



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: February 17, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0022
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 236 Albany Ave.

Applicant: Simon Andrew Meurer
236 Albany Ave.
Louisville, KY 40206
madeinusasimon@gmail.com

Owner: Same as Applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$25,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to construct a new, detached, two-car garage in the rear yard with existing alley access. It is proposed to be approximately 24' D x 26' W x 24' H at the roof peak. It will be constructed of concrete block walls with siding on the gable ends (east and west elevations) (siding material to be chosen after price analysis is back); north and south elevations show asphalt shingles on an approximately 8:12 pitch front facing gabled roof, aluminum gutters, and one small clerestory window on both sides; on the west elevation one 16' W double garage door facing the alley along with a window in the gable; on the east elevation an approximately 36" W person door with an adjacent double-hung window and a double-hung window in the gable as well.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on February 9, 2021 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on February 15, 2021.

Staff contacted the applicant regarding the concrete block walls and appropriate treatments on February 10, 2020. Per the conversation with the applicant, they intend to move forward with the use of untreated concrete block with standard joints.

The case has been scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee on February 24, 2021 at 5:30 pm online via WebEx.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Garage**, and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The building is located on the southwest side of Albany Avenue, twelve lots southeast of the intersection with Payne St. The property is zoned R5A within the Traditional Marketplace Corridor Form District. The building is a one-and-one-half-story, circa 1929 masonry structure in a Bungalow style with a front facing gabled roof and covered front porch. It is surrounded by an eclectic mix of similar historic residential buildings of various styles, materials, and massing.

Conclusions

The proposed changes generally meet the Clifton Preservation District for **Garage** and **Site**. The subject property does have alley. The proposed location of the garage is to be in the rear yard, so it will not be easily seen from the street. The simple, front facing gable roof is similar in orientation to the roofline of the house. The walls will be concrete block with (TBD siding in gables), and there are multiple concrete block structures in the vicinity. The design is simple, in scale with surrounding structures, and is appropriate for the Clifton Historic District. The design however does not comply with **G-11**, as it is concrete block that has not been skim coated or parged. It also does not meet the preference for single-car garage doors per **G-14**. The applicant proposes the use of a double-car door due to the narrow alley and size of vehicles to make turn into garage. The applicant proposes to use a carriage style door, that visually articulates two single-car garage doors.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. The concrete block shall have a flush joint finish and be painted with a breathable masonry paint, or the concrete block shall be skim coated /parged and then painted.
2. The siding shall have a 3" or 4" reveal depth, and material choice submitted to staff for approval prior to instillation.
3. The applicant shall install a carriage style door that visually articulates as two single-car garage doors, door shall be submitted to staff for approval prior to being installed.
4. Any poured concrete for apron visible from alley shall be of historic mix.
5. Storm-water management systems in new construction design and water runoff shall not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
6. Applicant shall design storage for waste receptacles to be hidden from view.
7. All other required permits and approvals shall be obtained prior to construction.
8. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

02/16/2021

Date

Garage

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
G1	Contributing secondary structures should be preserved. However, when demolition is being requested to make way for a new secondary building, then Landmarks staff and/or the ARC will evaluate and review the demolition permit request based on the structure's integrity, historical character and materials, functionality, and security concerns. All structures in the district will be identified as either contributing or non-contributing at the time of application. See the Demolition guidelines for more details.	NA	
G2	New garages or other secondary structures should be designed so they complement the scale, mass, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures. They should also be subordinate to the primary structure.	+	
G3	New garages should be sited adjacent to an alley where present. Review the garage prototype illustration that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	Alley access available
G4	When no alley exists, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Landscape screening is encouraged along the driveway.	NA	
G5	Single garage doors should be used rather than expansive double or triple doors.	-/+	Double-door proposed based on size of alley. Double-door needed due to narrow alley turning radius.
G6	The roofline of a new garage should be oriented, so it is parallel with the main house or follows the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures when a pattern exists.	+	Main structure has a high pitch front facing gabled roof, proposed orientation of the garage gable is similar.
G7	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. The roof form of the garage should match the roof form of the main house when it is a character-defining feature.	+	8:12 pitch
G8	New garages should be designed so access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	Alley access available

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
G9	New garages should be located at the rear of the property, should define and enclose the rear yard, and should be aligned with adjacent secondary structures.	+	
G10	The garage design should be simple and rectangular in shape. Ell-shaped floor plans, slightly-projecting bays, and cantilevered second floors are also permitted.	+	
G11	New garage walls should be constructed with any of these materials (1) Horizontal siding to match existing exposure of the primary structure (normally 3" or 4" exposure), (2) corner boards and trim around openings, (3) board and batten siding, (4) brick, (5) stucco over frame or concrete block, (6) painted concrete block with parged or flush joint finish, (7) cast stone, molded concrete block, or (8) wood, aluminum or vinyl siding, or fiber cement siding or board to match existing exposure of the primary structure. Do not use these materials: T-111, exposed uncoated concrete block, or painted concrete block unless parged or skim coated first.	-	Unpainted concrete block proposed
G12	Approvable roof designs include simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope), hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets, intersecting gables, overhanging eaves, and gable end-vents. Not approvable are low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope), flush eaves, and roofs without gutters.	+	8:12 gable
G13	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, tile, metal, slate or synthetic shingles are recommended roof materials. Half-round or ogee gutters, gable-end elements, and solar collectors are approvable. Do not use membrane or roll roofing on sloped roofs with 3-in-12 pitch or greater. See Roofing guidelines for additional details.	+	Asphalt shingles; ogee gutters
G14	Single-car garage doors or openings are preferred. Double- or triple-wide doors which convey the appearance of 2 or 3 single doors may be approved. Flush garage doors which accentuate the large size of the opening are prohibited.	+/-	Double-door proposed base on narrow alley.
G15	Garage window openings should be used that visually break up the wall's surface and may be placed at higher elevations for security. Security grills may be installed on the inside face of the windows.	+	Window openings used to break up wall surface.

Site

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Paving materials (concrete, brick, paver stones, cobblestones, asphalt, gravel, stone, permeable or pervious materials) that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character should be used for private sidewalks, drives, and roadways.	+/-	Existing alley will be utilized for access. Applicant shall use historic mix concrete for apron.

ST2	Historic paving materials for streets, alleys, sidewalks, and curbing (brick, hexagonal pavers, cobblestones, limestone, granite, or natural stone) should be protected, maintained, restored, and reused. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Replacement with historic materials is encouraged. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original. See Masonry M13 guideline for cement mortar mix recipe.	+	Applicant shall retain any historic limestone curbing.
ST3	Steps on private property made of brick, stone, or poured concrete should be maintained wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST4	Paving companies and utility contractors shall not harm historic resources during road or underground utility repair projects.	NA	
ST5	Driveways, parking areas, and loading docks should be constructed or located to the side and rear of properties. Alley access is preferred.	+	Rear yard; already exists onsite
ST6	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not re-contour front yard berms into stepped terraces. Do not use railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST7	Excavations, trenching or re-grading adjacent to a building or site should be performed cautiously so as not to cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources. Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve architectural resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project.	NA	
ST8	Masonry walls in street-visible locations should not be installed unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless an historic precedent exists.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST9	Retaining wall and curbing should match the existing character of the original materials when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST10	Fencing should match existing sections of fencing in material, height, design, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST11	Iron fencing should be installed, historically compatible, and of a similar height where there is a demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST12	Front yard fencing should not be installed where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST13	Rear yard or side yard privacy fencing should be installed with the finished side out and a side wall setback from the front of the house of at least two feet. Privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Refer to the Land Development Code or contact the Department of Codes and Regulations regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST14	Chain-link fencing painted black or dark color may be installed in residential front yards or along commercial corridors at the street where there is an historic precedent. Split-rail, woven-wood fencing, opaque fencing, painted or stained pressure-treated wood fencing, or recycled or reclaimed materials may be permitted with appropriate design. Synthetic or composite fencing that is durable may be considered.	NA	
ST15	Exterior lighting fixtures should not be falsely historical. The fixture should be attached to the exterior in a way as to not damage historic fabric.	NA	
ST16	Exterior lighting for parking areas, architectural features, or other site areas should be directed down and away from neighboring properties. Energy-efficient lights should be used to create a soft illumination and to minimize the impact to adjacent properties. Reference the Land Development Code for illumination restrictions.	NA	
ST17	Parking lot design requires a portion of the parking area to be landscaped or buffered from adjoining properties. Reference the Land Development Code for specifics on parking lot design, maneuvering, landscaping, and buffering requirements.	NA	
ST18	Auxiliary fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, rain barrels, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, should be located on secondary elevations (side or rear) so they do not detract from the street-address façade and the character of the site.	NA	
ST19	Trees in front yards should be preserved. Established street tree patterns should be enhanced by planting additional trees along the public rights-of-way in the grass area between the street and sidewalk. Consult the city arborist or Frankfort Avenue Street Tree Master Plan to determine tree species that are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review by Landmarks staff unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety concerns.	NA	
ST20	Cellular towers and associated fixtures should be strategically located to minimize the impact on historic view shed(s), screened from public view, and should not damage historic elements when attached to structures.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST21	Utility lines should be installed underground whenever possible.	NA	
ST22	The concrete mixture should match the existing or historic concrete mixture when repairing or replacing sidewalks or installing new sidewalks in the public right-of-way. Contact the Landmarks staff for the appropriate mixture and specifications.	NA	