Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:	Butchertown Architectural Review Committee
Thru:	Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From:	Becky P. Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date:	December 6, 2018

Case No: 18COA1297
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1043, 1045, 1049, and 1051 East Washington Street

Applicant:
Scott Kremer
Stuidio Kremer Architects
1231 Shelby Street
Louisville, KY 40203
502.499.1100 x 2503
scott@studiokremer.com

Owner:
Joseph Brown and Todd Roman
2101 Elderton Court
Brentwood, TN 37027
615.474.9269
joe.l.brown@aol.com

Architect: Same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: $2,800,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:
The proposed project is construction of a new 3-story multi-family residential structure, 37' in height with 15 units and approximately 19,508 sq. ft. It will be located on vacant parcels on the Northeast corner of N. Johnson Street and E. Washington Street and setback approximately 8½' from the property line. The new structure will have a flat roof, wide cornice, and brick sheathing. The foundation will be concrete slab with stone veneer or a parged finish. The south

elevation (front) facing E. Washington Street will feature 2 identical bays with a vertical separation element. Each bay has a row of 6-over-6 double-hung windows with accentuated lintels and sills on the 2nd and 3rd floors, and 3 windows and an entry door on the first floor. The entry has a door enframement and a half-lite door with a transom window. The west elevation facing N. Johnson Street will have a similar fenestration with 3 bays separated by a vertical element. Parking will be located behind the structure with access to the parking lot from N. Johnson Street. Four trees along N. Johnson Street are proposed for removal.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application
The application was received on November 21, 2018. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee Review on November 26, 2018.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Butchertown Architectural Review Committee on December 12, 2018 at 5:30 p.m. at Metro Development Center at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines
The following design review guidelines, approved for the Butchertown Preservation District are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **New Construction-Residential and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background
The subject property is located on the northeast corner of E. Washington Street and N. Johnson Street and is zoned R-6, R-7, and CM in a Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The rezoning case was passed by the Planning Commission on December 6, 2018 and will proceed to Metro Council. It is surrounded by 2-story industrial and commercial structures, as well as, 1- and 2-story residential structures.

Conclusions
The proposed new multi-family structure generally meets the applicable design guidelines for New Construction- Residential and Site. The design of the new structure is meets the recommendations of the guidelines for spatial organization, façade organization, and compatibility of roof forms, materials, window patterns, front door design, and orientation of the entrances as reflections of the historic context. The massing of the structure should be broken up some. The vertical feature in between bays may help with this. Staff recommends some variation of color and windows. The structure's set back is in line with its neighbors. The

proposed height is 1-story higher than the adjacent industrial building. However, this height does not conflict with this location at the corner.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved with the following conditions:

1. Foundation materials shall be of a warm-toned poured concrete or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance. If a stone veneer is to be used, a sample shall be submitted to staff for review and approval.
2. Brick shall be submitted to staff for review and approval.
3. Lighting shall be submitted to staff for review and approval.
4. All glazing shall be clear.
5. Historic concrete mix shall be used.
6. Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.
7. Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
8. All Planning & Design approvals and building permits shall be obtained prior to construction.
9. If the design changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Becky P. Gorman
Historic Preservation Specialist

12/7/18
Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist
2. photos

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted

NA Not Applicable

NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	NSI	See conditions of approval.
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	NA	
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	NSI	Brick shall be submitted to staff for review and approval.
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	NA	
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+	
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+/-	The vertical feature in between bays may help break up the massing of the structure. See conclusions.
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+	

NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+	
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+	See conclusions.
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	+	
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	NSI	
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	NSI	
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	NSI	See conditions of approval
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NSI	Lintels and sills are proposed. Material was not submitted.
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NSI	See conditions of approval.

NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+	
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	NA	
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	NA	
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	NA	
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	NA	
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	NA	
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NSI	See conditions of approval

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NSI	Historic concrete mix shall be used.
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NSI	Historic concrete mix shall be used.
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	

ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NSI	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NSI	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NSI	A landscaping plan shall be submitted for compliance with Chapter 10 of the LDC.
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	+	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NSI	A landscaping plan shall be submitted for compliance with Chapter 10 of the LDC.
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	