



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: August 25, 2020

Case No: 20-COA-0134
Classification: Staff Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1452 Cherokee Rd.

Applicant: Marcos Mendoza
Buena Vista Group
602 Colonel Anderson Pkwy.
Louisville, KY 40222
(502) 899-6097
(502) 648-1796
buonavistagr@gmail.com

Owner: Kaveh Zamanian
Heather Bass
1452 Cherokee Rd.
Louisville, KY 40204

Architect: Christopher Quirk
Luckett & Farley
737 S. 3rd St.
Louisville, KY 40202
(502) 216-7651
cquirk@luckett-farley.com

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant is applying to incorporate the construction of a low terrace into the existing stairs that lead to the front door of the house. The proposed 32'-0" wide terrace would be centered on the existing stairs and begin two steps down from the existing front porch (approximately 2' from grade level). The terrace would extend outward toward the street from the foundation of the house approximately 11'-6". The foundation of the concrete terrace is proposed to be clad with stucco, while the perimeter is proposed to be cut limestone to mimic the design of the homes existing accents and foundation.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:

The application was originally received on July 24, 2020. The application was classified as requiring Staff Review on July 27, 2020 and staff emailed applicant to advise them their application had been assigned to a case manager. The original application was deemed to have elements that would need ARC approval, so on August 12, 2020 the application was divided into two separate applications. The original application 20-COA-0134 is now exclusively for the front terrace going to ARC, and this application 20-COA-0156 is for the additions to the rear, which are staff level review. This was done to help expedite the COA process, allowing the applicant to begin work. The Cherokee Triangle ARC has been scheduled for Wednesday Sept. 2 at 4:30pm via WebEx, at 444 S. 5th St.

FINDINGS**Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Addition, Porch, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site is located 9 lots west from the intersection of Baringer Ave. and Cherokee Rd. The property is zoned R4 within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The circa 1915, wood-framed, brick clad, Spanish influenced Colonial Revival Style home sits on a rusticated stone foundation. A brick addition was previously added to the rear of the home with an International Style-influenced design.

Conclusions

The proposed changes to the property generally meet the **Addition, Porch and Site** Design Guidelines for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, with the exception of the terrace proposed being constructed at the front of the home. Though it states in the Design Guidelines decks should not be constructed on front facades, this proposed terrace at the front of the home is not unusual on the street or the district as a whole. The design and materials proposed for the terrace will be complimentary to the architecture and would not be considered a deck. Therefore, staff recommends that the proposed work is appropriate for this property at this time.

DECISION

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness is **approved with the following conditions:**

1. If the design or materials should change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval prior to any work taking place.
2. The applicant shall use historic concrete mix for any newly poured concrete.
3. The addition of the handrail to the front stairs shall be presented to staff for approval prior to installing.
4. The applicant shall take precautions not to disturb the foundation of the house.
5. The applicant and/or their representative shall obtain any permits necessary to begin the work.

Bradley Fister
Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

08-25-2020
Date

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The proposed addition is in keeping with the scale of the existing building and those surrounding it.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	The proposed addition is subordinate to the existing structure and is a fraction of the overall square footage for the building.
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+/-	The proposed terrace addition is at the front façade of the house. The terrace will be slightly raised from grade but will not have enclosed walls.
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	The proposed use of concrete, stone, and stucco meet this guideline.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	NA	
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	The proposed addition is at the front of the building, and does not change the orientation of the building in any way.
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	NA	
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	NA	
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	The use of stucco will work to demonstrate a divide from what is added to the building.

A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	The design is in keeping with the guideline.
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	The applicant shall adhere to code while maintaining the historic fabric of the structure.
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	+	Code required hand rail shall be approved by staff prior to installing.
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	+/-	The terrace is located at the front of the house, but is not a deck structure. There are other examples of similar terraces.
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	+/-	The terrace will be visible to the street but is not a deck structure. It will be slightly raised from grade.
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

PORCH

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
PO1	Replace reconstructed entrance or porch features with in-kind materials. If that is not economically or technically feasible, a compatible substitute material may be considered. Composition and plastic moldings, however, should not be used due to their unproven longevity.	NA	
PO2	Photographically document architectural porch features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Applicant shall photograph the existing stairs prior to their removal.
PO3	Design replacement porch railings and balusters to match the originals as closely as possible. If it is technically or economically unfeasible to accomplish this, a simplified porch rail and baluster design may be used of 2" x 4" rails and 2" x 2" pickets, set between top and bottom rails, and nailed to the inside face of the rail. Railings should be finished with paint or an opaque stain. Plans are available from the Landmarks Commission.	NA	
PO4	Do not use cast- or wrought-iron columns, railings, or balusters as a replacement for brick or wood porch elements. Columns should match the proportion, detailing, and size of the original.	NA	
PO5	When installing a new code-required handrail or railing, select a design that is simple and stylistically appropriate. Generally, metal is appropriate for masonry buildings and wood for frame buildings.	+	Applicant shall present design to staff for approval.
PO6	Do not add conjectural porch ornament; often its style conflicts with the style of the house.	NA	
PO7	Do not use over-sized boards (2" thick) for porch floors. 3/4" to 1" tongue-and-groove boards are generally appropriate.	NA	
PO8	Install replacement porch flooring that closely matches the original tongue-and-groove flooring dimensions. A maximum gap of 1/16" should be left between boards to allow for expansion. Wood edging should be applied to the exposed ends of floorboards to prevent moisture infiltration into the grain.	NA	
PO9	Do not cover porch or cornice elements with vinyl or aluminum siding.	NA	
PO10	Do not install porch ceilings or close in exposed eaves where none existed previously. Exposed rafters and roof decks are character-defining features for certain architectural styles.	NA	
PO11	Replace deteriorated porch steps with in-kind materials. Replacement steps should be of the same scale and dimensions as the original. Stone steps may be patched with concrete that is tinted a visually-compatible color.	NA	

PO12	Do not replace historic stone steps unless the stone itself is no longer useable. Resetting stones on a firm foundation and repointing or applying sealant can address most problems.	NA	
PO13	Do not enclose front porches. Screen panels that can be removed seasonally, are set behind porch elements, and do not damage historic fabric may be permitted.	NA	
PO14	Do not obscure the design or detailing of original porch elements when undertaking a side or rear porch enclosure project. Large sheets of glass recessed behind original porch features should be used rather than solid materials such as wood, stucco, or masonry.	NA	
PO15	Do not add porches to the primary façades of structures that never had porches.	NA	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	The terrace is complementary to the front of the house.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	The use of stucco, stone, and historic concrete mix are keeping with this guideline.
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	-/+	Existing stair components shall be reused where possible.
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	

ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	The addition of the terrace will not change the grade, of the property.
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	+/-	The applicant shall take caution when pouring the terrace in such close proximity to the foundation of the house.
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	

ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	