Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:	Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru:	Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From:	Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date:	May 5, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0074
Classification: Staff Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1451 S. 2nd Street

Applicant:
Matt Phillips
Alpha Holding, LLC
3131 S 2nd St #106
Louisville, KY 40208
(502) 494-2266
contact@alphaholding.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: $165,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:
The applicant requests after-the-fact approval to replace six historic wood windows located on the front façade of the building, with wood framed aluminum-clad windows that match the existing size and configuration of the original windows. The applicant also seeks after-the-fact approval for the construction of a retaining wall, and privacy fence with barn-style gate, to create a secure private parking area located at the rear of the property off the alley.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application
The application was received on April 13, 2021. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee Review on April 19, 2021.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Windows,** and **Site** The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The TNZD zoned property within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the southeast corner of W. Burnett Avenue and S. 2nd Street. The 3-story Richardsonian Romanesque masonry structure has sandstone sills and decorative plaques on the front façade. It is surrounded by other 2½- to 3-story structures of the same era.

Prior COA 19-COA-1093

The upper stories of the façade were severely bowing from the structure which required it to be rebuilt. The masonry work proposed generally met the **Masonry** guidelines and the completed work meets the conditions of approval stated in the original Decision. The applicant worked with the Kentucky Heritage Council on approval for a Rehabilitation Tax Credit and had the work approved prior to implementation. The applicant also removed a tree that generally met the design guidelines for **Site** and **Streetscape**. The removal of the tree was deemed justified as the tree was impacting historic resources. The applicant also sought approval at the same time to rebuild the existing stone retaining wall located at the rear of the property with existing resources making the work general maintenance.

1. Windows shall be removed and reused in the rebuilding of the façade.
2. Match the existing bonding pattern, coursing, color, size, strength, and pointing mortar of masonry when replacing a section of brick wall.
3. Make sure that any exterior replacement bricks are suited for exterior use. Bricks should always be toothed-in to historic brickwork, to disguise the joint between new and old.
4. Match historic mortar joints in color, texture, joint size, and tooling when repointing.
5. Use a mortar mix that is compatible with historic masonry. Repointing mortar should be equivalent to or softer than the original mortar. When repointing mortar is harder than the surrounding masonry, as is the case with many modern mixtures, moisture cannot escape through the joints. Trapped moisture will crystallize within the walls and fragment surrounding brick and stone. A high lime and low Portland cement content mortar mix (1 part cement, 1 part lime, and 6 parts sand) is frequently acceptable.
6. Sandstone sills shall be replaced with in-kind material.

7. The applicant should consider replacing the tree with select native deciduous species as canopy trees or trees appropriate to the period and character of the district.
8. The removal of the tree shall not structurally damage the main structure on the lot.
9. All Planning & Design approvals and building permits shall be obtained prior to construction.
10. If the design changes, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Conclusions
The wood frame aluminum-clad replacement windows on the front façade generally meet the **Window** Design Guidelines. The applicant intended to originally repair the windows as done with the other windows, located on the sides and rear of the property. Once the masonry work began on the front façade it was discovered that the windows had been severely damaged by water. The box gutters were in disrepair and water had been running down the façade and pooling at the windows.

The extension of the original retaining wall to further allow for the leveling of the rear yard generally meets the **Site** design guidelines. The extension of the retaining wall is located at the rear of the property. New retaining wall is easily distinguishable from the historic retaining wall that was repaired. It is also located at the rear of the property and is not visible from the primary façade.

The privacy fence, and gate located at the rear of the property would generally meet the design guidelines for **Site,** other than the height is above the 7' maximum height as stated in the Design Guidelines. Though staff cannot recommend the privacy fence based on the Design Guidelines, staff recognizes the height is in keeping with the condition of the neighboring privacy fences in the alley. The height of the fence was chosen to follow this existing site line to create a more cohesive continuous feel. However, the LDC measures from grade level which would be in this case at the base of the retaining wall. This would make the height more than 8' max height per the LDC. If approved the applicant may require a variance for the height.

***see site photo for context.**

RECOMMENDATION
On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. The applicant shall lower the height of the privacy fence and gate to a maximum of 7' above grade.
2. The applicant shall paint, stain or clear coat the privacy fence within six months of construction.
3. The applicant shall contact staff and apply for a COA prior to any further exterior changes.

Bradley Fister
Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

5-5-21

Date

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

+ Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA Not Applicable
NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	+	Though staff did not see the original windows prior to being replaced. Based on the applicants repair of all the other windows the six front windows are presumed to have been in poor condition and unable to be repaired. The wood framed aluminum clad replacement windows generally meet the design guidelines
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+	The wood framed aluminum clad replacement windows generally meet the design guidelines
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+	Replacement fits existing window opening.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	

W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	+/-	The wood framed aluminum clad windows do appear to match the proportion and detail of the original.
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+	Windows function as originals did.
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	NA	
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.		
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	

W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	The changes generally complement the existing structure and site.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	Existing property lines remain.
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	Use of material is appropriate with those of neighboring properties

ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+	Original alley paving and curbing were not altered.
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	Parking area is located off of alley and at the rear of the property.
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	+	The retaining wall is not visible from the primary street and is used to retain earth.
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	+	Material choice of retaining will is simplified
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	+/-	Privacy fence is taller than 7’ but does follow the site line of the neighboring fences along the alley.
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	

ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	

The fences follow the same site line, allowing for a clean uniformed look. The fence in question is the one at the end that has a retaining wall positioned behind it. The retaining wall was installed to allow for the leveling of the rear yard to create useable outdoor space.