




Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer 
From: Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: February 22, 2019

Case No: 19COA1016
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2108 New Main Street

Applicant: Kathryn Klein and Melissa Beavin
524 Lola Road
Louisville, KY 40207
502-295-7264
502-291-6175
kathrynklein19@gmail.com
melissabeavin@gmail.com

Owner: same as applicants

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to replace the existing wood windows on the front facade. The front elevation windows are 1/1 double hung wood windows, a one-lite casement window, and a transom window. The new windows will be 1/1 double hung vinyl windows.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on January 22, 2019 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on January 28, 2019. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on February 27, 2019 at 5:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 302.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Windows**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the south side of New Main Street, midblock between Frankfort Avenue and S. Bellaire Avenue. The site is zoned R5A within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The frame shotgun house is surrounded by other frame shotgun houses and faces the railroad tracks.

Staff recently approved a COA (19COA1015) for the replacement of the side and rear windows.

Conclusions

The proposed window replacement does not meet the Clifton design guidelines for **Windows**. The windows located on the front façade of the shotgun portion of the building are in good condition and only need minor maintenance. The windows located on the front façade of the camelback portion of the building are in rougher shape but still should be repaired. While the windows are 1/1 double hung wood windows, they contain some character defining features like ogee brackets and decorative trim.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, his successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

2/22/19
Date


Savannah Darr
Planning & Design Coordinator

Windows

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+ Meets Guidelines
 - Does Not Meet Guidelines
 +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

NA Not Applicable
 NSI Not Sufficient Information

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|-----------|---|---------|---|
| W1 | The maintenance and repair of historic windows are essential to preserving the historic character and fabric of Clifton structures and the overall Clifton historic district. For that reason, historic windows on street-address façades and street-facing façades shall not be replaced with new windows unless the Clifton ARC determines that the condition of existing windows, safety or energy efficiency considerations, or other relevant factors support window replacement. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows. | +/- | The applicant is aware of the Clifton design guidelines and procedures. The applicant proposes 1/1 double hung vinyl windows for the front façade. However, the windows are not severely deteriorated. They contain some character defining details that could be lost with replacement. |
| W2 | If historic windows on façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades are replaced, or the owner is authorized to replace windows on street-address façade or street-facing façade pursuant to W1, the new windows shall convey the same visual appearance as the historic windows. The visual appearance of a window is based on details such as sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and other decorative features. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of wood, metal, or synthetic window systems for authorized window replacement is permissible. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows. | - | The applicant proposes 1/1 double hung vinyl windows for the front façade. The replacement windows cannot replicate the ogee bracket and appearance of a historic window. |
| W3 | Replacement sash should not be used that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows. | + | |
| W4 | Replacement windows proposed for façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades, and those authorized pursuant to W1 for street-address façades and street-facing façades, shall operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements. | + | |
| W5 | Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance with W2 shall have such muntins permanently applied and may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass panes. | NA | |

| | Guideline | Finding | Comment |
|------------|--|---------|--|
| W6 | Reflective or insulating film shall not be applied to window glass on street-address façades or street-facing façades. | NA | |
| W7 | Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass shall not be used on windows on street-address façades or street-facing façades. | NA | |
| W8 | Transoms or sidelights shall not be blocked-in or back-painted. | NA | |
| W9 | The number, size, location, or shape of original windows shall not be altered on street-address façades or street-facing façades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact. | NA | |
| W10 | Any new window openings for a new use shall not be located on street-address façades or street-facing façades. | NA | |
| W11 | The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side of historic window trim. | NSI | If the window replacement is approved, this should be a condition of approval. |
| W12 | New floors or dropped ceilings shall not be installed that block the glazed area of windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed. | NA | |
| W13 | If exterior storm windows are installed they should duplicate the shape of the original window. | NA | |
| W14 | When installing exterior storm windows or screens do not damage or obscure historic windows or frames. | NA | |
| W15 | Window sashes shall not be altered to accommodate window air-conditioning units. | NA | |
| W16 | When installing security bars do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours. | NA | |
| W17 | Awnings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade. | NA | |
| W18 | Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building. | NA | |
| W19 | Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units. | NA | |
| W20 | On commercial buildings attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows. | NA | |
| W21 | Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works). | NA | |
| W22 | Replacement shutters should match the visual appearance, size, and location of the originals and may be constructed of wood, metal, or synthetic material. | NA | |
| W23 | Shutters shall be installed only where there is historic evidence for them. | NA | |