

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 21, 2019

A meeting of the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission was held on Thursday, November 21, 2019 at 9:00 a.m. at the Old Jail Building located at 514 W. Liberty Street, Louisville, Kentucky.

Commission Members present:

Chris Hartman
Emily Liu
Jay Stottman
Stefanie Buzan (left at approximately 10:45 a.m.)
Amin Omidy
Joanne Weeter
Ashlyn Ackerman
Christopher Fuller
Morgan Ward
Carrye Jones
Tamika Jackson
Howard Rosenberg
Robert Kirchdorfer (arrived at approximately 9:25 a.m.)

Staff Members Present:

Dave Marchal, Deputy Director. Develop Louisville
Joe Haberman, Planning & Design Manager
Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Becky Gorman, Historic Preservation Specialist
John Carroll, Legal Counsel
Sue Reid, Management Assistant

The following matters were considered:

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 21, 2019

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

OCTOBER 17, 2019 HISTORIC LANDMARKS AND PRESERVATION DISTRICTS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

00:06:33 On a motion by Commissioner Weeter, seconded by Commissioner Buzan, the following resolution was adopted:

RESOLVED, the Louisville Metro Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission does hereby **APPROVE** the Minutes of the meeting conducted on October 17, 2019.

The vote was as follows:

Yes: Commissioners Buzan, Ackerman, Stottman, Omidy, Weeter, Jones, Jackson, Fuller, Ward, and Hartman

Abstain: Commissioners Liu, and Rosenberg

Absent: Commissioner Kirchdorfer

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 21, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19-LANDMARK-0002

Request: Individual Landmark Petition
Project Name: Skinner-Hoke House
Request: 5605 Fincastle Farm Trace (formerly 7607 Wolf Pen Branch Rd.)
Jurisdiction: Louisville Metro
Council District: 16-Scott Reed
Case Manager: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer

The Draft Designation Report prepared for this case was incorporated into the record. The Commissioners received this report in advance of the hearing, and this report was available to any interested party prior to the public hearing. The Draft Designation Report is part of the case file maintained at Planning and Design Services offices, 444 South 5th Street.

An audio/visual recording of the Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission meeting related to this case is available on the Planning & Design Services website, or you may contact the Customer Service staff to obtain a copy.

Agency testimony:

00:10:25 Cynthia Elmore presented the case and showed a Powerpoint presentation (see recording for detailed presentation).

The following spoke in favor of the petition:

Steve Porter, 2406 Tucker Station Road, Louisville, KY 40299
Alice Gunnison, 7849 Wolf Pen Branch Road, Prospect, KY 40059
David Ames, One Maple Crest Court, Louisville, KY 40206

Summary of testimony of those in favor:

00:22:57 Steve Porter spoke in favor of the petition. Mr. Porter reviewed the criteria for designation as relates to the Skinner-Hoke House. Mr. Porter objected to the decision that the case should be subject to the new Ordinance which was passed after this application was first presented. Commissioner Ward asked Mr. Porter to explain to the Commission if there would be a difference in the outcome between the old Ordinance and new Ordinance in his view. Mr. Porter stated the difference could be the use of the Economic Disadvantage that is allowed under the new Ordinance. Commissioner Hartman stated regardless,

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 21, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19-LANDMARK-0002

we are under the new Ordinance. Mr. Porter stated he understands (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:37:51 Alice Gunnison spoke in favor of the petition and showed a Powerpoint presentation. Ms. Gunnison showed a drawing by one of their board members and indicated restorations that could be made to the house. Ms. Gunnison completed her presentation (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:43:10 David Ames spoke in favor of the petition. Mr. Ames spoke in regard to the criteria for designation (see recording for detailed presentation).

00:52:42 Steve Porter spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

The following spoke in opposition of the petition:

Cliff Ashburner, 101 S. 5th Street, Suite 2500, Louisville, KY 40202

Joe Pierson, 1501 Morton Ave., Louisville, KY 40204

Summary of testimony of those in opposition:

00:58:52 Cliff Ashburner spoke in opposition of the petition and showed a Powerpoint presentation. Mr. Ashburner showed aerial views of the property from 1993, 2002, and 2006, and 2018 (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:05:58 Joe Pierson spoke in opposition of the petition. Mr. Pierson reviewed his Integrity Evaluation (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:17:21 Cliff Ashburner asked Mr. Pierson to explain the nature of his work with regard to historic preservation. Mr. Pierson explained his experience. Mr. Ashburner asked Mr. Pierson how far he thinks he would get in an attempt to use historic tax credits. Mr. Pierson stated he's pretty sure they would not let them get past part one. Mr. Ashburner spoke in regard to the efforts to save/reuse the Skinner-Hoke house. Mr. Ashburner discussed the standard for individual landmarking (see recording for detailed presentation).

Additional testimony in favor of the petition:

Seth Singleton, 7839 Wolf Pen Branch Road, Prospect, KY 40059

Arnold Zegart, 7800 Wolf Pen Branch Road, Prospect, KY 40059

Barbara Kelly, 6009 Mint Spring Branch Road, Prospect, KY 40059

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 21, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19-LANDMARK-0002

01:28:15 Seth Singleton spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:31:00 Arnold Zegart spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:33:38 Barbara Kelly spoke in favor of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

Additional testimony in opposition of the petition:

Mike Jones, 8908 Ayrshire Ave., Louisville, KY 40222

01:36:35 Mike Jones spoke in opposition of the petition (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:41:17 Cynthia Elmore said she just wanted to acknowledge that she did send comments that they had received to the full Commission, and to date they have received no further comments (see recording for detailed presentation).

REBUTTAL:

01:42:17 Steve Porter spoke in rebuttal and responded to questions from the Commissioners (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:49:15 Alice Gunnison and Mr. Porter responded to questions from the Commissioners (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:53:38 Cliff Ashburner spoke in rebuttal (see recording for detailed presentation).

01:59:05 Steve Porter responded to questions from the Commissioners (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:00:09 Meeting was recessed.

02:01:26 Meeting was reconvened.

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 21, 2019

NEW BUSINESS

CASE NUMBER 19-LANDMARK-0002

02:01:32 **Commissioners' deliberation**

02:01:27 Steve Porter and Alice Gunnison responded to questions from the Commissioners (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:05:23 Cynthia Elmore responded to questions from the Commissioners (see recording for detailed presentation).

02:22:09 A motion was made by Commissioner Weeter, seconded by Commissioner Jones, that Case Number 19-LANDMARK-0002, Individual Landmark Petition, be **APPROVED**. The motion **FAILED**.

The vote was as follows:

Yes: Commissioners Jones, Weeter, Stottman, and Fuller

No: Commissioners Kirchdorfer, Ward, Jackson, Liu, Omidy, Ackerman, and Rosenberg

Abstain: Commissioners Hartman

Absent: Commissioner Buzan

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission Minutes

November 21, 2019

The meeting adjourned at approximately 11:39 a.m.

Chairman

Division Director