



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer *CE*
From: Savannah Darr, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: January 17, 2020

Case No: 19-COA-0148
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 512 W. Ormsby Avenue

Applicant: Jody Offutt
Denton Floyd Real Estate Group
1024 S. 3rd Street
Louisville, KY 40203
502-648-0339
502-901-2914
joffutt@dentonfloyd.com

Owner: Park Chateau, LLC
1024 S. 3rd Street
Louisville, KY 40203
502-339-0611
502-901-2914
mcollins@dentonfloyd.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$355,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to replace existing broken bricks along the roofline of the building, but perfectly matching brick cannot be obtained. Thus, the applicant see approval to paint the unpainted masonry a white color (Sherwin Williams snowbound) with black accents.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on December 6, 2019 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on December 9, 2019. Staff met with the applicants prior to submittal. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old

Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on January 22, 2019 at 5:30 pm, at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Masonry** and **Paint**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the south side of W. Ormsby Avenue, near the southwest corner of W. Ormsby Avenue and S. 6th Street. It is zoned TNZD within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site contains the six-story masonry building, designed in the midcentury modern style. The apartment building was constructed in 1950 for Martin L. Adams & Sons and was known as The Adams House.

Conclusions

Brick repair and replacement is required on the building, which is why the applicant seeks approval to paint it. However, the proposed painting does not meet the design guidelines for **Masonry** and **Paint**. The building has never been previously painted. Per Masonry Design Guideline M24 and Paint Design Guideline P1, unpainted masonry cannot be painted because "paint is difficult to remove, accumulated layers will obscure decorative detail, and paint coatings (even "breathable" paints) will affect the wall's vapor transmission performance." While midcentury brick is not as porous as older brick, painting the brick will still affect the wall's vapor transmission performance. Furthermore, once painted, the building will continuously need to be repainted.

Based on documentation submitted by the applicant, the majority of the brick replacement is needed on the side and rear elevations near the roofline of the building. Thus, the brick modification will not be highly visible from W. Ormsby Avenue or from the ground level. Because of this and the fact that the proposed painting does not meet the design guidelines, staff recommends denial.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

1/14/2020

Date



Savannah Darr
Planning & Design Coordinator

MASONRY

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
M1	Do not construct new masonry features that are either falsely historical (characteristic of periods prior to the building's actual construction) or are incompatible with the building or historic district in terms of size, scale, material, or color.	NA	
M2	Do not cut new openings into exterior walls on elevations that can be seen from a public way. Creating an opening for the installation of an air conditioning unit, for example, is not appropriate for a façade that is visible from a public way.	NA	
M3	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	
M4	Match the existing bonding pattern, coursing, color, size, strength, and pointing mortar of masonry when replacing a section of brick wall. Bricks should always be toothed-in to historic brickwork, to disguise the joint between new and old.	NA	
M5	Do not remove or rebuild substantial portions of exterior walls if such an action would adversely impact a structure's historic integrity.	NA	
M6	Make sure that any exterior replacement bricks are suited for exterior use.	NA	
M7	Do not replace sections of historic brick with brick that is substantially stronger.	NA	
M8	Repoint only those joints that are no longer sound. Do not remove all joints, sound and unsound, in an effort to achieve a uniform appearance when repointing. Large-scale removal of mortar joints often results in damage to historic masonry.	NA	
M9	Remove unsound mortar joints carefully with hand tools that are narrower than the mortar joint. Power tools should not be used, because they have the potential to scar adjacent masonry.	NA	
M10	Remove unsound mortar to a depth of two-and-one-half the times the width of the joint or to sound mortar, whichever is greater.	NA	
M11	Match historic mortar joints in color, texture, joint size, and tooling when repointing.	NA	

M12	Use a mortar mix that is compatible with historic masonry. Repointing mortar should be equivalent to or softer than the original mortar. When repointing mortar is harder than the surrounding masonry, as is the case with many modern mixtures, moisture cannot escape through the joints. Trapped moisture will crystallize within the walls and fragment surrounding brick and stone.	NA	
M13	If possible, have your mortar analyzed. In order to determine an appropriate mortar mix for individual historic structures, it is recommended that property owners have a sample of the original mortar sent to a lab for analysis. If this is not feasible, a high lime and low Portland cement content mortar mix (1 part cement, 1 part lime, and 6 parts sand) is frequently acceptable.	NA	
M14	Do not attempt to remove joints that have been repointed using a very hard mortar or in an unworkmanlike manner until natural weathering has begun to weaken and crack them. Removal prior to that time would likely damage the masonry units	NA	
M15	Do not use synthetic caulking to repoint historic masonry.	NA	
M16	Have realistic expectations of how the cleaned masonry surface will appear. Remember, it is better to underclean than overclean. A "like new" appearance is rarely desirable.	NA	
M17	Make sure that your contractor has a clear understanding of the physical and chemical properties of your masonry before proposing or testing any chemical cleaning treatments. Such treatments, if improperly applied, can result in permanent damage that significantly outweighs any benefits of cleaning.	NA	
M18	Test proposed cleaning treatments in an inconspicuous area of the building to evaluate potential adverse effects to the masonry. Observation over a complete seasonal cycle is preferable, so that long-term effects may be ascertained. If chemical treatments are found to be acceptable, be sure that those applying the treatment follow all manufacturers' instructions.	NA	
M19	Do not use sandblasting or high-pressure water to clean historic masonry. The process of sandblasting or cleaning buildings using water pressure greater than 300 psi removes the tough, outer-protective surface of the brick and loosens mortar joints, accelerating deterioration.	NSI	
M20	Do not clean masonry on buildings with deteriorated mortar joints. Such masonry should be properly repointed prior to cleaning to ensure that water does not penetrate the wall during the cleaning process.	NA	
M21	Do not use any type of water- or chemical-based cleaning systems when a possibility for freezing temperatures exists. Masonry cleaning should not be undertaken until the temperature will remain above 50 degrees for 72 hours after cleaning.	NA	
M22	Remove graffiti as soon as possible, beginning with the gentlest means possible and taking care not to inadvertently etch an outline of the graffiti onto the wall.	NA	
M23	Use solvent-based chemical strippers to remove paint from previously-painted masonry only after testing its effectiveness and evaluating its potential to damage brickwork. Testing should be carried out in an inconspicuous location.	NA	
M24	Do not paint masonry or stucco that has never been painted. While one layer of paint may not affect the appearance of the masonry or stucco, accumulated layers will eventually obscure decorative detail.	-	This building has not been previously painted

M25	Paint previously-painted masonry a color that is close to its existing color, approximates a natural masonry color as approved, or is recommended by staff. Staff is available to consult with you on appropriate colors.	NA	
M26	Use a "breathable" masonry paint that is compatible with and can create a strong bond with existing paint.	NA	
M27	Make sure that areas of patched stucco match the strength, composition, color, and texture of the original to the greatest degree possible.	NA	
M28	When patching stucco, cut back the successive layers to provide a key for the new layers to prevent new cracking.	NA	
M29	Carry out stucco repairs so that the dimension between the surface of the stucco and adjacent finishes remains unchanged.	NA	
M30	Do not install stucco, Dryvit, or permastone-type cladding over historic masonry or wood siding.	NA	
M31	Do not resurface historic masonry with exterior insulation.	NA	
M32	Use a masonry or terra cotta chimney cap if needed. Metal chimney caps are not historically appropriate.	NA	

PAINT

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
P1	Painting masonry or stucco that has never been painted is not recommended. Paint is difficult to remove, accumulated layers will obscure decorative detail, and paint coatings (even "breathable" paints) will affect the wall's vapor transmission performance. The presence of a lead oxide wash does not constitute a precedent for painting a building.	-	This building has not been previously painted
P2	When removing paint from previously-painted masonry, use gentle treatments that have been previously tested in an inconspicuous location. Do not sandblast or use acid-based cleaners.	NA	
P3	Use a "breathable" masonry paint that is compatible with and can create a strong bond with existing paint, only on previously-painted masonry.	NA	
P4	If painting previously-painted masonry, select a color that matches the existing color, approximates a natural masonry color as approved, or is recommended by the staff. Staff is available to consult with you on appropriate colors.	NA	
P5	Have paint samples analyzed when possible. Paint seriation studies can determine historic pigments and appropriate colors for repainting, by analyzing a paint sample under special lighting conditions to ascertain specific color, hue, and value of paint layers.	NA	

P6	Do not expose metal types that require protection from the elements or apply paint or other coatings to metals that were historically meant to be exposed, such as copper, bronze, or stainless steel.	NA	
P7	Paint replacement gutters, downspouts, metal frame screen and storm windows, roof-vent assemblies, and fire escapes to match wall, trim, cornice, or roof color of the house, whichever is most effective in reducing the visibility of these elements.	NA	
P8	Be aware that historic structures often contain hazardous substances, such as lead paint and asbestos. Contact the Board of Health regarding proper methods of removal and disposal.	NSI	