




Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer 
From: Anthony Schneider, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: May 30, 2019

Case No: 19COA1138
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 937 Cherokee Road

Applicant: Deirdre & Stephen Seim
937 Cherokee Road
Louisville, KY 40204
502-403-9839
225-772-1393
theseimfamily@gmail.com

Owner: Same as Applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$19,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant is requesting to install wood deck of 30" in height on the south side of the home and on the eastern rear of the home. The deck will not have a hand rail. Additionally, the applicant is seeking approval to alter a sunroom window and two side windows by turning them into doors for access to the proposed deck.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on May 8, 2019 and was considered complete and requiring committee review on May 15, 2019. Staff met with the applicant on the date of submittal. Staff also met with the applicant's contractor in mid-April to inform them of the need for a COA.

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Addition**

and **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R-5A zoned property within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located mid-block on the east side of Cherokee Road between Eastern Star Drive and Highland Ave. This home is a three-story stucco and masonry structure built in the Italianate style with an early twentieth-century sunroom addition on the south side. This home is surrounded by other masonry home of a similar period in varying architectural styles.

Previous COA's on the property include a replacement and redesign of the front, entry vestibule under **S-05-24-CT** and the change of a window to a door under **S-00-84-CT**.

Conclusions

The project generally meets the Cherokee Triangle design guidelines for **Window** and partially meets the design guidelines or **Addition**.


Window: Staff finds that the alteration of the side windows on the historic addition and the window on the rear of the sunroom addition to have a minor impact on the overall integrity of the home and district. The applicant will be replacing the wood windows with new wood doors with the door glass having a sympathetic glass to frame ratio when compared to the existing sunroom windows. The applicant has agreed to repurpose the limestone sills and use them for the new door thresholds. Additionally, staff recommends that the applicant keep as much historic window trim as possible for the retention of historic fabric. Lastly, the windows are not severely deteriorated; however, the applicant has agreed to salvage the windows for restoration on other sides of the home.

Addition: Staff finds that the proposed deck would not meet Guidelines **A16** and **A17**. Guideline **A16** states that new decks should not be constructed on the side facades of a structure. The proposed deck is located on the side behind the historic sunroom addition; however, the deck extends beyond that addition toward the side property line by as little as three feet and up to five feet. It could be argued that the sunroom addition has rendered the area behind it as effective rear yard space, but the proposed deck extends beyond the sunroom addition. Staff finds that the proposal could meet the spirit Guideline **A16** should the applicant choose to modify the design and bring the deck flush with of the sunroom addition. This modification would bring the proposed deck into compliance with Guideline **A17** which states that the deck should not extend beyond the side walls of the structure.

Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. The applicant shall obtain all necessary building permits.
2. Deck and associated elements of the structure shall not extend beyond the sunroom addition.
3. All new wood shall be painted or opaque stained within a period of 9 months from date of COA approval.
4. Removed limestone window sills shall be repurposed as the threshold for the new doors in the same openings.
5. Historic window trim shall be retained and reused around the new doors.
6. Applicant shall work with staff on supplying detailed photos of the windows being altered for documentation.
7. If design changes are necessary, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.



Anthony Schneider
Historic Preservation Specialist

5/30/19
Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+/-	The deck is low to the ground and has a minimal impact; however the deck's size due to proposed location makes it less compatible with the neighborhood character.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	NA	
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	

A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	Deck is made of wood.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	NA	
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	NA	
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	NA	
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	NA	
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	NA	
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	NA	
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	See Conditions.
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	-	The deck as proposed is to be installed on the side of the structure behind the historic sunroom addition and will extend beyond the addition toward the property line. The deck will go down the side and wrap around the rear.
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	-	Deck will be attached to the side walls of the structure and extend

			beyond the historic sunroom addition.
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	+/-	Windows are not severely deteriorated but will be salvaged to repair other windows on the home. The window openings will become new doors. Windows being altered include two side windows in the historic addition and one window set in the sunroom.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+	New doors will have a muntin configuration consistent to that of the sunroom windows.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	+	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	NSI	
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	NA	
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	NA	
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	+	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	NSI	
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	NSI	
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	

W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+	Windows being altered are on the side of the historic addition and on the rear of the sunroom addition.
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	+	Window is modified to accommodate a new door.
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	+	See Conditions.
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	

W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	See Conditions.