



---

## Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

---

### Report to the Committee

---

---

To: Parkland Architectural Review Committee  
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*  
From: Becky P. Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist  
Date: December 7, 2018

---

**Case No:** 18COA1273  
**Classification:** Committee Review

#### GENERAL INFORMATION

**Property Address:** 2736 Virginia Avenue and 1213 S. 28<sup>th</sup> Street

**Applicant:** Chauncey Turner  
AC Investment LLC  
P.O. Box 11576  
Louisville, KY 40251  
502.387.2545  
Chaturner.ct67@gmail.com

**Owner:** same as applicant

#### Estimated Project Cost:

#### Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The proposed project is construction of a new multi-family residential structure on a vacant parcel with approximately 2,240 sq. ft. and 8-units. The structure is a proposed 1-story wood frame structure to be sheathed in horizontal Hardie lap siding and brick on a concrete slab foundation. The brick would be about 30"-36" from the foundation and then lap-siding from that point up. The new structure will feature a front gable roof with asphalt shingles. The north elevation (front) will feature: 2 front doors with gables above the entrances which will come out approximately 18" from the front façade and 2 windows which are proposed as 2-over-2 double hung windows. The east and west side elevations will feature: similar details 3 doors with gables above the entries and 2-over-2 double hung windows. The rear elevation will have two person doors for access to

mechanical rooms. The applicant is proposing 6-panel metal doors and vinyl windows.

### **Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application**

The application was received on October 25, 2018. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee Review on October 29, 2018.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Parkland Architectural Review Committee on December 12, 2018 at 6:30 p.m. at Metro Development Center at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 101.

## **FINDINGS**

### **Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Parkland Preservation District are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **New Construction-Residential and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

### **Site Context/ Background**

The subject property is located on the south side of Virginia Avenue, the second lot east of S. 28<sup>th</sup> Street. It includes 1213 S. 28<sup>th</sup> Street which has a circa 1930 commercial building. The lot wraps 2746 Virginia Avenue, which is the corner lot. It is zoned C-1 and R-7 in a Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The lot is surrounded by a newer 1-story commercial structure and 2- and 2½-story wood frame and masonry structures, built in the early 1900s.

### **Conclusions**

The proposed new single family structure generally meets the applicable design guidelines for New Construction-Residential and Site. The design meets the recommendations of the guidelines for spatial organization, façade organization, and compatibility of roof forms, massing, materials, window patterns, front door design, and orientation of the main entrance as reflections of the historic context. The structure's set back and height are in between those of its neighbors. A raised foundation would bring some height to the structure and therefore more compatible in height with the adjacent structures. The porches on the residential structures along Virginia Avenue are a character defining feature. In order to better meet guideline **NC35** staff recommends a porch that stretches across the front of the structure which will keep the continuity of porches along the streetscape.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved with the following conditions:

1. A porch across the front of the structure that is reflective of the porches along the streetscape.
2. Lap-siding shall be smooth-face and have a 4" exposure.
3. A raised foundation of a warm-toned poured concrete or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.
4. Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.
5. Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.
6. All glazing shall be clear.
7. All drainage issues to be addressed appropriately to ensure no adverse impact to the park or adjacent sites.
8. Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.
9. Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
10. All Planning & Design approvals and building permits shall be obtained prior to construction.
11. If the design changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.



Becky P. Gorman  
Historic Preservation Specialist

12/7/18  
Date

#### Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist
2. photos

## NEW CONSTRUCTION

### RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

|      | Guideline                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Finding | Comment                     |
|------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|-----------------------------|
| NC1  | Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | NSI     | See conditions of approval. |
| NC2  | Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.                                                                                                                                            | NA      |                             |
| NC3  | Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | +       |                             |
| NC4  | Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | +       |                             |
| NC5  | Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | +       |                             |
| NC6  | Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding. | +       |                             |
| NC7  | Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | +       |                             |
| NC8  | Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | NA      |                             |
| NC9  | Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | +       |                             |
| NC10 | Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.                                                                                                                                              | +/-     |                             |
| NC11 | Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.                                             | +       |                             |
| NC12 | Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).                                                                                   | +       |                             |
| NC13 | Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.                                                                                                                                                                                 | +       |                             |
| NC14 | Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.                                                                                                                                                                        | +       |                             |
| NC15 | Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | +       |                             |

|             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |     |  |
|-------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|--|
| <b>NC16</b> | Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | +   |  |
| <b>NC17</b> | Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | NA  |  |
| <b>NC18</b> | Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | NA  |  |
| <b>NC19</b> | Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.                                                                                                                                             | NA  |  |
| <b>NC20</b> | Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | +   |  |
| <b>NC21</b> | Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.                                                                                                                                                                         | +   |  |
| <b>NC22</b> | Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.                                                                                                                                                                                                         | +   |  |
| <b>NC23</b> | Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.                                                                                              | +   |  |
| <b>NC24</b> | Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | +   |  |
| <b>NC25</b> | Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated. | +   |  |
| <b>NC26</b> | Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.                                                                                                                                                                          | +   |  |
| <b>NC27</b> | Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | NA  |  |
| <b>NC28</b> | Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | +   |  |
| <b>NC29</b> | Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | NSI |  |
| <b>NC30</b> | Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.                                                                                                                       | +   |  |
| <b>NC31</b> | Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.                                                                                                                                                                                  | NA  |  |
| <b>NC32</b> | Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | NA  |  |
| <b>NC33</b> | Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | NA  |  |

|             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |     |                 |
|-------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|-----------------|
| <b>NC34</b> | Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.                                                                                  | NA  |                 |
| <b>NC35</b> | Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.            | +/- | See conclusions |
| <b>NC36</b> | Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head. | NA  | See conclusions |
| <b>NC37</b> | Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | NA  |                 |
| <b>NC38</b> | Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.                                                                                                                                                                                    | NA  |                 |
| <b>NC39</b> | Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.                                                                                                                                         | NA  |                 |
| <b>NC40</b> | Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | NA  |                 |
| <b>NC41</b> | Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.                                                                                                                                                                                                     | NA  |                 |
| <b>NC42</b> | Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.                                                                                                                                                                                                               | NA  |                 |
| <b>NC43</b> | Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | +   |                 |
| <b>NC44</b> | Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | +   |                 |

## SITE

### Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

|      | Guideline                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Finding | Comment |
|------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|---------|
| ST1  | Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | +       |         |
| ST2  | Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | NA      |         |
| ST3  | Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | NA      |         |
| ST4  | Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original. | NA      |         |
| ST5  | Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | NA      |         |
| ST6  | Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | NA      |         |
| ST7  | Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | +       |         |
| ST8  | Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.                                                                                                                                                           | +       |         |
| ST9  | Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | NA      |         |
| ST10 | Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | NA      |         |
| ST11 | Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | NA      |         |
| ST12 | Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | NA      |         |
| ST13 | Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | NA      |         |
| ST14 | Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | NA      |         |
| ST15 | Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.                                                                                                                                                                     | NA      |         |
| ST16 | Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | NA      |         |

|             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |     |  |
|-------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|--|
| <b>ST17</b> | Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | NSI |  |
| <b>ST18</b> | Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | NSI |  |
| <b>ST19</b> | Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | NA  |  |
| <b>ST20</b> | Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | NA  |  |
| <b>ST21</b> | Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | NA  |  |
| <b>ST22</b> | Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons. | NA  |  |
| <b>ST23</b> | Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | NA  |  |
| <b>ST24</b> | Install utility lines underground whenever possible.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | NA  |  |