



---

## Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

# Certificate of Appropriateness

---

---

To: Charles Williams  
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer  
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist  
Date: January 8, 2021 *BF*

---

**Case No:** 20-COA-0202  
**Classification:** Staff Review

### GENERAL INFORMATION

**Property Address:** 909 Cherokee Rd.

**Applicant:** Charles Williams Designs  
1626 Windsor Place  
Louisville, KY 40204  
(502) 459-1810  
[charliewilliamsdesign@gmail.com](mailto:charliewilliamsdesign@gmail.com)

**Owner:** Home in the Highlands LLC  
1210 Lilac Dr.  
Anchorage, AK 99516

**Estimated Project Cost:** TBD

### Description of proposed exterior alteration:

#### Part 1:

The applicant proposes to remove an existing deck and 180 SF one-story addition with shed roof at the rear of the home and construct a new one-story 700 SF addition in its place. The proposed addition will have an intersecting double hip roof, the largest portion approximately 32'-6" x 15' will have a 7/12 pitch and be clad with asphalt shingles to match the existing roof on the house. The smaller, second low slope hip roof approximately 13'-10 1/2" x 16'-7" will have a 1-1/2 / 12 pitch and is proposed to be clad with standing seam copper roofing. The addition is proposed to include the installation of half round copper gutters, and downspouts; 4" exposure, smooth composite siding; metal clad windows and doors; concrete block foundation clad with a stone veneer; wood

deck/porch approximately 34' x 16'-7", on concrete piers, clad on sides with a plank skirt on sides, and 4 wooden stairs along the entire approximately 34' section, and metal posts with cable for railing.

## **Part 2:**

The applicant proposes to demolish the existing concrete block carport and construct a new wood frame two car garage clad with 4" reveal smooth cementitious fiber board or vinyl dependent upon cost. The garage will be approximately 32' x 24', with a 7/12 pitched gable roof clad with asphalt shingles to match those used on the house. Half round brown aluminum gutters and downspouts are proposed to be installed on the north and south elevations. The two 9' carriage style doors are proposed to face the alley on the north elevation. On the south elevation that faces the rear of the house, there is proposed to be two square casement windows to the left of a 36" six panel door. Both the east and west elevations will have louvered gable vents framed as windows. Historic mix concrete is proposed for the approximately 12' deep apron. The applicant also states they are aware they may be required to receive a private yard encroachment.

## **Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:**

The application was received on September 23, 2020. The application was classified as requiring Staff Review on September 28, 2020 and staff emailed applicant to advise them their application had been assigned to a case manager. Staff later contacted applicant to find out more information. The applicant sent revised drawings to staff on December 9, 2020 and worked with staff to clarify details.

## **FINDINGS**

### **Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Demolition, Addition, Site,** and **Garage**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

### **Site Context/ Background**

The site is located 4 lots west from the intersection of Eastern Star Dr. and Cherokee Rd. The property is zoned R5 within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The circa 1900, wood-framed, two-and-one-half-story brick, Late Victorian style home has a partial basement and sits on a limestone foundation.

### **Conclusions**

The proposed changes to the property generally meet the Design Guidelines for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District. Therefore, staff determined the proposed work is appropriate for this property at this time. The existing addition is on the rear and its replacement will not negatively impact the historic integrity of the house. The new addition

is in keeping with the design of the home and meets the design guidelines. Furthermore, the new garage meets the design guidelines and is appropriate for the property.

## **DECISION**

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness is **approved with the following conditions:**

1. The applicant shall take precautions to prevent the building, or surrounding buildings from being damaged during the demolition and construction processes.
2. The applicant shall take measures to protect the interior of the historic building once the existing addition has been removed both prior to and during the new addition being constructed.
3. All new wood deck elements shall be stained or painted within 6 months of construction.
4. Any new concrete shall be of historic concrete mix.
5. The applicant shall take precautions to preserve the brick alley and the remainder of the historic limestone curbing along the alley.
6. The applicant shall submit lighting choices to staff for approval prior to installation.
7. The applicant shall submit garage door choice to staff for approval prior to installation.
8. The applicant shall submit to staff for approval their final siding material choice for the garage prior to installation.
9. The applicant and/or their representative shall obtain any permits necessary to begin the work.
10. If the design changes, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval.

*The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, their successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.*

Bradley Fister  
Bradley Fister  
Historic Preservation Specialist

01-08-2021  
Date

# DEMOLITION

## Design Guideline Checklist From Economic Hardship Exemption

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

### Introduction

Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

### Demolition by Neglect

The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.	+	The applicant shall take precautions to remove the addition and the carport in such a manner that harm will not come to the historic structures adjacent to them.
DE2	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	+	The applicant shall take precautions to protect the interior of the historic structure once the addition has been removed.
DE3	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	+	The applicant shall take steps to remove non-historic interior finishes in such a way as not to damage historically significant and contributing elements.
DE4	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	+	The applicant shall replace the existing addition with a new addition.
DE5	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent with those features on adjacent properties.	+	The topography and landscape shall not change due to the removal of the addition and carport.
DE6	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	+	The street wall will be reestablished with the construction of the new garage at the rear of the property.

# ADDITION

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>A1</b>	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The addition is in keeping with the size and scale of the historic building and district.
<b>A2</b>	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+	The addition is subordinate to the existing structure in material, size, and scale.
<b>A3</b>	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	The proposed addition is to be on the rear elevation of the house.
<b>A4</b>	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	The proposed use of materials are subordinate to the historic structure.
<b>A5</b>	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	The proposed roof form is complementary to the existing roof line, and material.
<b>A6</b>	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
<b>A7</b>	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	The original orientation of the building will not be altered.
<b>A8</b>	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	The floor to floor height is equal to, that of the original house.
<b>A9</b>	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+	The proposed addition has a similar ratio of solids and voids as the historic portion does.
<b>A10</b>	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	The change in material, will help to distinguish between what is historic and what is new.

<b>A11</b>	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	NA	
<b>A12</b>	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	The proposed addition does not attempt to incorporate falsely historic elements.
<b>A13</b>	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	The proposed addition shall not alter any character defining elements.
<b>A14</b>	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	NA	
<b>A15</b>	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	
<b>A16</b>	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
<b>A17</b>	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	+	The proposed new deck does not extend beyond the side walls of the house.
<b>A18</b>	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

# GARAGE

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	Located in the rear of the property adjacent to the alley.
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	The proposed garage shall generally align with the existing secondary structures.

		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	The proposed garage works to enclose the rear yard.
		+	Minimize paving	The amount of paving is appropriate for the proposed garage, and its location.
<b>Materials</b>	Walls	+	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	The applicant proposes corner boards and trim around openings. The applicant intends to use 4" exposure smooth cementitious fiber or vinyl siding.
		NA	Board and batten siding	
		NA	Brick	
		NA	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		NA	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	+	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	To match the existing on the house.
		NA	Metal roofing	
		+	Half-round or Ogee gutters	Half round brown gutters and down spouts shall be installed on the north, and south facades.
		+	Approved Gable-end element	The gable vents are appropriate and framed to look like windows.
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
<b>Building Forms</b>	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	The form is simple, and rectilinear.
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		NA	No overly-elaborate volumes	
	Roof	+	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	Gable end vent
		NA	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		NA	Overhanging eaves	
		+	Half-round gutters	Half round aluminum gutters and downspouts shall be installed.
		+	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	Applicant proposed a 7/12 pitch.
		+	No flush eaves	Eaves are not flush.
		+	No roofs without gutters	Gutters and downspouts shall be installed.
<b>Openings</b>	Garage	+	Single-car openings	Two single car openings.
	Doors	+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	Carriage style doors
		+	No double and triple doors	Two single doors proposed
		+	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	The carriage style doors are inset
	Windows	+	Use window openings to break up wall surface	Windows are proposed on the rear portion of the south façade that faces



		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	
--	--	----	---	--

# SITE

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>ST1</b>	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	The new addition to the home as well as the new garage are generally complementary to the property and the district.
<b>ST2</b>	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	Property lines are maintained.
<b>ST3</b>	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	Proposed use of historic concrete mix is keeping with the district as well as the Design Guidelines.
<b>ST4</b>	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+	The applicant shall take precautions not to disturb the bricked alley, or what remains of the deteriorated limestone curbing.
<b>ST5</b>	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
<b>ST6</b>	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
<b>ST7</b>	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	Parking is located in the rear with access from the alley.
<b>ST8</b>	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	



<b>ST9</b>	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	+	Applicant shall take appropriate precautions with the removal of the existing addition, deck, and carport being in such close proximity to the foundation at the rear of the home and its close proximity to neighboring properties.
<b>ST10</b>	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
<b>ST11</b>	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
<b>ST12</b>	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
<b>ST13</b>	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
<b>ST14</b>	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
<b>ST15</b>	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
<b>ST16</b>	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
<b>ST17</b>	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	+	Applicant shall present lighting choices to staff for approval prior to installation.
<b>ST18</b>	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	+	Lighting shall be appropriate.
<b>ST19</b>	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
<b>ST20</b>	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
<b>ST21</b>	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	+	Proposed site for HVAC is located on a side elevation.

<b>ST22</b>	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
<b>ST23</b>	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
<b>ST24</b>	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	