



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Limerick Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Katherine Groskreutz, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: January 13, 2021

Case No: 20-COA-0268
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 715 and 717 W. St. Catherine St.

Applicant: Rachael Harman
Concept Architects, LLC
1621 Windsor Pl.
Louisville, KY 40204
(270) 823-4647
rachel@conceptarcs.com

Owner: Steve Sizemore and Milana Boz
1030 S. 5th St.
Louisville, KY 40203
(513) 503-8746
Stevesizemore73@gmail.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$90,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant is seeking approval to construct a new, approximately 2,203 sq. ft., 28' W x 43' D x 27'-3" H, energy efficient, single-family dwelling over two vacant parcels along W. St. Catherine St. The lots will be combined prior to construction. It is a contemporary, two-story, wood frame structure on a concrete slab foundation.

The structure is to be sheathed primarily in fiber cement, vertical board and batten siding with 2" battens that are 12" on center. Fiber cement, 5.5" horizontal lap siding will also be used on the four facades, with the front and rear façades with a roughly 50/50 split between the two siding types and more limited horizontal siding on the side facades. The new structure will feature two opposing sloped shed

roofs with 4:12 and 2.5:12 slopes and a hip roof with 2.5:12 slope over the rear façade balcony. The roofs will be sheathed in a Galvalume metal roofing system that meets cool-roof standards and has 18" on center standing seams. The roof will have two 24" x 24" skylights and half round guttering. All trim, fascia boards, and soffit panels will be fiber cement. All windows will be Marvin Signature, black, aluminum-clad wood and will be a mix of fixed, casement, and awning styles.

The south elevation (front) will feature: vertical board and batten siding with horizontal lap siding accents on the lower right and upper left quadrants; a front entry porch with Therma-Tru Smooth-star solid fiberglass door and full-lite sidelite window with a transom window over both; a cable-suspended metal or wood awning over the entry porch; a two window unit with one fixed and one casement to the right of the entry on the first floor; a four window unit on the right of the second story with one fixed, one casement, and one awning and one fixed transom windows with a sunshade between the fixed/casement and transom windows; and a two fixed window unit with a sunshade above.

The east elevation (alley facing side) will feature: mostly vertical board and batten siding with horizontal lap siding accents on the lower front and the side of the balcony; two single, vertical, casement windows on the first floor and three on the second floor; one horizontal awning window on the second floor; and a three window unit with a fixed, casement, and fixed transom window on the first floor towards the rear.

The west elevation (yard facing side) will feature: mostly vertical siding with horizontal lap siding accents on the exposed roof clerestory and a small section of the second story near the front façade; one single, vertical, fixed window in between floors in an interior stairwell; two horizontal awning windows with one on each floor, two single, horizontal, fixed windows on the first floors; and three horizontal, fixed clerestory windows.

The north elevation (rear) will feature: horizontal lap siding on the first floor with vertical board and batten accent on the inset back entry porch and on the second story; a second story covered balcony; three full-lite door with full sidelite and fixed transom window units with one on the first floor and two on the second with access to the balcony; and a two window fixed and casement unit on the first floor.

The applicant is also requesting to construct a 34' W x 20' D x 12'-10" H carport/shed structure located at the back of the property with access to parking from the side alley. The carport portion will have open sides to the north and south, with a 16' double garage door to the east along the side alley for security. The shed portion will be on the left and have the same fiber cement, vertical, board and batten siding as the primary structure. The roof will also be two, 2:12, opposing sloped shed roofs with matching metal roofing to the primary structure.

The applicant is also requesting approval to construct a 6' tall wooden privacy fence from the front east side façade, around the east side and rear yards, joining into the carport/shed, and ending at the rear of the west side façade. Some interior

yard trees are to be removed for construction, but the existing street trees are to remain.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

Staff attended a pre-application meeting with the property owner on October 26, 2020 to review and provide feedback on the proposed design and materials. The owner was informed an ARC level review would be required.

The COA application was received on December 04, 2020. Staff contacted the applicant on January 4, 2021 requesting some additional material details, which was received on the 4th and 5th.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Limerick Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on January 13, 2021 at 5:30 pm, via WebEx video conference.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Limerick Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **New Construction-Residential, Garage, and Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The subject property is currently a vacant site of two adjacent parcels zoned TNZD in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site is the second and third parcels west from the intersection of W. St. Catherine Street and S. 7th Street. It is surrounded by a mix of other vacant parcels, historic and infill one-and-a-half to two story frame or masonry homes, mid-to-late 20th century masonry churches, and larger two-and-a-half story masonry homes one block to the east.

Pictures of the previous historic home located at 715 W. St. Catherine were found in the file and are included at the end of this report. The historic structure was a two-story, townhouse style home with a metal, low-pitched, hipped roof; decorative bracketing under the front eave; and wide, horizontal siding in what appears to be asphalt, asbestos, or other type of synthetic material.

Conclusions

The proposed new single-family structure generally meets the applicable design guidelines for New Construction-Residential. The design of the new structure is contemporary but meets the recommendations of the guidelines for spatial organization, façade organization, and compatibility of roof forms, scale, massing, materials, window proportions, front entry design, and orientation of the main entrance as reflections of the historic context and previously demolished two-story structure on this site. The structure's setback is roughly 5' farther back than most surrounding structures on the block, but falls in line with homes located a block to the east and is not excessively deep or out of line for the district. However the foundation does not meet guideline NC34 for a raised masonry foundation as it is a

slab foundation. Other surrounding homes do show siding very close to grade with little foundation visible. Overall Staff finds the single-family home proposal to be appropriate infill design for the site and district.

The proposed new carport and garage structure generally meets the applicable design guidelines for Garage. It is located in the rear yard with access from a side alleyway. It helps enclose the rear yard and is of similar roof form/orientation and materials to the primary structure for site cohesion. No garages are located along this section of the rear alley, and one with a gable roof and similar height is located to the north along the side alley. Some shed structures exist along the rear alley which have shed style roofs. There are multiple garages, sheds, and carports along the rear alley one block to the east, which are a mix of heights, materials, and gable and shed roof styles. The proposed carport/shed has similar height and scale to these surrounding secondary structures.

The flush double garage door does conflict with the Openings checklist section of the Garage guidelines, which requests single-car openings or doors that are broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce the scale. Two doors or a double door with detailing that helps break up the flush surface and reduce the opening's scale may be more appropriate for the district. However, the open sides of the carport and different carport/shed wall treatments help to reduce the scale and break up the façade. There is existing context for a more solid double garage door nearby at 625 W. St. Catherine St.

The proposal generally meets the design guidelines for Site. The street trees are to remain, and the mulberry trees proposed to be removed are not located in what would be the front yard of the site, so do not require a COA. The privacy fence is proposed to be 6' tall which falls under the required 7' maximum and will be located the side and rear yards. The design and material are appropriate for the district.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. **All grade level concrete and stairs shall use historic concrete mix.**
2. **All historic limestone curbing shall be retained and shall not be damaged during construction.**
3. **The privacy fence shall be setback at least two feet from the front façade.**
4. **All unfinished wood shall be opaque painted or stained within 6 months of construction.**
5. **Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.**
6. **Parking areas or architectural features shall not be lit in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles shall be sufficient. Light shall be directed down and away from neighboring properties.**

7. All other required approvals and permits shall be obtained prior to construction.
8. If the design or material changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Katherine Groskreutz
 Katherine Groskreutz
 Historic Preservation Specialist

01/05/2021

Date



Photos of previously demolished historic home at 715 W. St. Catherine St.

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	See conditions of approval

NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	+	Vacant lots
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+/-	While many of the buildings on this block of St. Catherine are vacant lots or one-and-a-half story shotgun homes, some have two-story camelbacks, and there are other taller religious and infill buildings. The original historic structure onsite had been a two-story home prior to demolition. There is a two-story building is two buildings to the west and directly diagonal across the street, and a taller church is directly to the east of the proposed lot; a block to the east the buildings are mostly two-and-one-half stories - the proposed two-story building is a good transition between the two
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	Scale does not conflict with the Limerick neighborhood; original home onsite had similar scale
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	Horizontal and vertical fiberboard cement siding; most surrounding buildings have siding sheathing
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	NA	
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	The street trees will remain; fence to be installed in rear yard
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	Modern design that takes cues of spatial organization of surrounding buildings
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+	Front façade has a front entry door and double first story window in similar proportion to surrounding buildings; proportional in window to wall space

NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	Massing and window proportions are compatible with surrounding buildings and the district
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+	The windows are modern in design but similar in proportion to historic windows
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+	Solid front door with a full lite sidelite window and transom window over both
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	+	Front façade faces W. St. Catherine
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	+	Paved walkway between sidewalk and front porch
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+	Site is surrounded one-and-a-half-story and two-story buildings; previous historic building onsite had been a two-story structure
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	Proposed floor-to-floor height is roughly 10' – is not a character defining feature of this block
NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	+	The spacing between buildings on this block is mixed and there are many vacant parcels; the proposed side setbacks are 7' to the west and 15' from the east property lines
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+/-	The front façade is setback approximately 5' feet further than directly surrounding buildings, but is in line with the slightly taller homes one block east, which will help the scale and massing feel in keeping with surrounding structures

NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+/-	The proposed split shed roof is a modern design but still mimics the front facing gables found on this block of the street; there are a mix of roof pitches on surrounding buildings and the proposed pitch is similar to the pervious lower hipped roof shown in historic photography; the surrounding buildings have asphalt shingles but a metal roof is appropriate for the district and can be seen on the previous onsite structure and the neighboring structure in the historic photographs
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	See above
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	Front facing gable-like roof similar to other roofs on street
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	+	
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	Rear yard will be fenced
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	Fiber cement horizontal and vertical siding; surrounding buildings have a mix of masonry and horizontal siding of differing reveal depths and materials
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	NA	
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	Not a character defining feature on this block
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	-	Slab construction, no raised masonry foundation; some surrounding buildings have siding that is very close to grade with little foundation visible.

NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	+	Does have a small front covered entry, but it is not a character defining feature on this block
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	+	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+/-	There are few adjacent secondary structures along this block, only a few sheds; the proposed garage is similar to secondary structures located a block to the east
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	Adjacent to rear alley
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	NA	Carport
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	+	
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	+	The carport/shed roof pitch is 2:12; other secondary structures in the surrounding area have low pitch shed or gable roofs; will echo form of main house
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	Side alley
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	NSI	See conditions of approval

Garage

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted		

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	Rear yard
		NA	Align with adjacent secondary structures	No adjacent secondary structures

		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	
		+	Minimize paving	
Materials	Walls	NA	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		+	Board and batten siding	Fiber cement board and batten
		NA	Brick	
		NA	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		NA	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	NA	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	
		+	Metal roofing	
		+	Half-round or Ogee gutters	Half-round
		NA	Approved Gable-end element	
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		NA	No overly-elaborate volumes	
	Roof	NA	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	
		+	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	shed
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		+	Overhanging eaves	
		+	Half-round gutters	
		+/-	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	2:12 slope shed roof - See NC42 above
		NA	No flush eaves	
		NA	No roofs without gutters	
Openings	Garage	-	Single-car openings	Double
	Doors	-	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	flush
		-	No double and triple doors	double
		-	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	flush
	Windows	NA	Use window openings to break up wall surface	Carport/shed
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	NSI	See conditions of approval
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+	See conditions of approval
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	Side/rear
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	Vacant parcels
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	

ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	+	See conditions of approval
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	+	Simple wall sconce by front entry
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NSI	See conditions of approval
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NSI	See conditions of approval
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	+/-	Street trees will remain; mulberrys in the middle of the parcels will need to be removed for construction; would not have been located in the front yard if the structures still existed
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	