



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: March 30, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0030
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2519 Cherokee Parkway

Applicant: Mary Semenza
Cherokee View Condominiums
2519 Cherokee Parkway
Louisville, KY 40204
502-424-4626
mary.semenza@gmail.com

Owner: Cherokee View Condominiums

Estimated Project Cost: \$17,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to remove the existing brick clad stair wall that is attached and runs down both sides of the stairs from the lower landing to the sidewalk. The applicant proposes to replace the stair walls with approximately twenty boxwood shrubs on each side of the stairs. The applicant also proposes to remove existing handrails and replace with new railings to match those at the landing where the stairs split left and right and continue up. The applicant also proposes to resurface the existing concrete steps, as well as pour a 6' x 6' walking pad to connect the sidewalk to the street to eliminate mud from people walking from cars parked on street.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on February 18, 2021 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on February 22, 2019. The case is scheduled to be

heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on April 7th, 2021 at 5:30 pm, online via WebEx.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Site** and **Masonry**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site is located six lots southwest of the intersection of Cherokee Parkway and Longest Avenue on the south side of the street. The property is zoned R5 and is located in a Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The three-and-a-half-story masonry condominium building was constructed in the early-Twentieth century. The buff brick, Mediterranean Revival-style building has a hip style roof sheathed in a terra cotta tile roof punctuated with four hipped roof dormers. The steep topography of the site lends itself to a monumental staircase that connects from Cherokee Parkway to the primary structure. The concrete stairs are flanked by buff brick knee walls.

Conclusions

The proposed work generally meets the **Site** and **Masonry** Design Guideline for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District. The existing center stair handrail does not appear to be original to the property and staff supports the removal and replacement of the existing, for a cleaner and more streamlined design that matches the historic handrail system at the landing. Staff observed that the existing concrete stairs are in need of repair and resurfacing; and recommends this to be done with historic concrete mix and made to be uniform. Staff acknowledges the reason behind the proposal for a 6'x 6' walk to connect the sidewalk to the curb to prevent mud and soil erosion from the grass being trampled.

The existing buff brick side knee walls appear to be historic and original to the property. The proposal to remove the knee walls does conflict with Design Guidelines **ST1** and **ST5** which address site elements relationship with the building and states that original brick, stone, or concrete stairs should be retained. Though the sidewalls are in disrepair and unstable in places staff does not find them to be in such a condition that would warrant removal rather than repair. Staff recommends that the masonry knee wall be retained and repaired using appropriate masonry repair techniques.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. The existing brick side walls on either side of stairs shall be repaired rather than removed.
2. The applicant shall reuse the existing brick and match the bond pattern and mortar mix as well as the joint profile. The masonry repair shall follow the guidance of the attached Masonry Design Guidelines.
3. The applicant shall remove and replace the existing center stair handrail with one that matches the handrail that runs from the landing upward.
4. The applicant shall use historic concrete mix to repair the stairs, as well as to pour the 6' X 6' concrete walk to connect the sidewalk and the curb.
5. If the design or materials change, the applicant and/or their representative shall contact staff for review and approval prior to installation.

3-30-21

Date

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister

Historic Preservation Specialist

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+/-	The proposal to remove the existing masonry side knee walls would remove an element that appears to be integrated with the structure.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	See conditions of approval.
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NA	
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	+/-	The applicant plans to repair and resurface the concrete stairs however; the applicant also proposes the removal of the brick knee walls running along the sides of the stairs.
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	NA	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	

ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	+	The applicant shall reuse all existing masonry in repair of the side knee walls.
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	

ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	

MASONRY

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
M1	Do not construct new masonry features that are either falsely historical (characteristic of periods prior to the building's actual construction) or are incompatible with the building or historic district in terms of size, scale, material, or color.	+	This is restoration of an existing masonry project.
M2	Do not cut new openings into exterior walls on elevations that can be seen from a public way. Creating an opening for the installation of an air conditioning unit, for example, is not appropriate for a façade that is visible from a public way.	NA	
M3	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	See conditions
M4	Match the existing bonding pattern, coursing, color, size, strength, and pointing mortar of masonry when replacing a section of brick wall. Bricks should always be toothed-in to historic brickwork, to disguise the joint between new and old.	+	See conditions
M5	Do not remove or rebuild substantial portions of exterior walls if such an action would adversely impact a structure's historic integrity.	NA	
M6	Make sure that any exterior replacement bricks are suited for exterior use.	+	If replacement brick is necessary it shall resemble the existing and be for exterior use.
M7	Do not replace sections of historic brick with brick that is substantially stronger.	+	See conditions

M8	Repoint only those joints that are no longer sound. Do not remove all joints, sound and unsound, in an effort to achieve a uniform appearance when repointing. Large-scale removal of mortar joints often results in damage to historic masonry.	+	See conditions
M9	Remove unsound mortar joints carefully with hand tools that are narrower than the mortar joint. Power tools should not be used, because they have the potential to scar adjacent masonry.	+	See conditions
M10	Remove unsound mortar to a depth of two-and-one-half the times the width of the joint or to sound mortar, whichever is greater.	+	See conditions
M11	Match historic mortar joints in color, texture, joint size, and tooling when repointing.	+	See conditions
M12	Use a mortar mix that is compatible with historic masonry. Repointing mortar should be equivalent to or softer than the original mortar. When repointing mortar is harder than the surrounding masonry, as is the case with many modern mixtures, moisture cannot escape through the joints. Trapped moisture will crystallize within the walls and fragment surrounding brick and stone.	+	See conditions
M13	If possible, have your mortar analyzed. In order to determine an appropriate mortar mix for individual historic structures, it is recommended that property owners have a sample of the original mortar sent to a lab for analysis. If this is not feasible, a high lime and low Portland cement content mortar mix (1 part cement, 1 part lime, and 6 parts sand) is frequently acceptable.	+	See conditions
M14	Do not attempt to remove joints that have been repointed using a very hard mortar or in an unworkmanlike manner until natural weathering has begun to weaken and crack them. Removal prior to that time would likely damage the masonry units	+	See conditions
M15	Do not use synthetic caulking to repoint historic masonry.	+	See conditions
M16	Have realistic expectations of how the cleaned masonry surface will appear. Remember, it is better to underclean than overclean. A "like new" appearance is rarely desirable.	+	See conditions
M17	Make sure that your contractor has a clear understanding of the physical and chemical properties of your masonry before proposing or testing any chemical cleaning treatments. Such treatments, if improperly applied, can result in permanent damage that significantly outweighs any benefits of cleaning.	+	See conditions
M18	Test proposed cleaning treatments in an inconspicuous area of the building to evaluate potential adverse effects to the masonry. Observation over a complete seasonal cycle is preferable, so that long-term effects may be ascertained. If chemical treatments are found to be acceptable, be sure that those applying the treatment follow all manufacturers' instructions.	+	See conditions
M19	Do not use sandblasting or high-pressure water to clean historic masonry. The process of sandblasting or cleaning buildings using water pressure greater than 300 psi removes the tough, outer-protective surface of the brick and loosens mortar joints, accelerating deterioration.	+	See conditions
M20	Do not clean masonry on buildings with deteriorated mortar joints. Such masonry should be properly repointed prior to cleaning to ensure that water does not penetrate the wall during the cleaning process.	+	See conditions
M21	Do not use any type of water- or chemical-based cleaning systems when a possibility for freezing temperatures exists. Masonry cleaning should not be undertaken until the temperature will remain above 50 degrees for 72 hours after cleaning.	+	See conditions

M22	Remove graffiti as soon as possible, beginning with the gentlest means possible and taking care not to inadvertently etch an outline of the graffiti onto the wall.	NA	
M23	Use solvent-based chemical strippers to remove paint from previously-painted masonry only after testing its effectiveness and evaluating its potential to damage brickwork. Testing should be carried out in an inconspicuous location.	NA	
M24	Do not paint masonry or stucco that has never been painted. While one layer of paint may not affect the appearance of the masonry or stucco, accumulated layers will eventually obscure decorative detail.	NA	
M25	Paint previously-painted masonry a color that is close to its existing color, approximates a natural masonry color as approved, or is recommended by staff. Staff is available to consult with you on appropriate colors.	NA	
M26	Use a "breathable" masonry paint that is compatible with and can create a strong bond with existing paint.	NA	
M27	Make sure that areas of patched stucco match the strength, composition, color, and texture of the original to the greatest degree possible.	NA	
M28	When patching stucco, cut back the successive layers to provide a key for the new layers to prevent new cracking.	NA	
M29	Carry out stucco repairs so that the dimension between the surface of the stucco and adjacent finishes remains unchanged.	NA	
M30	Do not install stucco, Dryvit, or permastone-type cladding over historic masonry or wood siding.	NA	
M31	Do not resurface historic masonry with exterior insulation.	NA	
M32	Use a masonry or terra cotta chimney cap if needed. Metal chimney caps are not historically appropriate.	NA	