



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Johnson-Historic Preservation Officer *CJ*
From: Becky Gorman-Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: May 30, 2019

Case No: 19COA1144
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1416 Willow Ave

Applicant: Tommy Arnold
Aspire Real Estate Group
1416 Willow Avenue #11B
Louisville, KY 40204
502.424.1133
tommy@tommyarnold.com

Owner: Tommy Arnold
Aspire Real Estate Designs
1416 Willow Avenue #11B
Louisville, KY 40204

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to replace 18 original wood windows in the unit with new 6-over-1 aluminum-clad wood windows. Andersen Architectural Collection windows are the proposed replacement windows.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application packet was received on May 10, 2019. It was determined to be complete and requiring Committee review on May 13, 2019.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site, zoned R8A, is located on the west side of Willow Avenue in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. It is located at the northwest corner of Baringer Avenue and Willow Avenue. The site contains an eleven story Beaux Arts style apartment building surrounded by other multi-story apartment buildings of varying architectural styles. A previous COA (18COA1219) approved the replacement of missing windows on the rear elevation of the unit 11B.

Staff visited the site on April 18th to evaluate the condition of the windows prior to the owner submitting the application. Staff photographed and evaluated the windows based on the Historic Window Condition Checklist. The windows on the south elevation facing Baringer Avenue, and on the west elevation facing Bardstown Road have evidence more weathering. Generally the windows meet Class One or Two on the condition checklist meaning the windows are repairable with paint removal, reglazing, weather stripping, calking and repainting; replacement of missing or broken panes would meet Class Two and at most a Class Three meaning the windows can be repaired with partial replacement.

Conclusions

The windows proposed for replacement do not meet "severely deteriorated" as required in W1 of the Window Design Guidelines. Staff visited the site on April 18th to evaluate the condition of the windows prior to the owner submitting the application. Staff photographed and evaluated the windows based on the Historic Window Condition Checklist. The windows on the south elevation, facing Baringer Avenue, and on the west elevation, facing Bardstown Road, have evidence of more weathering. Generally the windows meet Class One or Two on the condition checklist meaning the windows are repairable with paint removal, reglazing, weather stripping, calking and repainting. Replacement of missing or broken panes would meet Class Two and at most Class Three meaning the windows can be repaired with partial replacement. During the site visit, staff observed that there has been water infiltration into the unit from the ceiling and evidence of infiltration from the decorative elements surrounding the windows. The windows have more than likely sustained some damage from this water infiltration from the roof.

Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be Denied.


Becky P. Gorman
Historic Preservation Specialist

Date

5/30/19

Attached Documents / Information

1. Staff Guideline Checklist
2. Staff photos

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	-	The windows proposed for replacement do not meet the criteria for severely deteriorated.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	NA	See W1. The proposed replacement windows meet this criterion.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NSI	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	NA	If the replacement of windows were to be approved the proposed replacement windows should meet this criterion.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	NA	If the replacement of windows were to be approved the proposed replacement windows should meet this criterion.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	NA	If the replacement of windows were to be approved the proposed replacement windows should meet this criterion.

W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	If the replacement of windows were to be approved the proposed replacement windows should meet this criterion.
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	NA	
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	

W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	