	If historic windows on façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades are replaced, or the owner is authorized to replace windows on street-address façade or street-facing façade pursuant to W1, the new windows shall convey the same visual appearance as the historic windows. The visual appearance of a window is based on details such as sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and other decorative features. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of wood, metal, or synthetic window systems for authorized window replacement is permissible. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	+/-	<p>The applicant proposed 1/1 double hung vinyl windows to replace 1/1 double hung wood windows on the front facade.</p> <p>The proposed 1/1 double hung vinyl windows are not ideal for the front façade. Staff recommends that the 4 second story windows be replaced with new 1/1 double hung wood, wood clad, or Fibrex windows that fit the historic window openings.</p> <p>The applicant requests approval to replace the upper half story arched window with a solid piece of wood and repair the trim. Staff recommends the upper half story arched window opening be filled with wood, a wood vent, or a new wood, wood clad, or Fibrex window that fit the historic window opening.</p>
W3	Replacement sash should not be used that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows.	+	See conditions of approval
W4	Replacement windows proposed for façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades, and those authorized pursuant to W1 for street-address façades and street-facing façades, shall operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	NA	
W5	Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance with W2 shall have such muntins permanently applied and may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass panes.	NA	
W6	Reflective or insulating film shall not be applied to window glass on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+	See conditions of approval
W7	Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass shall not be used on windows on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+	See conditions of approval
W8	Transoms or sidelights shall not be blocked-in or back-painted.	NA	
W9	The number, size, location, or shape of original windows shall not be altered on street-address façades or street-facing façades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W10	Any new window openings for a new use shall not be located on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	
W11	The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side of historic window trim.	+	Condition of approval in previous staff level COA (18COA1126)
W12	New floors or dropped ceilings shall not be installed that block the glazed area of windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W13	If exterior storm windows are installed they should duplicate the shape of the original window.	NA	
W14	When installing exterior storm windows or screens do not damage or obscure historic windows or frames.	NA	
W15	Window sashes shall not be altered to accommodate window air-conditioning units.	NA	
W16	When installing security bars do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W17	Awnings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W18	Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building.	NA	
W19	Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units.	NA	
W20	On commercial buildings attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W21	Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works).	NA	
W22	Replacement shutters should match the visual appearance, size, and location of the originals and may be constructed of wood, metal, or synthetic material.	NA	
W23	Shutters shall be installed only where there is historic evidence for them.	NA	