

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Thru: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer Anthony Schneider, Historic Preservation Specialist

From: Date:

October 15, 2018

Case No:

18COA1192

Classification:

Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address:

1310 S Floyd Street

Applicant:

Josh Lindley

Glenmary Investment Group, LLC

710 Barret Avenue, Ste 201

Louisville, KY 40204

502-562-1985

josh@alltradeky.com

Owner:

Same

Estimated Project Cost:

\$175,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests to demolish the principal structure, a 2½ story Victorian home, which has fallen into a state of severe disrepair. In the demolition process the applicant proposes to perform a salvage operation in which a number of historic architectural details will be salvaged and reused in the reconstruction. The applicant proposes to reconstruct the home in nearly the exact footprint, size, and massing as the original. The proposed new construction will be 2½ stories and have new wood windows on the front and vinyl windows on the sides and rear. The new structure will also incorporate a number of details from the original home such as exterior trim around doors and windows where possible, salvaged bricks for chimneys, and the reuse of the historic cornice and front gable details.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on August 8, 2018 and was considered complete and requiring committee review on September 24, 2018. Staff performed a site visit on

Case #: 18COA1192-OL Page 1 of 12 August 30th to take photos and assess the structural damage from the interior as well as the exterior. Staff proceeded to have a meeting with the applicant on September 17th to discuss the potential for a salvage operation and to discuss the extent of damages. Staff received new plans on September 24th in which the notes of all salvageable materials and new materials were listed. Staff worked with the applicant on scheduling for the earliest day possible with an unsuccessful attempt to establish quorum for the Old Louisville ARC on October 10, 2018. Quorum was set for October 24, 2018.

This case is scheduled for a meeting of the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee on Wednesday October 24th at 5:30pm in Conference Room 101 of 444 S 5th Street, the Metro Development Center.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Demolition**, **New Construction-Residential**, and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The TNZD zoned property within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located mid-block on the west side of S Floyd Street and five lots south of the intersection of E Ormsby Avenue. This home is a $2\frac{1}{2}$ story late-Victorian era structure of frame construction with a hip roof and projecting front gable. The gable and cornice line possess significant levels of historic detail with board and batten siding and a detailed quatrefoil pattern in the cornice board. This home is situated amongst other Victorian era homes of varying materials from timber to masonry with a comparable mass and scale.

In the research process, staff did not find an existing COA on the property. Additionally, staff reviewed the proposed new construction for land development code compliance and the proposed new construction would be in compliance with all zoning and form district regulations as proposed.

Conclusions

Demolition: In the design guidelines under economic hardship, the guidelines for demolition state the following: Unless the City has determined that is poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district or individual landmark unless: 1) the demolition will not adversely affect the district's (or the landmark's) distinctive characteristics, taken as a whole, retained over time 2) the demolition will not adversely affect the district's importance as a "unified entity" composed of interrelated resources united historically or aesthetically by plan or physical development; and 3) the proposed replacement structure and development will strengthen the viability of the district as a whole.

Case #: 18COA1192-OL Page 2 of 12

Findings:

- 1. the demolition will not adversely affect the district's (or the landmark's) distinctive characteristics, taken as a whole, retained over time
 - a. The removal of this structure, while architecturally significant in its own right, from the district will not adversely affect the characteristics that define the Old Louisville preservation district. A number of the historic resources and architectural details have deteriorated beyond reasonable repair in which the restoration would yield a product that is more contemporary in material than historic. The proposed redevelopment includes measures for which the intent is to salvage as much historic material for reuse as possible.
- 2. the demolition will not adversely affect the district's importance as a "unified entity" composed of interrelated resources united historically or aesthetically by plan or physical development;
 - a. While the removal of this structure will eliminate a historic resource that contributes to part of the "unified entity" that is the Old Louisville preservation district, the reconstruction will fill in a missing piece of the puzzle that currently sits vacant in a state of severe disrepair. The redevelopment of the property will be a replica reconstruction of the historic home with a mix of contemporary materials and salvaged character defining elements from the original structure. The new construction will not alter the design or aesthetic of the street as it will fit in with the historic pattern of development along the Floyd Street corridor.
- **3.** the proposed replacement structure and development will strengthen the viability of the district as a whole.
 - a. The structure proposed for the replacement of the existing structure will mirror the design, scale, and footprint of historic home as it looked in the period of construction with conjectural yet historically appropriate alterations for contemporary construction methods. The proposed structure will replace a structure that has remained vacant for an extended period of time and been allowed to deteriorate long before the current owner took possession. The structure will add additionally housing opportunities to the district and enhance the aesthetic of the Floyd Street corridor. The new structure will also incorporate a number of salvaged materials from the historic home to provide homage to what once was.

Based on the guidelines listed above, the structure would qualify for demolition. The information provided by the applicant to staff tells us that the applicant acquired the property two years ago. The property was purchased without an inspection due to the nature of the sale. Once the applicant began inspecting the site and the structure, the applicant found the structure to have significant levels of deterioration at the structural level. The level of deterioration, as witnessed by staff and evidenced by the structural engineer's report, suggests that this structure is potentially beyond repair. The structure has significant termite damage in which a majority of supporting beams and walls lack connective tissue and are supported by unstable means. In areas where a sill plate and connective brackets would typically exist, there are none. A number of open holes in the masonry foundation and chimneys suggest that support joists were once mounted into them but have long since disappeared. The most peculiar part of this structure is that the first floor shows an immense level of deterioration while the roof and second story are

Case #: 18COA1192-OL Page 3 of 12 structurally intact; in fact, that is what makes the stability of this structure most worrisome. Rehabilitation of this structure, based on the report of a structural engineer as furnished by the applicant, suggests that the mitigating factors needed to secure the structure might be what brings it down or potentially damages an adjacent historic resource.

While the applicant initially proposed full demolition, staff met with the applicant in an effort to make compromises on project. Staff discussed the need for salvaging the intact historic resources and reusing them in the reconstruction. The applicant agreed to salvage a number of historic resources and restore them as part of the proposed reconstruction. Reconstruction of historic homes that are beyond repair or have since been removed is an acceptable practice under the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Reconstruction.

Staff found that the proposed design meets all criteria for the *Standards for Reconstruction* listed in the attachment with the exception of Standard 2. The proposed project will incorporate and recreate a historic resource with a number of historic and contemporary materials. The new building will possess the historic form and aesthetic while clearly being a modern reproduction. The list of materials to be salvaged is as follows:

- ➢ Box gutter
- > Cornice line
- Front gable details with board & batten
- > Wood window trim from first floor window
- Wood trim from main entry door
- > Bricks from foundation
- > Chimneys will be salvaged to the best extent possible.

Based on site visits and the structural engineer's report, staff recommends to the Committee the approval for demolition of a contributing structure to the Old Louisville preservation district.

New Construction-Residential: In addition to the demolition, the applicant proposes a replacement structure that replicates and is consistent in form, design, scale, and massing to the contributing structure proposed for demolition. Staff finds that this project generally meets the Old Louisville design guidelines for New Construction-Residential and Site. The new principal structure would be a near replica of the structure proposed for demolition. Historical reconstruction is an appropriate treatment as described in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Reconstruction. The new structure will incorporate a number of historic, character defining elements into the proposed reconstruction. The proposed building would incorporate character defining cornice elements, exterior trim, and masonry. The salvaging of historic materials and reincorporation of those elements into the new structure helps to unify the gaps that exist in the S Floyd Street corridor. This new structure would enhance the character of the district by reproducing a contributing structure that has become too deteriorated to restore. This replica of the original structure would be noticeably contemporary while paying homage to the historic character that the historic structure once provided to the continuity of the district and the development of the street.

The proposed structure will sit in nearly the exact footprint of the historic structure with slight modifications for current building codes. The setback from the public way will not

Case #: 18COA1192-OL Page 4 of 12 be increase or reduce thus keeping continuity along the corridor and help to retain its relationship to adjacent homes. The applicant will be using 4" exposure, smooth-face cement board siding with associated corner boards and window trim. Window trim materials will be consistent in scale to the historic trim that currently exits. The applicant will restore the cornice line and box gutter form with the addition of new half-round gutters to enhance the aesthetic and historic profile. The street-facing façade windows will be one-over-one, double-hung, clad-wood or wood windows in a coordinating color. The side and rear windows will also be one-over-one in configuration with double-hung operation; however, the sides and rear will be of vinyl construction. The roof form will mirror that of the historic structure with a front gable—to be salvaged—and hip construction on all other sides. The chimneys will also be incorporated into the new design as a structural and historic architectural element. The applicant proposes half-lite entry doors for the front, side, and rear entrances. Additionally, the applicant will be reconstructing the porch element with a mix of salvaged brick materials and new wood.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the request of demolition of a contributing structure to the Old Louisville preservation district.

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the request of new construction with the following **conditions**:

- 1. The demolition permit shall not be issued until the permit for construction of the entire development has been issued.
- 2. Applicant shall salvage as much historic material as possible as depicted on the plans provided and listed in this report.
- 3. There shall be corner boards on all corners and trim around all openings.
- 4. Cement board siding shall be smooth-face with 4" exposure.
- 5. New windows shall be one-over-one wood or clad wood windows on the front facades with vinyl windows on the sides and rear.
- 6. New windows and trim shall project slightly beyond the siding to create visual depth.
- 7. Building's front façade shall be set back to match those on either side.
- 8. The structure shall have half-round gutters.
- 9. Fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, shall be positioned on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site.
- 10. Masonry foundation shall be in keeping with the height of adjacent structures.
- 11. Any exterior lighting shall be presented to staff prior to installation.
- 12. All new wood shall be painted or opaque stained within a period of 9 months.
- 13. Applicant shall make provisions for the storing and screening of trash receptacles.
- 14. Applicant shall incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.

Case #: 18COA1192-OL Page 5 of 12 15. Applicant shall obtain all necessary building permits.

16. Applicant shall obtain all necessary Planning & Design appovals.

17. If the design changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Anthony Schneider

Historic Preservation Specialist

15 | 13 | 18 Date

Attached Documents / Information

- 1. Staff Guideline Checklists
- 2. Secretary of the Interior Standards for Reconstruction

DEMOLITION

Design Guideline Checklist From Economic Hardship Exemption

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Introduction

Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

Demolition by Neglect

The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.

Case #: 18COA1192-OL Page 6 of 12

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.		This is a contributing structure to the Old Louisville Preservation District; however, the current state of deterioration yields a structure that lacks the ability to be restored with significant amounts of historic material intact.
DE2	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	NA	
DE3	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	NA	
DE4	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	NA	
DE5	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent		
	with those features on adjacent properties.	NA	
DE6	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	NA	

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

+ Meets Guidelines

Does Not Meet Guidelines

+/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted

NA Not Applicable

NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	+/-	This is a contributing structure to the Old Louisville Preservation District; however, the current state of deterioration yields a structure that lacks the ability to be restored with significant amounts of historic material intact.
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	See Conditions
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	

Case #: 18COA1192-OL Page 7 of 12

NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.		New structure will have 4" siding with board and batten siding in the gable. A number of materials will be salvaged from
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wroughtiron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	the current structure.
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	New structure will be equal in size, scale, and massing to the original
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+	
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	New windows will be 1-over-1 double hung clad wood windows on the front and vinyl on the sides and rear.
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+	Front door will be a ½ light door
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+	
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+	See Conditions
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	

Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between percent of the average spacing for the block. NC23 become the streetscape, sepheaks for new onstruction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same straked or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setheaks. NC24 percent set the same straked or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setheaks. NC25 Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials. NC26 Design new constructions the predominant from is flat, built-up roofs are perferred. Where the predominant from is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In the predominant from is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In the predominant from is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof from separate led with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof from serve relatively consistent and a character-defining feature. NC27 Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature. NC29 Make provisions for screening and storing usast receptacles when designing new construction. NC30 Use an exterior sheathing that it similar to those of other surrounding historic structures. Any plant may be used for new construction but only a construction sheathing that it similar to those of other surrounding historic structures. Any plant may be used for new construction to material is wood. NC31 Design new construction. NC32 Design new construction. NC33 Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction. NC34 Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Poundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured confining features. NC35 Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in pr				
Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the stresscape, sebacks for new construction should cither match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same serback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks. NC24 Search and the the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials. NC25 Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing roeflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is a character-defining feature. NC27 Design new construction to emphasize the existing comice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature. NC30 Use an acterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding listoric buildings. While use of wood stiding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominant, historic construction materials and by a surrounding with smooth face with board and batten in gable details. NC31 Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs of new construction which is compatible in proportion and height with su	NC22	new construction and existing structures should fall within 20	+	
neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials. NC25 Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated. NC26 Sign new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature. NC27 Design new construction to emphasize the existing comice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature. NC28 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooflops remain uncluttered. NC30 Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate, historic construction material is wood. NC31 Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts. NC32 Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction construction construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features. NC33 Do not use modem "antiqued" brick in new construction. NC44 Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in preportion and height with surrounding huildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-noed poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance. NC35 Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with tefform, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. Foundat	NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas	+	
rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is faculti-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated. NC26 Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof forms is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature. NC27 Pesign new construction to emphasize the existing comice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature. NC28 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooffons remain uncluttered. NC29 Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction. NC30 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooffons remain uncluttered. NC30 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooffons remain uncluttered. NC30 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooffons remain uncluttered. NC30 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooffons remain uncluttered. NC30 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooffons remain uncluttered. NC31 Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction material is wood. NC31 Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction materials in a distinguish in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stucceed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance. NC33 Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured co	NC24	neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual	+	See Conditions
form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature. NC27 Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature. NC28 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered. NC29 Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction. NC30 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered. NC30 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered. NC31 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction beginning new construction. NC31 Integrate mechanical systems into new construction material is wood. Integrate mechanical systems into those of other surrounding buildings in designs for new construction material is wood. Integrate mechanical systems into those of other surrounding buildings in designs for new construction material is wood. Incorporate store or cast-stone sills and lintels into new common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts. NC32 Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features. NC33 Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction. NA NA NA NA NA NA NA NA NA N	NC25	rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs	+	
Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature. +	NC26	form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining	+	
htterooftops remain uncluttered. NC29 Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction. NC30 Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate, historic construction material is wood. NC31 Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts. NC32 Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features. NA NC33 Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction. NA NC34 Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance. NC35 Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof. NC36 Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head. NC37 Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of	NC27		+	retained and reinstalled with
NC30 Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate, historic construction material is wood. NC31 Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts. NC32 Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features. NC33 Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction. NC34 Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance. NC35 Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof. NC36 Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least of deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head. NC37 Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of	NC28	that rooftops remain uncluttered.	+	
surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate, historic construction material is wood. NC31 Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts. NC32 Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features. NC33 Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction. NC34 Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance. Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof. NC36 NC36 Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head. NC37 Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of	NC29		+	
buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts. NC32 Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features. NC33 Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction. NC34 Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance. NC35 Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof. NC36 Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head. NC37 Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of	NC30	surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate, historic construction material is	+	siding with smooth face with
construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features. NC33 Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction. NC34 Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance. NC35 Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof. NC36 Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head. NC37 Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of	NC31	buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic	+	used as cladding to front
NC34 Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance. NC35 Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof. NC36 Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head. NC37 Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of	NC32	construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-	NA	
which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance. **NC35** Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof. **NC36** Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head. NC37** Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of	NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof. NC36 Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head. NC37 Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of	NC34	which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.		
even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head. NC37 Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of	NC35	defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	+	
complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of	NC36	even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board		
	NC37	complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of	NA	

NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	NA
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	NA
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	NA
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	NA
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	NA
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	f -

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+ Meets Guidelines

Does Not Meet Guidelines

+/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted

NA Not Applicable

NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	Historic Mix
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	

Case #: 18COA1192-OL Page 10 of 12

ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NSI	See Conditions
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	+	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.		
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Reconstruction

The Standards will be applied taking into consideration the economic and technical feasibility of each project

feasibility of each project.

1. Reconstruction will be used to depict vanished or non-surviving portions of a property when documentary and physical evidence is available to permit accurate reconstruction with minimal conjecture, and such reconstruction is essential to the public understanding of the property.

- 2. Reconstruction of a landscape, building, structure or object in its historic location will be preceded by a thorough archeological investigation to identify and evaluate those features and artifacts that are essential to an accurate reconstruction. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
- 3. Reconstruction will include measures to preserve any remaining historic materials, features and spatial relationships.
- 4. Reconstruction will be based on the accurate duplication of historic features and elements substantiated by documentary or physical evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different features from other historic properties. A reconstructed property will re-create the appearance of the non-surviving historic property in materials, design, color and texture.
- 5. A reconstruction will be clearly identified as a contemporary re-creation.
- 6. Designs that were never executed historically will not be constructed.

Case #: 18COA1192-OL Page 12 of 12