



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee Amended 07-01-2020

To: Cherokee Triangle Preservation District
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: June 3, 2020

Case No: 20-COA-0085
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2651 Cherokee Parkway 40204

Applicant: Daniel Grimm
Grimm Architects
1915 Production Drive
Louisville, KY 40299
(502) 744-8716
dgrimm@grimm-arch.com

Owner: Judith Hollis
2651 Cherokee Parkway
Louisville, KY 40204
(502) 403-9689
judy@hollisjones.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$145,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant proposes to add a pergola to the front left side of the home. The pergola is proposed to be constructed of masonry pillars at the corners, with a free-standing stone fireplace, a timber beam and rafter system, and a flat-seam low profile copper-clad roof. The proposed roof will appear flat from all elevations as the proposed pitch is ½" per 12". This would involve replacing the existing windows on the side sun porch (that previously

had been converted into a home office), with new clad-wood windows to match existing style and muntin configuration. The applicant also proposes to remove the existing front façade facing sunporch windows to install French doors (to access the proposed pergola area). The applicant also proposes the removal of the windows on the rear side of the sunporch too, and the installation of French doors in their place.

The applicant also proposes to demolish two exterior walls of the existing detached garage as well as a portion of a garden-wall, and an existing stone retaining wall. This would allow the applicant an extended footprint to place a new larger garage on, as well as a master suite above it. The previously detached garage would then be attached to the home with the construction of an enclosed breezeway. This would allow the applicant the capability to install an elevator for accessibility purposes to access the second floor of the home. The applicant would also propose reconstruction of the previously demolished retaining wall, and for it to be clad in stone, and the garden wall that had been demolished to be reconstructed adjacent to where it had previously stood.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on May 20, 2020. The application was classified as requiring Architectural Review Committee approval on May 25, 2020 and staff emailed applicant to advise them their application had been assigned to a case manager. Staff contacted the applicant via phone and email to request additional information as well as schedule an Architectural Review Committee meeting. The applicant was aware that the project would require a committee level review, based on the proposed changes to the property. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on June 10th, 2020 at 4:30 pm, via a WebEx meeting at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

After the Cherokee Triangle ARC meeting on June 10th, 2020 the applicant took into account the feedback from the committee and has resubmitted new plans for the pergola, and to withdraw their proposal to change the traffic pattern of the driveway. The new drawings articulate the material change to the columns for the pergola from stone (which the committee felt did not communicate in a clear way what was original to the home and what was being added) to wood, which expresses more clearly the period of construction differences.

The continued meeting of the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) will be held on July 8th, 2020 at 4:30 pm, via a WebEx meeting at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Demolition, Addition, Garages, Roofing, Windows, Doors, New Construction-Residential, and Site.** The

report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

2651 Cherokee Parkway, is a 1928 stone clad Colonial Revival style home. The property is landlocked two lots south east of the intersection of Ransdell Ave. and Grinstead Dr. The primary façade of the home is oriented toward Cherokee Parkway, however it has a deep setback and has a raised terrace along the front elevation. There are two one-story side additions that are visible from the primary elevation. One is a stone veneer addition, and the other is a frame sunroom addition. The property is zoned R2, and located within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. There is an existing one-story stone veneered garage that is on the rear side of the house that appears to date the original period of construction of the house. A shared drive provides access to the landlocked site.

Conclusions

Demolition

The proposal generally meets the design guidelines in regard to demolition of a portion of the existing garage, retaining wall, and garden wall. The applicable Design Guidelines are DE1; DE5; and DE6. Applicant proposes to demolish a portion of the existing contributing garage and then build an attached breeze way to connect the new garage and addition to the existing home. The applicant shall be aware of and counter any grade changes that may occur due to the removal of the existing garage and retaining wall. The proposed demolition is only for a portion of the structure to allow for a breezeway connection to the main house. The applicant proposes to rebuild the existing retaining wall to allow for the expansion of the garage and the addition above it. The applicant also intends to rebuild the existing garden wall with gate.

Additions

Breezeway/Garage

The proposed addition to the rear of the home which includes the breezeway connector and the second story to the garage generally meets the design guidelines for addition. The proposed addition to the rear of the home is in proportion and scale to the existing structure, as well as to the homes adjacent to the property. The proposed addition to the rear of the home is subordinate to the original building, and does not exceed the square footage allowance. The proposed addition to the rear is attached to a secondary elevation and is set back from the front façade, and shall not damage or obscure any character-defining features.

The existing garage will be altered to create a second story. While it is generally not advisable to add full story additions, this is a secondary structure and will have a Carriage House appearance. The new roof line of the garage addition appears to be project slightly above the roofline of the principal structure. The siting of the garage is not on an alley and since it is landlocked, will not be visible from Ransdell Ave. The proposed addition to the rear of the home is designed in such a way that it is sympathetic to the existing, yet distinguishable as to what is new and what is old.

Pergola

The proposed pergola addition to the front elevation, is in proportion with the size, but not the scale of the existing historic front porch. The columns of the pergola, as well as the roof are far heavier in appearance than those on the existing front porch. The proposed pergola addition to the front of the home is to be attached to the primary façade and would potentially damage and obscure character-defining features to the front façade of the home. While the proposed front pergola addition is not in complete conformance with the Design Guidelines, the specific site conditions for this property distinguish it. The primary façade is setback a considerable distance from Cherokee Parkway, and there is an existing terrace on the front façade. The pergola addition has a transparent character and the majority of the structure is located in front of the side frame sunroom addition. The proposed pergola addition to the front of the home also attempts to use materials like what is existing.

Amended July 1, 2020:

The amended drawings articulate the material change to the columns for the pergola from stone (which the committee felt did not communicate in a clear way what was original to the home and what was being added) to wood, which expresses more clearly the period of construction differences. Though the character defining features of the first floor window would be obscured, they would not be damaged in the proposed construction and would remain intact.

Windows

The proposal to remove the existing windows on the front façade of the sunroom addition, and replace them with doors is in direct conflict with the design guidelines **W14** and **W16**. Proposed removal of windows on primary and secondary facades to be replaced with French doors. Additionally, the historic soldier course with key to be obscured by the construction of proposed pergola addition to the front façade. While the replacement of the rear windows with French doors is permitted based on the design guidelines, the alteration of the windows to door on the primary façade do conflict. The French doors, however, will be located in the side sunroom addition on the primary façade, and will have a window-like appearance.

Doors

The proposed French doors on the front façade of the home do conflict design guidelines D1; D9; and D11. The proposed doors on the front façade compete with the historic entrance. Though the door and the frame itself are appropriate, the placement of another entrance on the front façade does not meet the design guidelines. The doors are proposed to be a new entry point they are designed to be secondary as they provide access the pergola and terrace from the sunroom addition. The new doors would be visible from public way, however the deep setback of this structure on the site minimizes the new entrance created by the French doors.

Site

The proposed rear addition to the property generally meets the guideline, while the proposed front addition would change the character of the original front façade of the home. The pergola is generally located in front of the side sunroom addition and is situated on the existing terrace. Minimizing the roof line and columns could help to integrate the pergola into the primary façade. Additionally, the deep setback for this property reduces the visual appearance from the public view.

Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions.

- 1. If the design or materials change, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval prior to installation.**
- 2. The applicant and/or their representative shall obtain any permits necessary to begin the work.**

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, their successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

June 30, 2020

Date

DEMOLITION

Design Guideline Checklist

From Economic Hardship Exemption

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Introduction

Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

Demolition by Neglect

The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.	+/-	Applicant proposes to demolish a portion of the existing contributing garage and then build an attached breeze way to connect the new garage and addition to the existing home.
DE2	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	NA	
DE3	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	NA	
DE4	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	NA	
DE5	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent with those features on adjacent properties.	+/-	The applicant shall be aware of and counter any grade changes that may occur due to the removal of the existing garage and retaining wall.
DE6	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	+	The applicant proposes to rebuild the existing retaining wall to allow for the expansion of the garage and the addition above it. The applicant also intends to rebuild the existing garden wall with gate.

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+/-	<p>The proposed addition to the rear of the home is in proportion and scale to the existing structure, as well as to the homes adjacent to the property, other than the possible pitch of the roof.</p> <p>The proposed pergola addition to the front, is in proportion with the size, but not the scale of the existing historic front porch. The columns of the pergola, as well as the roof are far heavier in appearance than those on the existing front porch.</p>
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+/-	<p>The proposed addition to the rear of the home is subordinate to the original building, and does not exceed the square footage allowance. The second story floor addition to the existing garage will create a Carriage House appearance.</p> <p>The proposed pergola addition to the front of the home is minimal in size.</p>
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+/-	<p>The proposed addition to the rear is attached to a secondary elevation and is set back from the front façade, and shall not damage or obscure any character-defining features.</p>

			The proposed pergola addition to the front of the home is to be attached to the primary façade and would potentially damage and obscure character-defining features to the front façade of the home.
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	<p>The proposed addition to the rear of the property meets the guidelines for the use of subordinate materials.</p> <p>The proposed pergola addition to the front of the home proposes the use of the same materials that which the original structure is clad in.</p>
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+/-	<p>The proposed roof form to the addition to the rear of the property appears to complement the existing roof forms, other than in height.</p> <p>The proposed roof form of the pergola on the front façade is not complimentary to the existing roof forms visible; however it is an open air structure.</p>
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+/-	<p>The proposed rear addition to the home is done in a fashion that maintains integrity as a secondary façade.</p> <p>The proposed front addition however disrupts the existing primary façade.</p>
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	The proposed additions appear to meet the floor height guideline.
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+	<p>The proposed rear addition appears to generally meet the guideline for relationship of solids to voids of the historic structure.</p> <p>The pergola addition is generally transparent.</p>
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration.	+/-	The proposed addition to the rear of the home is designed in such a way that it is sympathetic to the existing, yet distinguishable as to what is new and

	This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.		what is old. The proposed addition to the front of the home attempts to use materials like what is existing.
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	NA	
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	The plans appear to preserve the character-defining features.
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

GARAGE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	On site of existing garage, but will be larger with an addition above it.
		NA	Align with adjacent secondary structures	
		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	The proposed garage does help to define and enclose the rear yard.
		+	Minimize paving	The proposal though a larger footprint than the original does minimize paving in the design.
Materials		NA	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	Stone veneer to match the existing as well as western red cedar shakes on the second level as a subordinate material.
		NA	Board and batten siding	
		NA	Brick	
		NA	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		NA	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	No painted concrete block.	

		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	+	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	Asphalt to match the roof of the home
		NA	Metal roofing	
		+	Half-round or Ogee gutters	Gutters to match the existing home
		NA	Approved Gable-end element	
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
Building Forms		+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	Rectilinear in form.
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		NA	No overly-elaborate volumes	
		+	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	Proposed garage meets minimum slope
		NA	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		NA	Overhanging eaves	
		+/-	Half-round gutters	Gutters to match existing home
		NA	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	
		NA	No flush eaves	
		+	No roofs without gutters	Roof has gutters to match the home
Openings		-	Single-car openings	Two car garage door
		+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	Carriage style door
		-	No double and triple doors	Double garage door
		NA	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	

		+	Use window openings to break up wall surface	Proportionate and scaled to match the voids and rhythm of home
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	

ROOFING

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R1	Use only replacement materials that closely match the original roofing material in color, texture, and profile. Possible substitute materials include asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles.	NA	Proposed new construction
R2	Use copper, lead-coated copper, terne-coated stainless steel, or terne metal when replacing a historic metal roof with in-kind materials. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted either muted red or green, traditional roof colors. Replacement with in-kind materials is recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original.	NA	Proposed new construction
R3	Make sure that the proportion of the seams and trim on replacement metal roofing matches that of the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture, because the scale is inappropriate.	NA	
R4	Retain ridge and hip tiles on historic tile roofs. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles, however, should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible.	NA	

R5	Remove existing roofing material when replacing non-repairable or non-historic roofing. Removing these underlying layers will prolong the life of the roof and help restore the original profile of the roof edge.	NA	
R6	Do not apply asphalt shingles over wood shingles. This will trap moisture and cause deterioration of the roof structure.	NA	
R7	Base the reconstruction of any missing roof feature on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If such evidence is insufficient, the feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely-historical or conjectural reconstruction.	NA	
R8	New roof designs for additions or new construction should be compatible in size, scale, material, and color with the historic building and district.	+	Roofing appears to meet guideline for compatibility in size, scale, material, and color.
R9	Use the form and detailing of severely deteriorated roof features, such as cupolas and dormers, or chimneys, to create appropriate replicas.	NA	
R10	Avoid having extensive areas of flashing visible. In some cases, portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco.	NA	
R11	Do not destroy historic detail when installing replacement gutters. If synthetic materials are used, they should be painted to match the trim color.	+	Gutters shall match the existing on the home.
R12	Half-round replacement gutters that are of a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim, or in limited cases ogee profile gutters, are preferred. Synthetic materials painted to match the trim color are acceptable.	NA	
R13	Do not use unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts, which rust and stain adjacent materials. These gutters should be painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy.	+	New gutters shall match the existing gutters.
R14	Leave historically-exposed rafter ends and eaves open and uncovered.	NA	
R15	Make sure that any new roof-top additions do not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	NA	
R16	Install any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment in such a way that historic fabric is not damaged.	NA	
R17	Do not attach antennae, satellite transmitters, skylights, vents, air conditioning units, decks, terraces, dormers, or solar panels that can be seen from a building's primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	NA	
R18	Do not introduce mechanical equipment or systems that may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system.	NA	

R19	Paint all roof vent assemblies to match the color of the roofing material.	NA	
R20	Do not install ridge vents on historic structures. They are non-historic approaches to attic ventilation.	NA	
R21	Replace historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps on slate roofs with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible.	NA	

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	NA	
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	NA	
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	NA	

W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	NA	
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	NA	
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	NA	
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+/-	Proposed removal of windows on to be replaced with French doors. The alteration of the windows to doors will be on a secondary side addition.
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	-	Historic soldier course with key stone will be obscured with proposed addition to front facade.
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	

W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	

W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Documentation shall be done prior to any alterations.

DOOR

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	+/-	The proposed French doors on the primary facade does create a new entrance; however this is located on the existing side frame addition which reads as a secondary entrance.
D2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric	+	Applicant shall document any existing features that may be altered in any way.
D3	Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate.	NA	
D4	Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.	NA	
D5	Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.	NA	
D6	Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.	NA	

D7	Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.	NA	
D8	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.	NA	
D9	Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.	+/-	Though the door and the frame itself are appropriate, the placement of another entrance on the front façade has some conflict with the design guidelines. The French doors will be located in the existing side addition that reads as secondary from the principal two-story structure.
D10	Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	
D11	Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.	+/-	The proposed new entry point though designed to be secondary is visible from public way. The doors, however, will be located in the existing side addition.
D12	Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended.	NA	

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+/-	Applicant shall conform to all code and zoning district regulations.
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	+/-	Though a portion of a contributing structure is proposed to be demolished, what is proposed to go back in its place is appropriate in style, form, and scale for its location.
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	The proposed new construction on the home generally meets the guideline. There are examples of side additions, terraces, and pergolas in the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District.
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	The scale of the proposed new construction on the rear of the home meets the general scale of the building, The proposed front pergola is a transparent structure that does not add a solid structure to the primary elevation.
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	Proposed additions are to the level of design and craftsmanship expect of a structure in the area.
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	All proposed materials generally meet the guideline.
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	All proposed new construction is sympathetic to the human scale of the district.
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+/-	The proposed new construction on the rear meets the guideline generally. While the proposed pergola addition would be within public view, it is generally a transparent structure and setback considerably from the street.
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	The proposed new construction does reinforce the existing patterns.

NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	NA	
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	NA	
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	Proposed design for new construction generally meets the design guideline.
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	Proposed design for new construction generally meets the design guideline.
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	NA	
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+/-	The rear addition generally maintains this guideline, while the pergola addition does add a second entrance to the front façade. The French doors are proposed to be located on an existing side addition.
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	NA	

NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	Proposed additions generally meet the floor-to-floor height guideline.
NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	NA	
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	Maintains historic setback patterns
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+/-	The roof on the proposed rear addition to the garage does appear to slightly extend beyond the roofline of the principal structure in some of the elevations. The deep setback of the house on the site could minimize the visibility of the garage roof.
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	The proposed new construction on the rear of the home generally meets the guideline. The pergola is an open air structure.
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	+	The proposed new construction on the rear of the home generally meets the guideline. The pergola is an open air structure.
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	NA	
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	NSI	Applicant shall take into account the storage of trash receptacles when designing new garage.

NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	Materials do conform to the surrounding historic building materials.
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	+	Proposed materials are appropriate.
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	+	Proposed sills in rear addition are in compliance with the design guideline.
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+	Proposed new foundations shall compliment the existing.
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	+/-	The proposed new front pergola porch is transparent and scaled to the house. The stone columns for the pergola do appear to be heavy in comparison the columns on the existing front porch.
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+	The proposed new garage generally meets the guideline.
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	The garage style is appropriate though there is not an alley present.
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	+	The proposed new garage generally meets the guideline.

NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+/-	A single double door is proposed, though it is a carriage style door in design.
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	+	The proposed new garage roof is in line with the existing home.
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	+	The proposed new garage and addition on the rear is a the same gable style roof design of the home.
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	NA	Property is landlocked
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NSI	Applicant shall be made aware of the importance of storm-water management provisions in their design.

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- +** Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/-** Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA** Not Applicable
- NSI** Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
--	-----------	---------	---------

ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+/-	The proposed rear addition to the property generally meets the guideline, while the proposed front pergola addition would change the character of the original front façade of the home.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	Applicant shall you like paving materials for any new portions of paving needed
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+	Applicant intends to reuse the existing materials from the garden and retaining walls to reconstruct them after the addition to the rear of the home are complete.
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	The driveway and parking are on the side rear of the property.
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	+	Existing retaining wall shall be reconstructed to match the existing.

ST12	use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	+	New retaining wall and garden wall shall be constructed of like materials if not enough of the materials are salvageable to reuse.
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	

ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	
-------------	--	----	--