



---

## Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

### Report to the Committee

---

---

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee  
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer  
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist  
Date: January 26, 2021

---

**Case No:** 20-COA-0185  
**Classification:** Committee Review

#### GENERAL INFORMATION

**Property Address:** 500 W. Ormsby Ave.

**Applicant:** James Drabo  
James Dra's Deck & Remodel  
4203 Norbrook Dr. #6  
Louisville, KY 40218  
(502) 533-0524  
[jamesdrabo@gmail.com](mailto:jamesdrabo@gmail.com)

**Owner:** Farhiya Mohamed  
500 W. Ormsby Ave.  
Louisville, KY 40203

**Estimated Project Cost:** TBD

#### Description of proposed exterior alteration:

1.The applicant seeks after-the-fact approval for the replacement of 32 previously replaced windows in the building with vinyl windows. The single double-hung window on the front façade had not been replaced previously and has been replaced with two vinyl double-hung windows.

2.The applicant also seeks approval to repair / replace the wooden porch beam, and the repair and replacement of the cornice, frieze, and architrave with in-kind materials. This work would typically fall under general maintenance and would not require a Certificate of Appropriateness.

### **Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:**

The application was received on September 09, 2020. The application was classified as requiring Staff Review on September 14, 2020 and staff emailed applicant to advise them their application had been assigned to a case manager. Staff contacted the applicant via phone and email to request additional information as well as to schedule a site visit. A site visit was scheduled for October 30, 2020. At the site visit, staff discovered that the window had already been replaced. It was decided that though the replacement of the window possibly could have been approved at staff level due to its deteriorated status; it was that the applicant had replaced a single double-hung wood window, with two double-hung windows that is in violation of the design guidelines. It was decided then, that the case would require the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee approval. The ARC case was originally scheduled to be heard on February 3, 2021 at 5:30 PM via WebEx at 444 S. 5<sup>th</sup> St. It was determined by staff that more research, and an understanding of the full scope of the project was necessary before presenting the case to the committee. Staff performed a second site visit on Monday, February 8, 2021. The case has now been scheduled to be heard on February 17, 2021 at 5:30 PM via WebEx at 444 S. 5<sup>th</sup> St.

## **FINDINGS**

### **Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window**, and **Porch**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

### **Site Context/ Background**

The building at 500 W. Ormsby Ave. was built circa 1900 in the Italianate Style. The three-story building is located 7 lots east of the intersection of S. 6<sup>th</sup> St. and W. Ormsby Ave. The property is zoned TNZD and located within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The brick masonry building sits on a rusticated limestone foundation.

### **Conclusions**

The proposed porch repair is classified as general maintenance.

The after-the-fact replacement windows generally do not meet the **Window** Design Guidelines for Old Louisville. The large one-over-one double-hung wood window on the front façade has been replaced with two vinyl one-over-one double-hung windows. Staff is unable to recommend the after-the-fact proposal for the vinyl windows per **W6** and **W7** for the front façade, as well as **W14** which states not to alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way.

While the new replacement windows do replicate the configuration of the previous replacement wood windows that had been installed previously without a COA, they are vinyl units. It appears that the window openings had been altered by decreasing the

openings to allow for stock size windows. This is in direct conflict with **W4** which states that window openings should never be filled in to allow for stock windows.

### **Recommendation**

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied** for the after-the-fact window replacement the front façade from one window to two windows.

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions** for the rest of the after-the-fact replacement windows on the front, sides, and rear facades.

1. **The two first floor front replacement windows that have been put into what was previously the opening for a single double-hung window, shall be replaced with a wood window that both fits the historic window opening, and original window configuration.**
2. **All other windows appear to have been previously replaced or altered and no longer have historic integrity, should these be changed again in the future the applicant shall notify staff prior to work being done.**
3. **The glass shall not be smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective. Clear low-E glass is permissible.**
4. **If the design or materials change for the windows or porch, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**

Bradley Fister  
Bradley Fister  
Historic Preservation Specialist

2-08-2021  
Date

# WINDOW

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>W1</b>	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	+/-	The windows on the front façade have been in need of replacement but it had been removed prior to site visit.
<b>W2</b>	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	-	Front façade replacement window(s) does not match the original.
<b>W3</b>	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	
<b>W4</b>	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	-	Current applicant did not alter the opening of the existing window, however more than one window was used to fill the space of the previous window. Openings on other windows were previously altered.
<b>W5</b>	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
<b>W6</b>	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	-	The windows on the front façade were previously wood and now vinyl.
<b>W7</b>	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	Replacement windows are double hung like the originals.
<b>W8</b>	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
<b>W9</b>	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	Applicant shall not apply reflective or insulating film to any window.
<b>W10</b>	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	Applicant shall not use smoked, tinted, Low-e or reflective glass. (clear Low-e is acceptable)
<b>W11</b>	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
<b>W12</b>	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	

<b>W13</b>	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
<b>W14</b>	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	-	Applicant altered the number, and size of window replaced.
<b>W15</b>	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
<b>W16</b>	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
<b>W17</b>	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
<b>W18</b>	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
<b>W19</b>	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
<b>W20</b>	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
<b>W21</b>	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
<b>W22</b>	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
<b>W23</b>	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
<b>W24</b>	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
<b>W25</b>	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
<b>W26</b>	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	

<b>W27</b>	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
<b>W28</b>	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
<b>W29</b>	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
<b>W30</b>	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
<b>W31</b>	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
<b>W32</b>	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Applicant shall document changes

# PORCH

## Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>P01</b>	Replace reconstructed entrance or porch features with in-kind materials. If that is not economically or technically feasible, a compatible substitute material may be considered. Composition and plastic moldings, however, should not be used due to their unproven longevity.	+	Applicant shall replace any deteriorated porch materials with in-kind materials and in-kind design.
<b>P02</b>	Photographically document architectural porch features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	Applicant shall document changes with photographs to be shared with staff.
<b>P03</b>	Design replacement porch railings and balusters to match the originals as closely as possible. If it is technically or economically unfeasible to accomplish this, a simplified porch rail and baluster design may be used of 2" x 4" rails and 2" x 2" pickets, set between top and bottom rails, and nailed to the inside face of the rail. Railings should be finished with paint or an opaque stain. Plans are available from the Landmarks Commission.	NA	
<b>P04</b>	Do not use cast- or wrought-iron columns, railings, or balusters as a replacement for brick or wood porch elements. Columns should match the proportion, detailing, and size of the original.	NA	
<b>P05</b>	When installing a new code-required handrail or railing, select a design that is simple and stylistically appropriate. Generally, metal is appropriate for masonry buildings and wood for frame buildings.	NA	
<b>P06</b>	Do not add conjectural porch ornament; often its style conflicts with the style of the house.	NA	
<b>P07</b>	Do not use over-sized boards (2" thick) for porch floors. 3/4" to 1" tongue-and-groove boards are generally appropriate.	NA	

<b>PO8</b>	Install replacement porch flooring that closely matches the original tongue-and-groove flooring dimensions. A maximum gap of 1/16" should be left between boards to allow for expansion. Wood edging should be applied to the exposed ends of floorboards to prevent moisture infiltration into the grain.	NA	
<b>PO9</b>	Do not cover porch or cornice elements with vinyl or aluminum siding.	+	Applicant shall not cover the cornice, frieze, or architrave with vinyl or aluminum siding.
<b>PO10</b>	Do not install porch ceilings or close in exposed eaves where none existed previously. Exposed rafters and roof decks are character-defining features for certain architectural styles.	NA	
<b>PO11</b>	Replace deteriorated porch steps with in-kind materials. Replacement steps should be of the same scale and dimensions as the original. Stone steps may be patched with concrete that is tinted a visually-compatible color.	NA	
<b>PO12</b>	Do not replace historic stone steps unless the stone itself is no longer useable. Resetting stones on a firm foundation and repointing or applying sealant can address most problems.	NA	
<b>PO13</b>	Do not enclose front porches. Screen panels that can be removed seasonally, are set behind porch elements, and do not damage historic fabric may be permitted.	NA	
<b>PO14</b>	Do not obscure the design or detailing of original porch elements when undertaking a side or rear porch enclosure project. Large sheets of glass recessed behind original porch features should be used rather than solid materials such as wood, stucco, or masonry.	NA	
<b>PO15</b>	Do not add porches to the primary façades of structures that never had porches.	NA	