



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:	Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru:	Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer <i>JH for</i>
From:	Becky Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date:	May 1, 2019

Case No: 19COA1117
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1425 South Brook Street

Applicant: Harold Glass
Stormy Realty LLC
1101 S Brook Street
Louisville, KY 40203
502.216.0245
Hglass1971@bellsouth.net

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$15,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks after-the-fact approval to install vinyl Dutch lap siding over original wood lap siding, and vinyl siding covering the soffits, and ornamental window details and replace the existing gutters.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on April 19, 2019. The application was considered complete and requiring Committee Review on April 22, 2019.

The case is scheduled for a hearing at the regular meeting of the Old Louisville Preservation District Architectural Review Committee on May 8, 2019 at 5:30 p.m. in Conference Room 302 of Metro Development Center at 444 S. 5th Street.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Siding**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report. The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The 2-story Victorian Queen Anne style wood lap-sided house is located on the east side of S. Brook Street mid-block between E. Burnett Ave and E. Magnolia Ave. The property is zoned TNZD within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. It is surrounded by 2- to 2½- story masonry and wood frame residences of the same era. There is one previous case on this property which approved a new asphalt shingle roof in 1975.

Staff issued a Stop Work Order on April 15, 2019 for the installation of vinyl siding without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Upon arrival approximately 75% of the siding had already been installed.

Conclusions

The proposal to install Dutch lap siding on all sides of the house does not meet Guideline SD7 or SD8. Guideline SD7 does not allow for vinyl siding to be installed on the primary, front façade. The guideline states "Do not install vinyl or aluminum siding on primary elevations on historic buildings. Retention of exposed original wood siding is always preferred; however, if a decision is made to apply siding to side and rear elevations, it should be done in a way that does not obscure or damage historic ornament, such as fishscale shingles, window casings, sills, hoods, brackets, and cornerboards." The proposal for vinyl siding on the front façade, and its current installation obscure the historic ornamental fishscale shingles, window casings, ornamental details, and sills which are character defining features of the structure and this period of architecture. Soffits should not be covered with vinyl siding. Installation of vinyl siding on the sides and rear, according to Guideline SD8, should match the dimensions of the original siding and historic fabric, trim, and cornerboards. The proposed Dutch lap siding, does not match the original siding which is traditional lap siding. Additionally, vinyl siding should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and allows the historic trim and cornerboards to project slightly beyond the vinyl siding. A smooth-faced, narrow-profile (matching the existing wood siding) vinyl siding would be more appropriate for the rear and side elevations.

Replacing the gutters with like gutters is considered general maintenance and does not need a COA.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness as proposed be Denied.


Becky Gorman
Historic Preservation Specialist

Date 5/2/19

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff guideline checklist

SIDING & TRIM

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SD1	Do not replace missing wood features with conjectural or falsely-historic reconstructions or with newly-designed elements that are incompatible with the building's size, scale, material, or color.	NA	Wood features are not proposed for replacement.
SD2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	
SD3	Consider using contemporary wood siding, which conveys the visual appearance of historic siding, when replacement of such materials is required.	NSI	Staff is not aware if the applicant considered contemporary siding.
SD4	Do not use textured plywood (T-111) vertical siding. It is not an appropriate substitute material.	NA	T-111 is not proposed
SD5	Do not install artificial stone, asbestos shingles, or asphalt shingles over or as a replacement for exterior siding.	NA	
SD6	Orient all replacement siding horizontally, unless there is sound, historic documentation for a different original orientation.	+	
SD7	Do not install vinyl or aluminum siding on primary elevations on historic buildings. Retention of exposed original wood siding is always preferred; however, if a decision is made to apply siding to side and rear elevations, it should be done in a way that does not obscure or damage historic ornament, such as fishscale shingles, window casings, sills, hoods, brackets, and cornerboards.	-	See conclusions
SD8	Use only vinyl or aluminum siding that matches the dimensions of the original siding. Generally, smooth-faced, narrow-profile siding (3" or 4" depending on the character of the existing siding) is acceptable for installation on secondary elevations. Wherever possible without causing damage to historic fabric, trim, such as cornerboards, should project slightly beyond the vinyl siding.	-	See conclusions
SD9	Make sure that removal, handling, and disposal of lead-containing paint complies with all local, state, and federal	NSI	Staff is not aware of paint removal.

	standards.		
SD10	Do not remove exterior siding to install insulation within the exterior walls of historic wood frame construction. This can result in damage to historic fabric. Installation of insulation with a proper vapor barrier should be done from the interior.	NA	