



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: May 5, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0038
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 224 E. Oak St.

Applicant: Joseph Negri
OL1, LLC
105 Daum Road
Manalapan, NJ 0772
(609) 495-4060
OLONELLC@gmail.com

Owner: Same as Applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$2500.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval for the proposed replacement of three one-over-one double-hung wood windows in a ganged configuration, with vinyl replacement windows. The existing transoms shall remain intact.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:

The application was received on February 25, 2021. The application was classified as requiring Committee Review on March 1, 2021 and staff emailed applicant to advise them their application would require committee approval, based on the material choice (vinyl) for the proposed replacement windows. The ARC case is scheduled to be heard on May 12, 2021 at 5:30 PM via WebEx.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The buildings at 224 E. Oak St. was built circa 1900 in the Italianate Style. The building is located 7 lots west of the intersection of S. Floyd St. and E. Oak St. The property is zoned TNZD and located within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The brick masonry building sits on a rusticated limestone foundation.

Conclusions

The proposed changes to the property have been found not to meet the Design Guidelines for the Old Louisville Preservation District. The proposed replacement windows generally do not meet the **Window** Design Guidelines for Old Louisville; therefore, staff determined that the proposed work is not appropriate for this property at this time. Based on the applicant's pictures, staff does not find that the windows meet the standard for **W1**. Based on the materiality of the existing wood windows, staff is unable to recommend the proposal for the vinyl windows per **W6** and **W7** for the front façade.

Recommendation

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **denied**.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

5-05-2021

Date

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	-	The windows on the front façade do not appear based on the applicants pictures to meet W1.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+	Proposed window appears to meet W2 in terms of it matching the size, and depth of the existing.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	NA	
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	-	The windows on the front façade are currently wood.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	Proposed replacement windows are double hung like the original.
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	Applicant shall not apply reflective or insulating film to any window.
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	Applicant shall not use smoked, tinted, Low-e or reflective glass. (clear Low-e is acceptable)
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	

W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	

W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	