



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: January 6, 2020

Case No: 19-COA-0165
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 514 Belgravia Ct.

Applicant: Randy Cruz
514 Belgravia Ct.
Louisville, KY 40208
(502) 494-4117
randy.cruz29@gmail.com

Owner: Randy Cruz

Estimated Project Cost: \$2,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to install a double iron door gate to the front of the home. The door gate, proposed will be similar in design to the existing iron balustrade affixed to the front of the home, as well as the iron hand rails that lead to the front stoop. The applicant also wishes to install a small, decorative iron fence inside the raised planting bed in front of the home.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:

The application was received on December 20, 2019. The application was classified as requiring Staff Review on December 23, 2019 and staff emailed applicant to advise them their application had been assigned to a case manager. Staff contacted the applicant via phone and email to request additional information to assist in their understanding of the project. On January 3, 2019 the applicant was notified the proposed project would require committee level review. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on February 12th, 2019 at 5:30 pm, at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

The applicant withdrew the portion of their application for the front yard fencing, and chose to only pursue approval for the installation of a metal door gate. The meeting was continued indefinitely to allow the applicant time to meet with a metal worker to design a door gate of period appropriate materials. The Committee requested that the applicant return to the committee once they had a finalized design for approval.

The applicant contacted staff June 2, 2020 to share images of the installed door gates. Staff reminded the applicant at that time, that the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee asked to see the design prior to construction. Staff worked with the applicant to schedule an Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee meeting as soon as possible. Due to the delay of public hearings during the Covid-19 Pandemic, the after-the-fact case has been scheduled to be heard on October 14, 2020 at 5:00pm, via WebEx at 444 S. 5th St. Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Doors, Site** The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site is located on the north corner of Belgravia Court and R Chin Alley. The late-nineteenth century, two-story brick house has a gable roof and dormers. The foundation is stone with a partial basement and crawl space. The property is zoned R5B within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. Previous cases include a 1989 ARC case to approve the iron balustrades that are installed on the second-floor windows.

Conclusions

The character of the existing door would not be changed by the installation of a door gate, as seen on other homes in the adjacent area. D1 states not to alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent. Staff recommends based on the design guidelines

that the applicant may install door gates to the front of the home. The adjacent homes have a mix of door styles similar to the one proposed by the applicant. The proposed door gate meets the architectural context of the neighborhood in Old Louisville.

Staff recommends based on ST 14 which states not to install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent to allow for the installation of the front yard fence. Even though the proposed fencing would be deemed appropriate if there had been historic precedent that a fence did exist on the proposed site.

Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, Staff recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. **Based on the design guidelines allow for the installation of door gates to the front of the home based on precedent in the neighborhood.**
2. **The guidelines do not support the instillation of a fence to the front of the home, where there is not any evidence to support one was there prior.**
3. **If the design or materials change for the replacement of the door, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

10-06-20

Date

DOOR

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	+/-	Door gates are a familiar period design application in the area, though not original to the home.
D2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric	+	Photos on file of the existing door
D3	Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate.	NA	
D4	Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.	+	Proposed door gate is appropriate for the home, the period, and the district.
D5	Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.	NA	
D6	Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.	NA	
D7	Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.	NA	
D8	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.	+	
D9	Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.	NA	
D10	Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	
D11	Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
D12	Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended.	NA	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+/-	There is not precedence for a fence however if there were the proposed fence would be appropriate for its location.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NA	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	

ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	+/-	There is no historic precedence in this case however if there were the fence chosen would be appropriate.
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	+/-	Proposed fence would meet this requirement if historic precedent existed.
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	+	There is not historic precedence in this instance.
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	