

### Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

## **Report to the Committee**

| To:   | Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee    |
|-------|--|
| Thru: | Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer    |
| From: | Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist |
| Date: | September 14, 2021                               |

| Case No:        | 21-COA-0202      |
|-----------------|------------------|
| Classification: | Committee Review |

#### **GENERAL INFORMATION**

Property Address: 1215 S. 3<sup>rd</sup> St.

Applicant: Joseph Impellizzeri 239 S. 5<sup>th</sup> St. Ste. 1021 Louisville, KY 40202 (502) 996-2272 josephimpellizzeri@gmail.com

**Owner:** Same as Applicant

#### Estimated Project Cost: \$5,000.00

#### Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant is seeking after-the-fact approval for the construction of an 8' tall wooden privacy fence that runs from the corner of the carriage house south to the property line along the alley, then west to the rear side of the house, then north to connect to the house. The fence is minimally visible from the street. The existing parking lot in the rear of the house will be entirely removed. All of the asphalt will be removed and the yard regraded and planted with grass in the center and shrubs and flower beds along its perimeter.

#### **Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application**

The application was submitted on September 7, 2021. Staff emailed the applicant to let them know that the application had been received. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville (OL) Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on September 22, 2021 at 4:30 pm, online via WebEx.

The applicants representative had a time conflict; the case is now on the agenda for the OL ARC meeting on October 13, 2021 at 4:30pm, online via WebEx.

#### FINDINGS

#### Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Site.** The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

#### Site Context/ Background

The site is located three lots southwest of the intersection of W. Oak St. and Arthur Kling Way. The property is zoned TNZD in a Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The three-story, circa 1900 masonry structure, has a limestone façade with a character defining cornice.

#### Conclusions

The proposed location of the fencing is primarily along the rear and side property line of the building that faces S. 3rd St. The proposed fencing generally does meet the Old Louisville Design Guidelines for **Site.** The primary conflict with the Design Guideline is the height being greater than 7' as stated in **ST-15**.

#### Recommendation

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, Staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved.** 

- 1. The applicant shall lower the height of the fence to be less than 7'.
- 2. If the scope of the project were to change, the applicant shall contact staff for approval.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister Historic Preservation Specialist <u>09-14-2021</u> Date

# SITE

#### **Design Guideline Checklist**

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

|      | Guideline   | Finding | Comment  |
|------|---|---------|--|
| ST1  | Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure<br>when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the<br>other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary<br>relationship.  | +       | The proposed fencing is generally complimentary to the site.   |
| ST2  | Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths.<br>Any replatting should be consistent with original development<br>patterns.  | +       | The proposed fencing lies within the established property line and alley widths.                                       |
| ST3  | Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.   | NA      |  |
| ST4  | Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks<br>such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain<br>original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship<br>between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any<br>replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with<br>original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a<br>substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture,<br>and visual appearance of the original. | NA      |  |
| ST5  | Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.   | NA      |  |
| ST6  | Do not harm historic resources through road widening or<br>underground utility repair.  | NA      |  |
| ST7  | Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.   | NA      |  |
| ST8  | Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes,<br>elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction<br>should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour<br>front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape<br>timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining<br>walls.   | NA      |  |
| ST9  | Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.  | +/-     | The applicant shall be cautious of any<br>excavation at the rear of the site in<br>removing the existing parking area. |
| ST10 | Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.   | NA      |  |
| ST11 | Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.  | NA      |  |
| ST12 | Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.  | NA      |  |

| ST13 | Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.   | NA  |   |
|------|---|-----|---|
| ST14 | Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.   | NA  |   |
| ST15 | Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back<br>from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side<br>out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height.<br>Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses<br>regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.  | +/- | The proposed fence has the finished side out but is approximately 8' in height. |
| ST16 | Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.  | +   | The fence is primarily only visible from the alley and has been stained.        |
| ST17 | Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting.<br>Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic<br>fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.   | NA  |   |
| ST18 | Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh<br>manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-<br>candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away<br>from neighboring properties.   | NA  |   |
| ST19 | Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking<br>area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving.<br>See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for<br>Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.   | NA  |   |
| ST20 | Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.  | NA  |   |
| ST21 | Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes,<br>greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations<br>where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to<br>minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.   | NA  |   |
| ST22 | Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established<br>street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-<br>of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are<br>suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street<br>trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once<br>mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public<br>right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless<br>directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons. | NA  |   |
| ST23 | Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.   | NA  |   |
| ST24 | Install utility lines underground whenever possible.  | NA  |   |