



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: West Main Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: September 2, 2020

Case No: 20-COA-0141
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 121 + 123 S. 7th St.

Applicant: Barrel, Proof Properties
5109 Dunvegan Rd.
Louisville, KY 40222
(502) 889-0711
mcadden@ktcbuilding.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant proposes to replace the existing windows on the front of the two buildings. The historic windows were previously removed and replaced by previous owners over the years. At 121 S. 7th St. on the front facade there are three 2/2 double-hung windows on the second story, three of the same on the third story, and three more of the same on the fourth story. At 123 S. 7th St. on the front facade there are three 2/2 double-hung windows on the second story, and three more of the same on the third story. As well as all the windows (approximately twenty) on the rear of the building. The replacement windows proposed are to be a static 2/2 aluminum window much like the windows located at 745 W. Main Street.

The applicant also proposes to remove the brick that has been used to fill in several of the window openings on the rear facade of the building. The proposal is to install the

same windows that are being proposed for use as replacement windows for both the front and rear façades in those voids, too.

The applicant also proposes to reinforce the existing fire escape on the rear of the building, and to add a walkway to it on the second floor to connect to one of the windows as another form of egress. The escape will be cleaned and painted uniformly.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:

The application was received on July 30, 2020. The application was classified as requiring Staff Review on August 03, 2020 and staff emailed applicant to advise them their application had been assigned to a case manager. Staff contacted the applicant via phone and email to request additional information as well as to schedule a site visit. After the site visit, and staff discussion, it was decided that though the replacement of the windows could be approved at staff level, it was the type of window being proposed for the replacement units would require the West Main Street Architectural Review Committee approval. The ARC case is scheduled to be heard on September 9, 2020 at 4:30 PM via WebEx at 444 S. 5th St.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the West Main Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window** and **Addition**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The buildings at 121 and 123 S. 7th St. were built circa 1875 in the Italianate Style. The buildings are located 3 lots north of the intersection of S. 7th and W. Market Streets. The property is zoned C3 and located within the Downtown Form District. The masonry building contains a narrow and deep floor plan, flat rooflines, ornamental cornices, expansive plate-glass storefront windows, and a variety of creatively combined building materials. Furthermore, the building contains a cast iron storefront.

Conclusions

The proposed changes to the property have been found to substantially meet the Design Guidelines for the West Main Preservation District. The proposed replacement windows generally do meet the **Window** Design Guidelines for West Main; therefore, staff determined that the proposed work is appropriate for this property at this time. The windows on the front and rear façades were replaced by previous owners. Though the proposed replacement windows will replicate the configuration of the existing non-historic windows, based on the materiality of the existing wood windows, staff is unable to recommend the proposed aluminum windows per **W6** and **W7** for the front facade. Staff does recommend the use of the proposed windows for the rear façade.

The proposed changes to the fire escape, including the addition of a walkway that will connect to a window for egress purposes, meet the **Addition** Design Guidelines for the West Main Preservation District especially **A15**.

Recommendation

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. **The front façade replacement windows shall be 2/2 double-hung wood windows that fit the historic window openings.**
2. **All new windows shall fit the historic window openings. The glass shall not be smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective. Clear low-E glass is permissible.**
3. **If the modifications to the fire escape should impact the historic fabric of the building in anyway the applicant shall contact staff prior for approval.**
4. **If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**
5. **The applicant and/or their representative shall obtain any permits necessary prior to beginning the work.**

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

Date

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	+	The windows on the front façade have been replaced by a previous owner. The existing non-historic rear windows are in very poor condition. Proposed replacement windows are in keeping with the historical character of the building.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+	Replacement windows shall match the same muntin configuration of the existing windows.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NSI	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+	Applicant shall not alter the opening of the existing window.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	+/-	The windows on the front façade are currently wood and are proposed to be aluminum.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	-	Proposed windows will look like double hung but will be fixed.
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	Applicant shall not apply reflective or insulating film to any window.
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	Applicant shall not use smoked, tinted, Low-e or reflective glass. (clear Low-e is acceptable)
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	

W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+	Applicant shall not alter number or size or location of windows being replaced.
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	

W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Applicant shall document changes

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The proposed addition to the existing fire escape is in proportion to the building and the existing structure.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	NA	
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	The addition to the fire escape is located on the rear façade.
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	The addition to the fire escape is of the same material as the existing structure.
A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	NA	
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	The addition does not alter the original orientation of the building.
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	NA	

A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	NA	
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	NA	
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	NA	
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	Addition to fire escape shall comply with all Kentucky building codes without altering character-defining features.
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	+	The addition to the fire escape is compatible.
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	+	The fire escape shall be painted to blend with the building.
A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	