



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: February 22, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0011
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2132 Baringer Avenue

Applicant: Laura & Brad Maudlin
2132 Baringer Avenue
Louisville, KY 40204
502-724-2423
502-741-9952
lauramaudlin@icloud.com
brad.maudlin@icloud.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

1. The applicant requests approval to remove the existing wood front door and sidelights in order to replace it with a new, fiberglass pre-hung door and sidelight unit. The new pre-hung door unit proposed will fit in the same opening as the existing door. The proposed sidelights will be a more simplified contemporary style.
2. The applicant requests approval to replace the existing wood side door, and replace it with a new fiberglass pre-hung door to fit the same opening as the existing door.
3. The applicant also requests approval to replace the existing wood replacement windows in the front facing dormer, with new wood clad full divided light replacement windows.

4. The applicant requests approval to replace 23 of the existing historic wood windows located on the front, sides and rear of the house.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on January 21, 2021. Staff conducted a site visit on February 9, 2021 to review the existing doors and windows on the interior and exterior. It was determined that this would need a committee level review on February 9, 2021.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on March 3, 2021 at 5:30 pm, online via WebEx. The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Doors** and **Window**. The report of the Commission staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

Findings

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R5B zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the southeast side of Baringer Avenue, seven lots west of Willow Avenue. The home is a two-and-a-half-story Arts and Crafts-style masonry home with a limestone foundation. The surrounding buildings are predominately two- and three-story masonry homes.

Conclusions

The existing door and sidelights appear to be original 1920 character-defining elements to the home. The existing door and sidelights are approximately 100 years old and maintain their historic form, material, location, setting, and integrity. D1 states not to alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent. Staff recommends that the existing character defining historic door and sidelights to stay in place. Staff recommends repair to any portions of the wooden door and sidelights that show signs of wear and rot.

The existing side door appears to be an original 1920 character-defining element to the home. The door is a custom sized wood raise paneled door. Staff recommends that the existing character defining historic door shall stay in place. Staff recommends repair to any portions of the wooden door that show signs of wear and rot, as well as the addition of weather stripping.

The existing front facing dormer windows have already been replaced previously with windows that did not keep the same configuration. Staff recommends that the new dormer replacement windows match the same configuration and muntin pattern as the original windows (as seen in the designation photo).

The existing (approximately 23) historic windows located on the front, sides, and rear of the house do not appear to meet **W1**, which is the standard per the Design Guidelines for total replacement. Staff recommends based on the design guidelines for the windows to be repaired not replaced. The proposed replacement windows are Renewal by Anderson true divided light wood replacement windows.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends part 1 (door and sidelights) of the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends part 2 (side door) of the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends part 3 (replacement windows) of the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**.

1. **The applicant shall replace the existing front facing wood replacement windows located in the dormer with an in-kind material window (wood).**
2. **The applicant shall replace the front facing windows, located in the dormer with windows that match the same configuration and muntin pattern as seen in the designation photo.**
3. **If the scope of the project should change, the applicant shall contact staff for approval**
4. **The applicant shall obtain any and all permits required prior to starting.**

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends part 4 (replacement of 23 windows) of the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

02-22-21

Date

DOOR Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	-	The proposed replacement door and sidelights would remove a significant character defining feature away from the home, as well as the district.
D2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric	+	The applicant shall document any and all changes with photographs and share them with staff for their files.
D3	Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate.	+	The applicant shall document any and all changes with photographs and share them with staff for their files.
D4	Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.	-	Proposed door sidelights are generally not appropriate for the home, based on the architectural style.
D5	Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.	NA	
D6	Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.	+	The applicant shall not alter the size of the door to accommodate a stock item.
D7	Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.	NA	
D8	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.	NA	
D9	Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.	+	The front door is distinguishable based on the design of the existing window and sidelights
D10	Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	

D11	Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
D12	Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended.	NA	Existing door and sidelights are original To the home

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	-/+	The 23 historic wood windows are not severely deteriorated. (-) The existing replacement dormer windows do meet W1. (+)
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+	Proposed windows shall fit existing window openings and match the muntin configuration as seen in the designation photo.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+	Proposed windows shall fit existing window openings.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	+	The replacement windows are proposed to be a wood clad true divided light window.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	The windows shall operate the same as the original historic windows would have.

W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	+	The proposed windows are true divided lights
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	The windows shall be clear
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	The windows shall be clear
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+	
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	

W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	

W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	

