



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to The Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: October 7, 2020

Case No: 20-COA-0181
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 515 W Oak Street

Applicant: Bryan Harmeling
Stengel Hill Architecture
613 W. Main St.
Louisville, KY 40202
502-893-1875
bharmeling@stengelhill.com

Owner: Ellen Wichmann
Little Way Pregnancy Resource
515 W. Oak St.
Louisville, KY 40203
(502) 589-0370
ewichmann@littleway.org

Estimated Project Cost: \$20,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to:

1. Remove the flat overhang roof on the front façade.
2. Remove the brick side panels that support the flat roof.
3. Remove the brick planters that flank the front door on the right and left on the front façade.
4. Paint the unpainted brick on the front façade an off-white/cream color.
5. Install metal awnings over the door and two large windows on the front façade.
6. Construct new planters under the two windows on the front façade.

The application also included the following items considered which are considered general maintenance and do not require a Certificate of Appropriateness.

1. Removal of the existing asphalt shingle roof, and replacement with an in-kind asphalt roofing material.
2. Painting of the cement block walls that have previously been painted.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on September 2, 2020 and was considered complete and requiring committee review on September 07, 2020. Staff contacted the applicant to inform them that an Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee meeting was set for Wednesday September 30, 2020 at 4:30pm via WebEx. The meeting was then postponed to quorum concerns and staff informed applicant that the meeting would be moved to October 14, 2020 at 5pm via WebEx.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Storefront, Paint, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The TNZD zoned property within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the north side of W Oak St and located mid-block, five lots west at the intersection of Garvin Place. This is a masonry block construction, one-story Mid-Century Modern commercial building with a hip roof. The street consists of commercial as well as residential brick structures, with a mix of façade styles.

The driveway runs parallel to the main structure, and the applicant has expressed concern over the dangers of exiting due to the side walls on the front façade obscuring one's vision. The flat overhang roof is said to collect water which develops into mold that runs down the building. The proposal to shrink the size of the existing flower beds is to allow for more space for pedestrians, as well as to provide added visibility of pedestrians to vehicles exiting the parking lot. Though the brick on the front façade is not painted, the proposed color is similar to others nearby. The proposed awnings are also similar in style and material of other businesses in the area.

Conclusions

The removal of the flat roof, brick side panels, and masonry planters are not in conformance with the **Storefront** Design Guidelines. Which states in **SF1** not to remove historic elements from front facades. Though the reasons behind removal of the proposed historic elements are not unfounded, **SF3** states to retain all

historic storefront elements. The removal of said elements would also change the scale and proportion of the building as a whole, which is discouraged in **SF6**. The proposal in regard to the **Paint** Design Guidelines, the non-painted masonry conflicts with **P1**, which states not to paint masonry that has not previously painted. The project generally meets the Design guidelines for **Site**, in regard to if the project is approved, the changes would be complementary in nature per **ST1**.

Recomendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness is recommended for **Denial**, however if the Committee were to find the changes appropriate, staff recommends the following conditions:

1. The applicant shall not paint the masonry on the front façade per **P1**.
2. The applicant shall photographically document the existing façade prior to removing any historic elements.
3. If the design changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

10-07-2020

Date

STOREFRONT

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SF1	Do not remove historic materials from storefronts. Such materials as wood, cast iron, terra cotta, carrara glass, ceramic tile, and brick contribute significantly to a storefront's architectural character.	-	The proposal to remove the flat roof, partition walls, and window planters will significantly affect the buildings architectural character.
SF2	Use historic materials where historic storefronts must be replaced in part or in whole. Cast iron, limestone, or wood are appropriate materials for storefront replacement.	NA	
SF3	Retain all historic storefront elements, including later alterations that are historic in their own right. An example is a late nineteenth-century storefront with Art Deco features added during the 1930s.	-	The proposal is to remove storefront elements that are historic in their own right.
SF4	Respect façade alterations that have attained historic or architectural significance in their own right. Work to incorporate such elements into any new storefront design or renovation. Do not attempt to recreate a conjectural historic design if there is insufficient physical or documentary evidence.	NA	
SF5	Do not remove later historically-significant material to restore a building to an earlier period. For example, a 1910 storefront should not be taken back to a conjectural 1850s appearance.	NA	
SF6	Maintain the original scale, proportion, and organization of architectural elements (bulkheads, display windows, transoms, door, piers, and cornices) when renovating historic storefronts.	+/-	The proposal would change the organization and scale of architectural elements.
SF7	Use the original form and detailing of a storefront as a model, if extensive deterioration requires complete reconstruction. The reconstruction should convey the same visual appearance and use the same material as the original. Under no circumstances should a historic storefront be removed and not replaced.	NA	
SF8	Use historic, pictorial, and physical documentation to construct a historic storefront when the original is missing. The design may be an accurate restoration, if sufficient evidence exists, or a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, material, and color of the historic building and district.	NA	
SF9	Keep storefront designs within their original openings. Transitions from one façade to another should be clean and clearly defined.	+/-	The proposed design would still be within the confines of the front façade and be clearly defined.
SF10	Emphasize the transparent character of storefronts when implementing new designs or renovations. Generally, 60 percent of the wall surface at the sidewalk level should be transparent. Historically, merchandise seen in storefront displays was emphasized to a much greater extent than any ornament on the storefront itself.	+/-	The proposed design would potentially increase the transparent character since the wall elements will be removed.
SF11	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	NA	
SF12	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
SF13	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	

SF14	Select replacement doors that reflect the storefront's original character. Doors should have large glass panels and be made of wood or painted steel or aluminum. They should not be overly-decorated or possess inappropriate historic features.	NA	
SF15	Do not change or reorient the location of the main entrance of a storefront.	+	The main entrance shall stay in place.
SF16	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	+	Proposed awnings are in fitting with the design of the front façade.
SF17	Install awnings made out of matte-finish weather-proofed fabric or a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	+	Proposed awning meets these standards.
SF18	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	+	Proposed color is in keeping with the color of the façade.
SF19	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	+	Awnings are proposed to be installed above the windows and doors.
SF20	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present.	+	Proposed awnings fall within the appropriate location range.
SF21	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7'-6" above the sidewalk.	+	Proposed height shall not be lower than 7'-6" above the sidewalk.
SF22	Maintain the commercial character of storefronts, even if they have changed use. Blinds or insulating curtains may be added for privacy and thermal performance.	NA	
SF23	Design replacement storefronts that are compatible with and complementary to their historic neighbors, but are recognizable as being of their own era.	+/-	Though the proposal is to remove the existing architectural elements from the front façade, the proposed new façade is in keeping with others in the area.
SF24	Do not add elements to storefronts that have no historic precedent. Common examples of inappropriate alterations include the installation of coach lanterns, false mansard designs, small-paned windows, and inoperable shutters.	NA	
SF25	Do not add false fronts, false stories, or pent eaves to the roofs of commercial buildings.	NA	
SF26	Do not use storefront design elements that are historically inappropriate, such as small-pane windows or colonial doors on late-nineteenth and twentieth-century buildings.	NA	
SF27	Do not use materials in storefront renovations that were not available at the time of original construction, such as vinyl or aluminum siding, stainless steel, uncoated anodized aluminum, tinted glass, or artificial stone.	NA	
SF28	Use historic materials when replacement of bulkheads is required in part or in whole. Wood or stone panels are most appropriate.	NA	
SF29	Do not use rough-textured wood siding or simulated masonry, such as perma stone, on storefronts.	NA	
SF30	Use historic materials when cornice replacement is required in part or in whole. Cast iron, wood, or sheet metal are appropriate materials.	NA	
SF31	Do not install inappropriately-scaled signs that obscure or damage surviving storefront features that convey a building's architectural character.	NA	

SF32	Include the following storefront elements when redesigning or renovating a historic storefront: large display windows and doors, transoms, relatively thin framing elements, a cornice element separating the storefront from the upper façade, low bulkheads, and tile entry flooring.	+/-	Some of these elements have been proposed for the new façade.
SF33	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	The front façade shall be documented with photographs prior to any work to be completed.

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+/-	The relationship between the site and the structure would change with the proposal, however if approved the changes would be complementary.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	Property line patterns shall not change.
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NA	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	Drive access is located on the side of the building.

ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	The grade shall not change.
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	+/-	The proposed new planters would meet the historic precedent standard.
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	+/-	The proposed materials for the front façade simplified in design.
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	

ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	
-------------	--	----	--

PAINT

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
P1	Painting masonry or stucco that has never been painted is not recommended. Paint is difficult to remove, accumulated layers will obscure decorative detail, and paint coatings (even "breathable" paints) will affect the wall's vapor transmission performance. The presence of a lead oxide wash does not constitute a precedent for painting a building.	-	The proposal to paint the unpainted masonry does not meet the design guideline.
P2	When removing paint from previously-painted masonry, use gentle treatments that have been previously tested in an inconspicuous location. Do not sandblast or use acid-based cleaners.	NA	
P3	Use a "breathable" masonry paint that is compatible with and can create a strong bond with existing paint, only on previously-painted masonry.	+	Proposed paint shall be breathable for the surfaces that have been previously painted to best adhere to.
P4	If painting previously-painted masonry, select a color that matches the existing color, approximates a natural masonry color as approved, or is recommended by the staff. Staff is available to consult with you on appropriate colors.	+	Color chosen does mimic a natural stone color.
P5	Have paint samples analyzed when possible. Paint seriation studies can determine historic pigments and appropriate colors for repainting, by analyzing a paint sample under special lighting conditions to ascertain specific color, hue, and value of paint layers.	NA	
P6	Do not expose metal types that require protection from the elements or apply paint or other coatings to metals that were historically meant to be exposed, such as copper, bronze, or stainless steel.	NA	

P7	Paint replacement gutters, downspouts, metal frame screen and storm windows, roof-vent assemblies, and fire escapes to match wall, trim, cornice, or roof color of the house, whichever is most effective in reducing the visibility of these elements.	NA	
P8	Be aware that historic structures often contain hazardous substances, such as lead paint and asbestos. Contact the Board of Health regarding proper methods of removal and disposal.	+	Applicant shall be aware of any existing paint dangers.