



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: January 14, 2021

Case No: 20-COA-0258
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 106 N. Keats Ave.

Applicant: Sara Coakley
106 N. Keats Ave.
Louisville, KY 40206
sarawoodford@hotmail.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$18,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to replace a total of 14 windows on the front, sides and rear façades of the house with new vinyl replacement windows. Some of the windows proposed to be replaced are historic wooden double-hung windows (as seen on front of home), as well as previous replacement windows. The purpose of the proposal to replace the existing windows is for improved energy efficiency, and continued deterioration of the existing windows due to lack of proper maintenance previously.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on November 16, 2020 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on November 16, 2020. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on January 20, 2020 at 5:30 pm, online via WebEx at 444 S. 5th Street, Conference Room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Windows**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the west side of N. Keats Ave., five lots north of its intersection with Frankfort Ave. The site is zoned R5 within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The one-and-one-half-story frame home on a crawl space was constructed circa 1910. It is surrounded by homes of similar size, style and age.

Conclusions

Based on photos provided by the applicant, staff believes that the street-facing windows do not meet **W1**, and that more research needs to be conducted by the applicant to look into exploring options to repair the existing wood windows (especially on the front façade). Staff also recommends that if the windows on the front (street-facing) façade are deemed to be unrepairable by a preservation window specialist, that they be replaced with a wood replacement window which meets Window Design Guidelines **W2-W7**. Windows on the side and rear elevations meet **W2-W7**. Window Design Guideline **W11** states that historic window trim shall not be covered with aluminum or synthetic materials.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. If the windows on the front façade are deemed appropriate for replacement, they shall be replaced with a wood replacement window with matching muntin pattern
2. Muntin pattern shall match those of the historic wood windows.
3. Original openings shall not be blocked-in to accommodate smaller replacement windows.
4. Window trim shall not be wrapped with aluminum or vinyl.
5. If the design changes, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval.

Bradley Fister
Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

1-14-21
Date

Windows

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	The maintenance and repair of historic windows are essential to preserving the historic character and fabric of Clifton structures and the overall Clifton historic district. For that reason, historic windows on street-address façades and street-facing façades shall not be replaced with new windows unless the Clifton ARC determines that the condition of existing windows, safety or energy efficiency considerations, or other relevant factors support window replacement. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	+/-	See conclusions and conditions for approval
W2	If historic windows on façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades are replaced, or the owner is authorized to replace windows on street-address façade or street-facing façade pursuant to W1, the new windows shall convey the same visual appearance as the historic windows. The visual appearance of a window is based on details such as sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and other decorative features. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of wood, metal, or synthetic window systems for authorized window replacement is permissible. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	+	The applicant will be replacing the front side and rear windows and the muntin patterns will match those of the original windows.
W3	Replacement sash should not be used that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows.	+	Replacement windows shall fit existing openings.
W4	Replacement windows proposed for façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades, and those authorized pursuant to W1 for street-address façades and street-facing façades, shall operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	All replacement windows shall function as the original.
W5	Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance with W2 shall have such muntins permanently applied and may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass panes.	+	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W6	Reflective or insulating film shall not be applied to window glass on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+	
W7	Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass shall not be used on windows on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+	
W8	Transoms or sidelights shall not be blocked-in or back-painted.	NA	
W9	The number, size, location, or shape of original windows shall not be altered on street-address façades or street-facing façades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+	Window size, number location and shape shall not change from original windows
W10	Any new window openings for a new use shall not be located on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	
W11	The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side of historic window trim.	NSI	Window trim shall remain as is currently in place.
W12	New floors or dropped ceilings shall not be installed that block the glazed area of windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W13	If exterior storm windows are installed they should duplicate the shape of the original window.	NA	
W14	When installing exterior storm windows or screens do not damage or obscure historic windows or frames.	NA	
W15	Window sashes shall not be altered to accommodate window air-conditioning units.	NA	
W16	When installing security bars do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W17	Awnings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W18	Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building.	NA	
W19	Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units.	NA	
W20	On commercial buildings attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W21	Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works).	NA	
W22	Replacement shutters should match the visual appearance, size, and location of the originals and may be constructed of wood, metal, or synthetic material.	NA	
W23	Shutters shall be installed only where there is historic evidence for them.	NA	