



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Preservation District
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: June 30, 2020

Case No: 20-COA-0093
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2126 Grinstead Dr. 40206

Applicant: Anne Del Prince
Del Prince Designs, LLC
640 Country Club Rd.
Louisville, KY 40206
(502) 893-6026
adelprince@att.net

Owner: Brittany & Patrick Starowitz
2126 Grinstead Dr.
Louisville, KY 40206
(502) 593-0118
(502) 802-9797
bward7777@yahoo.com
pstaro3674@gmail.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$30,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant proposes to add a dormer to the south side of the third level (currently attic space) in order to create a master suite. The south façade will have five 2' x 2' casement style windows, and the east façade will have one window approximately 36" in width for egress. The proposed dormer will start approximately 15' back from the front of the home,

and will extend to a depth of approximately 33' while staying in-line with the current south wall elevation. The proposed dormer will also extend vertically through the existing roof line approximately 6' in height on the south façade of the home. The proposed dormer will be clad with Hardie board lap siding to match the existing sidings exposure and paint color.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on May 28, 2020. The application was classified as requiring Architectural Review Committee approval on June 1st, 2020 and staff emailed applicant to advise them their application had been assigned to a case manager. Staff contacted the applicant via phone and email to request additional information as well as schedule an Architectural Review Committee meeting. The applicant was aware that the project would require a committee level review, based on the proposed changes to the property. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on July 8th, 2020 at 4:30 pm, via a WebEx meeting at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Addition, Roofing**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

2126 Grinstead Dr, is a two-story (with large attic space) 1890 late-Victorian era style home constructed partially on a stone basement foundation, and partially on a crawlspace. The property is located three lots south of the intersection of Everett Ave. and Grinstead Dr. The property is zoned R5B, and located within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District.

Conclusions

Additions

Dormer

The proposed addition to the third level of the south façade of the home generally meets the design guidelines for addition. The proposed dormer is in proportion and scale to the existing structure, as well as to the homes adjacent to the property. The proposed addition to the home is subordinate to the original building, and does not exceed the square footage allowance. While the dormer addition would be visible from the primary elevation it will be set back approximately 15' from the front façade. The proposed dormer will be

constructed on a secondary elevation and would not obscure any character-defining features.

Roofing

The proposed dormer generally meets the design guidelines for roofing. The dormer will be visible from the primary elevation, however it will be constructed on a secondary elevation. The proposed addition will not compromise the structural integrity of the building nor destroy historic detail. The proposed design is compatible in size, scale, material, and color of other similar additions to historic buildings in the district.

Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions.

1. If the design or materials change, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval prior to installation.
2. There shall be eaves on the addition that match the projection of the eaves on the rest of the home.
3. There shall be some sort of gutter system installed on the addition that meets the design guidelines.
4. The applicant and/or their representative shall obtain any permits necessary to begin the work.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, their successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

June 30, 2020

Date

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The proposed addition to the side of the home is in proportion and scale to the existing structure, as well as to the homes adjacent to the property.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	The proposed addition to the side of the home is subordinate to the original building, and does not exceed the square footage allowance.
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	The proposed addition to the side is attached to a secondary elevation and is set back from the front façade, and shall not damage or obscure any character-defining features.
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	The proposed addition to the side of the property meets the guidelines for the use of subordinate materials.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	The proposed roof form to the addition to the side of the property appears to complement the existing roof forms.
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	

A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	The proposed side addition to the home is done in a fashion that maintains integrity as a secondary façade.
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	The proposed addition appear to meet the floor height guideline.
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+	The proposed side addition appears to generally meet the guideline for relationship of solids to voids of the historic structure.
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	The proposed addition to the side of the home is designed in such a way that it is sympathetic to the existing, yet distinguishable as to what is new and what is old.
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	NA	
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	The plans appear to preserve the character-defining features.
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	

A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	
------------	--	----	--

ROOFING

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R1	Use only replacement materials that closely match the original roofing material in color, texture, and profile. Possible substitute materials include asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles.	NA	Proposed new construction
R2	Use copper, lead-coated copper, terne-coated stainless steel, or terne metal when replacing a historic metal roof with in-kind materials. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted either muted red or green, traditional roof colors. Replacement with in-kind materials is recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original.	NA	Proposed new construction
R3	Make sure that the proportion of the seams and trim on replacement metal roofing matches that of the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture, because the scale is inappropriate.	NA	
R4	Retain ridge and hip tiles on historic tile roofs. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles, however, should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible.	NA	

R5	Remove existing roofing material when replacing non-repairable or non-historic roofing. Removing these underlying layers will prolong the life of the roof and help restore the original profile of the roof edge.	NA	
R6	Do not apply asphalt shingles over wood shingles. This will trap moisture and cause deterioration of the roof structure.	NA	
R7	Base the reconstruction of any missing roof feature on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If such evidence is insufficient, the feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely-historical or conjectural reconstruction.	NA	
R8	New roof designs for additions or new construction should be compatible in size, scale, material, and color with the historic building and district.	+	Roofing appears to meet guideline for compatibility in size, scale, material, and color.
R9	Use the form and detailing of severely deteriorated roof features, such as cupolas and dormers, or chimneys, to create appropriate replicas.	NA	
R10	Avoid having extensive areas of flashing visible. In some cases, portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco.	NA	
R11	Do not destroy historic detail when installing replacement gutters. If synthetic materials are used, they should be painted to match the trim color.	+	Gutters shall match the existing on the home.
R12	Half-round replacement gutters that are of a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim, or in limited cases ogee profile gutters, are preferred. Synthetic materials painted to match the trim color are acceptable.	NA	
R13	Do not use unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts, which rust and stain adjacent materials. These gutters should be painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy.	+	New gutters shall match the existing gutters.
R14	Leave historically-exposed rafter ends and eaves open and uncovered.	NA	
R15	Make sure that any new roof-top additions do not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	NA	
R16	Install any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment in such a way that historic fabric is not damaged.	NA	
R17	Do not attach antennae, satellite transmitters, skylights, vents, air conditioning units, decks, terraces, dormers, or solar panels that can be seen from a building's primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	-/+	The proposed addition will be visible from the front façade of the home at certain angles.
R18	Do not introduce mechanical equipment or systems that may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system.	NA	

R19	Paint all roof vent assemblies to match the color of the roofing material.	NA	
R20	Do not install ridge vents on historic structures. They are non-historic approaches to attic ventilation.	NA	
R21	Replace historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps on slate roofs with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible.	NA	