Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:	Individual Landmark Architectural Review Committee
Thru:	Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer CE
From:	Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date:	March 6, 2020

Case No: 20-COA-0005
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 213 East Broadway

Applicant:
Jamie Moyle
Kentucky Medical Center Hotel LLC
101 South Fifth Street, Ste. 3500
Louisville, KY 40202
615-300-3619
jamie@lazlogroup.com

Owner:
Broadway Cloister LLC
550 S 4th St., Ste 165
Louisville, KY 40202
502-645-3164
tonystefater@gmail.com

Architect:
Candis Carroll & ESa Architects
1033 Demonbreun St., Ste. 800
Nashville, TN 37203
(601) 466-3715

Estimated Project Cost: $80,566,911. +/-

Description of proposed exterior alteration:
The applicant seeks approval of the proposed plan for the redevelopment of historic St. Paul's German Evangelical Church and Parish House. The plan includes

- Proposed demolition of a 1916 addition to the east of the rear of the building, which historically included meeting space on the first floor and a gymnasium on the second floor.

- Proposed demolition of rear west side of church (everything beyond the wall of the sanctuary space) this space had historically acted as an overflow auditorium for the sanctuary space. .
- Proposed removal of existing tented roof form, (a type of polygonal hipped roof with steeply pitched slopes rising to a peak) over the domed sanctuary (interior dome to remain intact).
- Proposed restoration of, and adaptive reuse of the sanctuary, parish house and other spaces left after demolition within the historic church.

Elevation and perspective drawings of the proposed demolition and new construction which will encapsulate the historic church beyond its south façade facing E. Broadway have been submitted, however are still in the conceptual stage and to come back for ARC review as developed. Portions of project proposal not in Landmarks purview include the adjacent property.

- A full-service or selective-service hotel
- Apartments / Extended-Stay Units
- A restaurant
- Flexible conference space

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application
The application was received on January 20, 2020 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on March 2, 2020. Staff met with the applicant's representative on February 20, 2020 to discuss their plans and the COA process.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Individual Landmark Architectural Review Committee on March 11, 2020 at 5:30 pm, at 444 South Fifth Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines
The following design review guidelines, approved for Individual Landmarks, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Demolition, Roof, New Construction-Non-Residential,** and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background
The property is located on the north side of E. Broadway, east of the intersection with S. Brook St. The site is zoned C2 in the Downtown Form District. St. Paul's German Evangelical Church and Parish House were constructed in 1906 by Clarke & Loomis, locally notable architects / builders.

St. Paul's is a two-story brick structure with a stone façade designed in the Gothic Revival-Style. There are two entrances to the church from the façade, both through

Tudor arches with stained glass transoms. The space behind the sanctuary was historically used for Sunday School classes, and is divided by large doors that crank open to allow for extra seating. The second-floor rooms over this space have large windows which can be opened to view the main floor. The second-floor rooms at one time were sloped for better viewing, but were later leveled to be functional as office and class space. In 1916 a two-story addition was added to the east rear of the building. This addition provided meeting space on the first level and a gym on the second floor.

The Parish House is a two-and-one-half-story brick structure with a stone façade also with a Gothic Revival design. There are two dormers; one is an eyebrow dormer and the other has a small parapet wall and finial, reflecting features found on the church façade. The second floor contains a pair of windows with a single sill and lintel, and a bay window. The single window on the first floor has a simple stone frame. The porch is wooden with classical columns. The entrance has double doors and a transom.

The property was designated as an Individual Landmark in 1996. Since that time, 2 COA applications are on file. One for a wheelchair ramp, and the other for the installation of a sign. The property also received zoning certification in May, 2019.

Conclusions

The two portions of the building proposed for demolition are historic in age. The 1916 designed for utilitarian purposes, and in such a location that it is hidden from public view. While it is referenced in the Designation Report, there is no defining significance associated with this addition. The addition is also not architecturally significant in design or location, in respect to the way that awkwardly attaches to the primary structure. The addition also is not keeping in the Gothic Revival-Style like the church and parish house. The removal of this addition would not impact the overall integrity of the main portion of the church and generally conforms with the **Demolition** Guidelines.

While part of the original church design, the rear portion of the church beyond the sanctuary that is proposed for demolition. This space is an extension of the sanctuary space and was historically utilized, as such. This section of the church has minimal exterior articulation and is not street visible. The 1916 addition further diminished the appearance of this rear section of the church. Over time, the interior has been heavily modified to transform its function into office space. The floors in this portion of the building have been heavily modified, for example the leveling of the floors and used as offices. The removal of this rear portion of the church would likely not diminish the overall integrity of the Individual Landmark as the principal, character defining elements will remain intact which generally conforms to the **Demolition** Guidelines.

While the tented roof form atop the dome in the main sanctuary of the church is part of the original design, it has been proposed to remove it and replace it with outdoor deck with green space that will be accessible from the adjacent new construction. The tented roof form is not visible from the any public view.

Therefore, the proposed alterations generally meet the Individual Landmark design guidelines for **Roof**.

The Parish House was constructed in conjunction and parallel to the church, in timeline as well as form. The Parish House still contributes to the historic significance of the site. The proposed adaptive reuse of the Parish House tie into the proposed new construction and will bring life back to this neglected property, as well as preserve the architectural significance it provides to the community as a whole.

If demolition is approved, Kentucky Historic Properties Survey Forms should be completed with photographic documentation (including interior) for the entire St. Paul campus, including the Parish House to document their history.

The proposed concept for new construction on and around the St. Paul Individual Landmark site generally meet the design guidelines for **New Construction-Non-Residential**. While detail design drawings have not been submitted yet, the footprints and locations of the proposed new buildings as represented in the massing studies is generally appropriate for the Individual Landmark. More information on how the new construction ties into the historic portions of the structures is also needed. Site considerations will be evaluated with the new construction part of the proposal when it is submitted. With appropriate design and planning, this should not negatively impact the streetscape of E. Broadway. This area of E. Broadway will benefit greatly from an appropriate infill project such as this, and would provide a positive impact on the city as a whole.

Based on the schematic nature of the proposal the recommendations are split into demolition pursuant to the approval of the new construction, and further design development should comply with applicable Design Guidelines to be properly reviewed by the Individual Landmarks ARC.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

Conditions for Demolition:

1. **Wrecking permits shall not be issued until all conditions of the COA are satisfied for the new construction have been obtained (per wrecking ordinance subsection 150.110).**
2. **Kentucky Historic Properties Survey Forms shall be completed with photographic documentation (including interior) for all current buildings on the St. Paul's German Evangelical Church and Parish House Campus prior to demolition.**
3. **All information shall be provided to determine Design Guideline compliance and must be approved prior to demolition.**

Conditions for New Construction:

4. **Elevation drawings of all new construction including details for the connections with the historic buildings, as well as manufacturer's information on materials, shall be submitted prior to construction for approval.**
5. **If the Plan changes, the applicant shall contact staff to reevaluate said Plan before moving forward.**
6. **All information shall be provided to determine Design Guideline compliance and must be approved prior to construction.**
7. **The applicant shall apply all necessary approvals with Planning and Design Services.**

3.06.2020
Date

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

DEMOLITION

Design Guideline Checklist
From Economic Hardship Exemption

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

Introduction

Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

Demolition by Neglect

The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.	+/-	Removal of the 1916 Addition will not negatively impact the church or parish. More information is needed for the removal of the rear section of the church.
DE2	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	NSI	TBD
DE3	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	NSI	TBD
DE4	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	+	TBD
DE5	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent with those features on adjacent properties.	NA	
DE6	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	NA	

ROOFING

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R1	Use only replacement materials that closely match the original roofing material in color, texture, and profile. Possible substitute materials include asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles.	+/-	Applicant is removing roof to encapsulate the existing space with an adjacent building.
R2	Use copper, lead-coated copper, terne-coated stainless steel, or terne metal when replacing a historic metal roof with in-kind materials. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted either muted red or green, traditional roof colors. Replacement with in-kind materials is recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original.	NA	
R3	Make sure that the proportion of the seams and trim on replacement metal roofing matches that of the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture, because the scale is inappropriate.	NA	
R4	Retain ridge and hip tiles on historic tile roofs. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles, however, should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible.	NA	
R5	Remove existing roofing material when replacing non-repairable or non-historic roofing. Removing these underlying layers will prolong the life of the roof and help restore the original profile of the roof edge.	+	Applicant shall remove all existing roofing material prior to securing it.
R6	Do not apply asphalt shingles over wood shingles. This will trap moisture and cause deterioration of the roof structure.	NA	
R7	Base the reconstruction of any missing roof feature on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If such evidence is insufficient, the feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely-historical or conjectural reconstruction.	+/-	The structures are older than 50 years of age (see conclusions). Photo documentation was submitted with the application. Additional documentation is being requested.
R8	New roof designs for additions or new construction should be compatible in size, scale, material, and color with the historic building and district.	NSI	More information on the roof deck over the domed portion of the church would be needed in the new construction phase.
R9	Use the form and detailing of severely deteriorated roof features, such as cupolas and dormers, or chimneys, to create appropriate replicas.	+/-	Applicant shall document existing condition.

R10	Avoid having extensive areas of flashing visible. In some cases, portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco.	NA	
R11	Do not destroy historic detail when installing replacement gutters. If synthetic materials are used, they should be painted to match the trim color.	NA	
R12	Half-round replacement gutters that are of a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim, or in limited cases ogee profile gutters, are preferred. Synthetic materials painted to match the trim color are acceptable.	NA	
R13	Do not use unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts, which rust and stain adjacent materials. These gutters should be painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy.	NSI	
R14	Leave historically-exposed rafter ends and eaves open and uncovered.	NA	
R15	Make sure that any new roof-top additions do not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	NSI	More information on the roof deck over the domed portion of the church would be needed in the new construction phase.
R16	Install any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment in such a way that historic fabric is not damaged.	NSI	More information on the roof deck over the domed portion of the church would be needed in the new construction phase.
R17	Do not attach antennae, satellite transmitters, skylights, vents, air conditioning units, decks, terraces, dormers, or solar panels that can be seen from a building's primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	NSI	More information on the roof deck over the domed portion of the church would be needed in the new construction phase.
R18	Do not introduce mechanical equipment or systems that may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system.	NSI	Applicant shall make sure that all systems can be handled by the existing structure. More information on the roof deck over the domed portion of the church would be needed in the new construction phase.
R19	Paint all roof vent assemblies to match the color of the roofing material.	NA	
R20	Do not install ridge vents on historic structures. They are non-historic approaches to attic ventilation.	NA	
R21	Replace historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps on slate roofs with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible.	NSI	More information on the roof deck over the domed portion of the church would be needed in the new construction phase.

NEW CONSTRUCTION

COMMERCIAL AND INSTITUTIONAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other applicable regulations including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	The applicant will have to apply for all necessary approvals with Planning and Design Services and meet all other codes and regulations.
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	+/-	What has been proposed to be demolished considered non-contributing or has been altered. (see conclusions).
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, scale, massing, volume, directional emphasis, and setback reflects the architectural context established by surrounding structures.		The scale of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context.
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the district.	+	The scale of the building concept is compatible with the Landmark given the urban context.
NC5	Select materials and design elements for new construction that are sympathetic with surrounding historic buildings in the district. Materials should be of a complementary color, size, texture, scale, and level of craftsmanship.	+	TBD
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	The scale of the building concept is compatible with the Landmark given the urban context.
NC7	Have new construction reinforce the human scale of historic districts by emphasizing the base of the building where this is a character-defining feature.	NSI	TBD
NC8	Design infill construction that enhances the pedestrian-oriented character of historic commercial districts. Commercial buildings should have a well-defined base at the pedestrian level with details conveying a sense of horizontality and progression along the sidewalk.	NSI	TBD
NC9	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	The scale of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context. The street visible portions of the church and parish will remain unchanged.

NC10	Plant canopy trees in front of any large-scale new construction to provide a visual sense of consistency along a streetscape.	NA	
NC11	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	NA	
NC12	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	The scale of the building concept is compatible with the Landmark given the urban context.
NC13	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	NSI	TBD
NC14	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weightiness as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solid surfaces (walls) to voids (window and door openings).	+	The scale of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context.
NC15	Maintain historic patterns of window and door proportion and placement in designs for new construction.	+	The design of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context.
NC16	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	The design of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context.
NC17	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	NSI	TBD
NC18	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street.	+	The design of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context. The new building will behind the historic building.
NC19	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	+	The design of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context. The new building will behind the historic building.
NC20	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NSI	TBD
NC21	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a way that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	+	The design of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context. The new building will behind the historic building. Applicant shall provide access in such a way as to not detract from the historic façade.
NC22	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings. The rhythm of the façade should also reflect the characteristic rhythm of existing buildings on the street. Vertical elements (doors, columns, and storefronts) should be spaced approximately every 20 to 40 feet at the pedestrian level.	+	The design of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context.

NC23	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	NSI	TBD
NC24	Incorporate set-back upper stories into designs for new construction that exceed the established cornice line.	+	The design of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context. The new building will behind the historic building.
NC25	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block. New construction should be built out to the property lines where this is a character-defining feature.	+	The design of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context. The new building will behind the historic building.
NC26	Historic commercial properties have long been anchors in Louisville's preservation districts. Construction of commercial properties on vacant corner lots should preferably be built to the corner with an entrance oriented to the corner.	NA	
NC27	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	The design of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context. The new building will behind the historic building.
NC28	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+/-	More information on the roof deck over the domed portion of the church would be needed in the new construction phase.
NC29	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominate form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominate form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	The design of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context.
NC30	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	The design of the building concept is compatible with the Individual Landmark given the urban context.
NC31	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NSI	TBD
NC32	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	NSI	TBD
NC33	Make provisions for screening and storage of trash receptacles when designing new construction.	NSI	TBD
NC34	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings.	NSI	TBD
NC35	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction.	NSI	TBD
NC36	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NSI	TBD
NC37	Design parking garages so that they relate closely to adjacent structures. Their facades should reflect the hierarchical organization and design elements seen on surrounding buildings.	NA	
NC38	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	NA	

NC39	Generally, leave at least 20 percent of a parking lot's surface area unpaved and planted. All parking lots must meet the minimum requirements of the city's Development Code. Perimeter landscaping, fencing, colonnades, or other construction that visually continues the building line along open sidewalks is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Generally speaking, parking should be located in the rear.	NA	
NC41	Design required new parking in such a way that it is as unobtrusive as possible and minimizes the impact on the historic setting. Shared parking areas among groups of businesses is encouraged.	NA	
NC42	Do not build additional surface parking lots within the West Main Preservation District.	NA	
NC43	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NSI	TBD
NC44	Do not create additional open space within the West Main Historic District.	NA	