

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

A meeting of the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission was held on Thursday, August 29, 2019 at 9:00 a.m. at the Old Jail Building located at 514 W. Liberty Street, Louisville, Kentucky.

Commission Members present:

Chris Hartman
Robert Kirchdorfer
Emily Liu
Stefanie Buzan
Amin Omidy
Joanne Weeter
Howard Rosenberg
Carrye Jones
Tamika Jackson (arrived at approximately 9:15 a.m.)

Commission Members absent (Excused):

Christopher Fuller
Jay Stottman
Ashlyn Ackerman

Staff Members Present:

Dave Marchal, Deputy Director. Develop Louisville
Joe Haberman, Planning & Design Manager
Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Becky Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
John Carroll, Legal Counsel
Sue Reid, Management Assistant

The following matters were considered:

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

**JUNE 20, 2019 HISTORIC LANDMARKS AND PRESERVATION DISTRICTS
COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES**

00:02:17 On a motion by Commissioner Omidy, seconded by Commissioner Liu, the following resolution was adopted:

RESOLVED, the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission does hereby **APPROVE** the minutes of the meeting conducted on June 20, 2019.

The vote was as follows:

Yes: Commissioners Buzan, Rosenberg, Hartman, Liu, Omidy, Jones, Kirchdorfer, and Jackson

Abstain: Commissioner Weeter

Absent: Commissioners Ackerman, Fuller, and Stottman

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19DESIGNATION1000

| | |
|-------------------|--|
| Request: | Individual Landmark Petition |
| Project Name: | Holy Name Complex Designation Request |
| Request: | 2914 S. 3rd Street and 2911 S. 4th Street |
| Jurisdiction: | Louisville Metro |
| Council District: | 15-Kevin Triplett |
| Case Manager: | Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator |

The draft designation report prepared for this case was incorporated into the record. The Commissioners received this report in advance of the hearing, and this report was available to any interested party prior to the public hearing. (The draft designation report is part of the case file maintained at Planning and Design Services offices, 444 South 5th Street.)

An audio/visual recording of the Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission meeting related to this case is available on the Planning & Design Services website, or you may contact the Customer Service staff to obtain a copy.

00:04:15 Chair Hartman briefly explained the designation process (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:06:39 John Carroll, Legal Counsel, briefly explained that the new Landmarks Ordinance would pertain to this case (see recording for detailed presentation).

Agency Testimony:

00:08:59 Savannah Darr presented the case and showed a Powerpoint presentation. Ms. Darr briefly reviewed the criterion for Integrity. Ms. Darr reviewed the Integrity of building 1 through 4 (see recording for detailed presentation).

The following spoke in favor of the petition:

Ann Ramser, 307 East Kenwood Drive, Louisville, KY 40214
Mike O'Leary, 1963 Payne Street, Louisville, KY 40206
Mary Purple, 4121 Brown Lane, Unit A8, Louisville, KY 40220
Jeff Underhill, 946 Goss Avenue, Louisville, KY 40217

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19DESGNATION1000

Summary of testimony of those in favor:

00:21:59 Ann Ramser spoke in favor of the petition. Ms. Ramser provided an email in support to the Commissioners. Ms. Ramser showed a Powerpoint presentation. Ms. Ramser objected to using the August 8, 2019 amended ordinance to control the procedures for this Holy Name Landmark Petition, and moved to use the ordinance that was in effect when the petition was filed, and asked if the Commission would make that decision now (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:29:27 Chair Hartman stated there is no decision to be made; the law in Louisville is now the current Landmarks Ordinance, and we have no choice but to operate under it (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:29:44 Ms. Ramser stated that will be appealed. Ms. Ramser continued her presentation (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:56:46 Mike O'Leary spoke in favor of the petition and showed a Powerpoint presentation (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:03:59 Mary Purple spoke in favor of the petition and showed a Powerpoint presentation (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:13:03 Jeff Underhill spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

The following spoke in opposition of the petition:

Jon Baker, 500 W. Jefferson St., Suite 2800, Louisville, KY 40202

Father Bill Bowling, 501 Cherrywood Rd., Louisville, KY 40207

Bruce Hines, 8100 Windsor Lakes Ct., Louisville, KY 40214

Lisa DeJaco Crutcher, 2911 S. Fourth St., Louisville, KY 40208

Mark Trier, 829 E. Market, Louisville, KY 40206

Bill Weyland, 815 W. Market, Louisville, KY 40202

Summary of testimony of those in opposition:

01:20:25 Jon Baker spoke in opposition of the petition and showed a Powerpoint presentation. Mr. Baker introduced speakers in opposition (see recording for detailed presentation).

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19DESIGNATION1000

01:26:14 Father Bill Bowling spoke in opposition of the petition. Father Bowling briefly reviewed the history of the parish. Father Bowling stated with the decline of finances, the ability to take care of buildings becomes far more challenging. Father Bowling introduced Bruce Hines, Business Manager, to speak in regard to the history of finances and the state of the buildings (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:36:23 Bruce Hines spoke in opposition of the petition. Mr. Hines spoke in regard to Holy Name's finances. Mr. Hines stated in late 2016 he had a meeting with Collin Underhill with Underhill and Associates. Mr. Hines stated he provided Mr. Underhill with a copy of an appraisal that had been obtained by Father David Sanchez who was the prior pastor, in an attempt to try to market the buildings. Mr. Hines stated Mr. Underhill evaluated the properties and indicated that there was absolutely no interest on the part of the investors in Underhill and Associates in assuming any responsibility for either the gym or the school because of their condition and because of the high rates of crime, poverty and drug addiction in the neighborhood. Mr. Hines stated there was some point being made about demolition through neglect, and that is not purposeful. Mr. Hines stated from the period of July, 2015 through August, 2019, Holy Name has spent 218,000 plus dollars in capital improvements. Mr. Hines stated over the last four years, Holy Name has been operating at a \$40,000 deficit, so any neglect in terms of trying to maintain buildings that are no longer serving a useful purpose for Holy Name is certainly not be design, it is out of necessity (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:43:08 Father Bowling spoke. Father Bowling showed a map which indicated where people come from in Louisville Metro. Father Bowling stated in looking to their history of building and tearing down and building again to have structures that fit the ministries that they want to do, they stand in support of the efforts of the Archdiocese to renew their campus to suit the purpose of ministry on the property that they own for the present and for the future (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:50:00 Jon Baker stated what they are looking to accomplish on the campus is removing non-income-producing religious structures and replacing them with another non-income religious structure. Mr. Baker stated the priority on the grounds is the church building, but the church building also needs resources to keep up, so it becomes an effort to allocate resources around the complex so as to maintain buildings, so they completely disagree with the allegations that have been put forth that this is demolition by neglect. Mr. Baker

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19DESIGNATION1000

stated there is a need for parking on the campus as they move forward (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:52:09 Lisa DeJaco Crutcher, CEO of Catholic Charities, spoke in opposition of the petition. Ms. Crutcher spoke in regard to the mission and ministries of Catholic Charities. Ms. Crutcher stated these buildings are not functional for the work they're trying to do. Ms. Crutcher stated the Holy Name location, however, is excellent for the work they're doing. Ms. Crutcher stated this is a neighborhood with a long history of Roman Catholic presence, and it's important to the church and Catholic Charities Ministry to maintain a presence there. Ms. Crutcher spoke in regard to disrepair of the buildings and the expense of upkeep. Ms. Crutcher spoke in regard to the need for parking (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:10:44 Jon Baker noted objection that they are being deprived of due process if they are not allowed to continue their case in objection to this designation. Mr. Baker introduced Mark Trier (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:12:01 Mark Trier with JRA Architects stated JRA was hired by Catholic Charities to evaluate these buildings in terms of their program and also in terms of renovation costs. Mr. Trier showed a Powerpoint presentation and discussed evaluation criteria. Mr. Trier stated they cannot recommend rehabilitation of these buildings (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:26:32 Jon Baker reviewed legal objections to landmark designation, and introduced Bill Weyland (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:29:34 Bill Weyland spoke in opposition of the petition. Mr. Weyland stated he is an individual who greatly respects the work of preservation. Mr. Weyland stated in his professional capacity he has saved over forty buildings throughout this region that are historic in nature. Mr. Weyland stated he still believes that demolition in some instances is required to really have impactful redevelopment because of the real cost of saving buildings. Mr. Weyland reviewed examples of repurposed buildings. Mr. Weyland stated the Preservation Task Force was very specific that this is exactly the type of situation that we try to avoid; we try to avoid last minute landmarking of buildings that had already been through the other systems of government like zoning (see recording for detailed presentation).

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19DESIGNATION1000

Public speakers:

Rosemary Hauck McCandless, 418 W. Kenwood Dr., Louisville, KY 40214

Heath Seymour, 631 S. 5th Street, Louisville, KY 40202

Eileen Murphy, 5611 Carolyn Way, Louisville, KY 40219

Keith Runyon, 1400 Willow Ave., Louisville, KY 40204

Ted Stone, 2830 Tremont Drive, Louisville, KY 40205

Martina Kunnecke, 311 Northwestern Pkwy., Louisville, KY 40211

Debra Harlan, 1734 Chichester Ave., Louisville, KY 40205

Cherise Williams, 1923 Quarry Street, Louisville, KY 40206

Summary of testimony of public speakers:

02:39:47 Rosemary Hauck McCandless spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:42:06 Heath Seymour spoke neither for nor against the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:43:52 Eileen Murphy spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:45:39 Keith Runyon spoke neither for nor against the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:47:53 Ted Stone spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:50:22 Martina Kunnecke spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:52:58 Debra Harlan spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:55:18 Cherise Williams spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

REBUTTAL:

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19DESGNATION1000

02:57:34 Ann Ramser spoke in rebuttal (see recording for detailed presentation).

03:00:35 Lisa DeJaco Crutcher spoke in rebuttal (see recording for detailed presentation).

03:02:51 Commissioner Weeter stated she strongly feels that they should defer any decision on this property and on this designation report at this moment (see recording for detailed presentation).

03:03:32 Commissioners' deliberation

03:06:43 On a motion by Commissioner Weeter, seconded by Commissioner Jones, the following resolution was adopted:

RESOLVED, the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission does hereby **CONTINUE** Case Number 19DESGNATION1000 to the September 19, 2019 Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission meeting, and that the Commission and the community be afforded an opportunity to take a closer look at the property in question with the permission of the Archdiocese and Catholic Charities, and to not close the public record.

The vote was as follows:

Yes: Commissioners Weeter, Buzan, Rosenberg, Hartman, Liu, Omidy, Jones, Kirchdorfer, and Jackson

Absent: Commissioners Ackerman, Fuller, and Stottman

**Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes
SPECIAL MEETING**

August 29, 2019

The meeting adjourned at approximately 12:18 p.m.

Chairman

Division Director