



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: March 30, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0033
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2012 Baringer Avenue

Applicant: Chris Reitz
2012 Baringer Avenue
Louisville, KY 40204
502-554-8033
reitzchris@gmail.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$8,125.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to remove and replace a total of six existing third floor wood windows three on the front and three on the rear of the home. The proposed window replacements are to be all wood full divided light with matching muntin pattern.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on February 19, 2021. Although Staff could not conduct an in-person site visit, Staff worked with applicant extensively to explore alternatives to replacement windows prior to coming to the committee. It was then determined that this would need a committee level review and is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle ARC on Wednesday April 7, 2021 at 5:30pm, online via WebEx.

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window.**

The report of the Commission staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

Findings

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R5B zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the east side of Baringer Avenue, five lots north of its intersection with Bardstown Road. The home is a two-and-a-half-story Arts and Crafts-style masonry home with a limestone foundation. The surrounding buildings are predominately two- and three-story masonry homes.

Conclusions

The proposed project does not meet the standard for replacement as described in **W1** for the **Window Design Guidelines** for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District. Specifically, the windows were not found to meet guideline **W1** "severely deteriorated" for staff level approvable replacement. The existing front and rear facing dormer windows have already been repaired previously by former homeowners. There is some evidence of the repair with L-brackets on some of the sashes and there is some broken glass. Storm windows are present, though they have some evidence of failure. Based on the photos provided, Staff determined the windows to fall between a condition 2 for "Stabilization" and 3 for "Partial Replacement" on the Historic Window Condition Checklist. Staff recommends that the front and rear facing dormer windows be repaired, and storms installed on the interior or exterior to assist with weatherization and energy efficiency.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

03-30-21

Date

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	-	<p>The 6 historic wood windows are not severely deteriorated, per the standards for replacement in the Design Guidelines(-).</p> <p>The windows are in need of repair and weatherization</p>
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+	As proposed windows will fit existing window openings and match the muntin configuration.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+	As proposed windows will fit existing window openings.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	+	The replacement windows are proposed to be all wood true divided light window.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	The windows shall operate the same as the original historic windows would have.

W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	+	The proposed windows are true divided lights
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	NSI	Would require as a condition of approval
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	NSI	Would require as a condition of approval
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+	
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	

W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	

W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	