



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Certificate of Appropriateness

To: Deondrea Robinson
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: June 13, 2018

Case No: 18COA1126
Classification: Staff Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 126 Pope Street

Applicant: Deondrea Robinson
Jump Start Realty and Development, LLC
5505 Mock Court
Louisville, KY 40258
502-298-5456
jumpstartranddev@gmail.com

Owner: Courtney and Darius Pettway
Pettway Estates, LLC
435 Camp Street
Louisville, KY 40203
502-414-3885
Courtney@pettwayestates.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$28,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to

- Add 6" ogee gutters to the outside of the remaining box gutters and roof over the box gutters.
- Replace the wood scalloping on the front façade with new vinyl scalloping.
- Replace the side and rear 1/1 double hung wood windows with new 1/1 single hung vinyl windows.
- Close off and side over the northernmost rear door and construct a 10' x 10' wood deck with wood balusters and handrails. The other rear door and casement windows will be repaired.

The remaining items in the scope of work are considered general maintenance. Those include repairing the wood siding on the first story of the front façade; replacing or repairing the existing vinyl siding; repairing the soffit and box gutters; painting the woodwork; and repairing the rear balcony.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on June 6, 2018 and was considered complete and requiring staff review on June 11, 2018. The proposed front façade window replacement and upper story arched window treatment were removed from this application and added to 18COA1127 because it will require committee review.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Roofing, Siding and Trim, Addition, Door and Entrance, and Windows**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R5A zoned property within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located midblock on the west side of Pope Street. The frame, two-and-a-half-story Queen Anne house is surrounded by a mix of one- and two-story homes of similar style.

There are no previous Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) for this property. According to the designation photograph, the property has been in its current condition since before Clifton became a Preservation District in 2003.

Conclusions

The project generally meets the Clifton Design Guidelines for **Roofing, Siding and Trim, Addition, Door and Entrance, and Windows**. Many of the proposed changes are common, such as roofing over the box gutters and adding new gutters to the outside. The wood scalloping on the front façade is deteriorating and the new vinyl scalloping will match the design. The side and rear windows will be replaced with appropriate new vinyl windows. The rear elevation has two exit doors, which the owners do not need. The northernmost door will be closed off and sided over leaving the other door as rear access to the new deck.

DECISION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness is **approved with the following conditions**:

- 1. The new gutters shall not be unpainted galvanized steel gutters or vinyl gutters.**

2. The new vinyl scalloping on the front shall not cover the arched window opening.
3. The new replacement windows shall fit the historic window openings and shall be 1/1 single hung windows.
4. All wood elements of the new deck shall be opaque painted or stained within 6 months of construction.
5. The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side of historic window trim.
6. If the design or scope of work changes, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact Landmarks staff for review and approval.
7. The applicant and/or their representative shall contact Landmarks staff to determine if a Certificate of Appropriateness is needed and obtained prior to any future work on the property.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.


Savannah Darr
Planning & Design Coordinator

6/13/18
Date

Roofing

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+ Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

NA Not Applicable
NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R1	Replacement roofing materials should closely match the original roofing material in texture and profile. Some substitute materials including asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles may be considered. Contact the Landmarks staff for any new emerging roof technologies.	NA	
R2	Metal roofing materials like lead-coated copper, terne-coated steel, and aluminum/zinc-coated steel can successfully replace tin, terne plate, zinc, or lead. Copper-coated steel is a less expensive (and less durable) substitute for sheet copper. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted a traditional roof color. Repair and replacement with in-kind materials is recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original. Contact the Landmarks staff for any new emerging metal roof technologies.	NA	
R3	When replacing metal roofing on residential roofs, the proportion and spacing of the seams and trim should match the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture because the scale is inappropriate.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R4	On historic terra cotta clay tile roofs, ridge and hip tiles should be retained. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible.	NA	
R5	On slate roofs, historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps, should be replaced with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible.	NA	
R6	The reconstruction of any missing roof feature should be based on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If the evidence is insufficient, the roof feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely historical or conjectural reconstruction.	NA	
R7	On additions or new construction, new roof designs should be similar or compatible with the shape, size, scale, and materials of the historic building and other buildings within the district.	NA	
R8	For major decaying or deteriorated roof features – like cupolas, dormers, or chimneys – the form and detailing of the features should be used to create appropriate replicas. Smaller irreparable historic roof details – such as decorative cresting, finials, or metal roof caps for slate roofs – should be replaced with in-kind or visually compatible materials.	NA	
R9	Extensive areas of flashing should not be visible and should be avoided. Portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco.	NA	
R10	When installing replacement gutters, do not destroy the historic roof detail.	+	Gutters will be placed on the outside of the box gutters
R11	When replacing gutters, use half-round replacement gutters or ogee profile gutters that have a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim. When it is not possible to repair or replace the original box gutters, the box gutters should be roofed over and the replacement gutters attached.	+	Ogee gutters will be placed on the outside of the box gutters
R12	Unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts are not preferred as they will rust and stain adjacent materials. Galvanized gutters should be appropriately primed and painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy.	+	See conditions of approval
R13	Historically exposed rafter ends and eaves should remain and be preserved.	NA	
R14	New roof-top additions should not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	NA	
R15	Any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment should be installed in a manner as to not damage the historic elements or fabric; examples include: cupola, weathervane, and chimney.	NA	
R16	Mechanical equipment or systems (examples: HVAC or water) should not be installed on roofs where they may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system. Additional support systems may need to be constructed to support the additional weight load.	NA	
R17	Antennae, satellite dishes, skylights, vents, roof-top mechanical units, decks, terraces, dormers, or high-profile solar panels should not be installed where they can be seen from a building's street address façade or primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	NA	

Siding and Trim

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SD1	Missing wood features should not be replaced with conjectural or falsely historic reconstructions or with newly designed elements that are incompatible with the building's size, scale, or materials.	NA	
SD2	Architectural features that are proposed for reconstruction or replacement must be photographically documented by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks for approval of any exterior modification. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained.	+	
SD3	Contemporary wood siding or fiber cement board, which conveys the visual appearance of historic siding, should be used when replacing sections of deteriorated wood. Other materials which expand and contract like wood may be used when approved by staff or ARC review.	NA	
SD4	Structurally inappropriate materials such as textured plywood (e.g., T-111) or similar soft wood products that shed water poorly should not be used on primary structures. Architecturally and historically inappropriate materials should not repair, replace, or be placed over historic wood siding.	NA	
SD5	Exterior veneers shall not be installed over wood siding or as a replacement for exterior siding. Some examples of historically inappropriate exterior veneers not to be used are artificial stone or other masonry, EIFS (synthetic stucco), asbestos shingles, or asphalt shingles.	NA	
SD6	Replace or repair damaged or deteriorated wood siding with wood or wood-like materials. Undamaged, intact historic wood siding should be preserved and not removed and/or replaced.	+/-	The wood scalloping is rotting so it will be replaced with vinyl scalloping. There is already vinyl siding located on the second story. This will create a better transition.
SD7	Replacement siding should be installed horizontally unless there is valid historic documentation for a different original orientation.	+	
SD8	Retaining and preserving the original wood siding and trim with paint is encouraged, especially on the street-address façade. The application of fiber cement board matching the original existing exposure is preferred over vinyl or aluminum siding and may be approved by staff without ARC review. Vinyl or aluminum siding may be applied to street address façades, side, and rear elevations with ARC approval. The installation of any type of siding should not obscure or damage historic ornamental details such as fish-scale shingles, moldings, window casings, sills, hoods, brackets, and corner boards. Do not install siding of any type over rotten wood. Do not wrap windows and trim with metal. If applied, remove insul-brick material and apply house wrap before applying siding.	+/-	The wood scalloping is rotting so it will be replaced with vinyl scalloping. There is already vinyl siding located on the second story. This will create a better transition.
SD9	Fiber cement, vinyl or aluminum siding should match the profile and dimensions of the original wood siding. A smooth-faced, narrow profile siding (3" or 4" reveal) is acceptable for installation. Historic fabric, trim, or corner boards should project slightly beyond the vinyl siding, wherever possible without causing damage.	+	The existing vinyl siding meets this guideline and the new will match.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SD10	Paints and coatings manufactured before 1978 contained lead. Historic structures often contain hazardous substances, such as lead paint and asbestos. Since June, 2010, the EPA regulations require contractors to be certified and follow specific work practices to prevent lead contamination. For additional lead paint information, contact the Metro Health Department. For asbestos removal and disposal methods, contact Metro Air Pollution Control.	NA	
SD11	Installation of insulation with a proper vapor barrier should be done from the interior. Do not remove exterior siding to install insulation within the exterior walls of historic wood frame construction. This can result in damage to historic fabric by locking in mold and moisture and will rot wood from within. Houses need to be breathable.	NA	

Windows

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	The maintenance and repair of historic windows are essential to preserving the historic character and fabric of Clifton structures and the overall Clifton historic district. For that reason, historic windows on street-address façades and street-facing façades shall not be replaced with new windows unless the Clifton ARC determines that the condition of existing windows, safety or energy efficiency considerations, or other relevant factors support window replacement. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	+	
W2	If historic windows on façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades are replaced, or the owner is authorized to replace windows on street-address façade or street-facing façade pursuant to W1, the new windows shall convey the same visual appearance as the historic windows. The visual appearance of a window is based on details such as sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and other decorative features. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of wood, metal, or synthetic window systems for authorized window replacement is permissible. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	NA	Sides and rear elevation windows
W3	Replacement sash should not be used that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never	+	See conditions of approval

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows.		
W4	Replacement windows proposed for façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades, and those authorized pursuant to W1 for street-address façades and street-facing façades, shall operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+/-	1/1 double hung wood windows are being replaced with 1/1 single hung windows. However, this change in operation is still acceptable.
W5	Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance with W2 shall have such muntins permanently applied and may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass panes.	NA	
W6	Reflective or insulating film shall not be applied to window glass on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	
W7	Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass shall not be used on windows on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	
W8	Transoms or sidelights shall not be blocked-in or back-painted.	NA	
W9	The number, size, location, or shape of original windows shall not be altered on street-address façades or street-facing façades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W10	Any new window openings for a new use shall not be located on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	
W11	The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side of historic window trim.	+	See conditions of approval
W12	New floors or dropped ceilings shall not be installed that block the glazed area of windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W13	If exterior storm windows are installed they should duplicate the shape of the original window.	NA	
W14	When installing exterior storm windows or screens do not damage or obscure historic windows or frames.	NA	
W15	Window sashes shall not be altered to accommodate window air-conditioning units.	NA	
W16	When installing security bars do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W17	Awnings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W18	Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building.	NA	
W19	Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units.	NA	
W20	On commercial buildings attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W21	Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works).	NA	
W22	Replacement shutters should match the visual appearance,	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	size, and location of the originals and may be constructed of wood, metal, or synthetic material.		
W23	Shutters shall be installed only where there is historic evidence for them.	NA	

Addition

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	The design of any new addition or expansion should be compatible and in proportion with the mass and scale of the historic building, adjacent structures, and the district.	+	10' by 10' deck on the rear elevation only
A2	New additions should be designed in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new. Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	
A3	Additions should be designed so there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion. Do not duplicate the exact form, material, style, and detailing of the historic building in the new addition.	+	
A4	Additions should be attached to side or rear elevations (façades) and should be set back from the street front façade, and should not damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	
A5	The design of the new addition should be subordinate to the original building. Rear and side additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	
A6	The original street front orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade. (The side or the rear of the house should not become the front of the house.)	NA	
A7	The new addition should be designed so the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	NA	
A8	The new addition should be designed with the intent to maintain the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion. The size and placement of doors and windows should be proportional to the number, size, and shape of the new wall elevation as compared to the mass and scale of the historic building. See Door and Entrance and Window guidelines for more details.	NA	
A9	Full-floor additions on contributing residential structures (adding an additional full floor on top of a house) are not recommended unless the full-floor addition will be compatible with the existing streetscape and adjacent homes and structures and the impact on the character of the historic home is not totally transformed.	NA	
A10	Materials should be used that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	
A11	The original roof pitch, style, shape, and volume should be	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	respected when designing an addition. The roof on the addition should complement the existing roof forms, not overwhelm them.		
A12	On commercial or institutional structures, the construction of new additions or additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street and should not damage or destroy character-defining features. New additions or additional stories should be set back from the historic wall plane.	NA	
A13	New additions to structures may incorporate contemporary, energy efficient, and sustainable design and materials. However, do not imitate an historic style or period of architecture in new additions, especially for contemporary uses such as drive-in windows or garages.	NA	
A14	Sunrooms or screened porches that are compatible with the home may be constructed as a rear or side addition and built with a similar level of quality construction and design.	NA	
A15	Decks may be constructed on the rear or an inconspicuous side of the building. Do not construct a deck on the front façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or stained.	+	10' by 10' deck on the rear elevation only
A16	The rear deck design should not extend beyond the side walls of the house and should not be visible from the front façade or street.	+	
A17	When adding new exterior steps, stairways, fire escapes, or elevator shafts, do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features. The new addition's construction scale and materials should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A18	Exterior fire escape steps should be installed only on the side or rear façade of the building. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. The fire escape should be as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street.	NA	
A19	Exterior fire escape steps constructed of wood should be painted or stained, oriented to the yard, and kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

Door and Entrance

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Front-facing (i.e., street-address façade) doors proposed for replacement should be replaced with the same or in-kind materials. Many options exist for repairing or restoring historic doors and producing historically compatible and durable results. Some of these options may be more economical, in the long run, than replacement. All options should be reviewed with Landmarks staff before replacing historic doors. If replacement is necessary, there are many new products to choose from for economical, compatible replacement doors and building materials.	NA	The northernmost door on the rear elevation is being removed and sided over.
D2	Replacing non-original, non-historic doors is recommended when the replacement doors are more appropriate to the period and style of the building, and match the size of the original opening.	NA	
D3	Replacement doors should – whenever possible – duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original door or period of architectural	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	significance. Replacing a missing historic door with one that matches the historic door is preferable if physical, pictorial, or photographic evidence exists to document its appearance. Absent that, the door may be replaced with a new door that is compatible with the style and character of the historic building.		
D4	The character of doors and entrances should be maintained by keeping decorative features and historic elements. Avoid the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	+/-	The rear elevation has two exit doors, which the owners do not need.
D5	Creating new entrances on street-address or street-facing facades should be avoided.	NA	The northernmost door on the rear elevation is being removed and sided over.
D6	Historically clear-finished (i.e., stained then lacquered or top-coated) doors should be refinished in the same manner and should not be painted. Leave historically clear-finished doors unpainted.	NA	
D7	Replacing historic double-entry (leaf) doors with a single door should be avoided.	NA	
D8	Original entrance or door openings should not be altered to accommodate stock doors. The historic entrance including the door, transom or fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablature should be retained and repaired.	NA	
D9	Architectural features that are proposed for reconstruction or replacement must be photographically documented by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks for approval of any exterior modification. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained.	+/-	Removal not reconstruction or replacement
D10	When undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature, historical, pictorial, and physical documentation should be used. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely historical designs are not appropriate.	NA	
D11	Screen doors, storm doors and security doors should be simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen and does not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric.	NA	
D12	Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Security bars should be painted an unobtrusive color.	NA	
D13	Vestibules should not be added to the street-address or street-facing facade on commercial use or leased buildings unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	
D14	Character-defining features of an historic building should be retained when undertaking work required for ADA accessibility and code compliance.	NA	
D15	ADA-accessibility ramps should be located on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a way that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	