



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Butchertown Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: September 21, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0155
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1600 Story Ave.

Applicant: Kevin Dohn
Pointe Havens, LLC
181 William St.
Louisville, KY 40206
347-461-6760
kebindohn@gmail.com

Owner: Same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$3,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

Part 1:

The applicant seeks approval to replace the existing non-historic (window added sometime post 1950) double-hung window with a new 1" insulated single-lite window to be installed with minimal framing.

Part 2:

The applicant seeks approval to replace the existing non historic arched door, with a new 83" wide, 1/2" single-pane, full lite, central pivot arched door to be installed with minimal framing.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on July 29, 2021 and considered requiring committee level review on August 2, 2021.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Butchertown Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on September 29, 2021 at 5:30 pm, via WebEx video conference.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design guidelines, approved for the Butchertown Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Window**, and **Door**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The C-2 zoned property within a Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the northwest corner of Story Avenue and Frankfort Avenue. This three-story commercial building is constructed of masonry and built in the Italianate style.

Previous COA's for the property:

20-COA-0244 – Staff Level Review

Solarium addition, ADA accessible walk, replacement of the front and sidelights with French doors

18-COA-1277 – Staff Level Review

Replacement of 4 rear windows

16-COA-1257 – Staff Level Review

Replacement of non-original storefront windows and door, instillation of 3 sconces on the front façade, a wood pergola and sconces at the rear of the building, and removal of paint and repointing on the front façade.

12966-BT – Staff Level Review

Replacement of a single one-over-one double hung sash for a front-facing window in a one-story addition to side of main corner structure.

Conclusions

Overall the two projects are generally appropriate for the district. The proposed window generally meets **W1** and **W2**. The window opening though historic in its own right, was not original to the building. This is evident in the historic photos of the property (see below). The proposed single-lite window would generally tell a clearer story of the building's history, and not be visually read as conjectural, or falsely historic. The proposed window would fit in the existing opening per **W4**. However, the proposed window would not meet **W5** or **W7**. The window would be considered a picture window, and it would also not operate the same as the existing window. The existing double-hung window was replaced previously in 2009. Given the corner commercial context of the building however, a fixed single-lite window would read as a storefront window.

The proposed door generally meets the design guidelines. There is not sufficient information to determine the original design, and the proposed new design is

generally compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. The proposed door is also not considered to be conjectural or falsely historical in design, per **D3**. The proposal generally meets **D4**, and **D12**, in that there is not sufficient evidence to determine what was original, and the proposed door does fit in the existing opening.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

- 1. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**

Bradley Fister

09/21/2021

Bradley Fister

Date

Historic Preservation Specialist





WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	+/-	The proposed window is generally in keeping with the character of the building and district even though it does not match what is currently in place.
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	+/-	The proposed window being replaced is not a historic window and not an original opening.
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	+	Proposed window fits existing opening.
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	-	The proposed window would be considered to be contemporary picture
W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	NA	
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	-	The proposed window would be a fixed window
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	Applicant shall not add.
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	Applicant may use clear low-E
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	

W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+/-	The shape of the window would be different than what is there currently.
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	
W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	

W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	

DOOR

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	NA	
D2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric	NA	
D3	Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate.	+	There is not sufficient documentation to determine what the original door may have looked like. The proposed door is generally in keeping with the district, and is not falsely-histoic.
D4	Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.	+/-	There is not sufficient documentation to determine what the original door looked like.
D5	Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.	NA	
D6	Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.	NA	
D7	Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.	NA	
D8	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.	NA	
D9	Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.	NA	
D10	Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	
D11	Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	

D12	Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended.	+/-	The proposed door does fit the existing opening.
------------	--	-----	--