Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:	Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru:	Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From:	Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date:	July 20, 2020

Case No: 20-COA-0097
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1473 St. James Ct.

Applicant:
Viji Evers &
Thomas Evers
1473 St. James Ct.
Louisville, KY 40208
(502) 974-7179
(502) 472-7536
kviji@hotmail.com
tevers@thorpegroup.io

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: $35,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:
The applicant is seeking approval to remove the existing wood privacy fence from the front of the home, and erect in its place a 4'-8" brick wall. The proposed brick wall will incorporate a cylindrical alcove that will feature a bronze water fountain. The brick wall will also incorporate brick columns to act as support for the proposed deck and railing to be constructed at the rear and side of the property. The new deck will replace the existing metal deck at the rear of the home. The proposed deck is to be constructed of wood and will be clad with Trex composite decking and cast iron railings to match the proposed new cast iron railings for the front steps. The brick columns will be capped with limestone consistent with the existing limestone trim on the home. The new side privacy fence will be constructed of wood with 6" x 6" columns clad in a brick veneer panel. The applicant also proposes to remove the existing cast iron railings and to replace them with railing to match the railing for the new deck. At this time the applicant proposes to also replace the cracked limestone

steps on the front of the home and then flank them with 1'-6" x 1'-6" brick columns approximately 2' in height that will be capped with bronze urns. All brick shall be painted to match the existing colors of the home. The applicant also proposes to cap the current purple portion of the turret with copper, and add a peacock weathervane. The applicant also proposes to replace the existing downspouts from on all sides of the home with new copper downspouts to match the existing in size and style. The applicant privacy fence with brick columns at the left side and rear of the property.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application
The application was received on June 4th, 2020 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on June 8th, 2020. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on July 29th, 2020 at 4:30 pm, online.

FINDINGS

Guidelines
The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Addition, Masonry, Site, Roof.** The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background
The site is located on the corner of St. James Ct. and Belgravia Ct. The property is zoned TNZD in a Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The turn-of-the-century Victorian structure (also known as the "Pink Palace") constructed circa 1890 is a 2.5-story with a raised basement, wood framed, brick clad building with limestone details.

Conclusions
The proposed changes generally do not meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Addition** based on the location of the proposed new deck being located on the side facade according to **A3, A16** & **A17**. However the design of the proposed deck is in keeping with the style and character of the existing structure including proportion, size, scale, and use of materials as stated in **A1, A2, A4, A5,** & **A10**.

In regard to the proposal of the wall, fountain, and columns, though they generally do not meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Masonry,** they are in keeping with the style and character of the existing building. There is an existing masonry wall on the Saint James Ct. elevation. The proposed masonry structures are not falsely historic and shall be compatible with the building and district in size, scale, material and color.

In terms of **Site,** the project generally meets the Old Louisville Design Guidelines with the exception of **ST10**, which states that new masonry structures shall not be

visible from the street unless they are used for the retention of soil. The proposed work is complementary to the existing structure per **ST1**, and follows the existing property lines per **ST2**. The proposed in-kind replacement of the damaged limestone step meets **ST5**, which states that if changes to steps must be made they should be done with the same materials. In regard to **ST14** which calls for historic precedent for fencing in the front of the home, there is currently an existing wood privacy fence, the material of the fence is what is being proposed to change. This existing fence is located adjacent to the house and not at the sidewalk, as well.

In regard to the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Roof**, the project generally meets them. The use of copper to replace the existing finial on the turret is in keeping with **R1**, and **R2** based on the material choice. The proposed copper downspouts is in keeping with **R13**. The Design Guidelines that are in question are **R17**, and **R21** which discuss instillation of non-historic materials to the front elevations of roofs, yet never specifies weathervanes. The proposed weathervane does meet both **R17**, and **R21** in regards to appropriateness in terms of design and materiality.

Though some of the proposed elements of the project do not specifically meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines, the majority of the proposed changes are in keeping with both the Design Guidelines as well as the whimsical style of the home known as the “Pink Palace”.

Recommendation
On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, Staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved with the following conditions.

1. **The applicant shall stain or paint the proposed wood fence within six months of being installed.**
2. **The replacement of the cracked limestone stair shall be with the same material and the choice of stone presented to staff for approval prior to removal of existing stair.**
3. **The painting of the proposed new masonry construction shall not be the same color as the home in order to distinguish between what is historic and what is not, and the color shall be presented to staff prior to painting for approval.**
4. **The existing stair rails shall stay in place, the railing on the proposed deck shall be distinguishably different in style from what is attached to the home currently, and the applicant shall seek approval from staff prior to instillation of deck railing.**
5. **The proposed fence and brick columns shall not exceed 7’ in height and the finished side of the fencing shall be outward facing per ST15.**
6. **If the design or material changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**

Bradley Fister 07-22-2020
Bradley Fister Date
Historic Preservation Specialist

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The proposed size and scale of the new deck are in proportion to the home and district
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	The proposed deck would be subordinate to the existing structure.
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+/-	The proposed deck is attached to secondary elevations, but is not set back from the front façade and shall not obscure character-defining features.
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	Materials proposed are the same as the existing materials or subordinate.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	The proposed addition shall not overwhelm the existing forms.
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	NA	
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	NA	
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	NA	
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	This is proposed to be accomplished through the use of new cast iron railings, and the use of brick columns.
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	NA	
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	Applicant shall comply

A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	+/-	The proposed deck is primarily on the side façade, but shall be constructed of wood and Trex composite material
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	+/-	The rear deck is proposed to extend beyond the side walls of the house and will be visible to an extent from the street.
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

MASONRY

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
M1	Do not construct new masonry features that are either falsely historical (characteristic of periods prior to the building's actual construction) or are incompatible with the building or historic district in terms of size, scale, material, or color.	+	The proposed masonry structure is not falsely historic and shall be compatible with the building and district in size, scale, material and color.
M2	Do not cut new openings into exterior walls on elevations that can be seen from a public way. Creating an opening for the installation of an air conditioning unit, for example, is not appropriate for a façade that is visible from a public way.	NA	
M3	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	
M4	Match the existing bonding pattern, coursing, color, size, strength, and pointing mortar of masonry when replacing a section of brick wall. Bricks should always be toothed-in to historic brickwork, to disguise the joint between new and old.	NA	
M5	Do not remove or rebuild substantial portions of exterior walls if such an action would adversely impact a structure's historic integrity.	NA	
M6	Make sure that any exterior replacement bricks are suited for exterior use.	NA	
M7	Do not replace sections of historic brick with brick that is substantially stronger.	NA	
M8	Repoint only those joints that are no longer sound. Do not remove all joints, sound and unsound, in an effort to achieve a uniform appearance when repointing. Large-scale removal of mortar joints often results in damage to historic masonry.	NA	

M9	Remove unsound mortar joints carefully with hand tools that are narrower than the mortar joint. Power tools should not be used, because they have the potential to scar adjacent masonry.	NA	
M10	Remove unsound mortar to a depth of two-and-one-half the times the width of the joint or to sound mortar, whichever is greater.	NA	
M11	Match historic mortar joints in color, texture, joint size, and tooling when repointing.	NA	
M12	Use a mortar mix that is compatible with historic masonry. Repointing mortar should be equivalent to or softer than the original mortar. When repointing mortar is harder than the surrounding masonry, as is the case with many modern mixtures, moisture cannot escape through the joints. Trapped moisture will crystallize within the walls and fragment surrounding brick and stone.	NA	
M13	If possible, have your mortar analyzed. In order to determine an appropriate mortar mix for individual historic structures, it is recommended that property owners have a sample of the original mortar sent to a lab for analysis. If this is not feasible, a high lime and low Portland cement content mortar mix (1 part cement, 1 part lime, and 6 parts sand) is frequently acceptable.	NA	
M14	Do not attempt to remove joints that have been repointed using a very hard mortar or in an unworkmanlike manner until natural weathering has begun to weaken and crack them. Removal prior to that time would likely damage the masonry units	NA	
M15	Do not use synthetic caulking to repoint historic masonry.	NA	
M16	Have realistic expectations of how the cleaned masonry surface will appear. Remember, it is better to underclean than overclean. A "like new" appearance is rarely desirable.	NA	
M17	Make sure that your contractor has a clear understanding of the physical and chemical properties of your masonry before proposing or testing any chemical cleaning treatments. Such treatments, if improperly applied, can result in permanent damage that significantly outweighs any benefits of cleaning.	NA	
M18	Test proposed cleaning treatments in an inconspicuous area of the building to evaluate potential adverse effects to the masonry. Observation over a complete seasonal cycle is preferable, so that long-term effects may be ascertained. If chemical treatments are found to be acceptable, be sure that those applying the treatment follow all manufacturers' instructions.	NA	
M19	Do not use sandblasting or high-pressure water to clean historic masonry. The process of sandblasting or cleaning buildings using water pressure greater than 300 psi removes the tough, outer-protective surface of the brick and loosens mortar joints, accelerating deterioration.	NA	
M20	Do not clean masonry on buildings with deteriorated mortar joints. Such masonry should be properly repointed prior to cleaning to ensure that water does not penetrate the wall during the cleaning process.	NA	
M21	Do not use any type of water- or chemical-based cleaning systems when a possibility for freezing temperatures exists. Masonry cleaning should not be undertaken until the temperature will remain above 50 degrees for 72 hours after cleaning.	NA	
M22	Remove graffiti as soon as possible, beginning with the gentlest means possible and taking care not to inadvertently etch an outline of the graffiti onto the wall.	NA	
M23	Use solvent-based chemical strippers to remove paint from previously-painted masonry only after testing its effectiveness and evaluating its potential to damage brickwork. Testing should be carried out in an inconspicuous location.	NA	

M24	Do not paint masonry or stucco that has never been painted. While one layer of paint may not affect the appearance of the masonry or stucco, accumulated layers will eventually obscure decorative detail.	+/-	The proposed brick work is proposed to be painted to match the existing structure in color.
M25	Paint previously-painted masonry a color that is close to its existing color, approximates a natural masonry color as approved, or is recommended by staff. Staff is available to consult with you on appropriate colors.	NA	
M26	Use a "breathable" masonry paint that is compatible with and can create a strong bond with existing paint.	+	Applicant shall use appropriate masonry paint.
M27	Make sure that areas of patched stucco match the strength, composition, color, and texture of the original to the greatest degree possible.	NA	
M28	When patching stucco, cut back the successive layers to provide a key for the new layers to prevent new cracking.	NA	
M29	Carry out stucco repairs so that the dimension between the surface of the stucco and adjacent finishes remains unchanged.	NA	
M30	Do not install stucco, Dryvit, or permastone-type cladding over historic masonry or wood siding.	NA	
M31	Do not resurface historic masonry with exterior insulation.	NA	
M32	Use a masonry or terra cotta chimney cap if needed. Metal chimney caps are not historically appropriate.	NA	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	The proposed changes are complementary to the structure.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	Retention of existing property lines shall be followed.
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NA	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	

ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	+	Proposed replacement of cracked limestone steps shall be with like materials see conditions.
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	-	The proposed masonry wall will be street visible and does not meet the historic precedent.
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	+	There is currently a privacy fence inline with the front façade of the home, however the proposed front fence is to be brick.
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	+	The applicant shall install all wood fencing finish side out and shall not exceed seven feet in height.
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	+	Proposed new wood fencing shall be stained or painted within six months of construction.
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	

ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	

ROOFING

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
R1	Use only replacement materials that closely match the original roofing material in color, texture, and profile. Possible substitute materials include asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles.	+	The use of copper on the top of the turret is in keeping with the materials of the home and the district.
R2	Use copper, lead-coated copper, terne-coated stainless steel, or terne metal when replacing a historic metal roof with in-kind materials. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted either muted red or green, traditional roof colors. Replacement with in-kind materials is recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original.	+	The use of copper to replace the metal on top of the turret is in keeping with R2
R3	Make sure that the proportion of the seams and trim on replacement metal roofing matches that of the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture, because the scale is inappropriate.	NA	
R4	Retain ridge and hip tiles on historic tile roofs. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles, however, should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible.	NA	
R5	Remove existing roofing material when replacing non-repairable or non-historic roofing. Removing these underlying layers will prolong the life of the roof and help restore the original profile of the roof edge.	NA	

R6	Do not apply asphalt shingles over wood shingles. This will trap moisture and cause deterioration of the roof structure.	NA	
R7	Base the reconstruction of any missing roof feature on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If such evidence is insufficient, the feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely-historical or conjectural reconstruction.	NA	
R8	New roof designs for additions or new construction should be compatible in size, scale, material, and color with the historic building and district.	NA	
R9	Use the form and detailing of severely deteriorated roof features, such as cupolas and dormers, or chimneys, to create appropriate replicas.	NA	
R10	Avoid having extensive areas of flashing visible. In some cases, portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco.	NA	
R11	Do not destroy historic detail when installing replacement gutters. If synthetic materials are used, they should be painted to match the trim color.	NA	
R12	Half-round replacement gutters that are of a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim, or in limited cases ogee profile gutters, are preferred. Synthetic materials painted to match the trim color are acceptable.	NA	
R13	Do not use unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts, which rust and stain adjacent materials. These gutters should be painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy.	+	The proposed use of copper downspouts is in keeping with the design guidelines.
R14	Leave historically-exposed rafter ends and eaves open and uncovered.	NA	
R15	Make sure that any new roof-top additions do not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	NA	
R16	Install any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment in such a way that historic fabric is not damaged.	NA	
R17	Do not attach antennae, satellite transmitters, skylights, vents, air conditioning units, decks, terraces, dormers, or solar panels that can be seen from a building's primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	-/+	The proposed weathervane is not original to the structure, and though not called out specifically in R17 is in keeping with the spirit of the design guideline and will be visible from the primary façade.
R18	Do not introduce mechanical equipment or systems that may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system.	NA	
R19	Paint all roof vent assemblies to match the color of the roofing material.	NA	
R20	Do not install ridge vents on historic structures. They are non-historic approaches to attic ventilation.	NA	
R21	Replace historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps on slate roofs with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible.	+/-	The placement of the weathervane in place of the existing finial on the turret is visually compatible.