



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Anthony Schneider, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: October 15, 2018

Case No: 18COA1228
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2224 Highland Avenue

Applicant: Kevin Greer
2224 Highland Avenue
Louisville, KY 40204
502-741-8275
KLG2273@aol.com

Owner: Same

Estimated Project Cost: \$24,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests to demolish a wood-frame garage structure constructed circa 1925 at the rear of the property. Applicant is also proposing new construction of a garage structure with a larger footprint and massing than what currently exists. The proposed garage is 24' wide by 40' deep with a height of 20'6" measured from grade to the highest point of the gable. The structure, as proposed, will be situated at the rear of the lot adjacent to the alley. The new garage will be clad with 4" cement board siding as well as board and batten in the gable. Additionally, the structure will have a two-car garage door and upper story vinyl windows with a three-over-one muntin configuration.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on September 12, 2018 and was considered complete and requiring committee review on October 1, 2018. Staff performed a site visit on October 15th to take photos and assess the structure from the exterior.

This case is scheduled for a hearing of the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee on Wednesday October 24th at 4:30pm in Conference Room 101 of 444 S 5th Street, the Metro Development Center.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Demolition, Garage, New Construction-Residential, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R-5B zoned property within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located mid-block on the southeast side of Highland Avenue and three lots from the intersection of Dudley Avenue while facing Cave Hill Cemetery. The home is a 1½ story Craftsman bungalow constructed of masonry and timber with a hip roof and front hip dormer. The site features a small, single car garage to the rear of the lot that likely dates to the construction of the main house, circa 1925. The home is situated amongst other Craftsman bungalows of 1½ to 2 stories all of which have accessory structures to the rear of the lot along the alley.

Staff found one COA on the property under case number **C-01-45-CT** which was a request to paint unpainted concrete foundation. Committee reviewed the case and application for the COA was denied.

Conclusions

Demolition: The project generally meets the Cherokee Triangle design guidelines for **Demolition**. The garage structure proposed for demolition is contemporaneous with the main house. The structure, as viewable from the exterior, shows significant signs of wood rot and some roof damages. A large amount of the rot is likely attributed to the cover of large pine trees that allow for moisture retention in wood. The building is also beginning to lean which is likely due to the rot, age, and a number of other potential factors. Restoration of the structure would require the removal and replacement of existing siding materials, the replacement of the garage door, the person door, and the side window. Staff finds that the amount of restoration required would yield a structure that require more new material than historic material thus staff recommends approval for demolition.

New Construction-Residential: In addition to the demolition, the applicant is also proposing a replacement structure of a larger footprint and massing than the current garage structure. Staff finds that this project generally meets the Cherokee Triangle design guidelines for **Garage, New Construction-Residential, and Site**. The new accessory garage structure would allow for a more functional accessory area and will not detract from the historic character of the home. The proposed garage will not be street visible and is subordinate in size and scale to the home. The structure, as proposed, has a gable roof with sloping eaves, windows in the half story, a yard side garage door for

access, and a double garage door facing the alley. The structure measures at 20'6" from grade to the highest point of the gable. The applicant proposes to use a 4" cement board siding on the first floor with either board and batten siding or shake shingle in the gable to break up vertical massing along the alley. The foundation will consist of poured concrete and the proposed garage doors will have design details that echo that of a carriage style door. A person door will be installed on east side to provide access and will be solid panel. The windows in the gable will be three-over-one vinyl windows in a coordinating color.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the request of demolition of the existing garage structure.

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved for the request of new construction with the following **conditions**:

1. **There shall be corner boards on all corners and trim around all openings.**
2. **Cement board siding shall be smooth-face with 4" exposure.**
3. **The garage shall have gutters that are consistent with that of the main house.**
4. **Windows shall have a three-over-one muntin configuration.**
5. **Any exterior lighting shall be presented to staff prior to installation.**
6. **Garage door shall not be flush mounted so that a sense of depth is present.**
7. **Garage door shall have articulated details to resemble that of a "carriage style" door.**
8. **Garage door shall be submitted to staff for review prior to installation.**
9. **Historic concrete mix shall be used for garage drive apron.**
10. **All new wood shall be painted or opaque stained within a period of 9 months.**
11. **Applicant shall make provisions for the storing and screening or trash receptacles.**
12. **Applicant shall incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.**
13. **Applicant shall obtain all necessary building permits.**
14. **If the design changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**



Anthony Schneider
Historic Preservation Specialist

10/18/18
Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklists

DEMOLITION

Design Guideline Checklist From Economic Hardship Exemption

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Introduction

Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

Demolition by Neglect

The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.	+	While the garage structure is indicative of the period, the level of restoration would render a new structure rather than a historic one.
DE2	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	NA	
DE3	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	NA	
DE4	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	NA	
DE5	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent with those features on adjacent properties.	NA	
DE6	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	NA	

GARAGE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	Structure will fall in line of the step-back pattern that currently exists for accessory structures along the alley.
		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	
		+	Minimize paving	
Materials	Walls	+	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	Corner boards and trim around openings with cement board siding and 4" exposure.
		+	Board and batten siding	
		NA	Brick	
		NA	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		NA	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	+	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	
		NA	Metal roofing	
		+	Half-round or Ogee gutters	Ogee Gutter to match house.
		+/-	Approved Gable-end element	Applicant is using a different siding material in lieu of a gable end detail to alleviate the vertical massing.
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		NA	No overly-elaborate volumes	
	Roof	+	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	Clipped gable with windows
		NA	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	
		NA	Intersecting gables	

		+	Overhanging eaves	
		+	Half-round gutters	
		NA	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	
		NA	No flush eaves	
		NA	No roofs without gutters	
Openings	Garage	+/-	Single-car openings	The narrow lot makes a 2 car garage difficult. Applicant proposes a double garage door with details to resemble 2 carriage doors.
	Doors	+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	
		+/-	No double and triple doors	See Conditions
		+	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	
	Windows	+	Use window openings to break up wall surface	
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	Applicant is required 1828sf of PYA or private yard area. Applicant has 1832sf of PYA with proposed garage and a variance will not be needed.
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	+/-	Existing building is in disrepair and restoration would remove enough historic character that it would be reconstruction.
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	New garage has a gable roof
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	New garage will be larger than the existing but the adjacent accessory structure is 2 stories
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	New structure will have 4" siding with board and batten siding in the gable.

NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	New garage is 1½ story
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	New garage will better enclose the rear yard.
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+	
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	New windows will be 3-over-1 muntin configuration
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+	Solid panel door
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	NA	
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+	See Conditions
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	NA	

NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	Staff recommends a clipped gable roof to reduce vertical massing.
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	NA	
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate, historic construction material is wood.	+	
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	NA	
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	NA	
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+	New garage will sit in line with other adjacent structures and have comparable siding materials.
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	

NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+/-	See Conditions
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	+	
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	+	
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	Historic Mix
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	

ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NSI	See Conditions
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	